



1. Project Data

Project ID P144454	Project Name GPE-BEP		
Country Pakistan	Practice Area(Lead) Education		
L/C/TF Number(s) TF-19124,TF-B0772	Closing Date (Original) 30-Apr-2020	Total Project Cost (USD) 44,175,000.00	
Bank Approval Date 18-Mar-2015	Closing Date (Actual) 31-Aug-2021		
	IBRD/IDA (USD)	Grants (USD)	
Original Commitment		44,175,000.00	44,175,000.00
Revised Commitment		44,175,000.00	44,175,000.00
Actual		44,175,000.00	44,175,000.00
Prepared by Judith Hahn Gaubatz	Reviewed by Judyth L. Twigg	ICR Review Coordinator Eduardo Fernandez Maldonado	Group IEGHC (Unit 2)

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

According to the Grant Agreement (page 6) and the Project Appraisal Document (PAD, page 15), the project objectives were as follows:



- **To increase school enrollment and retention in project supported schools, with a special focus on girls' participation; and to develop mechanisms for information collection and use for the improved management of education.**

The project objectives remained the same throughout the project period; however, one key outcome indicator target was revised downwards, and therefore a split rating is assessed.

b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?

Yes

Did the Board approve the revised objectives/key associated outcome targets?

Yes

Date of Board Approval

18-Jul-2019

c. Will a split evaluation be undertaken?

Yes

d. Components

Component 1: Access and Equity (Appraisal: US\$ 23.2 million; Additional Financing: US\$ 6.5 million; Actual: US\$ 24.5 million): This component aimed to improve access to and equity of girls and boys in schooling. Activities included: construction of 2000 primary schools (with the site selection process based on (i) confirmed need and demand in communities that lacked a school facility; (ii) third-party validation to ensure availability of teachers and children; and (iii) community partnerships for school management); and upgrading of 50 primary girls' schools to middle schools and 10 middle girls' schools to high school (with the site selection based on teacher availability, especially for science and mathematics).

Component 2: Quality and Increased Accountability (Appraisal: US\$ 6.03 million; Additional Financing: US\$ 0; Actual: US\$ 8.7 million): This component aimed to improve quality of teaching. Activities included: development of an early childhood education (ECE) policy and curriculum; development of teacher management and planning tools; strengthening of data collection tools and quality; and a learning assessment.

Component 3: Technical Assistance for Improved Capacity for Management and Monitoring (Appraisal: US\$ 4.76 million; Additional Financing: US\$ 4.0 million; Actual: US\$ 9.4 million): This component aimed to support the establishment of systems and procedures for effective planning and implementation of the project, including monitoring systems.

e. Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates
Project Cost



- The appraised project cost was US\$ 34.0 million. With the approval of additional financing, the total project cost increased to US\$ 44.175 million, which disbursed in its entirety.

Financing

- The project was financed by a grant from the Global Partnership for Education (GPE) in the amount of US\$ 34.0 million.
- Additional Financing in the form of a US\$ 10.5 million grant from the European Commission was approved in July 2019.

Borrower Contribution

- There was no planned Borrower contribution.

Dates

- *November 2018*: The project closing date was extended from December 2018 to March 2019 due to implementation delays.
- *March 2019*: The project closing date was extended from March 2019 to June 2019 due to implementation delays.
- *June 2019*: The project closing date was extended from June 2019 to September 2019 to allow for completion of activities and to finalize the proposal for Additional Financing.
- *July 2019*: The project was restructured to provide additional financing of US\$ 10.175 million, to revise the project design (focusing on rehabilitating existing schools rather than constructing new ones, increasing support to upgrading of girls secondary schools and teacher salaries, and providing transportation activities), and to revise the results framework including upward revision of the targets for girls' enrollment and student retention, and downward revision of the target for boys' enrollment. The project closing date was extended from September 2019 to April 2020.
- *April 2020*: The project closing date was extended from April 2020 to June 2021 due to COVID-related delays.
- *May 2021*: The project closing date was extended from June 2021 to August 2021 due to COVID-related delays.

3. Relevance of Objectives

Rationale

Balochistan is Pakistan's largest province in terms of land mass but the smallest in population, with less than 4% of the country's population. It is characterized by low economic growth, low social indicators (low net enrollment rate, low immunization rate, and high infant mortality rate), and fragility, including weak governance, low human resource capacity, and internal security conflicts. In the education sector, public sector education is free but participation rates are very low (56% net enrollment in primary school, 40% for girls) due to low quality and weak accountability mechanisms. As reported in the PAD (page 12), poor education outcomes are evidenced by low access (fewer than 2 in 5 children aged 5-9 are enrolled in primary schools), low efficiency (late enrollments, low survival rates, and repetition), and high inequities



(females are 4.5 times more likely than males to be out of school - according to the PAD (pages 16 and 17), the lack of middle and high schools for girls is cited as one of the main reasons for dropping out of school after grade 5, as well as inadequate attention to children in early grades). At the time of project appraisal, out of the approximately 22,000 settlements in the province, 40% did not have access to a school. For those that did have existing schools, the facilities were generally in poor physical condition, with approximately 7% of schools lacking a building, thereby functioning in temporary shelters or without shelter. An estimated one million children were out of school in the province (PAD, page 13).

In response to these challenges, the government of Pakistan sought participation in the GPE, which aims to support education in fragile and conflict-affected states, promote girls' education, increase basic numeracy and literacy skills in primary school, and improve teacher effectiveness. As a requirement to receive a GPE grant, the province of Balochistan prepared an Education Sector Plan (2012-17) that stated its objectives as follows: to establish schools, to remove bottlenecks to school availability at the middle and secondary levels, to institutionalize ECE, to strengthen capacity of teachers, to increase use of data in decision making and planning, to increase community involvement in education management, and to improve the teaching and learning process. The project's objectives were highly relevant to these country education sector strategies.

In addition, the most recently available Bank Country Partnership Strategy (FY15-19) identified "inclusion" and "service delivery" as key results areas, highlighting the particular vulnerability of women and girls and those living in conflict-affected areas. An increase in girls' gross primary education enrollment rate was included as a key outcome indicator.

Rating

High

4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy)

OBJECTIVE 1

Objective

To increase school enrollment in project-supported schools, with a special focus on girls' participation (ORIGINAL outcome targets)

Rationale

The theory of change was clear. The activity to build or improve school facilities would create additional places for children to enroll in school. Teacher professional development and school management committee training would likely contribute to improved quality of education, alongside ECE offerings that would increase readiness for primary school and likelihood of primary school enrollment. The focus on girls' participation was initially reflected in the project elements of hiring female teachers and establishing upper grade school



facilities for girls; with additional financing from the European Union, the focus was further sharpened through revisions to school design including separate latrines, boundary walls, and separate classrooms, as well as the provision of transportation. A critical assumption of the theory of change was that there would be a demand for schooling, which would be verified by the community-based site selection process.

Outputs

- Construction of 708 new primary schools (original target: 2000; revised target: 725). These schools were selected according to a transparent school site selection process that emphasized verified demand in communities without an existing school facility, third-party validation to ensure availability of teachers and children, and community partnerships to manage the school. The shortfall in achieving the original target was due to COVID-19 shutdowns, regional security concerns that created challenges in accessing some school sites, and, most significantly, a change in school design. According to the ICR (page 11), the original design of the simple school structures needed to be revised to take into account necessary climate (insulation from hot and cold weather) and gender (separate classrooms and water/sanitation facilities) considerations; the modified design required additional financing and time to implement.
- Improvements to 1,186 classrooms through physical enhancements (target: 1,000) in both new and existing schools.
- Provision of furniture to 1,099 schools (original target: 2000; revised target: 1,145) and teaching and learning materials to 1,113 schools (original target: 2000; revised target: 1,145). According to the project team, these were provided to the newly established primary schools, the upgraded schools, and also "feeder" and "next level" schools (primary schools that would feed enrollment to the newly upgraded middle schools, and high schools that would eventually receive enrollment from the upgraded middle schools).
- Development of ECE policy, curriculum, and teaching and learning materials.
- Delivery of ECE programs in 828 schools (original target: 2000; revised target: 845).
- Development of teaching and planning tools, including monitoring teachers' use of tools.
- Provision of training to 2,632 teachers (original target: 4,000; revised target: 2,488) on using the teaching materials and management tools, including 374 teachers who went on to teach in the new middle and high schools for girls. According to the project team, over 90% of the teachers trained were female, meeting the qualifications outlined in the PAD.
- Provision of training to 5,927 school management committee members on school management (original target: 10,000; revised target: 6,365). According to the project team, the committees played a vital role in various functions such as enrollment campaigns, maintenance and supervision of stocks, ensuring teacher attendance by supporting their accommodation or other affordable support garnered from the community, and providing an important additional supervision layer for ensuring quality and timeliness of civil works.

However, the activity to provide transportation for girls and female teachers, which was added during the project restructuring, was only partially completed. While a planned study on the viability of a transport facility to address the issue of dropouts and difficulties faced by female students and teachers due to large distances of schools from their homes was carried out, the pilot activity to provide transportation was cancelled due to COVID-19 restrictions. However, the project team noted that the government has endorsed the study and is



planning to seek solutions based on the study's findings, and future Bank engagements will also build upon the findings.

Outcomes

- 30,931 boys and 99,558 girls (grades 1-5) were enrolled in project-supported schools. This fell short of the original target for boys (48,000) but surpassed the original target for girls (48,000). These enrollment figures represented students in both newly established schools and in existing schools. According to additional data provided by the project team, the number of newly enrolled boys was 8,310 and the number of newly enrolled girls was 25,632. These latter figures hence represent the increase in school enrollment resulting from project support.
- 76% of the total beneficiaries were girls, surpassing the target of 70%. The gender enrollment gap (ratio of girls to boys) in project-supported schools improved from 2.10 (i.e. 1 girl per every 50 boys) in early 2019 to 3.2 percent at completion (i.e. 1 girl per every 31 boys), thus achieving the 3 percent target (i.e. 1 girl per every 33 boys).

Achievement is rated Modest as, with respect to project supported schools, the project met its target with respect to girls' enrollment but fell short from its target for boys. In addition, the additional figures provided by the project team indicate that the majority of enrolled students were not newly enrolled but already in school.

Rating Modest

OBJECTIVE 1 REVISION 1

Revised Objective

To increase school enrollment in project-supported schools, with a special focus on girls' participation (REVISED outcome targets)

Revised Rationale

Outcomes

- 30,931 boys and 99,558 girls (grades 1-5) were enrolled in project schools. This surpassed the revised targets for boys (19,942) and for girls (48,366). According to additional data provided by the project team, the number of newly enrolled boys was 8,310 and the number of newly enrolled girls was 25,632.



Achievement is rated Substantial. While the project surpassed its (downward) revised target for boys' enrollment and the (upward) revised target for girls' enrollment, the additional figures provided by the project team indicated that the majority of enrolled students were not newly enrolled but already in school.

Revised Rating

Substantial

OBJECTIVE 2

Objective

To increase school retention in project-supported schools, with a special focus on girls' participation (ORIGINAL outcome targets)

Rationale

The theory of change for the second objective to increase retention, which has some overlap with the theory of change for the first objective to increase access, included construction/ upgrading of middle and high schools for girls, as lack of these facilities was cited as one of the main reasons for drop out after grade 5, and professional development of teachers for these schools. In addition, provision of early childhood education (including development of curriculum and materials) was expected to improve quality of education and hence increase likelihood of staying in schools.

Outputs

In addition to the outputs reported above:

- Upgrading of 195 primary schools into middle schools (target: 50) and 25 middle schools into upper secondary schools (target: 10).
- Provision of COVID-19 sanitization supplies to 1,286 schools.
- Equipping of 85 schools with science lab equipment.

Outcomes

- The retention rate at the newly-constructed project schools was 81.7% at project closing, achieving the original target of 80%. According to the project team, the baseline was 0%, as it measured rates at newly constructed schools where there were no students previously. Additional data provided by the project team (enrollment by grade and gender, for 2017, 2018, 2020, and 2021) indicated that retention rates from one year to the next (2017 to 2018, and 2020 to 2021) for girls ranged from 75% to 96%. In particular, the retention rate for girls from 5th grade to 6th grade (when girls make the transition from primary to middle school) was 77% in 2017-2018 and 76% in 2020-21.
- 39,014 girls were enrolled in grades 6-10 in project-supported schools, far surpassing the original target of 2,000. According to additional data provided by the project team, 4,693 girls were newly enrolled while 34,321 were already enrolled (and continuing in middle and high school).



Achievement is rated Substantial due to evidence of continued enrollment of girls from one school year to the next.

Rating
Substantial

OBJECTIVE 2 REVISION 1

Revised Objective

To increase school retention in project supported schools, with a special focus on girls' participation (REVISED outcome targets)

Revised Rationale

Outcomes

- The school retention rate was 81.7%, achieving the revised target of 81%. See above for additional data provided by the project team.
- 39,014 girls were enrolled in grades 6-10, far surpassing the revised target of 9,127. According to additional data provided by the project team, 4,693 girls were newly enrolled while 34,321 were already enrolled (and continuing in middle and high school).

Achievement is rated Substantial due to evidence of continued enrollment of girls from one school year to the next.

Revised Rating
Substantial

OBJECTIVE 3

Objective

To develop mechanisms for information collection and use for the improved management of education

Rationale

The theory of change was clear. Activities to strengthen data collection methods, strengthen the quality of data collected (including through use of technology), and conduct learning assessments were likely to contribute to the production of timely and reliable data to inform decision making and management of the education sector.



Outputs

- Strengthening of data collection tools, including through the use of geographic information systems, school census instruments, and a real-time school monitoring system, which featured an Android application that sent data directly from the field to the customized Balochistan Education Management Information System (BEMIS) dashboard.
- Provision of training to 2,632 teaching staff and 5,927 members of parent-teacher school management committees on data collection.

Outcomes

- Data collected through the BEMIS was used to generate regular progress reports on selected indicators, which were made public on the government website.
- The ICR (pages 14-15) reported the following uses of education data collected: improvements in the teacher recruitment process through externally administered tests, supervision of highly geographically dispersed schools, publication of school performance indicators, review of education sector plan progress by donors, monitoring of teacher attendance, functioning of District Education Groups, and decision-making at the provincial level.

Achievement is rated Substantial due to evidence of improved management of education using data collection systems.

Rating

Substantial

OVERALL EFFICACY

Rationale

Efficacy under the original outcome targets is rated Substantial due to Modest achievement of the first objective to increase enrollment, Substantial achievement of the second objective to increase retention, and Substantial achievement of the third objective to develop mechanisms for information collection and use for the improved management of education.

Overall Efficacy Rating

Substantial



OVERALL EFFICACY REVISION 1

Overall Efficacy Revision 1 Rationale

Efficacy under the revised outcome targets is rated Substantial due to Substantial achievement of the first objective to increase enrollment, Substantial achievement of the second objective to increase retention, and Substantial achievement of the third objective to develop mechanisms for information collection and use for the improved management of education.

The Additional Financing in the amount of US\$ 10.5 million, provided by the European Union, contributed significantly to the achievement of targets and objectives.

Overall Efficacy Revision 1 Rating

Substantial

5. Efficiency

An economic analysis was not prepared either at appraisal or during preparation of the Additional Financing. However, the ex-post analysis in the ICR calculated economic returns using appraisal figures (estimated project costs and target values for PDO indicators). Benefits were calculated as the increased lifetime labor earnings of the beneficiary students, i.e. increased number of girls and boys graduating from primary schools (grade 5) in newly established schools and in upgraded schools, and increased number of girls graduating from secondary schools (grade 10), assuming an 80% completion rate. Costs included project costs and additional four years of teacher salaries. The result was a net present value (NPV) of US\$75.5 million and an internal rate of return (IRR) of 15%. The analysis using actual figures at completion resulted in an NPV of US\$93.2 million and IRR of 18%, both of which compare favorably to the appraisal estimates. Also, considering the government's annual school budget spending of about PKR 50 billion per one million children, the project's yearly budget of PKR 1 billion per 170,000 children compares favorably and thus indicates that the spending per student for this project was lower than the government's.

However, with regards to implementation efficiency, the cost of school construction per unit was higher than originally estimated due to significant school design modifications that led to a reduced number of schools constructed within the same overall financing envelope (although the reduced targets for increased enrollment and retention for girls were still achieved). Although experience from prior operations in the education sector in the country had already noted the importance of gender and climate considerations in school design, these were not incorporated in the original design and thus necessitated significant revisions to the project components four years into the project period. In addition, there were delays in the project restructuring due to ongoing discussions regarding potential additional financing, as well as multiple project closing date extensions (16 months total). These factors led to significantly diminished implementation efficiency. Therefore, overall Efficiency is rated Modest.

Efficiency Rating

Modest



a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR) and/or Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation:

	Rate Available?	Point value (%)	*Coverage/Scope (%)
Appraisal		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable
ICR Estimate	✓	18.00	100.00 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable

* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.

6. Outcome

Project under original targets – Moderately Satisfactory

Relevance is rated High due to strong alignment with country conditions and Bank/country strategic priorities. Efficacy is rated Substantial due to modest achievement of the first objective to increase enrollment (with achievement of targets for girls but not for boys), substantial achievement of the second objective to increase retention and substantial achievement of the objective to develop mechanisms for information collection and use for the improved management of education. Efficiency is rated Modest due to significant implementation inefficiencies, namely the modifications to the key project activity of school construction four years into the project period.

Project under revised targets – Moderately Satisfactory

Relevance is rated High due to strong alignment with country conditions and Bank/country strategic priorities. Efficacy is rated Substantial due to substantial achievement of the first objective to increase enrollment, substantial achievement of the second objective to increase retention and substantial achievement of the objective to develop mechanisms for information collection and use for the improved management of education. Efficiency is rated Modest due to significant implementation inefficiencies, namely the modifications to the key project activity of school construction four years into the project period.

Overall outcome – Moderately Satisfactory

According to harmonized IEG/OPCS guidelines, the overall outcome of a restructured project is determined by weighting the amount of the Grant that disbursed at the time of restructuring. As the outcome rating for the project before and after the restructuring is Moderately Satisfactory for both, the combined rating is also the same.

a. Outcome Rating Moderately Satisfactory



7. Risk to Development Outcome

The project objectives continue to be highly relevant to the government's current education sector plan, and therefore they are likely to remain priorities for the government. All schools established through project support were "mainstreamed" into the education sector; for example, teacher salaries have been paid by the government since July 2018 (this was in response to the lesson learned from the prior project, in which there were delays in government recognition of the new community-established schools thus preventing grade 5 graduates from enrolling at government middle schools in a timely manner). In addition, the government adopted the real-time school monitoring mechanism developed under the project. Continued capacity building support is being provided through the ongoing Balochistan Human Capital Investment Project, approved in June 2020, as well as activities to increase access to and quality of education, including for girls. The project team also clarified that as the project-supported schools were fully integrated into the public administrative system including receiving a government school identification code, thereby are receiving annual funding for operations and maintenance. Lastly, the new school designs that are more responsive to disaster-risk, climate/weather, and gender considerations are still being implemented to this date in new government school constructions.

8. Assessment of Bank Performance

a. Quality-at-Entry

The project design was strongly aligned to country and GPE objectives, while taking into account some implementation challenges such as security concerns, low capacity, and a widely dispersed population. The project design aimed to support implementation of the Balochistan Education Sector Plan, which had been developed following a comprehensive needs assessment in consultation with local stakeholders and donors. It drew upon lessons and experience from two prior, highly relevant Bank projects, the Balochistan Education Support Project and the Promoting Girls' Education in Balochistan (PGEB), including the importance of involving communities in the selection, construction and monitoring of new schools and using third parties to validate availability of school children and teachers, and also utilizing the same project management unit, although less so for school design considerations.

While the government of Balochistan had considered the education sector to be in an emergency state and therefore requested Bank support to rapidly increase the number of schools by building simple, transitional structures, it became evident that the design was neither climate considerate nor conducive to achieving the project's objectives particularly as they pertained to girls (i.e. boundary walls, separate latrines, transportation needs). As a result, school designs had to be modified. The adjustments (minimum of two classrooms for cultural gender privacy, separate sanitation facilities, and climate resilience) were critical and necessary changes but led to delays, inefficiencies, and a financial gap that was then addressed through the additional financing.

The risk assessment was appropriately rated High due to low implementation capacity, delivery risk, and governance risks; effective mitigation measures were identified including community monitoring, third-party validation, and use of technology. The M&E arrangements took into account the challenges of data collection with the widely dispersed school population, however there were shortcomings in the selection



of indicators, including not adequately capturing the actual increase in enrollment and a lack of clarity on “increased retention”

Quality-at-Entry Rating

Moderately Unsatisfactory

b. Quality of supervision

Given the fragile and challenging context, the Bank team was able to provide effective supervision by relying on remote monitoring mechanisms and third party validation. A comprehensive project review following closure of the GPE part of the project (November 2019) generated critical findings that were incorporated into the design and implementation of the additional financing portion of the project, thereby sharpening focus on achieving the project objectives. The project components were adjusted accordingly, including most notably the revisions to the school design that better supported the objective to increase enrollment of girls (and are still being implemented in new government school constructions), although COVID impacts led to further challenges (including dropping the transportation pilot). Although targets were revised to account for the changes, other shortcomings in the indicators were not adequately addressed.

Fiduciary and safeguards performance was satisfactory with no major problems reported.

Quality of Supervision Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

Overall Bank Performance Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

9. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization

a. M&E Design

The M&E collection arrangements were adequate, particularly given the challenges in monitoring and data collection. A key project intervention was to develop a more robust and reliable education management information system, including using a real-time school monitoring mechanism (an Android application from the field, inputted by local school management committee members) to monitor implementation progress remotely. Institutional arrangements for monitoring included third-party validation for site selection of schools and school management committee monitoring of school construction, teacher attendance, and use of teaching and learning materials in classrooms. However, shortcomings in the choice of indicators included the lack of a clear measure of increased enrollment; the results framework's key project indicator only measured enrollment in project schools, which included both newly enrolled and already enrolled



students. In addition, the key project indicator on increased retention was unclear both in its definition and the outcome data reported in the ICR.

b. M&E Implementation

The project activity of upgrading the education management information system was effectively implemented, leading to the collection of key data to inform education sector decisions. School management committees were trained in their monitoring functions, and data was reported to district offices.

c. M&E Utilization

Project data was reviewed at the mid-term review and at the time of project restructuring to sharpen the focus of additional financing activities. Also, as reported in the ICR (page 17), education data was used by the government to identify an important need to rationalize the use of teachers across schools to cater to the number of students enrolled in existing schools, and to support and strengthen existing schools where possible. However, the shortcomings in the results framework prevented a more thorough analysis of outcomes achieved.

M&E Quality Rating

Modest

10. Other Issues

a. Safeguards

The project was classified as an Environmental Category "B" project due to construction activities, triggering the safeguard on Environmental Assessment (BP/ OP 4.01). The Environmental and Social Institutional Assessment that had been prepared for the prior PGEB project was adapted for this project with an addendum, given the similar nature of the activities and the same supervisory institutional arrangements. An Environmental and Social Management Plan was prepared in response to the assessment, including criteria for construction of new schools, required documentation regarding land ownership/donations, and strategies for social inclusion (for the poor, girls, women, youth, and the disabled). Staffing arrangements to monitor safeguards included a dedicated Safeguards Officer in the project management unit (PMU) and district focal points to monitor compliance in the field.

The ICR (page 23) reported that safeguards management was satisfactory, and no major problems were noted.



b. Fiduciary Compliance

The fiduciary institutional arrangements built upon the prior PGEB project's PMU, supplemented with additional staff and procedures.

Financial management: In addition to the financial management arrangements already in place in the PMU, systems were developed to manage the payroll for 4,000 teachers and to support financial management capacity training for parent-teacher school management committees. Financial management reports were submitted in a timely manner, and audit reports were unqualified. As stated in the ICR (page 23), there were no major financial management problems reported during the project period.

Procurement: The PMU was staffed with an experienced procurement specialist, aided by additional infrastructure and design specialists. UNICEF carried out the third-party validation of physical infrastructure as part of the selection process for upgrading schools. An external fiduciary review was carried out in early 2021; as noted in the ICR (page 24), the review identified only a few minor issues, in particular administrative issues related to timely payments processing and contract management.

c. Unintended impacts (Positive or Negative)

None reported.

d. Other

11. Ratings

Ratings	ICR	IEG	Reason for Disagreements/Comment
Outcome	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	There were shortcomings in Efficiency due to significant revisions to school design.
Bank Performance	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	There were shortcomings in Quality at Entry in the project design (school design) and in the M&E framework (clarity of indicators).
Quality of M&E	High	Modest	There were shortcomings in the selection and formulation of key outcome indicators.
Quality of ICR	---	Modest	

12. Lessons



Lessons drawn from the ICR:

- Real-time monitoring systems, based on simple and accessible technologies, can be instrumental in difficult, geographically dispersed environments that cannot be accessed due to security reasons. In the case of this project, using a real-time school monitoring mechanism (an Android application from the field to a customized management information system dashboard, inputted by local school management committee members) to monitor implementation progress remotely helped identify and address implementation bottlenecks in inaccessible areas.
- Rehabilitation/upgrading of existing schools can be a more effective approach than constructing new schools in areas where access is low, the state of existing infrastructure is poor, and student-teacher ratios are high. In the case of this project, the shift in focus at the time of project restructuring to rehabilitating existing schools led to achievement of project objectives (and meeting enrollment targets) when the cost of new construction increased significantly. Additionally, decisions on new construction especially in previously underserved areas can bring new issues (e.g., distance, transportation, safety) that may impact the achievement of objectives.

In addition,

- Precision in the selection of key project indicators can capture project achievements more clearly and convincingly. In the case of this project, there was overlap in reporting on project "beneficiaries" (those who benefitted from any project intervention) and newly enrolled/retained students, and also in reporting on girls vs. boys (increased retention). More clearly disaggregated data would have given more clarity to the level of achievement of objectives.

13. Assessment Recommended?

No

14. Comments on Quality of ICR

The overall quality of the ICR was Modest. It was concise and consistent with guidelines (with the exception of the application of the split rating methodology, in which the ICR based the rating on the extent of outputs/outcomes reached at the time of restructuring, rather than achievement across the project's entire lifetime and then weighted according to the proportion of the Grants that disbursed before/after restructuring). The discussion of the theory of change clearly identified its underlying assumptions. The discussion of achievements and implementation experience was results-oriented, focusing on the project design elements that needed to be revisited in order to ensure progress towards project objectives. Lessons were informative, particularly for future operations in fragile and highly geographically dispersed settings. However, as noted above in various sections of the ICR Review, the analysis of the results chain could have



been strengthened with more precise indicators, and the quality of evidence reported in the ICR for the objective to increase retention was inadequate to fully assess achievements (thereby necessitating further information from the project team).

a. Quality of ICR Rating

Modest