

1. CPS Data	
Country: Nigeria	
CPS Year: FY10	CPS Period: FY10 – FY13
CPSCR Review Period: FY10 – FY13	Date of this review: 4/8/2014

2. Executive Summary

- i. This review examines the implementation of the FY10-FY13 Country Partnership Strategy (CPS) of FY10 and the CPS Progress Report (CPSPR) of FY12, and assesses the CPS Completion Report (CPSCR). The strategy was jointly designed and implemented by IDA, African Development Bank, the UK Department for International Development, and the US Agency for International Development. Although the CPS and CPSPR made reference to the IFC program insofar as it would complement the IDA program, both documents were presented without formal endorsement from IFC, and the CPSCR has limited discussion of IFC activities; this review covers only IDA activities.
- ii. The Bank has been consistent in using the pillars of the 2004 National Economic and Environmental Development Strategy for 2005-07 (NEEDS) in all three CPS's in Nigeria since 2004. The objectives of the FY10 CPS were organized under the three pillars of the NEEDS: 1) Maintaining non-oil growth by focusing on infrastructure to support growth clusters; investment climate to promote private sector involvement; technical and vocational education to address the skill gap; and reducing import bans and high tariff barriers; 2) Promoting human development via improvement in access and utilization of services, especially girls' education in the North and maternal and child health; and 3) Improving governance through transparency and accountability; participation; sector governance; capacity development; and (for DFID and USAID) judicial reform and democratic governance. Governance was both a major theme and a cross-cutting theme to be integrated in all forms of support. Supporting the government's responses to the global financial crisis was also a major concern. The CPSPR confirmed the validity of the CPS approach, and provided a new meta-objective 'Mitigating the Impact of the Global Economic Crisis'. It introduced significant changes to the results matrix which on the whole lowered the bar for success.
- iii. IEG rates the overall outcome of IDA support as *moderately satisfactory*, concurring with the CPSCR rating. Consistent support from the Bank over an extended period of time contributed to significant progress in developing the institutional framework for the power sector. Good progress was also achieved in agricultural development, with significant impact on poverty reduction. A series of modest steps were taken in the right direction to strengthen the institutions and systems for better governance, although there seems to lack a scale-up strategy for replicating these initial efforts, especially at the state level. Moreover, the positive achievements were partly offset by disappointing results in other areas of Bank engagement: although urban transport in Lagos improved, progress was limited in the overall transport network; while there was progress in post-basic education, polio, and maternal health care, little was achieved in basic education, HIV/AIDS, malaria, and institutional reforms in the social sectors. In addition, there was limited progress in environmental management and PPP. Finally, in spite of a substantial and well thought through support effort by the Bank, Nigeria's business environment deteriorated in many ways during the CPS period.
- iv. IEG rates IDA performance as *moderately satisfactory*, concurring with the CPSCR rating. The CPS objectives were relevant to Nigeria's development challenges and well aligned with the country's development priorities. The design of Bank interventions broadly supported the achievement of CPS objectives, although the coherence of the program was weak and there was

CPSCR Reviewed by:	Peer Reviewed by:	CPSCR Review Coordinator
Basil Kavalsky IEGCC Consultant	Pablo Guerrero IEGCC Consultant	Xiaolun Sun, Senior Evaluation Officer, IEGCC



evidence of lack of government ownership for parts of the program. As a genuine joint strategy, the Bank program meshed fully with those of other development partners. The results framework, however, was weak, with no clear results chain that shows the underlying assumptions for the Bank's interventions to succeed in achieving the CPS objectives and to make an important contribution to the country development goals. The significant changes introduced to the results matrix at the time of the CPSPR shifted the goalpost for measuring success, but without demonstrating how that would facilitate better attainment of the CPS objectives. The key implementation risks were accurately identified. The quality of supervision deteriorated until a major effort was made to improve portfolio performance. The program was responsive to changing priorities and circumstances. There was significant effort for coordination with partners and sufficient attention to safeguard and fiduciary issues.

v. IEG concurs with the four key lessons drawn in the CPSCR, and wishes to underscore three additional points. First, there is a need for close and careful portfolio management throughout the project cycle. The Nigeria program has few examples of project turn-around and there should be a real burden of proof on the supervision team that optimism is warranted. Second, there is a need for greater strategic coherence, not just in the preparation of the CPS document but in the follow through in program implementation. A concerted effort to enhance governance and to address poverty should be the challenges of the next CPS. Finally, there is a need to develop a strong results framework that provides a clear line of sights for strategic decision making and accountability. This requires an explicit results chain that links Bank interventions, the complementary actions by the government and partners, and other critical factors, to the strategic objectives, as well as a results matrix that is stable enough for tracking results.

3. WBG Strategy Summary

Overview of CPS/CPS Relevance:

Country Context:

- 1. The CPS began implementation as the global financial crisis unfolded. Nigeria weathered well the crisis, as well as the sharp fall in petroleum prices and virtual collapse in parts of the banking sector. The Government drew on the special stabilization account established in 2004 from oil revenues to maintain public expenditures and to finance a stimulus package. Non-oil growth continued at a robust pace and real GDP grew at 7 percent from 2009 to 2012 (compared to CPS projection of 5 percent), with average per capita income growth reaching 4.3 percent. However, steady growth has had a limited impact on poverty, which remained very high (54 percent of the population at \$1.25 a day (PPP) poverty line in 2011) and Nigeria is unlikely to meet most of the MDGs. Unemployment is high and youth unemployment constitutes a major social risk. The security situation remains unsettled, with unrest in the oil-producing Delta states now overtaken by religious conflicts in the North as the principal concern.
- 2. Nigeria's national goals were set out in the 2004 National Economic and Environmental Development Strategy (NEEDS) for 2005-07. It defined three broad objectives: 1) Governance; 2. Non-oil growth; and 3) Social Development. These were maintained through subsequent strategy documents such as the Seven Point Agenda.

Objectives of the WBG Strategy:

3. The Bank has been consistent in using the NEEDS pillars in all three CPS's in Nigeria since 2004. The objectives of the FY10 CPS were organized under the three pillars of the NEEDS: 1)



Maintaining non-oil growth by focusing on infrastructure to support growth clusters; investment climate to promote private sector involvement; technical and vocational education to address the skill gap; and reducing import bans and high tariff barriers; 2) Promoting human development via improvement in access and utilization of services, especially girls' education in the North and maternal and child health; and 3) Improving governance through transparency and accountability; participation; sector governance; capacity development; and (for DFID and USAID) judicial reform and democratic governance. Governance was both a major theme and a cross-cutting theme to be integrated in all forms of support. Supporting the government's response to the global financial crisis was also a major concern. The strategy of IFC, which was not a formal part of the CPS, emphasizes diversification through agribusiness and infrastructure (power) and within financial markets.

4. The CPSPR confirmed the validity of the CPS approach, and provided a new meta-objective - 'Mitigating the Impact of the Global Economic Crisis'. It proposed to adjust the lead roles under partnerships, scope of analytical work, and financing arrangements. The results matrix underwent significant changes which on the whole lowered the bar for success.

Relevance of the WBG Strategy:

- 5. **Congruence with Country Context and Country Program.** As a joint strategy that covered about 80 percent of Nigeria's ODA receipts, the objectives of the CPS were broad and aligned with the Government's own priorities. All the core development issues governance, particularly at the state level; economic diversification; youth employment; the quality of education; providing access to health care for the poor in rural areas; and of course infrastructure were fully reflected in the CPS program. Even issues of justice and democratization were covered by the program through the efforts of DFID and USAID. The difficult security problems in the Niger Delta were also the subject of donor support, with the Bank expanding its program in the Delta states in order to provide support for the Government's amnesty and development programs there. An important feature of the CPS compared to the past was the new emphasis on non-oil growth and employment, which had been somewhat downplayed earlier.
- 6. **Relevance of Design**. Given the broad definition of the pillars and objectives, and the wide ranging nature of the Bank and partners programs with presence in every relevant area, it is difficult to argue that there was any mismatch between objectives and design. The Bank and the partners adopted a sensible approach of maintaining a focus on the pillars and broad supporting programs, but moving opportunistically into aspects of those programs that seem to offer the best chances of success. The DPO in support of Nigeria's adaptation to the global crisis was an example which helped to strengthen the regulatory framework for commercial banking. As a joint strategy, the meshing of the country programs of the Bank, DFID, USAID and the AfDB meant that the Bank took a less prominent role in certain areas (e.g., social development) than it would otherwise have done. Consequently, it is not always clear whether the proposed Bank interventions were appropriate and capable for achieving the CPS objectives. Moreover, with the increasing emphasis on supporting better governance at the state-level, the modalities for doing this have changed with more emphasis on DPOs. This reflects the broad consensus about what needs to be done in Nigeria on the one hand and the lack of consensus on how to do it, on the other.
- 7. In addition, although there was a high level of government ownership of the program as a whole, the ownership often did not extend to the individual projects, where the emphasis given to fiduciary concerns was often at odds with the interest of middle-level officials and state governments. There is also some evidence of a lack of broader country ownership given the failure of parliament to process the legal requirements of some projects and consequent delays in signing. The project designs, however, reflected greater realism than in earlier years about what could reasonably be achieved, with relatively modest steps proposed. This is particularly true of the state programs where the Bank faced an uphill battle in securing commitment and building the capacity to implement programs effectively.



- 8. **Strength of the Results Framework**. The CPS had an overarching objective of enhancing government at the federal, state and sector levels. While a great deal was made of this in the CPS, it was not reflected in the results framework. Instead, the Nigeria CPS results framework is a direct reflection of the projects supported by the Bank. While the results matrix makes it reasonably clear what the Bank expects to achieve with its interventions (especially lending), there lacks a results chain that explains the underlying assumptions and the expected complementary actions by the Government and/or other partners that were required for the Bank to be effective. For example, many state level outcomes are stated in terms of achievements in the three or five (out of 36) states covered by a particular intervention. The question is naturally raised as to how the individual operations and the associated results will eventually be scaled up to promote key national outcomes.
- 9. Moreover, while the Nigeria CPS results matrix was a reasonable reflection of the pillars and Bank projects, there were substantial revisions to the outcome indicators at the time of the CPSPR in 2011. More than half of the CPS indicators (22 out of 38) were either dropped or modified while 21 new indicators were added. Even though some indicators were made more precise, for the most part, the changes involved a lowering of targets, and many of the additional indicators (mostly of an institutional nature) had already been achieved when the CPSPR was prepared. While mid-course corrections and the associated adjustment to the results framework are necessary, the scale of some of the adjustments raises questions. For example, the target for roads rehabilitated was lowered by 85 percent, thereby enabling the Bank to claim success in an area where it clearly did not do well. In addition, despite the substantial changes to the results matrix, the CPSCR does not report on a large number of the indicators. The lack of a clear results chain to facilitate risk assessment combined with many moving targets in the results matrix suggests that the results framework cannot be reliably used for learning or accountability.
- 10. *Risk Identification and Mitigation*. The CPS identified six risks: continuing impact of the global financial crisis; policy reversals or governance reform slowdown; lack of commitment and weak governance at the State level; institutional weaknesses and capacity constraints in states; political risks and absence of strong reform champions; and deterioration in security and law and order situation. The CPSPR assessed that institutional weakness and capacity constraints, as well as deterioration in security and law and order, remained highly relevant, while the other risks were unlikely to impact program implementation going forward. However, except for the first and last these are really contextual factors rather than risks. Thus the weak political, institutional and governance situation was the context in which programs had to be designed, and the Bank needs to think through how to build in incentives and structures that are resilient to backslidings. Although not discussed in the CPSCR, a governance, conflict and gender filter is reported to have started to be implemented so as to ensure that projects take into account incentives and political economy aspects. In discussing the Bank's responses to the risks that materialized during the CPS period, the CPSCR highlighted the unanticipated risk of insecurity in the North.

Overview of CPS/CPS Implementation:

Lending and Investments:

11. At the beginning of the CPS period, 34 IDA-financed projects totaling \$4.1 billion were ongoing. The majority of these projects (44 percent) were concentrated in human development (education, health, nutrition and population, and social protection), followed by infrastructure (29 percent), and agriculture and rural development (15 percent). The entire portfolio consisted of investment operations. During the CPS period, IDA made 22 new commitments (16 investment operations, 4 development policy operations (DPO), 1 guarantee and 1 regional project) totaling \$ 3.8 billion, compared to the CPS plan of 29 programmed projects for \$4.6 billion. The new commitments



included a \$500 million DPO at the Federal level in response to the global crisis. Five planned operations did not materialize, including two state level DPOs, while two were postponed to the next CPS period. In their place, four non-programmed projects (including two additional financing and a DPO) were added to the portfolio. IDA resource was complemented by \$2.7 billion of trust fund during the CPS period.

- 12. Disbursements peaked in FY10, with net disbursement reaching \$992.8 million driven mainly by the \$500 million DPO in response to the global financial crisis. Nevertheless, disbursement ratios were generally lower in Nigeria (16–20 percent) than the African regional average (19-23 percent). Portfolio performance fluctuated, with the proportion of projects at risk rising to 50 percent in FY10, recalling the levels that had been reached around 2005 before a concerted effort was made to cancel or restructure poorly performing projects. A similar exercise undertaken after 2010 achieved a substantial reduction in the share of projects at risk to 12.5 percent in FY12, before doubling to 25.9 percent in FY13. This performance compared favorably with the Africa region as a whole, where the percentage of projects at risk ranged from 23.9 to 30.2 percent during the CPS period.
- 13. IEG reviewed the implementation completion reports for 11 projects and rated the development outcomes as *moderately satisfactory* or better in 9 of the projects, including a *highly satisfactory* rating for the Second National Fadama Development Project. At 82 percent of success rate, the Nigerian program achieved better results than the African region where the average success rate was 63 percent. Moreover, IEG considered that 64 percent of the reviewed projects faced moderate or lower risk to development outcome, a much lower rate than African regional average (38 percent). Of the 46 ongoing projects, 35 (76 percent) are progressing at least moderately satisfactorily according to management assessments, four have encountered delays caused by a variety of issues, while implementation supervision reports are not available for five projects.

Analytic and Advisory Activities and Services

A comprehensive program of analytic work, including 19 Economic and Sector Works (ESW) 14. and 24 Technical Assistance (TA) tasks, was delivered covering all key sectors, except transport and urban water. These AAAs were used to inform lending and policy dialogue and to build capacity. An important feature of the AAA was the increasing number of products focused on economic management at the state level. It would have been useful for the CPSCR to report on the dissemination efforts, local media coverage and perceived impact of these products since they are likely to be an increasing part of the program and the lessons will be important for the design of future activities. This extensive program of analytic work in large part reflected the Bank's need to deepen its understanding of the Nigerian economy given its size and complexity. The FY09 Employment and Growth Study, for example, was the first piece of analysis on this critically important topic for Nigeria. The Bank now has a much better understanding of Nigeria's economic landscape, especially at the state level. Now the focus of analytic work now needs to move from building the Bank's own understanding to promoting dialogue, policy impact and program design. In this regard, the Growth and Employment Study set a best practice example in dissemination, with extensive seminars and conferences and with the report being serialized in the local press. Another important consideration is the involvement of the Government, academia and others in its preparation and analysis - there has been some involvement but it needs to be substantially scaled up, both because of the enhanced impact of work that is carried out jointly, but also because the Bank needs to support an expansion of the capacity for policy analysis in Nigeria.

Partnerships and Development Partner Coordination

15. Nigeria represents a good practice example of development partner coordination. In many countries coordination is pro forma, but in Nigeria there is an active coordination process which reflects the comparative advantage of each institution. The CPS was prepared jointly with AfDB, DFID and USAID through an extensive consultation process with key government officials and civil



society representatives. The partnership expanded in 2011 to include and coordinate activities with the European Commission (EC) and the Agence Francaise de Developpement (AFD). Within each sector, the partners identified a division of responsibilities and periodic meetings were held to coordinate activities. For the next assistance period, the partners have established a Country Assistance Framework (CAF) under which they will agree on modalities to intensify engagement and measure impacts in critical areas. Given the interest in these approaches it would have been helpful for the CPSCR to provide some reflection on the donor coordination challenges and on the experience of establishing the CAF.

Safeguards and Fiduciary Issues

16. The CPSCR discusses two cases where safeguards and fiduciary issues led to disbursement delays in one and cancellation in another. It provides no detail on the claim that "the Bank team reacted in a way which was considered as best practice", but draws no lessons from the incidences.

Overview of Achievement by Objective:

Pillar I: Achieving Sustainable and Inclusive Non-Oil Growth

- 17. The CPS enunciated a strategic vision based on the concept of developing growth poles which had been identified in earlier analytical work. The CPS results matrix by contrast defined a much broader and more disparate agenda consisting of: i) Increased access to critical physical infrastructure; ii) Sustainable agriculture development and market access; iii) Improved investment climate and financial system. The CPSPR continued with the formulation of the CPS results matrix.
- 18. Increased Access to critical physical infrastructure. The achievement of this objective is gauged by progress in energy, transport and urban water supply. In energy, the CPS proposed two outcome indicators to measure improvement in power generation capacity and transmission efficiency. Both were slightly modified in the CPSPR and achieved, although power supply subsequently declined after reaching the CPSPR target. More broadly, the prospect for developing Nigeria's lagging power sector is brightened with the government issuance of a roadmap for the sector and the breakup and privatization of power generation and distribution (e.g., a management contract was provided to a foreign operator for the transmission company). The Bank has been the main interlocutor with the Government on power development for the past 10-15 years, and continued to implement two investment projects during the CPS period. This is an instance where the Bank stayed the course.
- 19. In transport, progress has been sluggish: the rural roads rehabilitation target was 75 percent achieved, while the federal roads target was reduced by 85 percent in the CPSPR due to significant delay, restructuring and scaling-down of the Federal Roads Development Project (FY09). Although the CPS intended to tackle governance in all its support programs, the key issue in the transport sector remains the need for institutional strengthening. A bright spot in the transport sector is the establishment of Lagos Metropolitan Area Transport Authority, which received continuous Bank support since the early 2000s. Impressive improvements in road transport in Lagos have been achieved with much better maintained roads and an effective bus network. The CPSCR, however, provides poor evidence for the Bank's achievements: the outcome indicator (increase in bus speed) is not reported on; the proposed proxy (time saved in motorized travels per day) is not about public transportation, although the significant per trip time reduction (from 45-60 minutes to 7-12 minutes between 2007 and 2010) is said to be highly correlated with bus speed; and the indicator introduced in the CPSPR (money saved by poor household on bus travels), which would have been a good indicator except that the target was set for 2010, prior to the CPSPR, and was not achieved.



- 20. In water, the outcome target for better access to improved water supply in targeted states was 77 percent achieved. In addition, under this pillar, the CPS aimed to improve public private partnership in infrastructure development. The original indicator for measuring progress in this area (share of privately financed investment in targeted infrastructure) had no baseline or target and was dropped in the CPSPR. It was replaced by five new indicators, of which four (three energy sector specific and one general) had already been achieved prior to their selection as progress measurements in the CPSPR, while the fifth (Inter Ministries, Departments and Agencies Agreement on legislative amendments and new legislations required to strengthen PPP) was not achieved.
- 21. Sustainable agricultural development and market access. There are two components to this objective. The progress in agricultural development has been encouraging with the Commercial Agricultural Development Program (FY09) achieving substantial success and demonstrating a viable model for both agricultural and off-farm rural development. However, the results reported in the CPSCR are confusing: the original CPS indicator (sales of agricultural products in targeted areas for selected crops) was revised in the CPSPR, but is then judged "too high a target and erroneous" in the CPSCR and not reported on. Similarly, although the CPSPR proposed to report results (income increase in selected communities) from two Bank projects (FADAMA II and III), the CPSCR provides data on only FADAMA III (over 90 percent achieved). Additional information suggests that FADAMA II was also successful in raising the incomes of project beneficiaries even if the impact on the poorest households had been limited. In addition, the scope of FADAMA III is being expanded with additional financing, while the Agricultural Transformational DPO (FY13) is supporting critical reforms which helped address major bottleneck and corruption in the provision of fertilizers and seeds to farmers.
- 22. On environmental management, the CPSPR substantially lowered the definition of success, from developing an early warning system for coastal disaster risk assessment, planning and management, to simple identification of the key features of such a system. Although this modest target was achieved, it provides little evidence of improved environmental and climate change management. The CPSCR reports that the two new targets (Local Government Authorities with environmentally sustainable development plans and Watershed Management Coordination Capacity established) introduced in the CPSPR were both achieved, although both indicators were imprecise and represented very preliminary steps towards getting the institutional framework right for environmental management.
- Improved investment climate and financial system. The Bank has helped put in place an important information base through its State Level Investment Climate Assessments and Doing Business (DB) reports. The CPSCR does not provide evidence on how this has influenced policy decisions beyond raising awareness and informing state DPOs. The expected improvement in business start-up procedures did not happen, while the progress in enforcing contract in two of the six selected states was not substantiated in the CPSCR Nigeria's overall DB ranking slipped during 2009-11 and stagnated since then. The Bank's Medium Small and Micro Enterprise project (FY04-FY12) helped establish the framework and setting-up of two Credit Reference Bureaus, although other reforms (e.g., moveable assets registry) were not fully implemented at closure. The Growth and Employment project (FY11) has run into problems. As far as the financial system is concerned, the shock caused by the withdrawal of foreign portfolio investment during the financial crisis and its effect on local portfolio investment (much of it financed on the margin by Nigerian Commercial Banks) have led to a major reform of the commercial banking system and a new Central Bank Governor, which resulted in much more stringent capital requirements and regulation being put in place. None of the relatively well-capitalized banks supported by IFC were severely affected by the crisis. The Bank and IFC remain a significant source of support for the financial sector, but it is difficult to assess the contribution of the WBG to the outcome of maintaining capital adequacy ratios at above 15 percent or increasing adult access to financial services from 15 to 20 percent.



24. IEG rates the outcome of WBG support under Pillar I as *moderately satisfactory*. Bank's sustained assistance has contributed to good progress in the power sector and to agricultural development. Some progress was achieved in access to water and urban transport, as well as in the financial system. On the other hand, results were disappointing in transport network, environmental management, and PPP. Most importantly, the Bank's support was not effective for helping improve Nigeria's investment climate, as evidenced by the deterioration in the Doing Business ranking.

Pillar II: Sustained Improvement in the Quality of Human Development Services

- 25. Under this pillar, the Bank pursued objectives in health and education sectors, as well as increasing access to basic services for the extreme poor and vulnerable groups.
- Improve access to and utilization of quality health care services. An important goal of the CPS was to engineer a shift from the focus on individual diseases (HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria, polio, etc.) to the adoption of a broader health services approach in which health service providers dealt with the needs of patients across the range of health issues. Despite the intentions, in practice the shift to a health systems approach was not as far reaching as planned and was not significantly reflected in the results framework, which had a large number of indicators devoted to individual diseases because a considerable portion of the lending program was still devoted to vertical programs in these areas. The only indicator to measure system improved (passage of a National Health Bill) was initially achieved with Bank support, but was substantially revised thereafter and resubmitted, and has not yet been approved. With regard to individual diseases, the CPSCR omits to report on several outcome indicators, including some that were revised or added in the CPSPR. Reportedly, the omission is based on the fact that the Bank was not "directly responsible" for these outcomes; however, the choice of indicators retained/omitted is not consistent with the CPS/CPSPR indication of "World Bank sole accountability". Many indicators measure project outputs rather than outcomes. For example, a significant achievement reported in the CPSCR is the training of a large number of additional health service providers in the Northern States, which, in the absence of any information on the quality of the training and the changes in the skills and motivation of the health workers, is a poor measurement of improvement in access to maternal health services. That the target was exceeded by nearly 10 times also raises questions over the usefulness of this indicator for quiding program implementation. Overall, the data presented in the CPSCR suggest significant progress in polio eradication, good progress in maternal health services, mixed results in malaria treatment, and poor outcome in HIV/AIDS where neither of the two indicators is reported on and available information does not indicate achievement of the targets.
- 27. Improved access and inclusiveness to quality and relevant education at all levels. In education, the Bank moved away from basic education (except in three northern states) and focused on tertiary education and skills development. Nevertheless, four out of the six outcome indicators retained in the CPSPR pertained to basic education. The CPSCR does not report on the two indicators measuring access to basic education and data show partial progress (30-50 percent) in quality improvement for basic education. The Bank's State Education Sector Project (FY07-FY12) was meant to be a pilot project to demonstrate that learning conditions could be improved through School Based Management Committees, but there is no information on the broader impact of the project through replication. On the other hand, the two targets for post-basic educational achievement at the federal level were substantially exceeded.
- 28. **Equitable utilization of HD services.** This objective focuses on the extreme poor and vulnerable groups, and the outcome indicator measures the access of poor households to basic health, education and water services in targeted communities. The CPSCR reports that this was achieved (target exceeded by nearly four times) through the Community and Social Development Project (FY09) based on local participation, but there is no discussion of how the project level



outcomes would be scaled up.

29. IEG rates the outcome of WBG support under Pillar II as *moderately unsatisfactory*. The achievements in health and education, to some degree in terms of access, but even more in terms of quality, are disappointing relative to the efforts of the Bank and other partners. Although progress was made in some areas (post-basic education, polio, maternal health care), little was achieved in institutional reforms and other areas (HIV/AIDS, malaria, basic education). Unreported indicators and multiple-times surpassed targets suggest that the partnership may be diluting the accountability of the Bank and that this is an area which might benefit from clearer definition of longer-term objectives and indicators.

Pillar III: Governance for Results

- 30. The CPS pursued four objectives under the rubric "governance as a core theme", including 1) improved effectiveness of anti-corruption institutions, 2) improved performance management system in the civil service, 3) strengthened public financial management systems, and 4) strengthened national statistical system. The focus was very much at the federal level even though some interventions targeted selected states, especially for improving procurement practices. The CPSPR shifted the emphasis strongly to the state level and broadened the scope of the objectives under this pillar. This was reflected through the introduction of process indicators such as EITI compliance and the preparation of Medium-Term Sectoral Strategies at federal and state levels. Despite the increased focus, however, delayed effectiveness of Bank project in two states led to reductions in the number of "selected states" from five to three for most outcome indicators.
- 31. Measured by the outcome indicators, the achievement was impressive in all four governance areas. The effectiveness of Nigeria Anti-Corruption Agency improved more than expected; new civil service performance management system was widely adopted at federal level and being introduced gradually in the states; public financial management systems, especially budget planning, were strengthened; and some progress was made in building statistical capacity at both federal and state levels. Overall, there is little doubt that the systems at the federal level are addressing corruption with the closing of numerous loopholes and the increasing use of e-government processes. The Bank program is notably thin on the demand side and the efforts at scaling up will only produce concrete results in the next strategy periods. The real challenge will be to move up from the handful of states whose governors have some commitment to, if not reduced corruption, at least improved service provision.
- 32. IEG rates the outcome of Bank support under Pillar III as *moderately satisfactory*. There is evidence that good progress was made in improving governance at the federal level and in some states as a result of the Bank's coherent lending and analytic work. However, several Bank projects encountered low implementation, signaling limited traction on the demand side. There is also little evidence of scaling-up of the Bank program.

Objectives	CPSCR Rating	IEG Rating
Pillar I: Achieving Sustainable and Inclusive Non-Oil Growth	Partially Achieved	Moderately Satisfactory
Pillar II: Sustained Improvement in Access to, Quality and Utilization of Human Development Services	Partially Achieved	Moderately Unsatisfactory
Pillar III: Governance for Results	Achieved	Moderately Satisfactory



4. Overall IEG Assessment						
	IEG Rating					
Overall Outcome:	Moderately satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory				
IDA Performance:	Moderately satisfactory	Moderately satisfactory				

Overall outcome:

33. IEG rates the overall outcome of IDA support as *moderately satisfactory,* concurring with the CPSCR rating. Consistent support from the Bank over an extended period of time contributed to significant progress in developing the institutional framework for the power sector. Good progress was also achieved in agricultural development, with significant impact on poverty reduction. A series of modest steps were taken in the right direction to strengthen the institutions and systems for better governance, although there seems to lack a scale-up strategy for replicating these initial efforts, especially at the state level. Moreover, the positive achievements were partly offset by disappointing results in other areas of Bank engagement: although urban transport in Lagos improved, progress was limited in the overall transport network; while there was progress in post-basic education, polio, and maternal health care, little was achieved in basic education, HIV/AIDS, malaria, and institutional reforms in the social sectors. In addition, there was limited progress in environmental management and PPP. Finally, in spite of a substantial and well thought through support effort by the Bank, Nigeria's business environment deteriorated in many ways during the CPS period.

IDA Performance:

34. IEG rates IDA performance as *moderately satisfactory*, concurring with the CPSCR rating. The CPS objectives were relevant to Nigeria's development challenges and well aligned with the country's development priorities. The design of Bank interventions broadly supported the achievement of CPS objectives, although the coherence of the program was weak and there was evidence of lack of government ownership for parts of the program. As a genuine joint strategy, the Bank program meshed fully with those of other development partners. The results framework however was weak, with no clear results chain that shows the underlying assumptions for the Bank's interventions to succeed in achieving the CPS objectives and to make an important contribution to the country development goals. The significant changes introduced to the results matrix at the time of the CPSPR shifted the goalpost for measuring success, but without demonstrating how that would facilitate better attainment of the CPS objectives. The key implementation risks were accurately identified. The quality of supervision deteriorated until a major effort was made to improve portfolio performance. The program was responsive to changing priorities and circumstances. There was significant effort for coordination with partners and sufficient attention to safeguard and fiduciary issues.

5. Assessment of CPS Completion Report

35. The CPSCR does not do justice to such a complex and ambitious operational program. For the most part, it takes the substantially modified CPSPR indicators and targets as a given with little discussion of the changes made from the CPS, the logic for these changes, and their impact on the Bank program's ability for achieving the strategic objectives. As such, the focus of the CPSCR is on the indicators rather than the objectives, and insofar as some of the measurements are rather preliminary in relation to the objectives, they throw little light on the progress towards achievement of



the ultimate goals. In a significant number of cases, the evidence base is weak and some of the outcomes are ambiguously reported. Moreover, for a genuinely joint country strategy, the CPSCR misses the opportunity to reflect on how the partnership helped the Bank and the partners achieve greater impact. The CPSCR provides no explanation of how the WBG dealt with safeguard, fiduciary, and conflicts of interest issues. There is limited discussion on the Bank's response to the security situation in the North and its impact on Bank program implementation. On the other hand, the CPSCR provides a reasonably comprehensive analysis of the design and particularly the implementation of the World Bank program (although there is little on IFC and MIGA, reflecting perhaps the fact that the CPS was not a joint IDA/IFC/MIGA strategy) and offers a thoughtful delineation of the key lessons of the program.

6. Findings and Lessons

- The CPSCR provides four key lessons. First, governance challenges remain a binding constraint. This is well stated and the elaboration is convincing. Second, overly complex or ambitious projects have slowed implementation and impacted results. By and large, the projects that have worked in Nigeria are those which are run by one institution with the accountability. responsibility and incentives for making it work. This calls for creative project design from the Bank since it probably cannot limit its program to narrow sub-sector based operations, which is also no guarantee of success unless the implementing institution is adequately empowered. Third, there is a need for the right balance and synergies between federal and state-level reforms. Here the CPSCR is less convincing as the Bank continues to struggle with how to deal with 36 state governments and needs to take a longer term view of how it will scale up its state-level engagement over time and work back from that on how best to define the current program. Finally, adequate stakeholder engagement is essential to enhance results. The CPSCR rightly points out that ownership is not just a matter of some key government ministers or officials, but in the Nigerian context includes the national assembly, NGOs and the media. The Bank has been doing this much more systematically in recent years and with some positive results, although given the size of the country this must be a central feature of the program.
- 37. To these good points, IEG wishes to add three additional points. First, there is a need for close and careful portfolio management throughout the project cycle. The Nigeria program has few examples of project turn-around and there should be a real burden of proof on the supervision team that optimism is warranted. Second, there is a need for greater strategic coherence, not just in the preparation of the CPS document but in the follow through in program implementation. A concerted effort to enhance governance and to address poverty should be the challenges of the next CPS. Finally, there is a need to develop a strong results framework that provides a clear line of sights for strategic decision making and accountability. This requires an explicit results chain that links Bank interventions, the complementary actions by the government and partners, and other critical factors, to the strategic objectives, as well as a results matrix that is stable enough for tracking results.



Annex Table 1: Summary Achievements of CPS Objectives

Annex Table 2: Planned and Actual Lending, FY10-13 (US\$ Million)

Annex Table 3: Analytical and Advisory Work for Nigeria, FY09-13

Annex Table 4: Grants and Trust Funds Active in FY10-13 (in US\$ million)

Annex Table 5: IBRD/IDA Project Ratings for Nigeria, FY09-12

Annex Table 6: IEG Project Ratings for Nigeria, Exit FY10-13

Annex Table 7: Portfolio Status for Nigeria and Comparators, FY09-13

Annex Table 8: Disbursement Ratio for Nigeria and Comparators, FY10-13

Annex Table 8: Net Disbursement and Charges for Nigeria, FY10-13 (\$M)

Annex Table 9: Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid for Nigeria (in US\$ Million)

Annex Table 10: Economic and Social Indicators for Nigeria, 2009 - 2012

Annex Table 11: Nigeria Millennium Development Goals



Annex Table 1. Summary Achievements of CPS Objectives

	CPS FY010-FY13: Pillar I Achieving Sustainable and Inclusive Non-Oil Growth	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	Comments
	Increase Access to Critical Physica		
	Increased power supplied (MW/year): Baseline: 2,800 (2009) Target: 4,500 (2013)	Power As of May 2013, the available grid supply was 4500MW.	Source: CPSCR The CPS target was improved generation capacity. Note that although the power supply did reach 4500 MW, it subsequently fell
	Multi Year Tariff Order (MYTO) including feed-in tariffs for generation plants revised: Baseline: MYTO outdated (2009) Target: MYTO revised (2013)	The MYTO was revised in 2011. It took effect on May 31, 2012 and will last for 5 years. MYTO is designed to provide financial motivations for instantly needed incremental investments in the industry and increase the average Tariff from 8 Naira/kWh to cost reflective levels (~ 21 Naira/kWh). The revised MYTO included feed-in tariffs for generation plants.	back to a level of 3300 NW. Source: CPSCR and MYTO 2012-2017.
	Nigerian Bulk Electricity Trading (NEBT) company takes effect as a "Single Buyer": Baseline: "Single Buyer" not available (2009) Target: "Single Buyer" available (2013)	tariffs for generation plants. The NEBT, also known as the bulk trader, was established in 2011. It was set up by the National Electricity Sector Reform Act of 2005 to fight recouping of investment by distribution companies which was the single biggest risk in the growth of the power sector. The National Electricity Reform Act also established NBET as a "Single Buyer" of power generated by private power plants.	Source: CPSCR and consultations with CMU.
Major Outcome Measures ¹	Action Plan and Roadmap for Power Sector Reform with Indicative Timelines and Planned Actions: Baseline: Action Plan and Roadmap not available (2009) Target: Action Plan and Roadmap available (2013)	The Roadmap for Power Sector Reform was launched in August 2010.	Source: CPSCR
	Improve power transmission efficiency by reducing system losses (percent): Baseline: 13% (2009) Target: 9% (2013)	Transmission losses were reduced from 13 percent in 2010 to 9.4 percent in 2012. These include losses in transmission between sources of supply and points of distribution and in the distribution to consumers, including pilferage.	Source: CPSCR The CPS targeted overall system losses.
	<u></u>	Transport	·,·
	Improve road network condition by rehabilitating selected unity roads and rural roads (Km):		
	Unity Roads in fair and good condition (Km): Baseline: 99.8 (2009) Target: Additional 150 (2013)	Additional 262 Km of selected unity roads were rehabilitated to fair and good condition, exceeding the target	Source: CPSCR and Federal Roads Development Project (FRDP). Substantial. The CPS targeted 1100 Km rehabilitated.
	Rural roads in fair and good condition (Km): Baseline: 0 (2009) Target: 600 (2013)	An additional 450.69 Km of roads were rehabilitated, compared to the target of rehabilitating 600 Km of selected rural roads to fair and good condition. The rehabilitation of another 157Km of roads is underway and expected to be completed by the end of 2013, which will bring the	Source: CPSCR

 $^{^{1}}$ According to the CASC PR, the WB has sole accountability for the indicators that are bolded and italicized.



	total length of rehabilitated roads to 607.69 Km.	
Increase average bus speed on Lagos' BRT corridors (km/hour): Baseline: 10km/hour (2009) Target: 20 km/hour (2013)	A decrease from 45 – 60 minutes in 2007 to between 7 - 12 minutes per trip at the end of 2010 was reported in the total time saved in motorized travels per day on selected legs of the declared road network.	Source: CPSCR and consultation with CMU. This indicator was not changed in the PR, but the CR reports a different indicator: total time saved in motorized travels per day on selected legs of the declared road network, which was considered by CMU as a better reflection of improved public transport in Lagos
Reduce bus transportation costs for poor households (Nairas spent per trip along project corridor): Baseline: Nairas 108 (2009)	The money spent by poor households on bus travel per trip along project corridor has reduced from N108/day in 2009 to N96/day in 2010.	Source: CPSCR
Target: Nairas 92 (2013) Establish single agency coordinating urban transport at the state and local level in Lagos: Baseline: No single agency in place (2009) Target: Single agency in place (2013)	Lagos Metropolitan Area Transport Authority (LAMATA) was established by law in 2010 and has continued to operate as a single Agency coordinating urban transport at the state and local level in Lagos.	Source: CPSCR
rarget. Single agency in place (2013)	 Water	<u>i</u>
Increase access to improved water supply in urban and peri-urban communities in targeted stated (number of people):	As of March 2013, nearly 9.2 million people living in urban and peri-urban communities in Kaduna, Ogun, Enugu, Lagos and Cross River states received up to 760 million liters of improved water.	Source: CPSCR
Baseline: 5 million (2009) Target: 12 million (2013) Approve a National Policy on Public Private Partnerships: Baseline: No policy approved (2009) Target: Policy approved (2013)	The National Policy on Public Private Partnership was approved in August 2009. The approval of the Policy was as a result of consistent dialogue and strengthened engagement with government prior to 2009.	Source: CPSCR
Inter-MDA Agreement on key legislative amendments and new legislation required to strengthen the enabling environment for PPPs: Baseline: No agreement (2009) Target: Agreement in place (2013)	Although the inter-MDA Agreement on key legislative amendments and new legislation required to strengthen the enabling environment for PPPs is not yet in place, efforts are underway to improve the legal and regulatory framework governing FGN PPP activity. The PPP facility is now available to Ministries and Government Agencies who wish to implement PPP projects under their Ministries.	Source: CPSCR
Develop Sustainable Agriculture and		
Increase volume of sales of :	Agriculture Beneficiaries of CADP in Cross River, Kaduna,	Source: CPSCR
agricultural products in targeted areas for selected groups (metric tons): Baseline: 2.1 MT (2009) Target: 2.94 MT (2013)	Kano, Enugu and Lagos states succeeded in increasing the volume of sales, indicated by an overall increase of 3.21 percent more than the targeted 20 percent over the project baseline. 12,762.94mt from fresh fruit bunch (ffb), pineapples, guava fruit, cocoa, maize, rice and processed fish (baseline: 2665.87mt). Additionally,	Source: CPSCK



	(Baseline: 4,066,450) and 6,694, 275 crates of eggs (Baseline: 68,000 crates).	
Increase income from agriculture in selected communities per household per year (Nairas/hh/yr):	A substantial increase was achieved from N135,000/hh/yr toN184,241/hh/yr ² .	Source: CPSCR
Baseline 2009: N135,000/hh/yr Target 2013: N189,000/hh/yr		
Adopt a National Agriculture Strategy:	The national agriculture strategy was adopted in 2010, reflecting the positive efforts of the reform	Source: CPSCR
Baseline: National Agriculture Strategy	agenda in the sector. The commitment to this	
not adopted (2009).	program was consolidated by the subsequent	
Target: National Agriculture Strategy adopted (2013)	launching of the Agricultural Transformation Agenda (ATA) by the new Agriculture Minister in 2011.	
	Environment	:
Define key features of an early warning	Three key features of an early warning system for	Source: CPSCR
system for coastal disaster risk assessment, planning, management	coastal disaster risk assessment, planning, and management were defined. These are (a)	The recently conducted Post Disaster Needs Assessment
assessment, planning, management	developing a disaster profile for Nigeria, (b)	(PDNA) will inform the developmen
Baseline: No key features defined (2009)	building DRM capacity and (c) the framework for	of the framework for the early
Target: Key features defined (2013)	the early warning system. The first two have been	warning system, which is the third
	fully developed.	expected feature that is being developed.
Increase in the number of Local	Using the Community Driven Development (CDD)	Source: CPSCR
Government Authorities (LGAs) that	approach, 279 LGAs have integrated	
are supporting communities with environmentally sustainable	environmentally sustainable LDPs in their annual work plan and budget (AWPB). Environmentally	
development plans (number of	sustainable micro-projects include, for example,	
communities):	community woodlots, bee-keeping, water	
Baseline: 0 (2009)	production, and agro forestry.	
Target: 200 (2013)		
Establish Watershed Management	At the federal level, a National Environmental	Source: CPSCR
Coordination Capacity in targeted states (number of states):	Policy is in place. At the state level, watershed management and coordination capacity as well as	
States (Hulliber of States).	Geographic Information System (GIS) for poverty	
Baseline: 0 (2009)	and environmental information management have	
Target: 6 (2013)	been built in seven states (Abia, Anambra, Cross River, Ebonyi, Edo, Enugu and Imo States).	
Improve Investment Climate and Fire		:
Influence policy making with	The Doing Business reviews and growth and	Source: CPSCR and Mid-Term
considerations on growth and employment, and trade liberalization:	employment study have contributed to key policy decisions in Nigeria. The annual doing business	Report of the Transformation Agenda (provided by CMU).
omprogramm, and trade liberalization.	reports have enabled states to examine	Agorida (provided by Civio).
Baseline: Issues growth and	impediments to growth more closely. The Bank	
employment, and trade liberalization not	completed the Investment Climate Assessments	
addressed in the national strategic documents (2009)	(ICAs), reviewed the experiences of over 3000 surveyed business owners in 26 states of Nigeria	
Target: Issues growth and employment,	about the aspects of the business climate that	
and trade liberalization addressed in the	affect their businesses. The Bank also provided	
national strategic documents (2013)	policy advice through workshops which led to government establishing Ports, Competitiveness	

² Fadama 3 beneficiaries only



	number of agencies in Ports from 17 to 7. Overall, 60 reforms were identified and DFID is providing technical support through GEM. Similar progress was made under the land regulations. The challenge that remains is translating the reforms into results, because the business climate and trade regime in Nigeria remains quite restrictive.	
Reduce procedures, time and cost involved in starting business and enforcing contracts in 6 selected states: Baseline: Doing Business Sub national (2008) Target: 20% reduction (2010)	The Bank's support through the Medium, Small and Micro Enterprise (MSME) project aimed at enabling individuals in three targeted states (Abia, Lagos and Kaduna) to increase access to financial services and the GEM project was to reduce selected investment climate barriers that constrained MSME performance. None of the states supported by the Bank improved in starting a business. However, Kaduna and Lagos states ³ improved in enforcing contracts.	Source: Sub-National Doing Business Study (2008 and 2010).
Increase the share of the adult population with access to financial services (% of the total adult population): Baseline: 15% (2009) Target: 20 % (2013)	The proportion of adults that are formally included ⁴ increased from 23.6% in 2008 to 43.0% in 2012, which is an increase of 17.4 million; The proportion of adults that are financially served ⁵ increased from 47.5% to 60.3%, which is an increase of 11.7 million; The number of adults that are financially excluded ⁶ decreased by 10.5 million.	Source: DFID and Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation study (Enhancing Financial Innovation and Access to Financial Services in Nigeria 2012 survey)
Maintain capital adequacy ratios above 15% (ratio): Baseline: 19.2% (2009) Target: >15% (2013)	Average Capital Adequacy Ratio (CAR) of all the banks operating in Nigeria was 17.12 percent in 2013.	Source: Central Bank of Nigeria Database 2013

³ Kaduna, Lagos and Sokoto.

⁴ "Financially included" refers to: (a) all adults who have access to or use a deposit money bank in addition to having/using a traditional banking product, including ATM card, credit card, savings account, current account, fixed deposit account, mortgage, overdraft, loan from a bank, or Islamic banking product; including indirect access; and (b) all adults who have access to or use other formal institutions and financial products not supplied by deposit money banks, including Insurance companies, microfinance banks, pension schemes or shares. It also includes remittances (through formal channels); including indirect access.

⁵"Financially served" includes the group of individuals described above in addition to all adults who do not have any banked or formal other products, but have access to or use only informal services and products. This includes savings clubs/pools, esusu, ajo, or moneylenders; as well as remittances (through informal channels such as via a transport service or recharge card)

⁶ "Financially excluded" refers to adults not in the banked, formal other or informal only categories, even though the person may be using or have access to any of the following: loan/gift from friends or family and loan from employers, as well as remittances via a friend/family member



	CPS FY09-FY12: Pillar II Sustained Improvement in Access to, Quality and Utilization of Human Development Services	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	Comments
	4. Improve Access to,	Utilization, and Quality Health Care Services	
	Health Sector Developmen	Y	γ
	Pass a National Health Bill in the National Assembly:	The National Health Bill was passed by the National Assembly in 2011 before the general election.	Source: CPSCR
	Baseline: No National Health Bill passed (2009) Target: National Health Bill passed (2013)		
	Increase the percent of children under 2 years fully vaccinated with OPV increase:	Data shows that the proportion of under-2 years fully vaccinated with OPV (3 doses) within the age bracket has increased. In 2010, a value of 74.0 percent was reported on a national scale (NICS 2010), exceeding the CPS target.	Source: National Immunization Coverage Survey (NICS) 2010.
	Baseline: 20 - 30% (2009) Target: 40 - 50% (2013)		C NDUC
Major Outcome	Increase the percent of children (12-23 months old) fully vaccinated (percentage):	Against the baseline of 22.7 percent from the National Demographic and Health Survey (NDHS 2008), the National Immunization Coverage Survey shows an increase to 53% in 2010 (NICS 2010). World Development Indicators (WDI) data show an increase to 71 percent in 2011.	Source: NDHS 2008; NICS 210; WDI 2011
<u>Measures</u>	Baseline: 13% (2009) Target: 71% (2013)		
	Increase the number of births attended by skilled health personnel (number) in selected states:	The number of births attended by skilled health personnel in selected states ⁷ increased from 800,000 in 2010 to 6,739,593 in 2011 ⁸ .	Source: Health Facility/HMIS data
	Baseline: 0.8 million (2009) Target: 6 million (2013)		
	Train health service providers in the northern states (number of health service providers trained):	The Bank's support to health delivery was responsible for the training of an additional 29,203 health service providers in Northern States ⁹ between 2009 and 2012.	Source: CPSCR
	Baseline: 0 (2009) Target: 2,700 (2013)		
	Ingrana the	HIV/AIDS	Nigorio Clabal
	Increase the percentage of women	The number of people aged 15 to 49 who received an HIV test in the last 12 months and who know their results increased by	Nigeria Global AIDS Progress

⁷28 States were supported by HSDP2: Benue, Federal Capital Territory (FCT), Kogi, Kwara, Nasarawa, Niger, Plateau, Adamawa, Bauchi, Borno, Gombe, Taraba, Yobe, Jigawa, Katsina, Kano, Kaduna, Kebbi, Sokoto, Zamfara, Abia, Anambra, Ebonyi, Enugu, Imo, Akwa Ibom, Bayelsa, Cross River, Delta, Edo, Rivers, Ekiti, Lagos, Ogun, Ondo, Osun and Oyo.

⁸ Health Facility/HMIS data

⁹ Selected states were Benue, Federal Capital Territory (FCT), Kogi, Kwara, Nasarawa, Niger, Plateau, Adamawa, Bauchi, Borno, Gombe, Taraba, Yobe, Jigawa, Katsina, Kano, Kaduna, Kebbi, Sokoto and Zamfara.



who received an HIV test in the last 12 months and know their results (percentage): Baseline (2009): Males (10.8%); Women (10.4%) Target (2013): Males (20%); Women (20%)	an HIV test in the last 12 months and who know their results by 57 percent between 2011 and 2012 (from 1.65 Million to 2.8 Million ¹⁰ ; 1,512,810 females and 1,279,801 males) ¹¹ . Malaria							Report 2012 The target of 20% was relative to the respondent population in the NARHS ¹² and not the entire population in the country.	
			M	lalaria					
Increase the percentage of under age 5 children sleeping under insecticide treated nets (percentage): Baseline: 3.6% (2009) Target: 60% (2013)	The percentage of under age 5 children sleeping under insecticide treated nets in the preceding night to the survey increased from 6 % in 2006 to 50.2 % in 2011 (Total population of children under 5 was 8,348,611 in 2011). This result is supported by a corresponding increase in households that owned at least insecticide treated nets/long lasting insecticide treated nets (ITN/LLIN) from 71.7 percent in 2011 compared to 2.6 percent in 2006.						Source: National Malaria Indicator Survey (NMIS) 2011.		
Increase the percentage of under age 5 children with fever treated with an effective anti-malarial within 24 hours from onset of symptoms in seven selected states: Baseline: 10% (2009) Target: 60% (2013)	The percentage of under age 5 children with fever who were treated with an effective anti-malarial medicine within 24 hours from onset of fever was 5.8 percent in 2010 from a baseline of 1.7 percent (NDHS 2008; 1.5 percent MICS 2007; and 0 LQAS 2006) ¹³ .					Source: Nigeria Demographic and Health Survey (NDHS) 2008; Nigeria Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS); Lot Quality Assurance Sampling (LQAS) 2006.			
5. Improve Access and	: d Inclusiven	ess to	Quality	and Re	levant	Educati	ion at a	II Level:	<u>:</u> S.
				Educati					-
,									
Increase transition rates from primary to junior secondary in targeted states:	The CPS to and girls. In rates in Ka boys	n Kadur	na, trans	sition fo	girls in	creased	d while th	he	Source: CPSCR
Increase transition rates from primary to junior secondary in targeted	and girls. In rates in Ka boys	n Kadur no rema	na, trans ained th	sition for e same	girls in	creased and de	d while the ecreased	he	Source: CPSCR
Increase transition rates from primary to junior secondary in targeted states: Baseline (2009): Kaduna (Girls 49.4%; Boys 59.9%);	and girls. In rates in Ka	n Kadur	na, trans ained th	sition fo	girls in	creased	d while the ecreased	he	Source: CPSCR
Increase transition rates from primary to junior secondary in targeted states: Baseline (2009): Kaduna (Girls 49.4%; Boys 59.9%); Kano (Girls 25%; Boys	and girls. In rates in Ka boys States (%) Actual	n Kadur no rema Kwara Girls 59	na, trans ained th Boys	e same Kano Girls 25	girls in for girls Boys 46	creased s and de Kadun Girls 51.8	d while the creased had been been been been been been been bee	he	Source: CPSCR
Increase transition rates from primary to junior secondary in targeted states: Baseline (2009): Kaduna (Girls 49.4%; Boys 59.9%);	and girls. In rates in Ka boys States (%) Actual Target 2011	Kwara Girls 59	Boys 59 44	Kano Girls 30	girls in for girls Boys 46 54	Kadun Girls 51.8 54.4	na Boys 50.7 64.9	he	Source: CPSCR
Increase transition rates from primary to junior secondary in targeted states: Baseline (2009): Kaduna (Girls 49.4%; Boys 59.9%); Kano (Girls 25%; Boys 49%); Kwara (Girls 38%;	and girls. It rates in Ka boys States (%) Actual Target 2011 Baseline 09	Kwara Girls 59 38	Boys 59 44	Kano Girls 25 30	Boys 46 54	Kadun Girls 51.8 54.4 49.4	a Boys 50.7 64.9 59.9	he d for	Source: CPSCR
Increase transition rates from primary to junior secondary in targeted states: Baseline (2009): Kaduna (Girls 49.4%; Boys 59.9%); Kano (Girls 25%; Boys 49%); Kwara (Girls 38%; Boys 44%) Target (2013): Kaduna (Girls 54.4%; Boys 64.9%); Kano (Girls 30%; Boys 54%); Kwara (Girls 38%; Boys 44%) Improve average national math and reading test scores of	and girls. It rates in Ka boys States (%) Actual Target 2011 Baseline	Kwara Girls 59 38 38	Boys 59 44 44	Kano Girls 25 30 25	Boys 46 54 49	Kadun Girls 51.8 54.4 49.4	a while the creased has been seen a Boys 50.7 64.9 59.9	he d for	Source: CPSCR
Increase transition rates from primary to junior secondary in targeted states: Baseline (2009): Kaduna (Girls 49.4%; Boys 59.9%); Kano (Girls 25%; Boys 49%); Kwara (Girls 38%; Boys 44%) Target (2013): Kaduna (Girls 54.4%; Boys 64.9%); Kano (Girls 30%; Boys 54%); Kwara (Girls 38%; Boys 44%) Improve average national math and	and girls. It rates in Ka boys States (%) Actual Target 2011 Baseline 09	Kwara Girls 59 38 38	Boys 59 44 44 44 as exceeding a	Kano Girls 25 30 25	Boys 46 54 49 T Math is acy test	Kadun Girls 51.8 54.4 49.4 Kadun Kad	a Boys 50.7 64.9 59.9	he d for	

Actual amount is 2,792,611.
 Nigeria Global AIDS Progress Report 2012.
 National HIV/AIDS and Reproductive Health Surveys (NARHS).
 The baseline used in the CPS and CPS PR was calibrated from standard sources.



	Actual	5.02	43.6	10.15	8.0	42.16	25.81	
Baseline (2009): Kaduna	Target	12.4	33.7	9.6	11.3	12.7	30.4	
(Reading 26.4%; Math	Baseline	8.4	29.7	5.6	7.3	8.7	26.4	
8.7%); Kano (Reading	09							
7.3%; Math 5.6%); Kwara								
(Reading 29.7%; Math								:
8.4%)								
Target (2013): Kaduna								:
(Reading 30.4%; Math								
12.7%); Kano (Reading								:
11.3%; Math 9.6%);								
Kwara (Reading 33.7%;								
Math 12.4%).								:
		Pos	t – Basi	c Educati	on			
Increase the	The proport							Source: CPSCR
percentage of public	with pass gr	ade in V	VASSCE	E achieve	d the C	PS target		
senior secondary								:
students with pass	Subjects		iology	Math	Englis	h		
grade in WASSCE	Actual		5.20	47.27	84.48			
disaggregated by Math,	Target	2	8	25	26			:
English, Science (Biology) (percentage):	2011	0 0	2	20	01			
(Diology) (percentage).	Baseline C	9 2	3	20	21			
Baseline (2009): English:								
21%; Math: 20%;								:
Biology: 23%.								
Target (2013): English:								:
50%; Math: 39%;								
Biology: 37%.								<u>.</u>
Increase the number of	The number							Source: CPSCR
students obtaining	Science and							:
grades B and above in	Institutions							
Science and	against targ							
Technology disciplines	Forty Four (aents w	ere enroi	iea in	
in federal post basic institutions (percentage	senior seco	iuai y Sc	1110015 111	2010.				
increase):								
morcuscy.								
Baseline (2009): 36,953								
(Male 14,975; Female								:
21,978)								
Target: 25% increase								1
Increase Equity in th								
Increase the number of	The CPS tai							Source: CPSCR
poor household	1,800 new o	ommun	ities) are	e now ber	nefiting f	rom HD s	services.	
utilizing primary health								:
care, basic education								
and rural water in								:
targeted communities in selected states ¹⁴ (#								
of poor households):								:
or pour nouscholus).								
Baseline: 50,000 (2009)								
Target: 150,000 (2013)								
 	·							··

¹⁴ Selected states include Abia, Benue, Delta, Imo, Anambra, Adamawa, Kogi, Niger, Bauchi, Enugu, Kebbi, Cross River, Plateau, Yobe, Osun, Oyo and Rivers.



	CPS FY09-FY12: Pillar III	Actual Results	Commente
	Improving Governance for Results	(as of current month/year)	Comments
	7. Improve Effectiveness of A	nticorruption Institutions	
	Increase in the cumulative total amount proceeds of corruption recovered (millions of USD): Baseline: USD 5.9 billion (2009)	Cumulative total amount proceeds of corruption recovered increased to US\$9.11 billion (2011), surpassing the CPS targets. The Bank supported the Nigeria Anti-Corruption Agency (EFCC) to strengthen its capacity to recover misappropriated funds through the Economic	Source: CPSCR
	Target: USD 7 billion (2013) Bill on Sovereign Wealth Fund passed by the Senate: Baseline (2009): No bill in place Target: (2013): Bill passed	Reform and Governance Project (ERGP). The Sovereign Wealth Fund (SWF) bill was passed by the Senate in 2011 and Governors concurred in 2012. A Sovereign Wealth Investment Agency was formed and its Board and Management constituted with a seed fund of \$1 billion from the Excess Crude Account (ECA).	Source: CPSCR
<u>Major</u> <u>Outcome</u> <u>Measures</u>	Comply with the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI): Baseline (2009): Nigeria is not EITI compliant Target (2013): Nigeria becomes EITI compliant	Based on the World Bank support to Nigeria Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (NEITI) and continuous engagement of USAID- supported civil society partners, the Oil and Gas Revenue audit for 2006 – 2008 was completed and the report made available to the public by the NEITI. Similar reports were completed for 1999 - 2004 and 2005. In addition, the NEITI engaged a consulting firm to conduct Oil and Gas Revenue audit for 2009 - 2011. Efforts were also made by the NEITI to ensure the implementation of the recommendations of remediation actions on the audit reports. With these actions, Nigeria became EITI compliant in 2011.	Source: CPSCR
	8. Improve Performance of M	anagement System in the Civil Service	
	Increase the number of Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) using new performance-based management system at Federal level (number):	The performance-based management system was launched and has been initiated by the Head of Service in October 2012 for 30 MDAs ¹⁵ . All civil servants including the Cabinet Ministers have to enter into Performance Contracts which will be evaluated annually.	Source : CPSCR
	÷		•
	Baseline: 0 (2009) Target: 6 (2013)	D 10044 0 D' 11	0,000
	Target: 6 (2013) Reduce database discrepancies between personnel records and payroll records in 3 selected states (% of discrepancies): Baseline (2009): 15%	By end-2011, Cross River had reduced the discrepancy to 3 percent, Kaduna to 0 percent and Bauchi to 8 percent from a baseline of 20-25 percent in 2009. This system is expected to enhance savings on recurrent expenditure in the states. For instance, estimated savings for Kaduna State was USD 0.1 million per year.	Source: CPSCR
	Target: 6 (2013) Reduce database discrepancies between personnel records and payroll records in 3 selected states (% of discrepancies):	discrepancy to 3 percent, Kaduna to 0 percent and Bauchi to 8 percent from a baseline of 20- 25 percent in 2009. This system is expected to enhance savings on recurrent expenditure in the states. For instance, estimated savings for	Source: CPSCR
	Target: 6 (2013) Reduce database discrepancies between personnel records and payroll records in 3 selected states (% of discrepancies): Baseline (2009): 15%	discrepancy to 3 percent, Kaduna to 0 percent and Bauchi to 8 percent from a baseline of 20- 25 percent in 2009. This system is expected to enhance savings on recurrent expenditure in the states. For instance, estimated savings for Kaduna State was USD 0.1 million per year.	Source: CPSCR Source: CPSCR

¹⁵ Thirty Federal Ministries and their agencies are covered under the Performance Management system. Some of these key ministries are; Health, Education, Agriculture and Natural Resources, Water Resources, Petroleum, Solid Minerals, Housing and Urban Development, Works, Transport, Aviation, Defense, Police Affairs and Communication Technology.



of government by Office of the Accountant General at Federal Level and selected states (number of months):	Accountant General reduced at Federal level and in selected states ¹⁶ from 6 – 9 months in 2010 to 2 – 3 months (Federal and States ¹⁷) which is in line with the CPS target.	
Baseline (2009): 6-9 months Target (2013): 3 months		
Reduce the time for issuing audit reports on Annual Accounts by the Office of the Auditor-General (number of months): Baseline (2009): 12 months Target (2013): 6 months	The time for issuing of audit report on Annual Accounts by Office of the Auditor-General reduced from 12 months in 2010 to 4.5 months in Bauchi, 2 months in Cross River and 5 months in Kaduna. At the federal level, the four-year backlog in 2005 reduced to a one-year back log in 2012.	Source : CPSCR
Increase in the share of government MDAs producing month-end financial statements within 7 days (percentage): Baseline (2009): 0% Target (2013): 75%	59 percent of the MDAs now produce automated statements from a zero baseline in 2010. In addition to this, the time taken to produce these reports reduced to 14 days in Bauchi, 7 days in Cross River and 14 days in Kaduna, down from an average of 60 days at the inception of the CPS.	Source : CPSCR
Implement multi-year budgeting in the Federal Government Nigeria (FGN) and in at least in 3 states: Baseline (2009): No Target (2013): Yes	Multi-year budgeting now taking place at Federal level and in Bauchi, Cross River, Kaduna and Lagos States.	Source: CPSCR
Prepare and publish Medium Term Sectoral Strategies (MTSS) in Lagos State's Ministries (# of ministries with MTSS prepared and published): Baseline (2009): 0 Target (2013): 10	The CPS target was achieved beyond the initial plan: As of April 2013, twenty Five (25) Ministries ¹⁸ in Lagos State are now preparing and publishing MTSS.	Source: CPSCR
Prepare the 2011 Budget based on at least 10 MTSS and in accordance with the Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF): Baseline (2009): No Target (2013): Yes	Bauchi, Cross River and Kaduna States prepared 2011 budgets based on MTSS ¹⁹ and in accordance with their MTEF. In 2010, thirteen (13) key federal MDAs developed and documented MTSS for the 2011 - 2013 period which formed the basis of more detailed budget submissions by the MDAs; and also for evaluation of the budget proposals by the parliament.	Source: CPSCR
Increase the percentage of contracts awarded above threshold through open	At the federal level, public contracts awarded above threshold through open competition exceeded the CPS target of 90 percent,	Source: CPSCR

¹⁶ The states are Bauchi, Cross River and Kaduna.

¹⁷ Cross River, Bauchi, Kaduna, Lagos.

¹⁸The Ministries are: Education; Health; Environment; Rural Development; Agriculture; Housing; Ministry of Economic Planning and Budget; Office of the head of service; Transportation; Establishment & Training; Youth and Social Development; Office of Sports; Justice; Women and Poverty Alleviation; Information; Finance; Special Duties; Home Affairs; Tourism and Intergovernmental Relations; Works and Infrastructure; Local Government and Chieftaincy Affairs; Lagos Waterfront Administration; Physical Planning and Rural Development, Lands Bureau and; State treasury office and Department management office.

¹⁹ These are in 10 key sectors.



 competition at the Federal level and in seven selected states ²⁰ (percentage):	increasing to 100 percent whereas the 30 percent value at state level fell below the target of 70 percent and was only a marginal increase from the baseline.	
Baseline (2009): Federal 50%; State 25%		
Target (2013): Federal 90%; State 70%		
Increase the percentage of public contract awards published at the Federal level and in five selected States (percentage): Baseline (2009): Federal 30%; State 0% Target (2013): Federal 100%; State 60%	The publication of public contracts awards increased from 30 percent in 2009 to 100 percent at Federal in 2013. In the states, it increased from 0 to between 90 and 100 percent. Lagos, Edo, Cross River, Bauchi, Rivers and Kaduna now publish 100 percent of all contracts above approved threshold, while Bauchi publishes 90 percent from a baseline of 30 percent at federal and zero at state level.	Source: CPSCR
Increase the number of MDAs with third party procurement monitoring (# MDAs): Baseline (2009): Federal = 0; State = 0 Target (2013): Federal = 40; State = 20 (4 in 5 selected states)	Procurement third party monitoring by organized civil societies has been introduced and MDAs with third party monitoring have increased to 28 at Federal and 12 at State level, falling below the CPS target of 40 MDAs at Federal and 20 at State level ²¹ . However, an electronic procurement portal has been established to further strengthen accountability.	Source: CPSCR
10. Strengthen National Statist	tical System	
Increase the percentage of statistical outputs released within General Dissemination System (GDDS) time and frequency limits (percentage):	83 percent of the targeted 100 percent of statistical outputs released within GDDS time and frequency limits, falling below the CPS target of 100 percent but well above the baseline of 10 percent in 2010.	Source: CPSCR
Baseline (2009): 10% Target (2013): 100%		
Increase the number of states producing an annual Statistical Year Book (number): Baseline (2009): 0 Target (2013): 17	As of December 2012, 15 states (Niger, Ondo, Lagos, Anambra, Ogun, Kano, Ekiti, Oyo, Zamfara, Borno, Ebonyi, Bayelsa, Kebbi, Cross River and Bauchi) have statistical year book no older than 2010, nearly reaching the CPS target of 17 States from a zero base. The statistical agencies at federal and state level have improved their capacity considerably within the CPS period. Starting from a very bleak background, twenty four (24) states ²² currently have statistical master plan in place; 15 ²³ have passed statistical Laws and 11 state bureaus of	Source: CPSCR
	statistics ²⁴ have been established with state Statistician General appointed.	

 $^{^{20}}$ The states are Lagos, Edo Rivers, Bauchi, Kaduna, Ekiti, Osun and Cross River. 21 The states are Lagos, River, Cross River, Bayelsa, Edo, Nasarawa, Enugu and Kaduna.

Anambra, Abia, Gombe, Niger, Plateau, Nasarawa, Kwara, Sokoto, Kaduna, Bauchi, Ondo, Ekiti, Lagos, Rivers, Delta, Cross River, Abia, Imo, Ogun, Enugu, Jigawa, Kano, Bayelsa and Edo
 Abia, Anambra, Rivers, Cross Rivers, Delta, Ondo, Ekiti, Niger, Kwara, Nasarawa, Sokoto, Zamfara, Gombe and Imo
 Anambra, Ondo, Cross River, Niger, Kwara, Ekiti, Lagos, Zamfara, Oyo and Gombe



Annex Table 2. Planned and Actual Lending, FY10-13 (US\$ Million)

Project ID	Project name	Proposed FY	Approval FY	Closing FY	Proposed Amount	Approved Amount	Outcome Rating
Project I	Planned Under CPS / CPSPR 2010-13						
P117088	Financial Sector and Public Financial Management Development Policy Credit	FY10	FY10	FY10	500.0	500.0	IEG: MS
P103499	Growth, Employment and Markets in States (GEMS)	FY10	FY11	Active	175.0	160.0	LIR: MU
P097026	Nigeria Public Sector Governance Reform and Development Project II	FY10	FY10	Active	100.0	120.0	LIR: MS
P115565	Additional Financing for the First National Urban Water Sector Reform Project	FY10	FY10	Active	100.0	80.0	LIR: S
P115658	Second National Urban Water Sector Reform Project	FY10	FY12	Active	80.0	120.0	LIR: MS
P112956	: Lagos Urban Transport Project 2	FY10	FY10	Active	150.0	190.0	LIR: S
	Sub-Total progr	ammed project	s CPS FY10		1,105.0	1,170.0	
P112805	Conditional CPSh Transfers Assistance Program	FY11	Dropped		100.0		
P115386	Nigeria Public/Private Partnership Program	FY11	FY11	Active	300.0	115.0	LIR: U
P120798	Nigeria States Health Investment Project	FY11	FY12	Active	150.0	150.0	LIR: MS
P126182	Nigeria Electricity and Gas Improvement Project Additional Financing	FY11	FY12	Active	100.0	100.0	LIR:S
P126190	Nigeria Electricity and Gas Improvement Project Additional Financing (Guarantees)	FY11	FY12	Active	200.0	200.0	LIR: Not available
P117148	West Africa Agricultural Productivity Program APL**	FY11	FY11	Active	100.0	51.0	LIR: MS
P117237	First Lagos State Development Policy Credit	FY11	FY11	F12	200.0	200.0	LIR: S
	Sub-Total progr	ammed project	s CPS FY11		1,150.0	816.0	
	<u> </u>					<u> </u>	
P124905	Erosion and Watershed Management Project	FY12	FY12	Active	450.0	500.0	LIR: U
P119236	Nigeria Rural Access & Renewable Energy Development Project	FY12	Dropped		100.0		
P123353	Edo State First Development Policy Operation	FY12	FY12	Active	75.0	75.0	LIR: S
P121455	State Employment and Expenditures for Results Project (SEFOR)	FY12	FY12	Active		200.0	LIR: S
	Sub-Total progr	ammed project	s CPS FY12		625.0	775.0	
P126964	Nigeria Youth Employment & Social Support Operation (YESSO)	FY13	FY13	Active	300.0	300.0	LIR: Not available
P122124	State Education Program Investment Project III	FY13	FY13	Active	150.0	150.0	LIR: Not available
P095003	Second Phase of the Rural Access and Mobility Project	FY13	FY13	Active	278.0	170.0	LIR: MU
	Edo State Second Development Policy Operation	FY13			75.0		
	Edo State Third Development Policy Operation	FY13			75.0		
P123352	Nigeria Lagos Second State Development Policy Credit	FY13	FY14		200.0		
P128171	Nigeria Public/Private Partnership Program	FY13	Dropped		200.0		
P123112	Irrigation and Water Resources Management Project	FY13	FY15		400.0		
	Sub-Total progr				1678.0	620.0	
		med projects C	PS FY10-13		4558.0	3381.0	
P124264	Unplanned Partnership for Polio Eradication Project - 3rd Additional Financing		FY11	FY12		60.0	LIR: S



P130788	Third National FADAMA Development Project - Additional Financing	FY13	Active		200.0	LIR: S
P130865	Polio Eradication Support	FY13	Active		95.0	LIR: S
P130012	Agricultural Transformation DPO	FY13	Active		100.0	LIR: Not available
	Total Non pr	ogrammed projects CP	S FY10-13		455.0	
		Total projects CP	S FY10-13	4558.0	3836.0	
			<u> </u>		<u>; </u>	
On-going		Approval FY	Closing FY		Approved Amount	
P063622	: NG-Fadama SIL 2 (FY04)	= 2004	2010		: 100.0 :	LIR: S
P070293	NG-Privatization Supt SIL (FY01)	2001	2010		114.3	IEG: MS
P070291	NG-HIV/AIDS Prog Dev (FY02)	2002	2010		90.3	IEG: U
P074963	NG-Lagos Urb Trans SIL (FY03)	2003	2011		100.0	IEG: MS
P100122	Avian Influenza Emergency ERL (FY06)	2006	2011		50.0	IEG: S
P096151	NG - State Edu Sector Project	2007	2012		65.0	IEG: MS
P069901	NG-Com Based Urb Dev (FY02)	2002	2012		110.0	LIR: S
P074447	NG-State Governance & Cp Bldg TAL (FY05)	2005	2012		18.1	IEG: S
P083082	: MSME	2004	2012		32.0	IEG: MS
P080295	: NG-Polio Eradication (FY03)	2003	2012		28.7	IEG: S
P070290	NG- Health System Dev. II (FY02)	2002	2012		127.0	IEG: MU
P086716	NG-Min Res Sustain Mgmt (FY05)	2005	2012		120.0	LIR: S
P090104	: NG-Natl Energy Dev SIL (FY06)	2006	2012		172.0	LIR: MS
P074132	: NG-S&T Educ in Post-Basic Ed (FY07)	2007	2013		180.0	LIR: MS
P088150	: NG-Econ Reform & Govern SIL (FY05)	2005	2013		140.0	LIR: MS
P071075	NG-Urb Water Sec Reform 1 SIL (FY04)	2004	Active		120.0	LIR: S
P071340	NG-Lagos Metropolitan Dev & Governance	2007	Active		200.0	LIR: MU
P090644	NG-Comm. Social Dev. (FY09)	2009	Active		200.0	LIR: S
P106280	NG-Lagos Eko Secondary Education (FY09)	2009	Active		95.0	LIR: HS
P097921	: NG-Malaria Control Booster Project (07)	2007	Active		180.0	LIR: S
P072644	: NG-Rural Access & Mobility - Ph. 1	2008	Active		60.0	LIR: S
P096648	: NG-Commercial Agriculture Development	2009	Active		150.0	LIR: MS
P102119	NG-HIV/AIDS Prog. Dev. II (FY09)	2009	Active		225.0	LIR: MS
P071391	: NG-Natl Urb Water Sec Ref SIM 2 (FY06)	2006	Active		200.0	LIR: MS
P090135	: NG-Federal Roads Development	2008	Active		330.0	LIR: MS
P096572	: NG-Fadama Development-III SIL (FY08)	2009	Active		250.0	LIR: S
P106172	: NG-Electricity and Gas Improvement	2009	Active		200.0	LIR: S
P090652	NG-Polio Eradication - Suppl. (FY05)	2005	2013		51.7	LIR: Not available
P102029	NG-Lagos Urban Transp. Add'l Fin (FY07)	2007	2011		50.0	LIR: HS
P102966	NG-Com-Based Pov Red - Add Fin (FY07)	2007	2010		25.0	LIR: S
P105097	: NG-HIV/AIDS APL - Add Fin (FY07)	2007	2011		50.0	LIR: MS
P110696	: NG-Polio Eradication - Add Fin (FY09)	2009	2013		50.0	LIR: S
P110697	NG-2nd Health Sys Dev II - Add Fin (FY09	2009	2013		90.0	LIR: MU
P115036	NG:Malaria Control Booster Proj-Add Fin Total Ongoing Projects	2009	Active		100.0 4074.1	LIR: S

Source: Nigeria CPS, CPSPR and WB Business Warehouse Table 2a.1, 2a.4 and 2a.7 as of 07/24/2013
*LIR: Latest internal rating. MU: Moderately Unsatisfactory. MS: Moderately Satisfactory. S: Satisfactory. HS: Highly Satisfactory.
**USD 51 million is Nigeria share this USD 300 million regional project



Annex Table 3. Analytical and Advisory Work for Nigeria, FY09 - FY13

Proj ID	Economic and Sector Work	Fiscal year	Output Type
P077459	GCMCG: Nigeria Country Assessment	FY09	Report
P106472	Employment and Growth Study	FY09	Report
P115133	Nigeria Debt Management Performance Assessment (DeMPA)	FY09	Report
P117236	Lagos State Rolling PER I	FY10	Report
P120768	Medium Term Debt Management Strategy (MTDS)	FY10	Report
P106171	Energy Sector Policy Analysis (FY11)	FY11	Report
P106706	Community-Based Health & Nutrition (FY10)	FY11	Report
P107337	Governance of Service Delivery (FY10)	FY11	Report
P108714	State Public Expenditure Reviews (PERs)	FY11	Report
P110184	Secondary Education & Training Policy Note-FY11	FY11	Policy Note
P117437	Nigeria Socio-Economic Assessment	FY11	Report
P117812	ICA (Investment Climate Assessment)	FY11	Report
P123599	ROSC Accounting & Auditing (FY11)	FY11	Report
P125489	Subnational DeMPA - Lagos	FY11	Report
P131031	DeMPA Federal - NIGERIA	FY12	EW/Not assigned
P117818	Enhancing the Climate Resilience of Grow	FY13	Policy Note
P127652	Transforming Nigeria into an African Lion	FY13	Report
P129132	MTDS Follow Up NIGERIA	FY13	EW/Not assigned
P130345	Subnational DeMPA Bauchi and Ondo	FY13	EW/Not assigned
P131553	FSAP Update Nigeria	FY13	EW/Not assigned
P133544	Education and Skills Note (FY13)	FY13	EW/Not assigned
P143869	Nigeria Poverty Notes	FY13	EW/Not assigned
P113432	Investment Climate Program & SPPIM	FY14	Report
P125206	Federal Govermt of Nigeria PEFA plus	FY14	Report
P127785	: Value Chain Analysis	FY14	Report
P143476	Nigeria Urbanization Review	FY14	EW/Not assigned
P144252	Housing Finance Policy Note	FY14	EW/Not assigned
Proj ID	Technical Assistance	Fiscal year	Output Type
P103180	HD Policy/SP/CCT/CDD (FY09)	FY09	How-To Guidance
P108709	Gender Multisector (FY09)	FY09	Institutional Development Plan
P109051	Inventory & Management of PCBs (FY09)	FY09	Institutional Development Plan
P114142	Dialogue with Civil Society	FY09	Knowledge-Sharing Forum
P114899	Nigeria ICT Policy Dialogue	FY09	How-To Guidance
P090895	EITI Mgt/Gas & Oil Sec Policy	FY10	Institutional Development Plan
P110134	Nigeria FS Strategy 2020 - Phase 2	FY10	Institutional Development Plan
P114300	Agriculture Strategy & NACRDB Restructuring	FY10	How-To Guidance
P115405	Gemloc: Nigeria country policy dialogue	FY10	How-To Guidance
P117962	Nigeria - ICT Policy Dialogue	FY10	How-To Guidance
P124403	GCMGL Gemloc TA Nigeria II	FY11	How-To Guidance
P125190	Disaster Risk Management in Nigeria	FY11	How-To Guidance
P114387	PSIA on petroleum subsidies	FY12	TA/IAR
P117629	Health Systems for Outcomes - Nigeria	FY12	How-To Guidance
P122368	Dialogue with Civil Society	FY12	Knowledge-Sharing Forum
P123354	Programmatic Integrated Fiduciary Assessment	FY12	Institutional Development Plan
P126659	Nigeria #10073 Enhance the Capacity of SEC	FY12	TA/IAR
P127365	CMPGL Nigeria III	FY12	TA/IAR
P129393	Nigeria #10183 Deposit Insurance Corp.	FY12	TA/IAR
P118398	Skills Development in IT and ITES	FY13	TA/IAR
P120715	Nigeria EITI Gas & Oil Sector Ph II	FY13	TA/IAR
P121351	State Public Expenditure Management	FY13	TA/EPD
P121810	Trade Facilitation and Policy Project	FY13	TA/IAR
P122284	Sector Governance & Service Delivery	FY13	TA/IAR
	,		



P127243	Social Safety Nets Develop Dialogue	FY13	TA/EPD
P131415	Open Government Technology Framework	FY13	TA/IAR
P133013	Financial Markets	FY13	TA/IAR
P133612	Nigerian National Assembly	FY13	TA/IAR
P143387	Spatial Analysis (FY13)	FY13	TA/IAR
P115976	Promoting Good Governance Niger Delta	FY14	TA/IAR
P128058	ICT for Social Accountability	FY14	TA/IAR
P131363	Niger Delta Social Accountability	FY14	TA/IAR
P131651	Program Management and Governance	FY14	TA/IAR
P131750	Increased Citizen Voice and Inclusion	FY14	TA/IAR
P132218	Trade in Agricultural Markets (TFF)	FY14	TA/IAR
P132236	Improved PFM-Governance Nigeria	FY14	TA/IAR
P132487	Improved Transparency-Fin, Oil and Gas	FY14	TA/IAR
P132900	Nigeria FSAP collaboration and follow up	FY14	TA/IAR
P133015	China Cooperation	FY14	TA/IAR
P143702	PDNA and Recovery Framework	FY14	TA/EPD
P144441	Nigeria Saving One Million Lives	FY14	TA/IAR
P144716	Statistics and Capacity Building	FY14	TA/IAR

Source: WB Business Warehouse Table ESW/TA 8.1.4 as of 07/24/2013



Annex Table 4. Grants and Trust Funds Active in FY10-13 (in US\$ million)

Project ID	Project name	TF ID	Approval FY	Closing FY	Approved Amount
P063622	Second National Fadama Development Project	IDA 38380	2004	2010	100.0
P106280	Lagos Eko Secondary Education Project	IDA Q6530	2009	2010	2.0
P073880	Roots & Tubers Expansion Project	COFN 04450	2000	2010	21.9
P114089	Power to the Poor: Off-Grid Lighting from CPSsava Waste in Nigeria	TF 93353	2009	2010	0.2
P117088	Financial Sector and Public Financial Management Development Policy Credit	IDA 46440	2010	2010	500.0
P088150	Federal Government Economic Reform and Governance Project	TF 56669	2007	2011	25.7
P074963	Lagos Urban Transport Project	IDA 37201	2007	2011	50.0
P083082	Micro, Small and Medium Enterprise Project	IDA 38390	2004	2012	32.0
P114267	Nigeria Phase II: EITI Implementation	TF 95381	2010	2012	0.9
P090104	Nigeria National Energy Development Project	IDA 40850	2006	2012	172.0
Project Information Not Available		TF 55210	2005	2012	28.3
P107166	Niger Delta Community Foundations Initiative	TF 94481	2010	2013	1.4
P121154	African Smallholders to Play Out Climate Drama on the Airwaves	TF 96917	2011	2013	0.1
P111697	Strengthening the Capacity of the Common Financial Management Platform	TF 94407	2010	2013	0.5
Project Information Not Available		TF 95528	2010	2013	25.6
P095003	NG-Rural Access & Mobility Project - Phase 2	IDA Q6290	2009	2013	2.0
P088150	Federal Government Economic Reform and Governance Project	IDA 40110	2005	2013	140.0
P103499	Nigeria - Growth & Employment in States	IDA Q6280	2009	Active	2.0
P120494	Support to International Economic Relations Department (IERD) of FMF	TF 97439	2011	Active	0.4
P093186	Nigeria National Energy Development Project - Carbon	TF 95796	2010	Active	3.0
P090644	Community and Social Development Project	IDA 44960	2009	Active	200.0
P119872	Nigeria Statistics Development Program (NSDP)	TF 99783	2011	Active	10.0
P121725	Support to the Nigerian Economic Summit Group	TF 99050	2011	Active	0.5
P104405	Pre-paid Health Scheme Pilot in Nigeria	TF 92182	2009	Active	6.0
P106172	Nigeria Electricity and Gas Improvement Project (NEGIP)	IDA 46200	2009	Active	200.0
P112329	EarthCare Solid Waste Composting Project	TF 97228	2010	Active	2.6
P096648	Commercial Agriculture Development	IDA 45390	2009	Active	150.0
P072644	Rural Access and Mobility Project (RAMP)	IDA 44080	2008	Active	60.0
P112956	Lagos Urban Transport Project 2	IDA 47670	2010	Active	190.0
P102119	Nigeria HIV/AIDS Program Development Project II	IDA 45960	2009	Active	225.0
P071391	Second National Urban Water Sector Reform Project	IDA 40860	2006	Active	200.0
P071391	Second National Urban Water Sector Reform Project	IDA 51290	2012	Active	120.0
P117148	West Africa Agricultural Productivity Program APL (WAAPP-1B)	IDA 48220	2011	Active	45.0
P090135	Nigeria Federal Roads Development Project	TF 56896	2009	Active	3.0
P096572	Third National FADAMA Development Project (FADAMA III)	IDA 52930	2013	Active	200.0
P098664	NG-CF Aba Cogeneration (FY06)	TF 56954	2007	Active	9.0
	Total				2,729.1

Source: Client Connection as of 7/24/2013



Annex Table 5. IEG Project Ratings for Nigeria, FY09-12

Exit FY	Proj ID	Project name	Total Evaluated (\$M)	IEG Outcome	IEG Risk to DO
2009	P069086	NG-Com Based Pov Reduc SIL (FY01)	94.0	SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2009	P069892	NG-Local Empowerment & Environmental Mgm	78.6	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2009	P072018	NG-Transmission Dev SIL (FY02)	115.7	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2010	P063622	NG-Fadama SIL 2 (FY04)	103.7	HIGHLY SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2010	P070291	NG-HIV/AIDS Prog Dev (FY02)	138.9	UNSATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2010	P070293	NG-Privatization Supt SIL (FY01)	110.6	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2010	P117088	Fin Sec + Pub Fin Mgmt DPC	507.5	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2011	P074963	NG-Lagos Urb Trans SIL (FY03)	165.1	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2011	P100122	Avian Influenza Emergency ERL (FY06)	48.3	SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2012	P070290	NG- Health System Dev. II (FY02)	240.5	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY	HIGH
2012	P074447	NG-State Governance & Cp Bldg TAL (FY05)	18.4	SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2012	P080295	NG-Polio Eradication (FY03)	187.0	SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2012	P083082	MSME	33.7	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2012	P096151	NG - State Edu Sector Project	63.7	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
		Total	1,905.9		

Source: BW Key IEG Ratings as of 07/232013



Annex Table 6. IEG Project Ratings for Nigeria, Exit FY10-13

Region	Total Evaluated (\$M)	Total Evaluated (No)	Outcome % Sat (\$)	Outcome % Sat (No)	RDO % Moderate or Lower Sat (\$) *	RDO % Moderate or Lower Sat (No) *
Nigeria	1,617.5	11.0	76.5	81.8	38.3	63.6
AFR	8,414.4	158.0	68.2	62.8	32.8	37.6
World	43,938.1	570.0	81.6	69.6	64.0	52.9

Source: WB Business Warehouse as of 07/23/2013

^{*} With IEG new methodology for evaluating projects, institutional development impact and sustainability are no longer rated separately.



Annex Table 7. Portfolio Status for Nigeria and Comparators, FY09-13

Fiscal year	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	Total
Nigeria						
# Proj	28.0	26.0	28.0	24.0	27.0	133.0
# Proj At Risk	10.0	13.0	5.0	3.0	7.0	38.0
% Proj At Risk	35.7	50.0	17.9	12.5	25.9	28.6
Net Comm Amt	4,067.1	3,968.4	4,330.3	4,466.2	5,161.2	21,993.2
Comm At Risk	1,234.4	1,845.8	1,031.8	515.0	1,445.0	6,072.1
% Commit at Risk	30.4	46.5	23.8	11.5	28.6	27.6
AFR						
# Proj	440.0	454.0	470.0	452.0	430.0	2,246.0
# Proj At Risk	131.0	137.0	117.0	108.0	115.0	608.0
% Proj At Risk	29.8	30.2	24.9	23.9	26.7	27.1
Net Comm Amt	28,177.8	34,188.5	37,466.4	38,962.9	41,212.3	180,007.8
Comm At Risk	6,950.5	9,494.2	7,949.7	6,299.8	14,090.1	44,784.4
% Commit at Risk	24.7	27.8	21.2	16.2	34.2	24.9
World						
# Proj	1,552.0	1,590.0	1,595.0	1,500.0	1,466.0	7,703.0
# Proj At Risk	344.0	366.0	337.0	333.0	368.0	1,748.0
% Proj At Risk	22.2	23.0	21.1	22.2	25.1	22.7
Net Comm Amt	131,076.4	158,287.4	168,248.7	168,407.7	171,249.8	797,270.1
Comm At Risk	19,929.9	28,186.1	22,978.5	23,723.1	40,131.0	134,948.7
% Commit at Risk	15.2	17.8	13.7	14.1	23.5	16.9

Source: WB Business Warehouse as of 08/05/2013



Annex Table 8a. Disbursement Ratio for Nigeria and Comparators, FY10-13

Fiscal Year	FY2009	FY2010	FY2011	FY2012	FY2013
Nigeria					
Disbursement Ratio (%)	18.3	20.4	15.7	20.4	19.4
Inv Disb in FY (\$M)	348.3	580.4	426.1	511.2	580.8
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY (\$M)	1,908.0	2,852.1	2,718.4	2,507.4	2,989.9
AFR					
Disbursement Ratio (%)	23.4	23.1	18.6	20.4	22.1
Inv Disb in FY (\$M)	3,345.1	3,852.2	4,289.9	4,793.3	5,299.0
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY (\$M)	14,283.7	16,679.9	23,078.9	23,521.4	23,950.4
World					
Disbursement Ratio (%)	25.7	26.3	21.7	20.0	19.8
Inv Disb in FY (\$M)	16,661.1	19,517.9	19,551.5	19,537.6	19,050.0
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY (\$M)	64,715.8	74,242.6	90,026.0	97,579.6	96,038.8

Business Warehouse disbursement ratio as of 08/09/13

Annex Table 8b. Net Disbursement and Charges for Nigeria, FY10-13 (\$M)

Period	Disb. Amt.	Repay Amt.	Net Amt.	Charges	Fees	Net Transfer
FY2009	353.1	158.3	194.8	11.8	16.8	166.2
FY2010	1,106.0	113.2	992.8	4.1	20.3	968.4
FY2011	434.2	85.4	348.8	1.0	26.7	321.0
FY2012	736.3	98.2	638.1	0.2	30.1	607.8
FY2013	606.9	78.7	528.2	0.0	33.8	494.4
Report Total	3,236.4	533.8	2,702.6	17.0	127.7	2,557.8

World Bank Client Connection 07/23/13



Annex Table 9. Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid for Nigeria (in US\$ Million)

Development Partners	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013
Australia	0.12	0.34	0.4	3.31	
Austria	0.59	0.7	0.85	0.91	
Belgium	3.7	0.28	0.29	0.04	
Canada	26.67	17.5	12.61	28.2	
Czech Republic	0.32	0.62	0.63	0.3	
Denmark	81.56	31.24	19 📜	0.42	
Finland	0.52	0.82	0.89	1.28	
France	11.87	9.06	8.88	10.56	
Germany	27.53	26.7	38.98	21.78	
Greece	2.23	1.92	1.45	1.45	
Iceland	ļ				
Ireland	3.26	1.71	1.78	1.91	
<u>Italy</u>	3.81	2.36	2.08	1.23	
Japan	28.96	28.88	23.87	38.57	
Korea	0.81	1.36	3.11	2.21	
Luxembourg	 	0.18			
Netherlands	1.65	4.54	9.11	21.49	
New Zealand					
Norway	6.27	9.17	14.07	11.83	
Portugal	0.08	0.04		0.11	
Spain	25.42	6.97	0.49	0.2	
Sweden	0.97	0.7	0.34	0.19	
Switzerland	0.07	0.12	0.5	1.91	
United Kingdom	47.21	188.89	264.61	298.86	
United States	363.89	354.03	445.9	409.23	
DAC Countries, Total	637.51	688.13	849.84	855.99	0
AfDB	<u> </u>			0.07	
AfDF	29.25	17.21	22.48	28.41	
Arab Fund (AFESD)	<u> </u>				
AsDB Special Funds					
BADEA	<u> </u>				
CarDB	<u> </u>				
EBRD	ļ <u></u>				
EU Institutions	91.55	81.86	60.29	52.04	
GAVI	51	5.22	7.62	27.3	
GEF		21.44	11.02	11.54	···
Global Fund	68.06	288.67	48 :	96.39	
IAEA	0.82	0.76	0.49	0.25	0.58
IBRD					
IDA .	333.04	475.6	975.39	604.25	·····
IDB Sp.Fund	ļ		<u></u>		
IFAD	6.49	5.53	2.8	8.35	
IFC	<u> </u>	<u>.</u>	<u>.</u>	<u>:</u>	···
IMF (Concessional Trust				🗓	
Funds)	<u> </u>				
Isl.Dev Bank	<u> </u>	0.02	3.16	15.18	
Montreal Protocol	<u> </u>			<u></u>	
Nordic Dev.Fund	<u> </u>			<u></u>	
OFID	<u> </u>				
OSCE	<u> </u>				
UNAIDS	1.04	0.83	1.83	2.13	
UNDP	14.54	14.83	15.35	11.68	
UNECE	<u>; </u>	<u></u>			
UNFPA	9.27	5.52	6.74	6.22	
UNHCR	1.56	1.03	0.75	<u></u>	
UNICEF	43.3	48.83	54.32	52.11	



Development Partners	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013
UNPBF				:	
UNRWA				:	
UNTA	0.98				
WFP				:	
WHO				3.62	
Other Multilaterals					
Multilateral, Total	650.9	967.35	1210.24	919.54	0.58
Bulgaria					
Chinese Taipei					
Cyprus	0.01	0.02			
Estonia					
Hungary			0.24		
Israel	0.8	1.02	0.75	0.28	
Kuwait (KFAED)					
Latvia					
Liechtenstein					
Lithuania					
Malta					
Poland	0.18	0.12	0.12	0.08	
Romania			0.12	0.14	
Russia	:				
Saudi Arabia				:	
Slovak Republic					
Slovenia	0.1	0.09			
Thailand	0.02	0.03	0.02		
Turkey	0.55	0.21	0.48	0.5	
United Arab Emirates	0.09	0.1	0.15	0.14	
Other donor countries					
Non-DAC Countries, Total	1.75	1.59	1.88	1.14	0
All Development Partners, Total	1290.16	1657.07	2061.96	1776.67	0.58

Data extracted on 23 Jul 2013 20:46 UTC (GMT) from OECD. Stat



Annex Table 10. Economic and Social Indicators for Nigeria, 2009 – 2012

				Nigeria AFR		World	
Series Name	2009 2010 2011 2012				2012		
Growth and Inflation						J	
GDP growth (annual %)	7.0	8.0	7.0	7.0	7.3	4.0	1.8
GDP per capita growth (annual %)	4.0	5.0	4.0	4.0	4.3	1.0	0.8
GNI per capita, PPP (current international \$)	2,020.0	2,150.0	2,270.0	2,420.0	2,215.0	2,134.8	11,324.3
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$)	1,150.0	1,240.0	1,260.0	1,430.0	1,270.0	1,228.0	9,328.3
Inflation, consumer prices (annual %)	12.0	14.0	11.0	12.0	12.3	6.0	4.0
Composition of GDP (%)							
Agriculture, value added (% of GDP)						12.7	3.0
Industry, value added (% of GDP)						29.3	26.5
Services, etc., value added (% of GDP)						58.0	70.5
Gross fixed capital formation (% of GDP)						21.3	20.0
Gross domestic savings (% of GDP)						16.8	20.3
External Accounts							
Exports of goods and services (% of GDP)	35.0	35.0	40.0		36.7	32.0	28.7
Imports of goods and services (% of GDP)	30.0	30.0	36.0		32.0	35.8	28.7
Current account balance (% of GDP)	8.0	6.0	4.0		6.0		
External debt stocks (% of GNI)	7.0	6.0	6.0		6.3		
Total debt service (% of GNI)	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	1.3	
Total reserves in months of imports	8.0	5.0	4.0		5.7	5.7	14.0
Fiscal Accounts *							! !
General government revenue (% of GDP)	17.8	20.0	29.9	28.0	23.9		
General government total expenditure (% of	07.0	047		07.4			
GDP)	27.2	26.7	29.2	27.1	27.5		
General government net lending/borrowing	0.4	/ 7	0.7	0.0	2 /		
(% of GDP)	-9.4	-6.7	0.7	0.9	-3.6		
General government gross debt (% of GDP)	15.2	15.5	17.2	17.8	16.4		
Social Indicators							
Health							
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	51.0	51.0	52.0		51.3	54.3	69.7
Immunization, DPT (% of children ages 12-	63.0	40.0	47.0		59.7	72.2	02.2
23 months)	03.0	69.0	47.0		39.7	72.3	83.3
Improved sanitation facilities (% of	31.0	31.0			31.0	30.5	62.5
population with access)	31.0	31.0			31.0	30.3	02.3
Improved water source (% of population	58.0	58.0			58.0	61.0	88.0
with access)	30.0	30.0			30.0	01.0	
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	83.0	81.0	78.0		80.7	71.0	38.0
Education							
School enrollment, preprimary (% gross)	13.0	14.0			13.5	17.7	48.3
School enrollment, primary (% gross)	83.0	83.0			83.0	99.7	106.7
School enrollment, secondary (% gross)	39.0	44.0			41.5	39.7	70.0
Population							
Population, total	155,381,	159,707,7		168,833,7	162,028,8	875,784,6	6,925,695,5
	020.0	80.0	25.0	76.0	75.3	32.3	96.0
Population growth (annual %)	3.0	3.0	3.0	3.0	3.0	3.0	
Urban population (% of total)	48.0	49.0	50.0	50.0	49.3	36.3	52.0

Source: DDP as of July 22, 2013
*International Monetary Fund, World Economic Outlook Database, July 2013



Annex Table 11. Nigeria: Millennium Development Goals

	1990	1995	2000	2005	2011
Goal 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger					
Employment to population ratio, 15+, total (%)	53	53 :	52	51 ;	52
Employment to population ratio, ages 15-24, total (%)	30	31	32	33	34
GDP per person employed (constant 1990 PPP \$)	3,590	3,212	3,281	4,865	6,230
Income share held by lowest 20%	4	5		5	6
Malnutrition prevalence, weight for age (% of children under 5)	35	35	27	26	
Poverty gap at \$1.25 a day (PPP) (%)	31	32		29	22
Poverty headcount ratio at \$1.25 a day (PPP) (% of population)	62	69		63	54
Vulnerable employment, total (% of total employment)					
Goal 2: Achieve universal primary education					
Literacy rate, youth female (% of females ages 15-24)	62			61 :	66
Literacy rate, youth male (% of males ages 15-24)	81			78	78
Persistence to last grade of primary, total (% of cohort)			<u> i</u>	78	80
Primary completion rate, total (% of relevant age group)		!		83	74
Adjusted net enrollment rate, primary (% of primary school age children)		:	65	67	58
Goal 3: Promote gender equality and empower women					
Proportion of seats held by women in national parliaments (%)		!	3	6	7
Ratio of female to male primary enrollment (%)	79	83 :	82 :	85	91
Ratio of female to male secondary enrollment (%)	78		85	84	88
Ratio of female to male tertiary enrollment (%)	33		79 :	71	
Share of women employed in the nonagricultural sector (% of total nonagricultural employment)		:	18.6	21.1	
Goal 4: Reduce child mortality					_
Immunization, measles (% of children ages 12-23 months)	54	44 :	33 :	41	71
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	127	125	113	96	78
Mortality rate, under-5 (per 1,000 live births)	214	211 :	188	156	124
Goal 5: Improve maternal health					_
Adolescent fertility rate (births per 1,000 women ages 15-19)	:	135 :	130 :	122	113
Births attended by skilled health staff (% of total)	31	:	42	35	
Contraceptive prevalence (% of women ages 15-49)	6	13	15 :	15 .	
Maternal mortality ratio (modeled estimate, per 100,000 live births)	1,100	1,000	970	820	630
Pregnant women receiving prenatal care (%)	57		64	58	
Unmet need for contraception (% of married women ages 15-49)	21	:	17	20	
Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria, and other diseases					
Children with fever receiving antimalarial drugs (% of children under age 5 with fever)	:	:	:	34 :	49
Condom use, population ages 15-24, female (% of females ages 15-24)			7 :	8	
Condom use, population ages 15-24, male (% of males ages 15-24)	:	:	32	38	
Incidence of tuberculosis (per 100,000 people)	128	139	172	175	118
Prevalence of HIV, female (% ages 15-24)		:	:	I	2.9
Prevalence of HIV, male (% ages 15-24)		:		:	1.1
Prevalence of HIV, total (% of population ages 15-49)	0.5	2.3	3.7	3.6	3.7
Tuberculosis CPSe detection rate (%, all forms)	16	9 :	12 :	26	45
Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability					
CO2 emissions (kg per PPP \$ of GDP)	0	0 :	0 :	0 =	0
CO2 emissions (metric tons per capita)	0	0 :	1	1 :	0
Forest area (% of land area)	18.9		14.4	12.2	9.5
Improved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)	37	36	34	32	31
Improved water source (% of population with access)	47	50	53	57	58
Marine protected areas (% of territorial waters)	0	0 :	0 :	0	0
Net ODA received per capita (current US\$)	3	2	1	46	11
Goal 8: Develop a global partnership for development		- :	<u>-</u>		<u>-</u>
Debt service (PPG and IMF only, % of exports of goods, services and primary income)	22	14 :	8 :	15 🗄	0
Internet users (per 100 people)	0.0	0.0	0.1	3.5	28.4
Mobile cellular subscriptions (per 100 people)	0	0 :	0 :	13	59
Telephone lines (per 100 people)	0	0 :	0	1	0
Fertility rate, total (births per woman)	6	6 :	6 :	6	<u>5</u>
Other	·		<u>_</u> .	<u>_</u>	
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$)	270	220 :	270 :	630	1,260
GNI, Atlas method (current US\$) (billions)	25.5	23.6	33.4	87.7	207.3
Gross capital formation (% of GDP)	20.0	23.0 :	33.7 :	07.7	201.3
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	46	45 :	46 :	49	<u></u> 52
Literacy rate, adult total (% of people ages 15 and above)	55	40 ;	40 :	55	61
Population, total (billions)	0.1	0.1	0.1 :	0.1	0.2
Trade (% of GDP)		86.5	86.0	77.6	
Haue (70 UI GUF)	72.2	Ö.0ö	U.0ŏ	11.0	75.2

Source: World Development Indicators

