

.

1. CAS/CPS Data			
Country: Republic of Benin			
CAS/CPS Year: FY13		CAS/CPS Period:	FY13 – FY18
CLR Period: FY13 – FY18		Date of this review	: June 20, 2018
2. Ratings			
	С	LR Rating	IEG Rating
Development Outcome:	Modera	ately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory
WBG Performance:		Good	Good
3. Executive Summary			
<ul> <li>period of the Country Partnership Strategy (CPS) (FY13-17) and the Performance and Learning Review (PLR) which extended the CPS period to include FY18. The PLR was discussed at the Board on August 30, 2016.</li> <li>ii. Benin is a low-income country (per capita income of \$820 in 2016). It has a population of about ten million (2013 census) with a high population growth of around 2.8 percent per annum. The average GDP growth during the review period was 4.9 percent (2013-2016). The average per capita GDP growth rate was relatively low at 2.0 percent between 2013 and 2016, due to the high population growth and drop in the overall growth rate in 2015 as a result of an economic slowdown in neighboring Nigeria, political transition in 2015-2106, and decline in cotton prices. The economy is dominated by traditional agriculture, informal commerce and trade - areas with low levels of productivity. The country ranks 167 (out of 188) on the UNDP Human Development Index in 2015.</li> </ul>			
iii. The CPS strategic vision was "to harness Benin's comparative advantages to spur sustainable, shared economic growth". To this end, the CPS had three focus areas: (i) a foundation pillar for governance and public sector capacity; (ii) sustainable growth, competitiveness and employment; and (iii) improving service delivery and social inclusion. The			

CPS focus areas were aligned with the government's Third Growth Strategy for Poverty reduction (SCRP-3) for the period 2011-2015 and consistent with its long-term national vision called Alafia 2025.

iv. During the CPS period, IDA approved 19 lending operations for a total of \$827 million. New lending commitments comprised 14 Investment Project Financing (IPF) including Additional Financing and two regional operations for \$ 497.4 million, four Development Policy Financing (DPF) for \$110 million, and one Program for Results (PforR) for \$220 million. Five trust funded operations were also approved for \$48.9 million. The planned CPS lending program for the five years FY13-17 was \$490 million for 20 operations (of which \$130 million for five DPFs). This program was implemented largely as planned, with some modifications including the cancellation of PRSC 11 due to limited government commitment and weak governance which undermined policy reform efforts in important areas. During the same period, IFC made net commitments of \$225.9 million. The Global Trade Finance Program (GTFP), IFC's short-term trade finance

CLR Reviewed by:	Panel Reviewed by:	CLR Review Manager/Coordinator
Nils Fostvedt Consultant, IEGEC	Jorge Garcia-Garcia Consultant, IEGEC	Pablo Fajnzylber Manager, IEGEC
Takatoshi Kamezawa, Senior Evaluation Officer, IEGEC		Lourdes Pagaran CLRR Coordinator, IEGEC



guarantees, accounted for 95.6 percent or \$215.9 million of net commitments. For the same period, there was only one long-term financing transaction for \$10 million or 4.4 percent of total net commitments.

On balance, IEG rates the overall development outcome as Moderately Satisfactory. Of V. the 12 objectives, five were rated Achieved, three Mostly Achieved, and four Partially Achieved. Focus Area 1 had only one objective on public financial management (PFM) and was not fully supportive of the much broader theme of this focus area. The six indicators for the PFM objective showed mixed progress. There were improvements on some aspects of budget management in terms of timely submission of national accounts and transfers of funds to communes, and the publication of communal action plans (to deal with weaknesses identified by audits); but limited or no progress on other aspects of budget management (execution rate and unallocated percentage of budget), and the investment budget execution rate could not be verified. For Focus Area 2, there were improvements in transport and port services, access to IT services, agricultural productivity and diversification, business environment, and natural resource management; but limited progress on increased access to power services, and labor skills development for youth. For Focus Area 3, there was progress in increasing access to safety nets and improving access to health and nutrition services, and primary education; but limited progress on flood protection in urban areas. Overall, some of the indicators were narrowly focused on outputs rather than on outcomes, and/or based on results from specific Bank projects with limited sense of how and/or when such results have been replicated more broadly in the country.

Overall, IEG rates the WBG performance as Good. The CPS addressed important areas for vi. Benin's development, with an appropriate combination of lending and knowledge activities (ASA), with the latter generally linked to lending activities and policy discussions with the government. The program, while somewhat broad, had reasonable selectivity and reflected new challenges identified by the new government, such as youth and female employment and the reduction of gender inequalities. The CPS had planned for the PLR to be produced 18-24 months into implementation, but it was instead delivered more than four years into the period. At the PLR, the CPS period was extended by one year, or a total of six years, in order to respond to the priorities of the new government at that time. The original results framework was of reasonable size and complexity in relation to the WBG program. However, the changes at the PLR reduced the level of ambition of the program by focusing more on process and outputs and using achievements of specific target areas of Bank supported projects with no clear sense of broader program implications. The Benin portfolio (closed and active) showed mixed performance. There was good coordination among donors in areas of common interest. The CPS was Bank centric with limited reference to the IFC in the results framework and this approach did not change at the PLR. There were no safeguard or fiduciary issues during the review period.

vii. The CLR presents three key lessons with which IEG agrees: (i) weak governance and government commitment undermined the policy reform program in important areas such as public financial management; (ii) investment programs targeting the poor have yielded results and have led to meaningful policy and institutional changes in the affected sectors; and (iii) The WBG has been most effective when all its institutions work together.

viii. IEG adds the following lesson:

• It is important to establish close coherence between program objectives and indicators, and for relevant indicators to cover the different dimensions of the objectives. In the case of Benin, the modifications at the PLR reduced the level of ambition of the program results where some indicators only covered parts of their stated objectives. In some cases, indicators were concentrated quite narrowly on process and outputs rather than on outcomes, and/or on the results from Bank projects with limited sense of how and/or when such results might be replicated more broadly in the country.



# 4. Strategic Focus

## Relevance of the WBG Strategy:

1. **Congruence with Country Context and Country Program**. Benin is a low-income country (per capita income of \$820 in 2016). It has a population of about ten million (2013 census) with a high population growth of around 2.8 percent per annum. The average GDP growth during the review period was 4.9 percent (2013-2016). Benin's economy is dominated by traditional agriculture, informal commerce and trade - areas with low levels of productivity. The country ranks 167 (out of 188) on the UNDP Human Development Index in 2015. In that year the Gini coefficient was 47.8.

2. The CPS stated as its strategic vision "to harness Benin's comparative advantages to spur sustainable, shared economic growth." To this end, the CPS had three focus areas: (i) a foundation pillar for governance and public sector capacity; (ii) sustainable growth, competitiveness and employment; and (iii) improving service delivery and social inclusion. The CPS was prepared to reflect the government's Third Growth Strategy for Poverty reduction (SCRP-3) for the period 2011-2015 and consistent with its long-term national vision called Alafia 2025. The CPS noted that while the SCRP-3 did not differ fundamentally from the previous poverty reduction strategy, it included new challenges such as youth and female employment and the reduction of gender inequalities.

3. **Relevance of Design**. The WBG interventions covered a range of activities that were envisaged to support the achievement of the CPS objectives and contribute to the achievement of government's goals and priorities. The CPS sought to focus on areas where it would have comparative advantage and solid expertise. The program contained a combination of policy-based lending, PfoR and investment operations, with expected annual policy-based operations to support selected reform areas and complemented by capacity building. The ASA work and trust funds were generally well linked with lending operations. Limited government commitment and weak governance undermined the policy reform program in important areas (such as public financial management) and made it more difficult to achieve reforms – a weakness that had not been well foreseen at the design stage. As a consequence, while most of the planned program interventions were carried out as planned, disbursements under PRSC 10 took longer than expected, and the planned PRSC 11 was cancelled due to governance issues.

### **Selectivity**

4. The CPS document noted as one lesson from the previous CPS that IDA should focus its assistance in key priority areas. Overall, the program design and implementation corresponded reasonably to this intention, with three focus areas and 12 program objectives that were appropriate given country conditions and the Bank's limited resources. The CPS laid out well the justifications for the chosen priorities, but there was little discussion on why some areas were not covered. The CPS indicated that it did not plan to invest new IDA resources in agriculture, judicial reform, national transport, education, water, or HIV/AIDS, but at the same the CPS noted that several of these areas were in any case covered through trust funds and advisory services and analytics (ASA). There was no discussion in the CPS of other important areas not addressed by the program (such as how to address the high fertility rate in Benin).

## Alignment

5. The December 2017 Systematic Country Diagnostic (SCD) notes that Benin's GDP per capita has not grown much over the past 15 years, resulting in little substantive progress in reducing poverty. Explanatory factors for the lack of per capita growth include governance weaknesses, infrastructure deficiencies and economic competitiveness issues, together with notable gender imbalances, high population growth, and low levels of human capital among the poor. The CPS was prepared before the WBG's corporate strategy spelled out the twin goals, but the program sought to address issues concerning both ending extreme poverty and supporting shared prosperity by addressing key development challenges (governance and public sector capacity), strengthening sustainable growth, and supporting access to social services and social inclusion.



# 5. Development Outcome

Overview of Achievement by Objective:

6. Following the IEG-OPCS Shared Approach (SA) for Country Engagement, the assessment of the development outcome is based on the updated results framework at the PLR stage. In line with the SA, this review applies the following nomenclatures: focus areas and objectives corresponding to the CLR's pillars and outcomes, respectively.

Focus Area 1 (Foundation Pillar): Governance and Public Sector Capacity. This focus area had only one objective.

7. **Objective 1: Improved public sector capacity in public financial management**. This objective was supported primarily through the Poverty Reduction Support Credits (PRSC 8-10) (FY13-15), the Public Investment Management and Governance Support Project (FY16), the Decentralized Community Driven Services Project (FY12) and its additional financing (FY14), and various technical assistance (TA) including the Poverty Diagnostics and Statistics Regional TA (FY17), the Benin Medium-Term Debt Management Strategy TA (FY16), and the Benin Statistics Capacity Building Trust Fund (FY16). This objective had six indicators:

(i) <u>Execution rate of social priority expenditures.</u> *Not Achieved.* The target was for this rate to increase to more than 90 percent (2016) from 75 percent (2011). The rate first rose to 101 percent in 2013, but it then declined to 81 percent in 2014 (as reported in the CLR), and to 65 percent as reported in the 2017 IMF Article IV Report which notes under-execution of social priority spending.

(ii) <u>Time required to submit national accounts to the Chamber of Accounts</u>. *Achieved*. The time required to submit national accounts declined from nine months in 2012 to less than six months by end 2016, in line with the target.

(iii) <u>Unallocated percentage of budget</u>. *Partially Achieved*. This was expected to decline from 12.4 percent in 2012 to less than five percent by 2017. The ICRR for the PRSC-9 and 10 series reports that the unallocated share of budget decreased from 12.4 percent (2012) to 10.4 percent (2017).

(iv) <u>Investment budget execution rate</u>. *Not Verified*. The CLR reports that the execution rate was 89.2 percent as of June 2017, but this number could not be verified by IEG. The CLR also states that data for 2018 will only be available at the end of the first quarter of 2019. This reporting issue should have been considered at the PLR.

(v) <u>Fonds d'Appui au Development des Communes (FADeC) - transfers to communes (days from the published timetable</u>). *Achieved*. The average difference (number of days) fell to five by October 2016, surpassing the target of 15.

(vi) <u>Communes with audits and published action plans to correct any revealed deficiencies</u>. *Achieved*. As of September 2017, 100 percent of the communes with up-to-date financial audits published such action plans to correct any revealed deficiency, against the target of 90 percent.

8. Overall, Objective 1 was **Partially Achieved.** Of the six indicators, three were achieved, one partially achieved, one not achieved, and one not verified.

9. Focus Area 1 was **Moderately Unsatisfactory**. There were improvements on some aspects of budget management (timely submission of national accounts and transfers of funds to communes) and the publication of communal action plans (to deal with weaknesses identified by audits); but limited progress on other aspects of budget management (execution rate and unallocated percentage of budget).



**Focus Area 2: Sustainable Growth, Competitiveness and Employment**. This focus area had seven objectives: (i) increased access to power services; (ii) improved transport and port services; (iii) increased access to ICT services; (iv) enhanced business environment; (v) improved agricultural productivity and diversification; (vi) improved natural resource management practices; and (vii) labor skills development for youth.

10. **Objective 2: Increased access to power services**. This objective was supported primarily by the Increased Access to Modern Energy Services Project (FY09) and the GEF Energy Efficiency Program (FY09) The four indicators were introduced at the PLR, at which time several indicators were removed concerning reductions of power losses and electricity bill collection rates. This objective had four indicators.

(i) <u>Infrastructure for electricity distribution network established</u>. *Partially Achieved*. As of January 2018, 30 km of transmission lines had been constructed, against the target of 50 km by 2017.

(ii) <u>Infrastructure for electricity bill collection established</u>. *Mostly Achieved*. As of January 2018, 40,500 pre-payment meters had been installed against a 2017 target of 45,000 meters delivered and installation launched.

(iii) <u>Lighting efficiency standards developed and applied</u>. *Achieved*. Efficiency standards for two appliances (light bulbs and air conditioners) were developed and applied, as targeted.

(iv) <u>Revision of the international agreement on the Beninese-Togolese Electrical Code and the law governing the Electricity Code in Benin</u>. *Partially Achieved*. The CLR does not report on this indicator. No Bank document provides information on the Benin-Togo international agreement and the law governing the electricity code in Benin. Information from *Communauté Electrique du Bénin* (CEB) suggests that there were revisions made to the Electrical Code.

11. All four indicators could potentially contribute to the stated objective of access to power services. However, these indicators do not measure the achievement of the stated objective. On balance this Objective 2 was **Partially Achieved**.

12. **Objective 3: Improved transport and port services.** This objective, with two indicators, was primarily supported by the Abidjan-Lagos Trade and Transport Facilitation project (FY10), the ASA Customs Assessment Trade Toolkit (FY14), and by a trade policy note on the Port of Cotonou (2013).

(i) <u>Port dwell time in Cotonou</u>. *Achieved*. The dwell time was reduced from the 2012 baseline of 21.6 days to 14 days as of June 2017, exceeding the target of 16 days.

(ii) <u>Border crossing time of trucks/merchandise along corridor Krake-Seme</u>. *Achieved*. The border crossing time was reduced from the 48 hours in 2010 to 31 hours as of June 2017, exceeding the target of 40 hours in 2018.

13. The objective was **Achieved**.

14. **Objective 4:** Increased access to ICT services. This objective, with two indicators, was primarily supported by the E-government project (FY10) and the Benin West Africa Communications Infrastructure Program (FY13).

(i) <u>Retail price of internet services</u>. *Achieved*. The retail price of internet services dropped to \$50 (per Mbit/s per month) between 2010-2015, and dropped further to \$30 in 2017. The target for 2016 was \$80.

(ii) <u>Access to internet services</u>. *Achieved*. Access to internet services increased from 1.80 subscribers per 100 people in 2011, to 25.17 by June 2017, exceeding the 2016 target of 4.20 per 100 people in 2016.



#### 15. The objective was **Achieved**.

16. **Objective 5: Enhanced business environment**. This objective, with three indicators, was primarily supported by the Competitiveness and Integrated Growth Opportunity project (FY08) and by the PRSCs 9 and 10 (FY14-15). IFC also supported this objective through its Benin Investment Climate program (FY13).

(i) <u>Number of new SMEs registered</u>. *Achieved*. As of December 2017, the ISR for the FY08 project reports that 3,292 new businesses were formalized (against a target of 3,000 in 2016).

(ii) <u>Number of days to enforce a contract</u>. *Not Achieved*. The CLR reports that this activity was not directly reflected in portfolio results. The 2017 Doing Business Report states that the number of days to enforce a contract was 750, against the CPS target of 650.

(iii) <u>Number of approved innovative PPP investments in critical service delivery areas.</u> *Achieved.* Two PPP arrangements were signed as of December 2016 in line with the target. The CLR reports that four other PPPs were concluded for water services as part of joint Bank and IFC support for the Water and Sanitation program of Benin. IFC also advised the government on PPPs for a port project and in the health sector.

17. Two of the indicators were achieved and one was not achieved. However, taken together the three indicators would only cover some of the many important aspects making for an enhanced business environment, which was the stated objective. It also seems that no program interventions could reasonably be identified with the second indicator – number of days to enforce a contract - and hence any attribution is an issue. Additional information suggests that progress has been made in enhancing the business environment in Benin, but there are also areas that still need further improvements. According to the 2017 Doing Business Report, Benin ranks 151 (of 190) for the overall ratings, up from 174<sup>th</sup> place in the 2014 report, with significant relative improvements for some components (such as starting a business and dealing with construction permits), although some other components showed only modest improvements or declines (such as getting electricity and getting credit). The latest IMF country report (January 2018) notes that little progress has been made in addressing weaknesses in the doing business indicators, and addressing corruption and improving governance and transparency. On balance, this objective was **Mostly Achieved.** 

18. **Objective 6: Improved agricultural productivity and diversification**. This objective, with four indicators, was primarily supported by the Agricultural Productivity and Diversification project (FY11), together with various items of TA for agricultural diversification, cotton sector policy, and land tenure policy.

(i) <u>Average yield (tons per ha) in project area</u>. *Mostly Achieved*. The indicator aimed at a 15 percent increase in yield 2011-2016 for both rice and maize. For maize, this was more than achieved – an improvement of 83.3 percent (from 1.2 tons per ha to 2.2 tons per ha). For rice the average yield improved by 13.25 percent (from 4 tons per ha. to 4.53 tons per ha). The CLR does not explain how the dramatic increase in yield for maize was achieved.

(ii) <u>Average yield (tons per ha) of cash crops (pineapple and cashew) in project area (to increase by 15 percent in 2016)</u>. *Achieved*. The target was a 15 percent increase in yield 2011-2016 for both pineapple and cashew. Average yield was achieved for pineapple (from 50 to 60 tons per ha) and 38 percent for cashew (from 0.45 to 0.62 tons per ha).

(iii) <u>Quantity exported (tons) of cashew and pineapples in project area (to increase by 15 percent by 20 percent in 2016)</u>. *Achieved*. Between 2011 and mid 2017 the annual exports of pineapples increased from 20,000 to 74,000 tons (or 270 percent increase) and for cashews from 25,000 tons to 142,000 tons (or 468 percent increase).

(iv) <u>Share of project beneficiaries using improved technologies supported by project</u> (to increase by 80 percent in 2018). *Achieved.* The share of project beneficiaries using improved



technologies disseminated through the project increased from 73.4 percent (March 2011) to 80 percent (as targeted) in June 2017.

19. Three indicators were achieved and one mostly achieved; thus, the objective was **Mostly Achieved**. However, the improvements were based on specific project areas and it is not clear whether such improvements are also happening in other parts of the country.

20. **Objective 7: Improved natural resource management practices.** This objective, with four indicators, was primarily supported by the Support to Protected Areas Management project (FY11) and its GEF related project (FY11), the Community-Based Coastal Marine Biodiversity project (FY08), and the Forests and Adjacent Land Management project (FY06) and its additional financing (FY13).

(i) <u>Scores from PA-METT [Protected Areas - Management Effectiveness Tracking Tool] for</u> <u>Pandjari National Park</u>. *Achieved*. The score for this park increased from 85 (2011) to 94 by November 2017, above the target of 93.

(ii) <u>Communal marine and coastal biodiversity sites, including wetlands area are demarcated</u> <u>and protected</u>. *Achieved*. Three biodiversity sites were created and demarcated under communal order and adopted by ministerial decree in October 2013.

(iii) <u>Number of threatened species identified in the baseline study of biodiversity which benefit</u> <u>from conservation measures</u>. *Achieved*. The number of threatened species that benefit from conservation measures increased from 30 in 2011 to 35, in November 2017 in line with the target.

(iv) <u>Rehabilitation of degraded forests</u>. *Achieved*. 8,059 ha of forests had been rehabilitated by November 2017, above the target of 7.700 ha.

21. All four indicators were achieved; thus, the objective was **Achieved**.

22. **Objective 8: Labor skills development for youth**. This objective, with one indicator, was primarily supported by the FY14 Youth Employment project and by two ASA for tertiary education capacity and training assessment (FY13) and gender and youth employment (FY14).

(i) Youth supported by the project receiving professional certification. Partially Achieved. As of October 2017, 1,870 youth supported by the project received the *Certificat de Qualification Professionelle*, less than the 2018 target of 2,500. This target was set at the PLR, replacing the more ambitious CPS target of 3,000 youth employed in their area of training following project support. That earlier formulation would thus have addressed actual results of the training in terms of employment, and would also have measured better the objective.

23. This Objective was **Partially Achieved.** 

24. Focus Area 2 was **Moderately Satisfactory**. Three objectives were achieved, one mostly achieved and two were partially achieved. There were improvements in transport and port services, access to IT services and natural resource management, but limited progress on increased access to power services, business environment, and labor skills development for youth. While there was progress in agricultural productivity and diversification, the improvements were specific to target areas and it is unclear whether such improvements are also happening in other parts of the country.

**Focus Area 3: Improving Service Delivery and Social Inclusion**. This focus area had four objectives: (i) improved flood protection in urban areas; (ii) increased access to safety nets; (iii) improved access to primary education; and (iv) improved access to health and nutrition services.

25. **Objective 9: Improved flood protection in urban areas**. This objective, with one indicator, was supported primarily by the Emergency Urban Environment project of FY11 and its additional financing (FY14 and FY15), the Cities Support project (FY13), and the Global Index Insurance Facility Regulatory and Policy Capacity Building TA (FY16).



(i) **Drainage network rehabilitated/constructed in the targeted municipalities**. *Achieved.* At project completion 43.4 km of drainage network had been rehabilitated, against a 2018 target of 22 km. This indicator was introduced at the PLR, at which time the CPS objective was also renamed (from "Leveraging Environmental and Urban Sanitation Improvements"), and indicators were dropped regarding reduced percentages of household vulnerable to flooding, and number of alerts on flood risks per year using the flood early warning system put in place by the Emergency Urban Environment project. The PLR changes meant that the indicator focused only on project output.

26. The output indicator was achieved. However, this indicator does not sufficiently measure the stated objective of improved flood protection. Thus, this objective was **Partially Achieved**.

27. **Objective 10: Increased access to safety nets.** This objective, with two indicators, was primarily supported by the Decentralized Community Driven Services project (FY12) and its additional financing (FY14), by the Benin Poverty Assessment (FY15), and by TA for building a common national targeting and registry system (FY16).

(i) <u>Communities implementing safety nets program.</u> *Achieved.* The latest ISR (October 2017) for the FY 14 project reports that 125 communities were implementing safety nets program (versus the target of 120 communities in 2017).

(ii) <u>Beneficiaries of safety nets programs</u>. *Achieved*. There were 12,933 beneficiaries of safety net programs as of September 20127 (against of 12,000 in 2017).

28. Both indicators were achieved, and the objective was Achieved.

29. **Objective 11: Improved access to primary education**. This objective, with two indicators, was supported primarily by the Global Partnership for Education program (FY14) and education sector TA (FY17).

(i) <u>Gross primary intake rate for girls in deprived districts targeted by project support</u>. *Mostly Achieved*. The gross primary intake rate for girls was 100.5 percent in 2011 and increased to 115.2 percent as of December 2017. There was no target rate (beyond "substantive increase") as accurate estimates of baseline, actuals and target depended on then forthcoming census data.

(ii) <u>Primary education completion rate in targeted districts</u>. *Mostly Achieved*. As of December 2017, the primary education completion rate in targeted districts reached 54.4 percent overall and 50.9 percent for girls.

30. Both indicators were mostly achieved, However, both indicators are for a limited number of districts with project support, and it is not clear how and/or when the positive results in these districts will lead to broader improvements nation-wide. On balance, this Objective was **Mostly Achieved**.

31. **Objective 12: Improved access to health and nutrition services**. This objective, with three indicators, was primarily supported by the FY10 Health System Performance project, the FY14 Multi-Sector Food, Health, Nutrition project and the FY11 Benin Community Nutrition project.

(i) <u>Number of additional children under one in project target areas completely immunized</u>. <u>Achieved</u>. The number of immunized children reached 365,000 as of December 2016 against a target of 260,000.

(ii) <u>Number of communes engaged in scaling up community health, food and nutrition</u> <u>security interventions for women and children under five</u>. *Achieved*. Ten communities were involved in scaling up these interventions, and new contracts are almost completed for 11 new communes.

(iii) <u>Children 0-23 months who benefit from a minimum package of monthly community-based</u> <u>growth promotion activities in targeted communes</u>. *Achieved*. As of November 2017, 59.05 percent of children 0-23 months benefited from such a minimum package, against a target of 20 percent. The coverage has also expanded from 10 to 21 communes. However, at PLR



stage several indicators were dropped, including for assisted deliveries and number of communes engaged in scaling up interventions for women and children under five.

32. All three indicators were achieved; this objective was Achieved.

33. Focus Area 3 was **Moderately Satisfactory.** Of the four objectives, two of the objectives were Achieved, one Mostly Achieved, and one Partially Achieved. There was progress on increasing access to safety nets and improving access to health and nutrition services, and primary education; but limited progress on flood protection in urban areas. Some of the indicators under this focus area were narrowly concentrated on output rather than on outcomes, and/or based on results from Bank projects with limited sense of how and/or when such results have been replicated more broadly in the country.

## **Overall Assessment and Rating**

34. IEG rates the overall development outcome as Moderately Satisfactory. Of the 12 objectives, five were rated Achieved, three Mostly Achieved, and four Partially Achieved. Focus Area 1 was Moderately Unsatisfactory. The only objective focused on public financial management, and was thus not fully supportive of the much broader theme of this focus area. The six indicators showed a variable degree of progress: there were improvements on some aspects of budget management (timely submission of national accounts and transfers of funds to communes) and the publication of communal action plans (to deal with weaknesses identified by audits); but little or no progress on the execution rate of social priority expenditures, the unallocated percentage of the budget, and the investment budget execution rate. Focus Area 2 was Moderately Satisfactory. There were improvements for transport and port services, access to IT services, business environment, and natural resource management; but limited progress for increased access to power, and labor skills development for youth. Focus Area 3 was Moderately Satisfactory. There was progress on increasing access to safety nets, improving access to health and nutrition services, and access to primary education. Overall, some of the indicators were concentrated quite narrowly on output rather than on outcomes, and/or were based on results from Bank projects in specific target areas with limited sense of how and/or when such results might be replicated more broadly in the country.

Objectives	CLR Rating	IEG Rating
Focus Area 1: Governance and Public Sector Capacity	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory
Objective 1: Improved public sector capacity in public financial management	Partially Achieved	Partially Achieved
Focus Area 2: Sustainable Growth, Competitiveness and Employment	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory
Objective 2: Increased access to power services indicators	Partially Achieved	Partially Achieved
Objective 3: Improved transport and port services	Achieved	Achieved
Objective 4: Increased access to ICT services	Achieved	Achieved
Objective 5: Enhanced business environment	Mostly Achieved	Mostly Achieved
Objective 6: Improved agricultural productivity and diversification	Achieved	Mostly Achieved
Objective 7: Improved natural resource management practices	Achieved	Achieved
Objective 8: Labor skills development for youth	Mostly Achieved	Partially Achieved
Focus Area 3: Improving Service Delivery and Social Inclusion	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory
Objective 9: Improved flood protection in urban areas	Achieved	Partially Achieved
Objective 10: Increased access to safety nets	Achieved	Achieved
Objective 11: Improved access to primary education	Achieved	Mostly Achieved
Objective 12: Improved access to health and nutrition services	Achieved	Achieved



# 6. WBG Performance

## Lending and Investments

35. At the beginning of the CPS period, the outstanding lending volume was \$449 million for 15 lending operations, all Investment Project Financing (IPFs) including six regional operations. During the same period, there were also 12 approved trust funded operations for a total amount of \$48.3 million. During the extended CPS period, IDA approved 19 lending operations for a total of \$827 million. New lending commitments comprised 14 Investment Project Financing (IPF) including Additional Financing and two regional operations for \$497.4 million, four Development Policy Financing (DPF) for \$110 million, and one Program for Results (PforR) for \$220 million. Five trust funded operations were also approved for \$48.9 million. The planned CPS lending program for the five years FY13-17 was \$490 million for 20 operations (of which \$130 million for five DPFs). This program was implemented largely as planned, with some modifications including the cancellation of PRSC 11 due to limited government commitment and weak governance which undermined the policy reform program in important areas.

36. The closed portfolio showed mixed performance. Seven projects closed during the CPS period and were validated by IEG; of which three were rated Moderately Satisfactory, three Moderate Unsatisfactory and one Unsatisfactory. IEG rated the risk to development outcome as Significant for five of the seven operations. For Benin about 43 percent by number and 47 percent by amount were rated Moderately Satisfactory or higher – a lower percentage than the Africa region (68 percent by number and 76 percent by amount) or the Bank average (73 percent and 84 percent, respectively).

37. For the active portfolio, the disbursement ratio for Benin during the CPS period at 23.3 percent was a bit higher than for the Africa region (20 percent) and Bank-wide (18.8 percent). Benin's commitments at risk were only 6 percent at the end of the CPS period after a declining trend during the period (an average of 14 percent compared to 32.7 percent for the Africa region and 22.9 percent for the Bank-average). The ongoing portfolio (including regional projects) shows good ISR self-ratings – 11 rated Satisfactory, seven Moderately Satisfactory, and only one each Moderately Unsatisfactory and Unsatisfactory. The average percentage by number for projects at risk at 13.7 percent for the CPS period has also been considerably lower than for the Africa region (25.9 percent) or the Bank average (24.2 percent). The generally positive ratings in the ISRs may indicate some potential for downgrading at exit given portfolio performance at exit.

38. IFC made net commitments of \$225.9 million during the CPS period. The Global Trade Finance Program (GTFP), IFC's short-term trade finance guarantees, accounted for 95.6 percent or \$215.9 million of net commitments. There was only one long-term financing transaction for \$10 million or 4.4 percent of total net commitments during the period. Since Benin is a small IDA country with a modest formal sector, it appears that IFC found it difficult to identify suitable private sector transactions for its core business of a long-term financing. IEG has not validated the development impact of any IFC investment projects by producing Evaluation Notes during the review period. MIGA did not make any new guarantees during this period.

## Analytic and Advisory Activities and Services

39. The CPS envisaged to use extensive analytical work to nurture policy dialogue in key sectors of the economy. Broadly, this seems to have been achieved. During the review period, the Benin program delivered a total of 20 pieces of ASAs, comprising eight items of economic and sector work (ESW) and 12 items of technical assistance (TA). The ESW work included a poverty assessment (FY15), a social capital study (FY15), a jobs assessment (FY17), and two sets of growth diagnostics policy notes – these two sets included a total of 13 notes. The TA covered a broad range of activities such as for public sector capacity building, safety nets, statistics, and cotton sector policy dialogue. The ongoing FY16 Public Investment Management and Governance Support project also contains major items of technical assistance for the strengthening of the public sector. The CLR reports that technical assistance has helped to define government programs and Bank operational work, and that the 13 policy notes served to brief the new government on key issues.



40. During the review period, IFC approved seven new advisory service (AS) projects amounting to \$4.1 million of IFC funds, and has carried out projects for SME development, the water sector, and for investment climate reforms. One AS was complementary to IFC investment operation as it supported existing IFC clients to develop SME business, while other AS projects supported PPP and helped improve the business environment. During the review period, IEG validated the ratings of the Project Completion Report (PCR) of an AS project and assigned Mostly Successful rating for Development Effectiveness.

# **Results Framework**

41. The original CPS results framework and updated at the PLR was of reasonable size and complexity in relation to the WBG program. Broadly, the results chains were logical, but had several shortcomings. In the aggregate, the PLR modifications led to a reduction in the level of ambition and a shifting of the relative weight of the indicators away from outcomes and towards stronger focus on outputs and processes. For example, indicators for Objective 2 (increased access to power services), shifted from indicators for power losses and electricity bill collection rates to indicators for transmission lines construction and adoption of lighting efficiency standards which could potentially contribute to improving access to power services but do not measure access. Some indicators under Objective 5 (enhanced business environment) would only cover some of the many important aspects for an improved investment climate, which was the stated objective. Also, some indicators were focused exclusively on the achievements of specific target areas under Bank-supported projects – as in the case of Objective 6 (improved agricultural productivity and diversification), with no clear broader program implications. Finally, there were broad objectives with a single indicator, which was insufficient to measure the stated objective (Objectives 8 and 9).

## Partnerships and Development Partner Coordination

42. Both the PLR and the CLR emphasized that the WBG has been an active partner in donor coordination and played a leading role representing the development partners with the government. According to the CLR, there has been good interaction among donors and good coordination in areas of common interest (in particular social sectors and agriculture), and the IMF and the Bank have coordinated closely on the economic reform agenda.

## Safeguards and Fiduciary Issues

43. The CLR is rather silent on environmental and social sustainability risks and impacts during implementation. Five IPF operations were closed and validated by IEG during the CPS, of which two triggered environmental and social safeguard policies. The ICRs and ICRRs for these two projects report satisfactory safeguards compliance, with adequate staffing, citizen engagement and consultations. The main weakness noted was a delay in implementation, in particular for one operation, due to ongoing municipal and presidential elections early in the implementation period, which affected the preparation, review and disclosure of safeguards instruments. No requests for investigation were submitted to the Inspection Panel during the CPS implementation period.

44. INT notes that within the Development Market Place for the African Diaspora in Europe Project a small number of grants were not verifiable, including one in Benin, illustrating more general capacity constraints in managing small grants in regional operations.

## Ownership and Flexibility

45. The CLR rightly notes that weak government commitment and weak governance undermined the policy reform program in important areas (such as public financial management) and made it more difficult to achieve reforms. As a consequence, while most of the planned program interventions were carried out as planned, the Bank delayed the disbursements under PRSC-10 and cancelled the planned PRSC-11. Even with this cancellation, there may be a question whether the PRSC program was carried out longer than fully justified. IEG's ICR Review of PRSC-8 (FY13) noted that in the presence of significant resistance to reforms and high uncertainties, a stand-alone budget support operation would have been more appropriate than a programmatic series, and that it would have been even more appropriate to have switched the planned budget support operation to a



small technical assistance project. (IEG's ICRR for the subsequent PRSC9-10 was Moderately Unsatisfactory.) The CPS had planned for the PLR to be produced 18-24 months into implementation, but the PLR was only produced on August 30, 2016 – more than four years into the period. Nonetheless, the WBG demonstrated flexibility, by extending the CPS period by one year through FY18, primarily to facilitate program responses to the then new government. The CLR notes but does not discuss this extension, which led to an overall CPS period of six years.

# WBG Internal Cooperation

46. The CPS was a partnership of the Bank, IFC and MIGA. However, the CPS program was heavily Bank-centric, with IFC mentioned in the results matrix only concerning PPPs, while the brief discussion in the text of the document described the three entities working largely along their separate lines. This picture did not change significantly at the PLR. Nonetheless, the CLR reports that the Bank and IFC have worked together on innovative PPP investments. It also states that the WBG was most effective when all its institutions work together, such as programs in water (PPPs) and SME financing. However, more upfront and proactive engagements by the Bank and IFC are necessary to identify and develop opportunities for collaboration.

## **Risk Identification and Mitigation**

47. The CPS and PLR identified and addressed appropriately the program risks, which were both external and internal. The identified external risks included that economic or policy changes in neighboring Nigeria can have a strong influence on the economy of Benin, and there were also possible regional security threats. These risks largely did not materialize during the CPS period. Internal risks included governance, limited institutional capacity, and possible shifts in budget policies. These risks materialized to some extent, but overall, the risk level has been moderate, although higher for the category "political and governance", and as flagged in the SCD, political economy issues, elite capture and governance weaknesses may be the leading constraints to growth. Bank risk management has included timely policy notes, support for civil service improvements, and measures under budget support operations including for budget and debt service management. Also, as also rightly noted in the CLR, it is important to pay close attention to program implementation issues ahead of the PLR, and that the PLR needs to be conducted in a timely manner – not late in the planned cycle as was the case for the August 2016 PLR.

## **Overall Assessment and Rating**

48. Overall, IEG rates the WBG performance as **Good**. <u>Design</u>. The CPS as designed addressed important areas for Benin's development, with an appropriate combination of lending and knowledge activities (ASA), with the latter generally linked to lending activities and policy discussions with the government. The program, while somewhat broad, had reasonable selectivity although it reflected new challenges identified in the government's latest strategy document such as youth and female employment and the reduction of gender inequalities. The program contained a combination of PforR, policy-based and investment operations, with expected annual policy-based operations to go deeper into selected reform areas to be complemented by capacity building, but the CPS underestimated the risks for such operations of weak government commitment and weak governance. The CPS was prepared before the WBG's corporate strategy spelled out the twin goals, but the program sought to address issues concerning both ending extreme poverty and supporting shared prosperity.

# Implementation.

49. At the PLR, the CPS period was also extended by one year, which led to an overall CPS period of six years in order to respond to the priorities of the new government at that time. The WBG demonstrated flexibility in this regard. During the extended CPS period, the program was implemented largely as planned, with some modifications for the DPLs, while there were changes to the results framework including the indicators that reduced the level of ambition of the program. The Benin portfolio showed mixed results. There was good interaction among donors and good coordination in areas of common interest. Overall, there were no safeguard or fiduciary issues. The



CPS had planned for the PLR to be produced 18-24 months into implementation, but it was only delivered on August 30, 2016 – more than four years into the period.

# 7. Assessment of CLR Completion Report

50. The CLR is well organized and well prepared, and it covers most important aspects. There is however no discussion of the regional operations– flagged in the CPS – and its contribution to the CPS objectives. The CLR could have discussed (and not only noted) the extension of the already long CPS period. It could also have commented on the apparent downgrading of some program ambitions at the PLR, and could have explained the reasons for an apparently huge increase in the yield for maize.

## 8. Findings and Lessons

51. The CLR presents three key lessons with which IEG agrees: (i) Weak governance and government commitment undermined the policy reform program in important areas such as public financial management, and difficult policy and institutional reforms; (ii) Investment programs targeting the poor have yielded results and have led to meaningful policy and institutional changes in the affected sectors; and (iii) The WBG has been most effective when all its institutions work together.

- 52. IEG adds the following lesson:
  - It is important to establish close coherence between program objectives and indicators, and for relevant indicators to cover the different dimensions of the objectives. In the case of Benin, the modifications at the PLR reduced the level of ambition of the program results where some indicators only covered parts of their stated objectives. In some cases, indicators were concentrated quite narrowly on process rather than on outcomes, and/or on the results from Bank projects with limited sense of how and/or when such results might be replicated more broadly in the country.



- Annex Table 1: Summary Achievements of CPS Objectives Benin
- Annex Table 2: Planned and Actual Lending for Benin, FY13-FY18
- Annex Table 3: Analytical and Advisory Work for Benin, FY13-FY18
- Annex Table 4: Trust Funds Active for Benin, FY13-FY18
- Annex Table 5: IEG Project Ratings for Benin, FY13-FY18
- Annex Table 6: IEG Project Ratings for Benin and Comparators, FY13-18
- Annex Table 7: Portfolio Status for Benin and Comparators, FY13-18
- Annex Table 8: Disbursement Ratio for Benin, FY13-FY18
- Annex Table 9: Net Disbursement and Charges for Benin, FY13-FY18
- Annex Table 10: Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid for Benin
- Annex Table 11: Economic and Social Indicators for Benin, FY13-FY16\*\*
- Annex Table 12: List of IFC Investments in Benin
- Annex Table 13: List of IFC Advisory Services in Benin
- Annex Table 14: IFC net commitment activity in Benin, FY13 FY18
- Annex Table 15: List of MIGA Projects Active in Benin, 2013-2018



# Annex Table 1: Summary Achievements of CPS Objectives - Benin

	CPS FY13-FY18: Cross-cutting (Focus Area 1): <i>Governance</i> <i>and Public Sector Capacity</i>	Actual Results	IEG Comments
<u>Major</u> Outcome Measures	(Focus Area 1): Governance and Public Sector Capacity	<ul> <li>blic sector capacity in public financial mana Various Technical Assistance (TA) such as the Poverty Diagnostics and Statistics Regional TA (P157527, FY17, <u>Activity</u> <u>Completion Summary</u> which reports on the preparation of Poverty Updates and Policy Notes for Benin); the Benin Medium-Term Debt Management Strategy (MTDS) TA (P157674, FY16); the Public Expenditure Management and Financial Accountability Report (PEMFAR) TA (P148121, FY15, <u>Report</u>); the Benin Debt Management Performance Assessment, DEMPA, TA (P163611, FY17, final <u>Report</u>) and the Benin Statistical Capacity Building Trust Fund (TF) (P154314, FY16) supported this objective.</li> <li>The lending operations that supported this objective were the Poverty Reduction Support Credit (PRSC) series 8 (P127441, FY13), 9 (P132786, FY14 and 10 (P146665, FY15); the Public Investment Management and Governance Support Project (P147014, FY16, last <u>ISR: MU</u> of December 2017).</li> <li>As indicated in IEG <u>ICRR: MS</u> for the PRSC-8, budget execution rates of priority</li> </ul>	At PLR stage the following indicators were removed: Wage bill as a % of Tax revenues Baseline (2011): 46.8 Target:(2016): < 40 Number of PEFA Indicators rated B or better. Baseline: (2012): 7 Target (2016): 15 Number of PEFA sub- indicators rated B or better. Baseline (2012): 28 Target (2016): 40 The recently approved First Fiscal Reform and Growth Credit (P160700, FY18, see <u>Program</u> <u>Document</u> ) will continue supporting reforms in public financial management. No ISR
	Indicator 2: Time required to	PRSC-8, budget execution rates of priority social expenditures reached almost 101% (compared to a target of above 90%) as of 2013. The CLR reports that the rate dropped to 81.2% in 2014 and that no IMF reports are available for 2015-2016 since the IMF did not have a program with the Government in 2015 and 2016 and did not report on this. However, the 2017 IMF Article IV Report for Benin reports under-execution of social priority spending (CFAF 55.6 billion versus a target of CFAF 85.0 billion at end-June 2017 – a 65% execution rate. Not Achieved	Indicator added at PLR
	submit national accounts to the Chamber of Accounts (months) Baseline (2012): 9 Target (2017): <6	series reports that the time required to submit national accounts to the Chamber of Accounts decreased from 9 months to less than 6 months, between 2012 and 2017. Achieved	stage.



CPS FY13-FY18: Cross-cutting (Focus Area 1): Governance and Public Sector Capacity	Actual Results	IEG Comments
Indicator 3: Unallocated percentage of budget (%) Baseline (2012): 12.4 Target (2017): <5	IEG ICRR: MU the PRSC-9 and 10 series reports that the unallocated share of budget decreased from 12.4% (2012) to 10.4% (2017). Partially Achieved	Indicator added at PLR stage.
Indicator 4: Investment budget execution rate Baseline (2016): 66.3% Target (2018): 72%	IEG ICRR: MU for the PRSC-9 and 10 series reports that important progress was made in public financial management with outcomes indicating improved budget execution. However, the ICRR dot noes report data for budget execution rate. The execution rated of 89.2% (as of end of June 2017) reported in the CLR cannot be verified based on WBG projects. The CLR also reports that data for 2018 will only be available at end of first quarter of 2019 and that consequently, it is currently not possibly to rate this indicator. Not Verified	Indicator added at PLR stage.
Indicator 5: Fonds d'Appui au Developpement des Communes (FADeC) transfers to communes (days from the published timetable) Baseline (2012): 39 Target (2016): Maximum 15	The Decentralized Community Driven Services project (P117764, FY12) and its additional financing (P146597, FY14) supported this indicator. The latest <u>ISR: S</u> (October 2017) reports that average number of days' variation from the published transfer schedules of FADeC transfers to communes decreased from 16 to 5 between December 2011 and October 2016. <b>Achieved</b>	
Indicator 6: Communes with audits and published action plans to correct any revealed deficiencies (%) Baseline (2011): 0 Target (2016): 90%	The latest <u>ISR: S</u> (October 2017) of the Decentralized Community Driven Services project (P117764, FY12) reports that, as of September 2017, 100% of the communes with up to date financial audits possess published actions plans to correct any revealed deficiencies. <b>Achieved</b>	



	CPS FY13-FY17: Focus Area 2: Sustainable Growth, Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results	IEG Comments
	2. CPS Objective: Increased acc	ess to power services indicators	
<u>Major</u> <u>Outcome</u> <u>Measures</u>	2. CPS Objective: Increased acc Indicator 1: Infrastructure for electricity distribution network established (Km) Baseline (2012): 0 Target (2017): 50 Km	ess to power services indicators The Increased Access to Modern Energy Services project (P110075, FY09) and its additional financing supported this indicator. The latest ISR: MS (January 2018) reports that 30km of transmission lines were constructed as of January 2018 between Sakete and Porto-Novo but that the construction of the 260 km transmission line (between Onigbolo and Parakou) and associated power stations have not been achieved. Partially Achieved	At PLR stage these 4 indicators were added and the following indicators were taken out: - Reduction in power losses in Benin's transmission and distribution networks (% loss) Baseline (2012): 22 Target (2016): 17 - Electricity bill collection rates (%) Baseline (2012): 60 Target (2016): 90 The 2 <sup>nd</sup> Phase of the Coastal Transmission Backbone Sub-Program of the West African Power Pool Program (P094917, FY09) supported the construction of 219km of transmission line between the Sakete transformer substation in Benin and the Togo/ Ghana boundary as of June 2016 (see ICR: U). The Energy Service Delivery Project (P079633, FY05, IEG: MU), reported in the CLR, supported the construction of 269km of distribution lines in the country, but by April
	Indicator 2: Infrastructure for electricity bill collection established Baseline (2012): 0	The latest <u>ISR: MS</u> (January 2018) of the Increased Access to Modern Energy Services project (P110075, FY09) reports that 40,500 prepayment meters were	2011, before the CPS period.



l

CPS FY13-FY17: Focus Area 2:

Annexes 20

Sustainable Growth, Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results	IEG Comments
Target (2017): 45,000 prepayment meters delivered and installation launched	Mostly Achieved	
Indicator 3: Lighting efficiency standards developed and applied Baseline (2010): 0 Target (2016): Standards for at least 2 appliances	The GEF Energy Efficiency Program (P115064, FY09) financed the component related to efficient light bulbs and air- conditioners in Benin. The latest <u>ISR: MS</u> (January 2018) of project P110075 reports that efficiency standards for Compact fluorescent light bulb (CFLs) and air conditions were developed and applied, as of June 2016. <b>Achieved</b>	
Indicator 4: Revision of the international agreement on the Beninese-Togolese Electrical Code and the law governing the Electricity Code in Benin Baseline (2010): No Target (2018): Yes	The Program Appraisal Document (PAD) for the Togo Energy Sector Support and Investment Project (P160377, FY18) reports that the Benin-Togo electricity code was amended several times to remove the single buyer provision that gives <i>Communauté Electrique du Bénin</i> (CEB), the Benin-Togo Generation and Transmission Power Utility, the sole right to buy electricity from independent power producers (IPPs) in the two countries and that amendments were ratified in 2015 (see Togo National Assembly information). No other WBG document reports a revision to the international agreement and the law governing the electricity code in Benin. However, information retrieved from CEB indicates that the Beninese-Togolese Electrical Code was revised to 1) open production to IPPs, 2) confirm CEB as a single energy transporter and buyer; 3) authorize access to energy distribution network to third parties and to 4) modify the legal framework for the creation of the National Regulation Authority and for the preparation of the National Electricity codes. Partially Achieved	In 2015, the Electricity sector Regulation Authority (ARE, for Autorité de Régulation du secteur de l'Electricité) was created (see the <u>February, 27<sup>th</sup></u> <u>2015 decree</u> ). The CLR reports that ARE is not operational yet. No information was found to confirm that, as reported in the CLR, the review of the Law governing electricity code in Benin is pending (see Benin's <u>Ministry of</u> <u>Energy communique</u> ).
3. CPS Objective: Improved tran <u>Indicator 1:</u> Port dwell time in Cotonou (days) Passeline (2012): 21.6 days	The ASA Customs Assessment Trade Toolkit (P127439, FY14, <u>final report</u> ) and	At PLR the target was changed from 10 days
Baseline (2012): 21.6 days Target (2018): 16 days	the Trade Policy Note prepared on the Port	(2016).



CPS FY13-FY17: Focus Area 2: Sustainable Growth, Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results	IEG Comments
	of Cotonou in July 2013 supported this objective. The Abidjan-Lagos Trade and Transport Facilitation Project (P096407, FY10) also supported this objective. IEG I <u>CRR: MS</u> reports the implementation of a Single Window (see IEG comment) to reduce border crossing time (fully operational in 2013) and that Cotonou port dwell time was reduced from 19 days to 14 days as of June 2017. Achieved	The CLR reports the following baseline/target: <i>Baseline (2009): 19 days</i> <i>Target (2017): 15 days</i> which differ from the target and baseline set at PLR. Before the CPS period, in 2009, the IFC supported the development of a public- private partnership (PPP, see <u>project snapshot</u> and <u>presentation</u> ) to assist the Government meet its obligations under the concession agreement with a private operator to develop and operate a container terminal for the Port of Cotonou . In addition MIGA, in 2011, financed consulting services ( <u>project 9392</u> , USD 8.9 million guarantee) to help set up a Single Window supporting reduction in port dwell times and information system integration.
Indicator 2: Border crossing time of trucks/ merchandise along corridor (hours) Krake- Seme: Baseline (2009): 48 hours Target (2018): 40	The Abidjan-Lagos Trade and Transport Facilitation Project (P096407, FY10) supported this indicator. IEG <u>ICRR: MS</u> reports that border crossing time of trucks- merchandise along the Krake corridor decreased from 48 hours to 31 hours as of June 2017. <b>Achieved</b> .	Indicator 2 was added at PLR stage. The CLR reports the following target which differs from the target set at PLR stage: <i>Target (2017): 38 hours</i> The CLR also reports progress for the following indicator dropped at PLR: <u>Indicator 3 :</u> Roadblocks per 100 kilometers along the Abidjan-Lagos corridor along the Benin segment



 CPS FY13-FY17: Focus Area 2: Sustainable Growth, Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results	IEG Comments
 Lingio finem		Baseline: 7 (2009) Target: 3 (2017). The ICRR: MS for project P096407 reported that roadblocks/100km decreased to 3.7.
4. CPS Objective: Increased acc	ess to ICT services	<u>.</u>
Indicator 1: Retail price of internet services (per Mbit/s per month, in US\$) Baseline (2010): US\$125 Target (2016): US\$80	The E-government project (P113370, FY10) and the Benin West Africa Communications Infrastructure Program, WARCIP APL 1C (P130184, FY13) supported this objective. IEG <u>ICRR: MS</u> for the E-government project reports that the retail price of internet services (including broadband) dropped from USD 325 to USD 50 between 2010 and 2015.	The CLR reports that the retail price per MBits/s per month is between USD 40 and USD 80, depending on the technicality used.
	IEG <u>ICRR: MS</u> for the WARCIP APL 1C reports that retail price of internet services dropped to USD 30 per Mbit/s per month, as of June 2017, after the arrival of the Africa Coast to Europe (ACE) submarine cable in 2016. <b>Achieved</b>	
Indicator 2: Access to internet services (number of subscribers per 100 people) Baseline (2011): 1.80 Target (2016): 4.20	IEG: MS for the WARCIP APL 1C reports that access to internet services increased from 1.80 subscribers/100people to 25.17 subscribers/ 100 people at project closure (June 2017). Achieved	IEG I <u>CRR: MS</u> for the E- government project also reports that access to internet services (individuals using the internet) reached about 3% of the population at project closure (June 2015) compared to, as reported in the CLR, 12%, in 2016, and according to the <u>World</u> <u>Development Indicators</u> .
5. CPS Objective: Enhanced bus	iness environment	l
 Indicator 1: Number of new SMEs Registered Baseline (2012): 0 Target (2016): 3,000	The Competitiveness and Integrated Growth Opportunity Project (P104881, FY08) supported this Objective. The latest ISR: S (December 2017) reports that 3,292 new businesses were formalized under the "entreprenant" regime, as of December 2017.	An Impact Evaluation of the Entreprenant Status was carried out by the WBG (AAA P153242, FY16, see <u>April 2017</u> <u>Brief</u> and the <u>Policy</u> <u>Research Working</u> <u>Paper</u> ).



CPS FY13-FY17: Focus Area 2: Sustainable Growth, Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results	IEG Comments
	<ul> <li>99 ICT SMEs were also established, as of June 2015, through support from the E-government project (P113370, FY10, ICR: MS).</li> <li>In addition, the Cross-Border Tourism and Competitiveness Project (P149117, FY16, latest ISR: S, March 2018) supports MSME expansion but does not provide indicators related to their registration.</li> <li>As reported in the CLR, the IFC, through the Benin Investment Climate Program (FY13), supported the country in simplifying legal regime – in the frame of Benin's participation in the Organization for the Harmonization of Business Law in Africa (OHADA) to encourage MSMEs to join the formal sector and the launching of the entreprenant status, which took place in 2015 (see IFC Brief).</li> </ul>	The CLR also reported that 10,324 SMEs, including registered <i>Entreprise personne</i> <i>physique</i> , benefited from WBG programs and that 2,000 SMEs were formally registered using the streamlined registration process of GUFE ( <i>Guichet Unique</i> <i>de Formalisation des</i> <i>Entreprises</i> , business registration one-stop- shop), and 495 MSMEs were registered at CGA ( <i>Centres de Gestion</i> <i>Agrée</i> , a semi-private organization specializing in tax filling and payment support). This information could not be verified by IEG.
Indicator 2: Number of days to enforce a contract Baseline (2012): 825 Target (2016): 650	The CLR reports that this activity is not directly reflected in portfolio results but that the expected reforms of the Tribunal de Commerce (Court), supported by the PRSC series, should positively influence the time for contract enforcement as well as the PPP law to be approved by the parliament – <u>IEG ICRR: MU</u> for the PRSC-9 and 10 series reports that the PPP Law was not adopted. The ICRR does not report on progress for contract enforcement. Finally, as reported in Doing Business reports, the number of days to enforce a contract decreased from 795 (see <u>2012</u> <u>report</u> ) to 750 in 2017 (see <u>2017 report</u> ). <b>Not Achieved</b>	At PLR stage, this indicator was slightly changed from the original indicator: <i>Number of days to</i> <i>enforce a contract (and</i> <i>cost as % of claim):</i> <i>Baseline (2012): 825</i> <i>(64.7%)</i> <i>Target (2016): 650 (50%)</i> <u>Management ICR : MU</u> reports that a Competition Act was prepared and submitted to the National Assembly and that a Ministerial Order identifying the Registry of Commerce and Credit at the Court of First Instance, in Cotonou, as the sole registry for recording all collateral and leasing arrangements was adopted.



CPS FY13-FY17: Focus Area 2: Sustainable Growth, Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results	IEG Comments
Indicator 3: Number of approved innovative PPP investments in critical service delivery areas (supported by WBG) Baseline: (2012): 0 Target (2016): 2	<ul> <li>IEG ICRR: MU for the PRSC-9 and 10 series reports that two PPP arrangements or contracts were concluded as of December 2016.</li> <li>As reported in the CLR, four others PPPs were concluded for rural water services, over three sites (Gouounou, Sakété, Zogbodomey) as part of the joint WB and IFC support by the Water and Sanitation Program (WSP); the IFC advised on a PPP transaction in 2012 and four concession agreements were signed in 2014 with an estimated total cost of US\$1.1 million (see IFC PPP Series and WBG-IFC Case Study report). The IFC also concluded PPP investments for the Port of Cotonou terminal (see IFC PPP Series), and in the health sector (Benin Health PPP, FY12).</li> </ul>	Feasibility studies for PPP projects were in the process of finalization, including for the new airport, three dams and the dry ports. The December 2017 <u>ISR: S</u> of the Competitiveness and Integrated Growth Opportunity Project (P104881, FY08) reports that the project supports PPP project preparation and that 5 feasibility studies for government priority PPP projects (including Glo-Djigbé new airport, Vossa and Beterou Dams and two new dry ports have been elaborated).
6. CPS Objective: Improved agric	cultural productivity and diversification	I
Indicator 1: Average yield (tons/ha) of food crops (rice, maize) in project area Baseline (2011): 4.0 tons/ha (rice): 1.2 tons/ha (maize) Target (2016): 15% increase	The Agricultural Productivity and Diversification Project (P115886, FY11) supported this Objective. The latest <u>ISR: S</u> (March 2018) reports that, between 2011 and December 2017, the average yield of rice increased from 4 tons/ha to 4.53 tons/ha (13.25% increase) and that the average yields of maize increased from 1.20 tons/ha to 2.20 tons/ha (83.3% increase). <b>Mostly Achieved</b>	Various TA supported the agriculture sector such as: - the Benin Agricultural Diversification (P115822, FY13, <u>final</u> <u>report</u> ) - the Benin Cotton Sector Policy Dialogue (P154104, FY14, <u>report</u> ) - the Review of Land
Indicator 2: Average yield (tons/ha) of cash crops (pineapple and cashew) in project area Baseline (2011): 50 tons/ha pineapple; 0.45 tons/ha cashew Target (2016): 15% increase	The latest <u>ISR: S</u> (March 2018) of project P115886 reports that between 2011 and December 2017, the average yield of pineapple increased from 50 tons/ha to 60 tons/ha (20% increase) and that the average yields of cashew increased from 0.45 tons/ha to 0.62 tons/ha (38% increase). <b>Achieved</b>	Tenure Policy (P161412, FY16, <u>final</u> <u>report</u> ) The recently approved First Fiscal Reform and Growth Credit (P160700, FY18, see <u>Program</u> <u>Document</u> ) has one prior action related to the creation of decentralized, crop-specific development agencies to promote the development



CPS FY13-FY17: Focus Area 2 Sustainable Growth, Competitiveness and Employment	: Actual Results	IEG Comments
		of value chains (prioritized value chains include cotton, maize, rice, cassava pineapple and cashew) and boost productivity.
		As reported in the CLR, the Ministry of Agriculture was strengthened: it currently monitors, through the Ministry's Monitoring and Evaluation System, 100% of its program (baseline was 55% in 2011) and the agriculture sector program budget execution was 79% in 2017 (compared to 45% in 2011) as reported in the September 2017 <u>ISR:</u> <u>S</u> of Project P115886.
Indicator 3: Quantity exported of cashew and pineapples in project area (t) Baseline (2011): 20,000 tons (pineapples); 25,000 t/ha cashew Target (2016): 20% increase (i.e 24,000 tons (pineapples); 30,000 t/ha cashew)	P115886 reports that between 2011 and December 2017, the quantity of exported pineapples increased from 20,000 tons to 74,000 tons (270% increase) and that the quantity of exported cashews increased from 25,000 tons to 142,000 tons (468% increase). Achieved	This represents a diversification relative to cotton exports, whose share in total exports decreased from 29.5% to 25.2 % in the same period. <u>IEG ICRR: MU</u> for the PRSC-9 and 10 series reports that the value of non-cotton agricultural exports increased from CFAF 65 billion to CAF 162.94 billion between 2012 and 2017 but that it is unclear how this result can be attributed to the series.
Indicator 4: Share of project beneficiaries using improved technologies supported by project Baseline (2011): 0 Target (2018): 80%	The latest <u>ISR: S</u> (March 2018) of project P115886 reports that the share of project beneficiaries using improved technologies disseminated though the project increased from 73.40% (March 2011) to 80% (June 2017). Achieved	This indicator was added at PLR stage.



Annexes 26

CPS FY13-FY17: Fo Sustainable C Competitivene Employm	Frowth, ess and	Actual Results	IEG Comments
		esource management practices	
Indicator 1: Scores f METT for Pendjari M Baseline (2011): 85 Target (2017): 93	lational Park Ma GE sup (De rep Pro Effe the bet	e Support to Protected Areas nagement Project (P122419, FY11) and F related project (P115963, FY11) oport this indicator. The latest <u>ISR: MS</u> ecember 2017) of project P122419 orts that the score for the GEF otected Areas – Management ectiveness Tracking Tool (PA-MET) for Pendjari Park increased from 85 to 94 ween 2011 and November 2017. hieved	
Indicator 2: Commun and coastal biodive including wetlands demarcated and pro Baseline (2011): 0 Target (2016): 3	rsity sites, Bio areas are sup otected rep Bio wer site Oui Agu the wer con dec	e Community-Based Coastal Marine diversity Project (P071579, FY08) oported this indicator. IEG <u>ICRR: U</u> orts that three Community-Based diversity Conservation Areas (CBCA) re established in biodiversity priority es (Vodounto in the Commune of idah; Bamezoun in the Commune of uégués/Dangbo and Togbin-Adounko in Commune of Abomey-Calavi). They re created and demarcated under nmunal order and adopter by ministerial cree on October 2013. hieved	The CLR reports that 4 sites were demarcated and protected in Bouche du Roy, Vodounto, Togbin-Adounko, Bymins and that 4 other sites are in progress.
Indicator 3: Number threatened species the baseline study of biodiversity which I from conservation of Baseline (2011): 30 Target (2018): 35	identified in Ma of its a penefits sup neasures (De of t bas fror fror	e Forests and Adjacent Land nagement Project (P069896, FY06) and additional financing (P132431, FY13) oported this Indicator. The latest <u>ISR: S</u> ecember 2017) reports that the number hreatened species identified in the seline study on biodiversity that benefit n conservation measures increased n 30 to 35, as of November 2017. hieved	At PLR stage the baseline and target were changed from the original: <i>Baseline (2011): 5</i> <i>Target (2016): 20</i>
<u>Indicator 4:</u> Rehabili degraded of forests Baseline (2011): 0 Target (2016): 7,700	(ha) prohection hection Hectares Nov	e latest <u>ISR: S</u> (December 2017) of ject P069896 reports that the 8, 059 ctares of forests were rehabilitated, as of vember 2017. hieved	This indicator was added at PLR stage. The CLR reports the following baselines, not reported at PLR stage: <i>Baseline (2006): 0</i> <i>Baseline AF (2012)</i> <i>5,800</i>



Annexes 27

CPS FY13-FY17: Focus Area 2: Sustainable Growth, Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results	IEG Comments
8. CPS Objective: Labor Skills De	evelopment for Youth	
Indicator 1: Youth supported by the project receiving professional certification Baseline (2014): 0 Target (2018): 2,500	Two ASA supported this objective: the Tertiary Education Capacity and Training Assessment (P119788, FY13) and the Gender and Youth Employment (P147780, FY17). The Youth Employment Project (P132667, FY14) also supported this indicator. The latest <u>ISR: MS</u> (April 2018) reports that the number of youth supported by the project receiving the <i>Certificat de Qualification</i> <i>Professionnelle</i> reached 1,870 people as of October 2017. <b>Partially Achieved</b>	At PLR stage this indicator was modified from the original indicator: Number of youth employed in their area of training following support from the project Baseline (2013) 0 Target (2016) 3000

	CPS FY13-FY18: Focus Area 3: Improving Service Delivery and Social Inclusion	Actual Results	IEG Comments					
	9. CPS Objective: Improved floo	9. CPS Objective: Improved flood protection in urban areas						
<u>Major</u> <u>Outcome</u> <u>Measures</u>	Indicator 1: Drainage network rehabilitated/constructed in the targeted municipalities (Kilometers) Baseline (2011): 0 Target (2018): 22 (updated indicator)	The Global Index Insurance Facility (GIIF) Regulatory and Policy Capacity Building TA (P130676, FY16) and the Emergency Urban Environment Project (P113145, FY11) and its additional financing projects (P148628, FY14 and P154601, FY15) supported this Objective. Management ICR: S for project P113145 reports that 43.40 km of drainage network were rehabilitated as of October 2017. The Cities Support Project (P122950, FY13) also supported this objective. The latest ISR: S (December 2017) reports that 62.50km of drainage and anti-erosion flood reduction works were rehabilitated or constructed as of November 2017. Achieved	The CLR reports the following target which differs from the PLR target: <i>Target (2018): 21</i> (updated indicator) This objective was renamed at PLR: its original name was " Leveraging Environmental and Urban Sanitation Improvements". At PLR stage, the following indicators were taken out: - % reduction of households vulnerable to flooding in the targeted municipalities as a result of improved infrastructure Baseline (2011): 70 % Target (2016): 30 % - Number of alerts on flood					



CPS FY13-FY18: Focus Area 3: Improving Service Delivery and Social Inclusion	Actual Results	IEG Comments
		risks per year using the Flood Early Warning System on the Oueme River put in place by the Benin Emergency Urban Environment Project Baseline (2011): 0 Target (2015): 20 alerts
10. CPS Objective: Increased acc	ess to safety nets	1
Indicator 1: Communities implementing safety nets program Baseline (2011): 0 Target (2017): 120	The Benin Poverty Assessment (P118054, FY15, <u>Report</u> ) and the Building a Common National Targeting and Registry System for Safety Net and Health Interventions in Benin TA (P146298, FY16, see <u>final report</u> ) supported this objective. The Decentralized Community Driven Services Project (P117764, FY12) and its additional financing (P146597, FY14) also supported this Objective. The latest <u>ISR: S</u> (October 2017) reports that 125 communities were implementing safety nets programs, as of September 2017. <b>Achieved</b>	At PLR stage these two indicators were added and the following indicator was taken out: Temporary employment created in labor-intensive public works safety nets projects Baseline (2012): 0 Target (2016): 1.3 million person days
Indicator 2: Beneficiaries of safety nets programs (number) Baseline (2011): 0 Target (2017): 12,000	The latest <u>ISR: S</u> (October 2017) of the Decentralized Community Driven Services Project reports 12,933 beneficiaries of social safety net programs, as of September 2017. Achieved	
11. CPS Objective: Improved acco	ess to primary education	1
Indicator 1: Gross Primary Intake Rate for girls in deprived districts targeted by project support (%) Baseline (2011): 100.5% Target (2018): Substantive increase* (*accurate estimate of baseline, actuals and target depends on forthcoming census data)	The Benin Education Sector TA (P153478, FY17) and the Global Partnership for Education program (P129600, FY14) support this Objective. The latest <u>ISR: MS</u> (December 2017) reports that gross primary intake rate for girls in the deprived districts reached 115.20%, as of December 2017 (15% increase). Achieved	The CLR reported the following target that was not reported at PLR stage: <i>Target (2018): 117%</i> ( <i>Global partnership for</i> <i>Education June 2017 ISR</i> At PLR, this indicator was changed from the following: <i>Percentage of female</i> <i>students in primary</i> <i>school (gender ratio)</i> <i>Baseline (2011/12): 47%</i> <i>Target (2016/17): 50%</i>



CPS FY13-FY18: Focus Area 3: Improving Service Delivery and Social Inclusion	Actual Results	IEG Comments
Indicator 2: Primary education completion rate in targeted districts Baseline (2011): 40.40% (Girls 34.3) Target (2018): Substantive increase* (*accurate estimate of baseline,	The Global Partnership for Education program (P129600, FY14) supports this Objective. The latest <u>ISR: MS</u> (December 2017) reports that primary education completion rate in targeted districts reached 54.40% (35% increase), and 50.90% for girls (33% increase) as of December 2017. <b>Achieved</b>	The CLR reported the following target that was not reported at PLR stage: <i>Target (2018): 56.50%</i> and which is the project's target. At PLR, this indicator was changed from the following: <i>Primary completion rate</i> (%) disaggregated by gender Baseline (2011/12): Total 71.5, Girls 65.8 Target (2016/17): Overall 85, Girls 81
12. CPS Objective: Improved acces	ss to health and nutrition services	
additional children (under 1) in project target areas completely immunized Baseline (2011): 0	The Health System Performance Project (P113202, FY10) supported this indicator. Management ICR: MS reports that the number of children immunized reached 380,000 as of June 2017. Achieved	At PLR, the baseline/target were changed from: <i>Baseline (2011): 170,000</i> <i>Target (2016): 230,000</i>
communes engaged in scaling up community health, food and nutrition security interventions for women and children under five Baseline: (2012): 0 Target (2018): 7	The Multi-Sector Food, Health Nutrition Project (P143652, FY14) supported this indicator. The latest <u>ISR: S</u> (November 2017) reports that 10 communes were involved in scaling-up community health, food and nutrition security interventions for women and children under 5, as of November 2017, and that new contracts are almost completer for 11 new communes. <b>Achieved</b>	Other projects contributed to Objective 12: - The Building stewardship capacity for food and nutrition policies and programs Trust Fund (P131975, FY14) - The Nutrition Sensitive Agriculture and Capacity Building of Small &
months who benefit from a minimum package of monthly community-based growth promotion activities in targeted communes Baseline (2013): 0 Target (2018): 20%	The Benin Community Nutrition (P124191, FY11) and the Multi-Sector Food, Health Nutrition Project (P143652, FY14) supported this indicator. The latest <u>ISR: S</u> (May 2018) of project P143652 reports that 82.47% of the children 0-23 months benefited from a minimum package of monthly community- based growth promotion activities in targeted communes as of April 2018.	Marginal Farmers Project (P155822, FY16) - The Impact Evaluation of Health Result-Based Financing in Benin (P125066, FY17) At PLR stage the following indicators were removed: - Rate of assisted



CPS FY13-FY18: Focus Area 3: Improving Service Delivery and Social Inclusion	Actual Results	IEG Comments
	The ISR also reports that the coverage of children 0-23 months expanded to 40 communes. Achieved	among all pregnant women Baseline (2011): 84% (DHS) Target (2016: 92% - Number of communes engaged in scaling up community health, food and nutrition security interventions for women and children under five Baseline: (2012): 0 Target (2016): 7 - Number of community workers (% of whom are female) trained in community health and nutrition Baseline (2012): 0 Target (2016): 2,000 (at least 50% women)



# Annex Table 2: Planned and Actual Lending for Benin, FY13-FY18

Project ID	Project name	Proposed FY	Approval FY	Closing FY	Proposed Amount	Approved IDA Amount
Proj	ect Planned Under CPS/PLR FY13-18				CPS	
P122950	BJ-Cities Support Project	2013	2013	2020	60	60
P127441	BJ-PRSC 8-Eighth Poverty Reduction Suppo	2013	2013	2014	30	30
P132431	BJ-Forest & Adjacent Land Mgmt Addit Fin	2013	2013	2018	2	2
P130184	WARCIP APL 1C - Benin	2013	2013	2017	12	35
P132667	BJ-Youth Employment (FY14)	2014	2014	2018	35	35
P132786	BJ PRSC 9 Poverty Reduction Support Cdt.	2014	2014	2015	30	20
P143652	BJ Food, Health and Nutrition Project	2014	2014	2020	30	28
P126974	African Centers of Excellence	2014	2014	2020	5	8
P146665	PRSC-10	2015	2015	2016	20	20
DROPPED	Regional Adjarala Hydropower	2015			20	
P154601	Benin Emergency Urban Env. 2nd Add. Fin.	2016	2015	2018	30	40
DROPPED	PRSC-11	2016			20	
P147014	BJ-Public Investment Management and Gov	2017	2016	2022		30
P149117	Benin Cross Border Tourism & Competitive	2015	2016	2022	50	50
P156738	Benin Water and Urban Septage Management	2017	2017	2023		68
P160029	PADA Additional Financing	2017	2017	2021		45
P161015	ESIP	2017	2017	2024		60
P164186	BJ-Rural Water Supply Universal Access	2017	2018	2024		220
P160700	First Fiscal Reform and Growth Credit	2017	2018	2019		40
	Total Planned				344	791
Project ID	Project name	Proposed FY	Approval FY	Closing FY	Proposed Amount	Approved IDA Amount
Unpla	anned Projects during the CPS Period					
P146597	BJ-PSDCC Additional Financing		2014	2018		30
P148628	Benin Emergency Urban Env. Addit. Fin.		2014	2018		6.4
	Total Unplanned					36.4
On-goi	ng Projects during the CPS/PLR Period		Approval FY	Closing FY		Approved IDA Amount
P079633	BJ-Energy Srvc Delivery APL (FY05)		2005	2013		45
P094917	3A-WAPP APL 1 (CTB Phase 2) Project		2006	2016		15
P093806	3A-Niger Basin Water Resources		2008	2018		9
P104881	Compet & Integrated Growth Opportunity		2008	2018		25
P108583	3A-AirTransportPhase II-B APL(FY09)		2009	2013		16
P110075	BJ-Increased Access to Energy SIL		2009	2018		70
P096407	3A-Abidjan-Lagos Trade & Transp. Facilit		2010	2017		75
	+			2017		22.8
P113202	BJ-Health System Performance proj (FY10)		2010	2017		22.0



P112456	Regional Trade Facilitation Project II	2011	2015	7.5
P113145	Benin Emergency Urban Env. Pr.	2011	2018	50
P115886	BJ: Agricultural Diversification	2011	2021	31
P122065	West Africa Agric Prod Progrm (WAAPP-1C)	2011	2020	16.8
P122419	BJ-Support to Protected Areas Manag. Pro	2011	2018	5
P117764	BJ-Decentralized Community Driven Servic	2012	2018	46
	Total On-going			449

*Source*: CPS and PLR, WB Business Intelligence Table 2a.1, 2a.4 and 2a.7 as of 05/30/18 \*LIR: Latest internal rating. MU: Moderately Unsatisfactory. MS: Moderately Satisfactory. S: Satisfactory. HS: Highly Satisfactory.

Proj ID	Economic and Sector Work	RAS	Fiscal year	Output Type
P127439	Benin: Customs Assessment Trade Toolkit	No	FY14	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P132801	BJ Policy Notes - Tax Base/Public Invest	No	FY14	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P118054	BJ-Poverty Assessment	No	FY15	Poverty Assessment (PA)
P132787	BJ Social Capital Study	No	FY15	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P145228	Benin: DTIS Update	No	FY15	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P151582	Growth Diagnostics Policy Notes	No	FY16	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P151653	Benin Jobs Assessment	No	FY17	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P157158	Growth Diagnostics Policy Notes	No	FY17	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
Proj ID	Technical Assistance	RAS	Fiscal year	Output Type
P127410	BJ-Safety nets TA	No	FY13	Technical Assistance
P129262	Benin Use of Country System	No	FY14	Technical Assistance
P132114	Capacity Building for PPP and SS-DPSP	No	FY15	Technical Assistance
P143811	Public Sector Capacity Building	No	FY15	Technical Assistance
P146739	Benin Trade facilitation TA	No	FY15	Technical Assistance
P148121	Benin PEMFAR	No	FY15	Technical Assistance
P152764	BJ- Statistics TA	No	FY15	Technical Assistance
P146298	BJ Safety Nets Systems TA	No	FY16	Technical Assistance
P152068	Support to ARMP for eprocurement	No	FY16	Technical Assistance
P154104	Benin Cotton Sector Policy Dialogue	No	FY16	Technical Assistance
P157674	Benin MTDS	No	FY16	Technical Assistance
P154359	Infrastructure Competitiveness	No	FY17	Technical Assistance

# Annex Table 3: Analytical and Advisory Work for Benin, FY13-FY18

Source: WB Business Intelligence 05/30/18



# Annex Table 4: Trust Funds Active for Benin, FY13-FY18

Project ID	Project name	TF ID	Approval FY	Closing FY	Approved Amount
P069896	Forests and Adjacent Lands Management Project	TF 57165	2007	2013	6,000,000
P071579	Community-Based Coastal and Marine Biodiversity Management Project	TF 91739	2009	2014	4,300,000
P113202	Health System Performance	TF 96654	2010	2017	11,000,000
P110075	Increased Access to Modern Energy	TF 94664	2010	2016	1,818,182
P115886	Agricultural Productivity and Diversification	TF 99692	2011	2015	15,000,000
P115963	Support to Protected Areas Management	TF 99643	2011	2018	1,900,000
P124191	Benin Community Nutrition	TF 97920	2011	2016	2,797,781
P119962	BEIA-Promotion of Social Biofuels in Benin	TF 96657	2011	2014	90,155
P122775	Implementation of AML/CFT for Benin	TF 98975	2011	2014	427,985
P116598	SUPPORT TO APICULTURAL PROMOTION PROJECT	TF 10242	2012	2016	2,565,316
P124077	Institutional Strengthening of the Ministry of Development	TF 99838	2012	2015	481,750
P110075	Increased Access to Modern Energy	TF 99823	2012	2014	2,000,000
P131051	Benin AF Forest and Adjacent Land Management	TF 14109	2013	2018	5,555,556
P131975	Building stewardship capacity for food and nutrition policies and programs	TF 14714	2013	2017	745,817
P129600	Benin Global Partnership for Education Program	TF 16846	2014	2016	24,000,000
P129600	Benin Global Partnership for Education Program	TF 16842	2014	2018	18,300,000
P154314	Benin Statistical Capacity Building	TF A4794	2017	2019	264,040
	Total				97,246,582

*Source*: Client Connection as of 05/30/18 \*\* IEG Validates RETF that are 5M and above

## Annex Table 5: IEG Project Ratings for Benin, FY13-FY18

Exit FY	Proj ID	Project name	Total Evaluated (\$M) *	IEG Outcome	IEG Risk to DO
2013	P079633	BJ-Energy Srvc Delivery APL (FY05)	45.9	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2014	P071579	BJ-GEF ComBased Coastal Marine Biodiv.	4.6	UNSATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2014	P127441	BJ-PRSC 8-Eighth Poverty Reduction Suppo	30.5	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2015	P113370	eBenin Project	14.5	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2017	P130184	WARCIP APL 1C - Benin	33.9	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	Not Rated
2015	P132786	BJ PRSC 9 Poverty Reduction Support Cdt.	20.0	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2016	P146665	BJ PRSC 10 Poverty Reduction Support Cdt.	20.0	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
		Total	169.4		

Source: WB Business Intelligence 06/09/18



### Annex Table 6: IEG Project Ratings for Benin and Comparators, FY13-18

Region	Total Evaluated (\$M)	Total Evaluated (No)	Outcome % Sat (\$)	Outcome % Sat (No)	RDO % Moderate or Lower Sat (\$)	RDO % Moderate or Lower Sat (No)
Benin	169.4	7.0	47.0	43.0	23.0	17.0
AFR	20,083.9	372.0	76.0	67.8	34.4	30.8
World	104,937.1	1,223.0	84.6	72.9	53.7	43.3

Source: WB Business Intelligence 06/09/18, IEG Calculations

1)The total evaluated amount is understated because it does not include the net commitments of trust fund projects evaluated by IEG.

2) Data for 2018 is as of June 2018.

\* Refer to Annex Table 5 for IEG project ratings.

#### 2013 2015 2017 2018 Fiscal year 2014 2016 Ave FY13-18 Benin # Proi 11.0 13.0 12.0 13.0 14.0 11.0 12.3 # Proj At Risk 3.0 2.0 1.0 1.0 2.0 1.0 1.7 % Proj At Risk 27.3 15.4 8.3 7.7 14.3 9.1 13.7 Net Comm Amt 366.8 440.6 465.6 525.6 665.8 720.3 530.8 Comm At Risk 126.0 79.4 25.0 54.4 65.0 30.0 63.3 % Commit at Risk 18.0 5.4 9.8 4.2 13.7 34.4 10.3 Africa # Proi 403.0 438.0 458.0 474.0 502.0 539.0 469.0 # Proj At Risk 106.0 115.0 111.0 124.0 135.0 139.0 121.7 % Proj At Risk 26.3 26.3 24.2 26.2 26.9 25.8 25.9 40,799.0 46,621.7 51,993.5 56,089.8 61,022.2 54,150.4 Net Comm Amt 68,375.9 Comm At Risk 13,938.0 16,171.5 15,372.2 18,235.0 19,934.3 20,907.8 17,426.5 % Commit at Risk 34.2 34.7 29.6 32.5 32.7 30.6 32.4 World 1,402.0 # Proj 1,337.0 1,386.0 1,398.0 1,459.0 1,504.0 1,414.3 # Proj At Risk 339.0 329.0 339.0 369.0 342.7 336.0 344.0 % Proj At Risk 25.4 23.7 24.2 24.0 23.6 24.5 24.2 Net Comm Amt 169,430.6 183,153.9 191,907.8 207,350.0 212,502.9 222,662.7 197,834.6 Comm At Risk 39,638.0 39,748.6 44,430.7 42,715.1 50,837.9 50,820.9 44,698.5 % Commit at Risk 23.4 21.7 23.2 20.6 23.9 22.8 22.6

### Annex Table 7: Portfolio Status for Benin and Comparators, FY13-18

Source: WB Business Intelligence 05/31/18

Note: Only IBRD and IDA Agreement Type are included



Fiscal Year	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	Overall Result
Benin							
Disbursement Ratio	9.4	27.9	25.7	43.8	28.6	14.8	24.2
Inv Disb in FY	24.8	83.9	70.9	107.2	61.4	51.4	399.6
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY	265.0	300.9	275.3	244.7	215.0	347.9	1,648.8
AFR							
Disbursement Ratio	22.1	22.8	24.2	19.4	20.9	15.8	20.6
Inv Disb in FY	5,299.0	5,733.5	6,065.1	5,161.2	5,786.0	4,988.0	33,032.7
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY	23,950.4	25,191.6	25,054.6	26,631.7	27,741.7	31,630.2	160,200.2
World							
Disbursement Ratio	19.8	20.2	21.2	18.8	19.8	16.6	19.3
Inv Disb in FY	19,050.0	19,414.2	20,317.9	19,401.1	20,568.5	17,710.8	116,462.5
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY	96,038.8	96,254.9	95,816.0	103,447.2	103,705.0	106,971.0	602,232.8

## Annex Table 8: Disbursement Ratio for Benin, FY13-FY18

\* Calculated as IBRD/IDA Disbursements in FY / Opening Undisbursed Amount at FY. Restricted to Lending Instrument Type = Investment.

Source: WB Business Intelligence 05/31/18

Period	Disb. Amt.	Repay Amt.	Net Amt.	Charges	Fees	Net Transfer
FY13	78.5	1.2	77.3	-	3.2	74.2
FY14	151.3	1.4	149.9	-	3.9	146.0
FY15	115.7	2.7	113.0	-	4.4	108.6
FY16	143.9	4.2	139.7	-	5.1	134.6
FY17	72.2	5.0	67.3	-	5.7	61.6
FY18	102.1	6.5	95.6	-	6.4	89.2
Report Total	663.8	20.9	642.9	-	28.6	614.3

## Annex Table 9: Net Disbursement and Charges for Benin, FY13-FY18

Source: World Bank Client Connection as of 05/31/18



Development Partners	2013	2014	2015	2016
All Donors, Total	660.2	599.32	430.14	492.89
DAC Countries, Total	254.03	252.51	184.17	221.93
Australia	0.31	0.05	0.03	0.04
Austria	0.04	0.04	0.03	0.06
Belgium	24.15	21.15	19.56	19.94
Canada	4.8	5.43	6.63	7.98
Czech Republic	0.03	0.02	0.01	0.01
Denmark	16.7	-4.64	-0.68	(
Finland	0.16	0.11	0.07	0.04
France	37.89	36.51	27.86	27.62
Germany	50.97	77.71	38.38	39.84
Hungary			0	(
Ireland	0.16	0.15	0.03	0.02
Italy	1.91	1.42	2.37	1.34
Japan	33.52	10.2	12.9	10.92
Korea	0.1	0.1	0.12	0.23
Luxembourg	1.32	1.44	1.04	0.98
Netherlands	37.78	42.58	17.75	29.73
Norway			0.02	0.02
Poland			0.01	
Slovak Republic	0.02	0.02	0.01	
Spain	0.62	0.61	0.16	0.60
Sweden	0.89	0.86	0.65	0.8
Switzerland	19.05	19.59	21.61	23.49
United States	23.62	39.17	35.62	58.14
Multilaterals, Total	397.84	336.96	239.83	267.8
EU Institutions	78.95	72.18	48.27	47.78
International Monetary Fund, Total	15.19	8.6	-8.42	-9.6
IMF (Concessional Trust Funds)	15.19	8.6	-8.42	-9.6
Regional Development Banks, Total	90.13	54.33	40.72	50.65
African Development Bank, Total	82.77	50.1	31.92	47.79
African Development Bank [AfDB]	0.03	0.03	0	0.04
African Development Fund [AfDF]	82.74	50.08	31.92	47.75
Islamic Development Bank [IsDB]	7.36	4.22	8.8	2.86
United Nations, Total	16.78	18.02	17.41	16.6
Food and Agriculture Organisation [FAO]	0.73			
International Atomic Energy Agency [IAEA]	0.52	0.28	0.35	0.44
IFAD	1.82	3.68	1.94	0.37
International Labour Organisation [ILO]	0.32	0.27	0.33	0.24
UNAIDS	0.38	0.37	0.48	0.48



Development Partners	2013	2014	2015	2016
UNDP	3.96	4.24	3.78	3.9
UNFPA	2.2	1.82	1.83	1.64
UNHCR			0.48	
UNICEF	5.31	5.62	5.31	6.78
WFP	0.35	0.23	1.5	1.54
World Health Organisation [WHO]	1.19	1.51	1.41	1.21
World Bank Group, Total	140.56	126.82	106.87	124.17
World Bank, Total	140.56	126.82	106.87	124.17
International Development Association [IDA]	140.56	126.82	106.87	124.17
Other Multilateral, Total	56.23	57	34.97	38.26
Arab Bank for Economic Development in Africa [BADEA]	2.89	6.33	5.34	
Global Alliance for Vaccines and Immunization [GAVI]	13.3	9.52	5.11	7.2
Global Environment Facility [GEF]	3.8	4.84	4.44	6.93
Global Fund	36.45	31.15	19.72	22.51
Nordic Development Fund [NDF]	0.16	-0.14	-0.44	-0.44
OPEC Fund for International Development [OFID]	-0.37	5.3	0.8	2.06
Non-DAC Countries, Total	8.33	9.85	6.14	3.16
Israel	0.02	0.01	0.01	
Kuwait	5.6	6.41	4.55	2.57
Romania	0.04	0	0	0.01
Russia			0.09	
Thailand				0.05
Turkey	1.17	0.59	0.3	0.68
United Arab Emirates	1.5	2.84	1.2	-0.15

Source: OECD Stat, [DAC2a] as of3/19/18 \* Data only available up to FY16



# Annex Table 11: Economic and Social Indicators for Benin, FY13-FY16\*\*

Series Name					Benin	SSA	World
Series Name	2013	2014	2015	2016	Av	erage 2013-201	6
Growth and Inflation							
GDP growth (annual %)	7.2	6.4	2.1	4.0	4.9	3.4	2.7
GDP per capita growth (annual %)	4.2	3.4	(0.7)	1.1	2.0	0.7	1.5
GNI per capita, PPP (current international \$)	1,990.0	2,090.0	2,110.0	2,170.0	2,090.0	3,507.1	15,423.3
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$) (Millions)	890.0	930.0	870.0	820.0	877.5	1,650.2	10,657.2
Inflation, consumer prices (annual %)	1.0	(1.1)	0.3	(0.9)		4.6	2.1
Composition of GDP (%)							
Agriculture, value added (% of GDP)	24.1	24.3	25.3	25.6		17.5	3.9
Industry, value added (% of GDP)	23.6	23.5	23.2	23.4		25.3	27.9
Services, etc., value added (% of GDP)	52.3	52.2	51.4	51.1		57.2	68.2
Gross fixed capital formation (% of GDP)	27.2	28.6	26.4	27.2	27.3	20.9	23.4
Gross domestic savings (% of GDP)	14.7	16.2	14.4	18.6	16.0	17.5	24.8
External Accounts							
Exports of goods and services (% of GDP)	28.2	32.1	28.2	30.5	29.7	27.5	29.6
Imports of goods and services (% of GDP)	41.3	44.5	39.8	39.7	41.3	31.3	29.0
Current account balance (% of GDP)	(7.4)	(9.1)	(9.0)				
External debt stocks (% of GNI)	22.2	21.3	26.5	27.1			
Total debt service (% of GNI)	1.0	0.9	0.9	1.1		2.1	
Total reserves in months of imports						5.2	13.3
Fiscal Accounts*							
General government revenue (% of GDP)	18.5	17.2	17.3	15.3	17.1	18.9	
General government total expenditure (% of GDP)	20.4	19.4	24.9	21.3	21.5	22.9	
General government net lending/borrowing (% of GDP)	(1.9)	(2.3)	(7.6)	(5.9)	-4.4	-4.0	
General government gross debt (% of GDP)	25.3	30.5	42.4	50.3	37.1	35.9	
Health							
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	60.1	60.3	60.6		60.3	59.4	71.7
Immunization, DPT (% of children ages 12-23 months)	77.0	78.0	82.0	82.0	79.8	73.3	85.3
Improved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)	19.0	19.6	19.7		19.4	29.4	67.0



Annexes 39

Corriso Norres					Benin	SSA	World
Series Name	2013	2014	2015	2016	ŀ	verage 2013-2	016
Improved water source (% of population with access)	71.2	72.1	72.1		71.8	54.9	83.9
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	67.4	66.1	64.6	63.1	65.3	55.9	32.0
Education							
School enrollment, preprimary (% gross)	19.4	20.6	23.9		21.3	21.1	47.4
School enrollment, primary (% gross)	124.3	125.6	129.0		126.3	98.1	104.7
School enrollment, secondary (% gross)	54.2	54.4	56.8		55.1	42.5	76.1
Population							
Population, total (Millions)	10,004,451	10,286,712	10,575,952	10,872,298	10,434,853	992,395,162	7,312,300,570
Population growth (annual %)	2.8	2.8	2.8	2.8	2.8	2.8	1.2
Urban population (% of total)	43.1	43.5	44.0	44.4	43.7	37.5	53.6
Poverty							
Poverty headcount ratio at \$1.90 a day (2011 PPP) (% of pop)			49.5			41.0	10.7
Poverty headcount ratio at national poverty lines (% of pop)							
Rural poverty headcount ratio at national poverty lines (% of rural pop)							
Urban poverty headcount ratio at national poverty lines (% of urban pop)							
GINI index (World Bank estimate)			47.8		47.8		

Source: WB Development Data Platform as of 3/1/18 \*International Monetary Fund, World Economic Outlook Database, October 2017 \*\* Data only available up to FY16



# Annex Table 12: List of IFC Investments in Benin Investments Committed in FY13-FY18

Project ID	Cmt FY	Project Status	Primary Sector Name	Project Size	Original Loan	Original Equity	Original CMT	Loan Cancel	Equity Cancel	Net Loan	Net Equity	Net Comm	Greenfield Code
38159	2017	Active	Finance & Insurance	10,000	10,000	-	10,000	-	-	10,000	-	10,000	G
35105	2014	Closed	Finance & Insurance	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	Е
			Sub-Total	10,000	10,000	-	10,000	-	-	10,000	-	10,000	

# Investments Committed pre-FY13 but active during FY13-18

Project	CMT	Project	Primary Sector Name	Project	Original	Original	Original	Loan	Equity	Net	Net	Net	Greenfield
ID	FY	Status	Philliary Sector Marine	Size	Loan	Equity	CMT	Cancel	Cancel	Loan	Equity	Comm	Code
25280	2009	Active	Finance & Insurance	10,000	174,622	-	174,622	-	-	174,622	-	174,622	E
27518	2009	Active	Finance & Insurance	5,000	133,389	-	133,389	-	-	133,389	-	133,389	E
			Sub-Total	15,000	308,011	-	308,011	-	-	308,011	-	308,011	
			TOTAL	25,000	318,011	-	318,011	-	-	318,011	-	318,011	

Source: IFC-MIS Extract as of 12/31/17



## Annex Table 13: List of IFC Advisory Services in Benin Advisory Services Approved in FY13-18

Project ID	Project Name	Impl Start FY	lmpl End FY	Project Status	Primary Business Line	Total Funds, US\$
601619	Invest West Africa Benin Implementation	2018	2019	ACTIVE	TAC	500,000
602063	Benin Water Scale-Up	2018	2019	ACTIVE	CAS	573,395
602177	BOA BENIN AMSMETA	2018	2019	ACTIVE	FIG	252,476
602675	Technical Review	2018	2018	ACTIVE	INR	50,000
596667	Benin Port Post Mandate Assistance	2015	2015	TERMINATED	CAS	255,000
585927	Benin WSP	2013	2015	CLOSED	CAS	1,093,988
592047	Benin Investment Climate Reform Program	2013	2017	CLOSED	TAC	1,455,397
	Sub-Total					4,180,256

## Advisory Services Approved pre-FY13 but active during FY13-18

Project ID	Project Name		lmpl End FY	Project Status	Primary Business Line	Total Funds, US\$
583307	Benin Health PPP	2012	2015	TERMINATED	CAS	1,970,774
585627	Africa Small Scale Infrastructure Provider Program in Water II	2012	2014	DROPPED	SBA	100,000
	Sub-Total					2,070,774
	TOTAL					6,251,030

Source: IFC AS Portal Data as of 1/31/18

## Annex Table 14: IFC net commitment activity in Benin, FY13 - FY18

		2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	Total
Financial Markets	NBFI	-	-	-	-	10,000,000	-	10,000,000
Trade Finance	GTFP	62,562,151	45,920,825	28,747,028	33,381,632	28,279,926	16,975,381	215,866,943
Total		62,562,151	45,920,825	28,747,028	33,381,632	38,279,926	16,975,381	225,866,943

Source: IFC MIS as of 4/6/18

## Annex Table 15: List of MIGA Projects Active in Benin, 2013-2018

ID	Contract Enterprise	FY	Project Status	Sector	Investor	Max Gross Issuance
9392	Société d'Exploitation du Guichet Unique du Bénin, SA	2012	Active	Services	Netherlands	7
7457	Compagnie Hôteliere du Golfe	2009	Active	Tourism	Mali	1
Total						9

Source: MIGA 4-6-18