



1. Project Data

Project ID

P169486

Project Name

BF: Emergency Recurrent Cost Fin.Project

Country

Burkina Faso

Practice Area(Lead)

Governance

L/C/TF Number(s)

IDA-D4110

Closing Date (Original)

31-Dec-2021

Total Project Cost (USD)

100,550,879.26

Bank Approval Date

29-Nov-2018

Closing Date (Actual)

31-Dec-2021

IBRD/IDA (USD)
Grants (USD)

Original Commitment

100,000,000.00

0.00

Revised Commitment

100,000,000.00

0.00

Actual

100,550,879.26

0.00

Prepared by
Shahrazad Mobasher
Fard
Reviewed by

Paul Holden

ICR Review Coordinator

Jennifer L. Keller

Group

IEGEC (Unit 1)

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

The Project Development Objectives (PDOs) were to support the Government of Burkina Faso in enhancing food security readiness and delivery of core services in health and education in crisis-affected regions. (Financing Agreement, p. 4) For this ICRR, the PDO is unpacked as follows: (i) support the delivery of core services in education in crises-affected regions, (ii) support the delivery of core services in health in crises-affected regions; and (iii) enhance food security readiness.



b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?

Yes

Did the Board approve the revised objectives/key associated outcome targets?

No

c. Will a split evaluation be undertaken?

Yes

d. Components

Component 1: *Recurrent costs in education and health sector for service delivery (estimated cost: US\$74 million; 2021 restructuring: US\$76.05 million; actual cost: US\$82 million).* Support the Recipient in paying non-procurable operating costs of the Recipient's ministries in charge of education and health including through transfers (excluding the security forces and police) for civil service salaries, electricity, telecommunication, insurance, water, transport and mission expenses as well as office supplies and equipment required for addressing the current health, education and food supply crises in the crisis-affected regions, and as set forth in a list pre-approved by the Association ("Recurrent Costs"), through:

Sub-component 1.1: *Paying recurrent costs in the education sector.* Paying recurrent costs in the education sector of the Recipient's ministry in charge of education at the central, deconcentrated and decentralized levels, in order to maintain the capacity of the civil servants and teachers in the education sector in the crisis-affected regions to undertake their day-to-day duties, and to cover the organization for catch-up exams of displaced children.

Sub-component 1.2: *Paying recurrent costs in the health sector.* Paying recurrent costs in the health sector of the Recipient's ministry in charge of health, at the central, deconcentrated, and decentralized levels and financing activities linked to free health services for the most vulnerable population, to maintain the capacity of the health sector civil servants to operate in the crisis-affected regions.

Component 2: *Enhanced food security readiness (estimated cost: US\$21 million; 2021 restructuring: US\$22.05 million; actual cost: US\$18 million).* Replenish the millet, maize, and sorghum cereals stock of the *Société nationale de gestion du stock de sécurité alimentaire* (SONAGESS) for the North, Sahel, Centre, and East regions of the Recipient and install food silos of the strategic stock and other food storage materials in the crisis-affected regions.

Component 3: *Targeted technical assistance for enhanced deployment of state resources (estimated cost: US\$4 million; 2021 restructuring: US\$1.05 million; actual cost: US\$1 million).* Provision of financing for conducting surveys, data collection, field work and analyses of issues related to the deployment of public resources across the territory of the Recipient, including human resources; prepare the groundwork for future reforms; and support the establishment of an iterative beneficiary monitoring system in order to undertake cost-efficient, rapid and regular surveys and data collection of service delivery and state resource, including of civil servants, deployment. Provision of technical assistance to SONAGESS to improve its capacity to verify the use of its strategic food stock and its targeting of beneficiaries of the strategic food stock.



Component 4: *Project management (estimated cost: US\$1 million; 2021 restructuring: US\$0.85 million; actual cost: US\$0.7 million).* Support the Recipient's day-to-day implementation activities by financing the operating costs, including salaries, consultant fees and audits required for the Project.

e. Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates

Project cost. The approved amount for the project was US\$100 million. The actual amount disbursed was US\$101.7 million. The discrepancy between the actual amount disbursed relative to the approved amount was due to fluctuations in the SDR exchange rate. The project disbursed 95 percent of the total project funds by December 31, 2018, with the remaining 5 percent used to distribute the stock of food replenished to IDPs and to vulnerable households using national systems.

Financing. The project was financed through an IDA allocation (IDA-D4110).

Borrower contribution. There was no borrower contribution planned or made.

Dates. The project was approved on November 29, 2018, and became effective on December 10, 2018. The mid-term review, which was initially planned for May 2020, was postponed due to the COVID-19 pandemic and held on January 18, 2021. The project closed on December 31, 2021, with no delays incurred. The project was restructured once in April 2021 to reflect changes to the Results Framework, project components and costs, and a reallocation between disbursement categories. Component 1 was restructured to expand the geographic coverage of activities, with the number of regions recognized as being conflict-affected rising from four at appraisal (i.e., North, Sahel, Center, and East regions) to 13, and to provide clarifications regarding the nature and the scope of expenses eligible for project funding. Component 2 was restructured to (i) setup mobile storage facilities in targeted locations, (ii) develop institutional and human capacity in logistics, procurement, food safety, quality control, and warehouse management, including the digitalization of stock management, and (iii) digitalize SONAGESS's paper-based stock management system. Component 3 activities were not modified, with the exception of the study related to identifying bottlenecks to the deployment of human resources across the country which was cancelled and integrated in the functional review of key ministries supported by a parallel World Bank externally financed output activity (with funds originally allocated to this activity re-allocated to Component 1 and 2). Component 4 on project management was not modified. For the purposes of the split rating and given that US\$93.68 million was disbursed prior to the 2021 restructuring, a weight of 93.1 percent and 6.9 percent are used for measuring efficacy prior to and after the 2021 restructuring, respectively. Table 3 of the ICR presents the changes to project design and to the Results Framework following the 2021 restructuring.

3. Relevance of Objectives

Rationale

At appraisal, Burkina Faso was confronted with weak economic growth and significant challenges to the delivery of public services, which undermined progress toward the country's development objectives and increased its vulnerability to armed conflict. In 2018, Burkina Faso was one of the poorest countries in the world, with roughly 44 percent of its population living below the international poverty line of US\$1.90 per day. Economic growth was increasingly dependent on the mining and the services



sectors, with the agricultural sector (on which the poor were heavily dependent) constrained by pest infestations and low rainfall. Poor economic conditions, combined with weak state presence in rural and remote areas, facilitated the recruitment of youth into armed groups. Poorly controlled and porous borders permitted the cross-border movement of illicit trade and population movements.

In response to these challenges, the Government of Burkina Faso introduced the National Plan for Economic and Social Development (*Plan national de développement économique et social*) covering the 2016-2020 period, which aimed to support public investment, but with provisions for recurrent spending in education, health and the purchase of strategic food crops lacking. The deterioration in the country's fiscal space resulted in significant cuts in recurrent expenditure in education, health and the purchase of strategic food crops. While the revised 2018 Budget supported the government's program of targeted free health care (*Gratuité des soins*) introduced in 2016, the financial provision remained insufficient to deliver the program. Similarly, the revised 2018 Budget reduced the allocation to the National Food Security Stock (NFSS) managed by SONAGESS by US\$9 million relative to the 2017 Budget.

All this took place within the context of a food crisis and rising violence in the North, Sahel and East regions. The food crisis was caused by an invasion of fall armyworms which began in 2017 and extended into 2018, resulting in crop production losses in more than 90,000 ha of farmland across 13 regions. According to government estimates, the food crisis led to food insecurity for some 954,000 individuals, of which 90,000 were considered to be in need of emergency food assistance. The government estimated that 2.6 million individuals were vulnerable to becoming food insecure across 83 of the country's 351 communes. The food crisis led to the acute malnutrition of an estimated 587,000 children under the age of five, of which 187,000 were considered to suffer from severe malnutrition. The North, Sahel, East, and Center regions, which were particularly affected by the food crisis, experienced a reemergence of armed conflict. This led the government to reduce public service delivery in these regions in areas such as education and health, while raising security expenditures by more than 37 percent between 2017 and 2018. According to the 2019 Budget, security expenditures were planned to increase 26 percent in FY2019-20. These conditions created a vicious cycle which increased the country's vulnerability to armed conflict.

The food security crisis and the destruction of the strategic stock of food by armed groups resulted in the need to replenish the NFSS. In 2018, SONAGESS had exhausted 78 percent of its strategic stock of cereals as a result of the government's Emergency Response Plan -- which provided food and cash transfers to 605,000 individuals -- as well as the destruction of inventories by armed groups. Violent clashes by armed groups led to damages to SONAGESS' offices and facilities, adversely affecting its operations.

The insecurity caused by armed groups constrained the government's ability to deliver public services in education and health. The government estimated that between 400 and 500 schools were closed in 2018 due to security conditions, leaving 65,000 children in need of alternate schooling. Catch-up classes, additional instruction time and examinations were required for school-aged children displaced due to insecurity and conflict. These measures led to unanticipated education spending as additional teachers needed to be trained, remuneration incentives provided, and equipment purchased. Furthermore, health facilities were damaged and the security situation induced the temporary closure of facilities. The capacity to deliver healthcare services was also impeded by the fact that some healthcare workers had left their posts due to the presence of armed groups, while others were mobilized to treat the wounded.

Burkina Faso required urgent assistance to ensure effective state presence and delivery of basic public services in the crisis-affected regions. The government's response was intended to raise



public confidence in the state's ability to stave off fragility and conflict, and to achieve positive short-term outcomes ahead of broader institutional reforms, in line with the recommendations of the *World Development Report 2011: Conflict, Security, and Development*. The delivery of basic public services required predictable resources earmarked for the crisis, as well as regular payment of civil servants' salaries and other operating costs. The government estimated the short-term cost of its response at more than XOF 115.0 billion, with a financing gap estimated at more than XOF 50.4 billion.

The objectives pursued by the project were aligned with the government's strategy, as well as the World Bank's strategy and ongoing commitments. The 2017 Systematic Country Diagnostic identified low and unequal level of access to social services including in education, health, and nutrition, as key constraints to ending poverty and supporting shared prosperity. The interventions featured under the project were fully aligned with the Burkina Faso Country Partnership Framework for FY18–FY23, supporting the achievement of Objectives 2.1 ("Support inclusive, high-quality education and skills development"), 2.2 ("Expand access to reproductive and child health services and improved nutrition") and 2.3 ("Expand social protection to the most vulnerable"). They funded free health care services for women, children under the age of five, catch-up exams for displaced children, professional training for teachers, and salary of civil servants in the ministries of National Education and Health for January and February 2019 and January 2019. Project interventions were aligned with the World Bank Group Strategy for Fragility, Conflict, and Violence (2020–2025) to prevent violent conflict and interpersonal violence. The interventions were designed to complement World Bank-supported interventions through other engagements, such as, the Health Services Reinforcement Project, the Education Access and Quality Improvement Project, the Agricultural Productivity and Food Security Project, the Livestock Sector Development Support Project, the Burkina Faso Local Government Support, COVID-19, And Resilience Response Project, the Economic Governance, Govtech, and Citizen Engagement Project, and the Public Sector Modernization Program.

The ICR provides a reasonable justification for IPF. At the time of appraisal, an IPF adapted to Situations of Urgent Need of Assistance or Capacity Constraints and was considered the most appropriate instrument as it allowed fast preparation and disbursement to respond to the escalating multi-faceted crises that Burkina Faso was facing. An emergency Development Policy Operation (DPO) or triggering Contingent Emergency Response Components (CERC) of existing IPFs were also considered. While a DPO could have encouraged the GoBF to adopt reforms, scope was limited by the emergency context and uncertainties, including on timely implementation of reforms to allow disbursement of resources that the country urgently needed. CERCs, meanwhile, would not have allowed sufficient resources to be mobilized. An IPF adapted to Situations of Urgent Need of Assistance or Capacity Constraints was therefore considered the most appropriate instrument. In addition to enabling rapid project preparation and disbursement, the operation combined emergency assistance with capacity building to strengthen country resilience to future crises and shocks." (ICR, p. 27)

Rating

Substantial

4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy)



OBJECTIVE 1

Objective

Support the delivery of core services in education in crisis-affected regions

Rationale

The PDO sought to provide catch-up classes and examinations to students who were out of the school system in crisis-affected regions. It responded to the challenges of providing education to school-aged children to reduce their likelihood of joining armed groups, and to inculcate them with the skills and the knowledge which would later allow them to join the labor force and to meet labor market demands. The geographic coverage for this PDO was expanded from four regions (i.e., North, Sahel, Center and East regions) at appraisal to 13 regions affected by the security crisis following the project restructuring. The end targets were revised to reflect the impact of a highly volatile security environment and the COVID-19 pandemic.

Outputs and intermediate outcomes. The project generated four outputs which met their respective targets by December 31, 2021. First, it allowed for the salary payment of 118,590 staff, including, 73,088 teachers, employed by the Ministry of National Education to be made during the months of January and February 2019. This measure prevented important delays in the payment of civil servants in the education sector, which staved off potential strikes and social unrest. Second, it enabled remedial examinations to be organized in 2018 and 2019, as well as following the restructuring, for 6,612 displaced students (of which, 3,021 were girls) whose classes were disrupted due to violent attacks against a revised target of 6,600 students (downwardly revised from 20,000 students) and a baseline of 0. The task team clarified that the original target of 20,000 was in reference to the original PDO level indicator of “students benefitting from catch-up exams organized for regions affected by the crises” and that the PDO level indicator had to be reformulated to the “number of displaced children completing the school year in crisis-affected region” due to security conditions. The restructuring justified this downward revision in the target given the challenge of mobilizing students to take part in catch-up exams in crisis-affected regions, as well as the COVID-19 pandemic and the November elections. Third, it allowed for the training of 54,717 new teachers in crisis-affected regions against a revised target of 50,000 (the original target of 5,000 constituted a typo according to the project team and the target was always intended to be 50,000). Fourth, it allowed for the provision of school textbooks in support of the free education policy. While an intermediate result indicator on the fiscal deficit in proportion to GDP was featured in the Results Framework, and the end target was achieved, this indicator is not relevant as it does not measure achievement toward the objective nor is its timeframe aligned with the disbursements of this project.

Outcomes. The project achieved the outcome of supporting the delivery of core services in education in crisis-affected regions. The target on the number of displaced children completing the school year in crisis-affected regions was met with 6,612 students completing their school year in these regions against a target of 6,600 students (downwardly revised from 20,000 students) and a baseline of 0. The target on the number of displaced children completing the school year in crisis-affected regions was met with 3,021 girls completing their school year against a revised target of 3,000 students (revised down from 10,000) and a baseline of 0.

Rating

Substantial



OBJECTIVE 2

Objective

Support the delivery of core services in health in crisis-affected regions

Rationale

This PDO sought to deliver healthcare services to women and children below the age of five to improve health outcomes as it pertained to maternal and child health, nutrition and disease surveillance.

Outputs and intermediate outcomes. There were three outputs under this objective. First, the project financed a portion of the annual operating costs of public health centers in 2018 and 2019. To limit fiduciary and safeguard risks, investments and medicine costs were excluded. Second, salaries of public servants working in crisis-affected regions were paid for the month of January 2019 by the Ministry of Health. This measure prevented important delays in the payment of civil servants in the health sector, which staved off potential strikes and social unrest. Third, 9,264,098 medical consultations and follow-up care for women and children under five were offered as part of the *Gratuité des soins* program, exceeding the target of 9,000,000 medical consultations. While an intermediate result indicator on the fiscal deficit in proportion to GDP was featured in the Results Framework, and the end target was achieved, this indicator is not relevant as it does not measure achievement toward the objective nor is its timeframe aligned with project disbursements.

Outcomes. The project achieved the outcome of supporting the delivery of core services in health in the crisis-affected regions, with 9,264,098 medical care acts offered to women and children under the age of five against a target of 9,000,000 (upwardly revised from 15,000) and a baseline of 0. The medical care acts were defined as actions and services provided to promote and maintain a patient's health, and included assisted childbirth, caesarean sections, care during pregnancy, screening for precancerous lesions of the cervix, and consultations for pregnant women and children under the age of five.

Rating

Substantial

OBJECTIVE 3

Objective

Enhance food security readiness

Rationale

The PDO sought to replenish SONAGESS' strategic food stocks to enhance the country's food security in order to support the delivery of basic food supplies to vulnerable individuals in crisis-affected regions.

Outputs and intermediate outcomes. There are a number of outputs generated under this objective. First, 40,000 tons of maize, millet, and sorghum were purchased by December 31, 2021 to replenish SONAGESS' strategic food stock meeting the project target. Second, according to data collected by the National Council for Emergency Relief and Rehabilitation (*Conseil national de secours d'urgence et de réhabilitation*), a government body charged with the coordination of the disaster and humanitarian crisis response, basic food supplies were secured for 849,925 individuals (of which 436,362 were internally



displaced persons) against a target of 400,000 individuals. The corresponding target for basic food supplies secured for vulnerable individuals in regions affected by the crisis was also achieved with 436,362 individuals benefiting from this measure against a target of 200,000. Third, the project allowed for SONAGESS' digitalized stock management plan to be in place by June 4, 2021 against a baseline of no stock management system. Fourth, 35 mobile storage units (i.e., storage warehouses that can be assembled and dismantled quickly) were purchased to ensure the proper conservation of the additional stock of grains purchased by SONAGESS by December 31, 2021 against a target of 30 and a baseline of 0. Finally, a governance crisis response framework which establishes measures to enable an effective, efficient and transparent management of public finances in response to targeted urgent needs of the population in times of crisis was made available by June 4, 2021 against a baseline of no governance crisis response framework. The governance crisis response framework is structured around five thematic blocks: (i) the establishment of overall institutional governance; (ii) the financing of emergency measures; (iii) the implementation of budgetary, accounting, and financial management procedures adapted to the situation; (iv) the guarantee of an ex-post accountability mechanism; (v) and the tools to be implemented, in a cross-cutting manner, for greater transparency of the system.

Outcomes. The project achieved the objective of enhancing food security readiness. First, it enhanced food security readiness and resilience to crisis through the purchase of 40,000 tons of maize, millet, and sorghum by December 31, 2021 to replenish SONAGESS' strategic food stock. Second, basic food supplies were secured for 849,925 vulnerable individuals in regions affected by the crisis against a target of 400,000 individuals, of which 436,362 were internally displaced individuals (against a target of 200,000).

Rating
Substantial

OVERALL EFFICACY

Rationale

The project achieved the targets of PDO indicators 1, 2 and 3 on supporting the delivery of core services in education in crisis-affected regions, supporting the delivery of core services in health in the crisis-affected regions, and enhancing food security readiness (Table 1). The PDO indicators and the intermediate results indicators linked to each of the three objectives supported the achievement of the overarching objectives pursued by the PDOs.

Table 1: PDO Indicators

Indicators and IRIs	Baseline (2018)	Original End Target (PAD)	Restructured End Target	Actual Result at closure (Dec-2021)	Status
PDO Indicators by Outcome					
Outcome 1: Delivery of core services in education in the Crisis-affected Regions					



Displaced children completing the school year in crisis-affected regions (number)	0	20,000	6,600	6,612	Achieved (Not achieved based on original target)
Displaced children completing the school year in crisis-affected regions of which girls (number)	0	10,000	3,000	3,021	Achieved (Not achieved based on original target)
Outcome 2: Delivery of core services in health in the Crisis-affected Regions					
Basic health care secured for women and children under the age of 5 (number)	0	15,000	9,000,000	9,264,098	Achieved (Achieved based on original target)
Outcome 3: Enhancing food security readiness					
Enhanced food security readiness and resilience to crisis (metric ton)	0	40,000	40,000	40,000	Achieved
Basic food supplies secured for vulnerable people in regions affected by the crisis (number)	0	n.a.	New, 400,000	849,925	Achieved
Basic food supplies secured for vulnerable people in regions affected by the crisis of which IDPs (number)	0	n.a.	New, 200,000	436,362	Achieved
IRIs by Component					
Component 1: Support the delivery of core services in health and education in crisis-affected regions					
Months of salaries paid	0	3	3	3	Achieved
Fiscal deficit contained below 6% of GDP	Yes	n.a.	Yes	Yes	Achieved
Teachers benefiting from the professional training organized to support the regions affected by the crisis	0	500 (former PDO indicator)	50,000	54,717	Achieved (Achieved based on original target)
Component 2: Replenishment of the strategic food stock of SONAGESS					
SONAGESS digitalized stock management plan is in place	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Achieved
Number of mobile storage available	0	n.a.	30	35	Achieved
Availability of a governance crisis response framework for enhanced crisis management	No	n.a.	Yes	Yes	Achieved



Component 3: Targeted technical assistance for enhanced deployment of state resources					
Number of projects that have implemented an IBM approach	0	1	1	1	Achieved
Component 4: Project management					
Audit of Project Financial Statements	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Achieved

Overall Efficacy Rating

Substantial

5. Efficiency

No *ex ante* economic analysis was performed at appraisal. The task team justified this based on the emergency context. An *ex post* economic analysis for two of the project's interventions was undertaken, pertaining to the payment of public servant wages and the distribution of staple foods to vulnerable households:

Payment of public servant wages. The project allowed the payment of salaries of roughly 10,000 civil servants working in education and health in remote and conflict-affected areas at the beginning of 2019. Since the benefit stream considered by the project team consisted of the multiplier effect of a spending of US\$29 million on public servant wages on GDP, which is not linked to the achievement of the PDO, the IEG does not consider the results of this economic analysis to be of relevance.

Distribution of staple food to vulnerable individuals. Some 40,000 tons of staple food (millet, sorghum, and maize) were distributed to 849,925 individuals by October 2019, of which 436,362 were internally displaced persons according to data collected by the National Council for Emergency Relief and Rehabilitation. The intervention is assumed to have reduced the malnutritional burden of disease through morbidity and mortality from Burkina Faso's higher-bound to the middle-bound prevalence over one year. The benefit related to the reduction in the malnutritional burden of disease was estimated at US\$8.6 million for one year, with benefits expected to accrue beyond one year. The benefit related to the value of lives lost being averted is estimated at US\$4.9 million. Furthermore, the task team estimated that the more efficient procurement of staple foods generated savings of US\$4.4 million. The ICR reports that these savings were in turn used by SONAGESS to improve its capacity and logistical capacity, which, although not quantified for the economic analysis, are expected to accrue. The ICR notes that "time and cost efficiency was achieved by purchasing from both large suppliers (70 percent) and farmer organizations (30 percent) including a women-owned organization made up of 210 members. Commodity losses resulting from food mishandling were significantly reduced due to WFP quality and safety standards. The UN agency trained approximately 100 SONAGESS staff in Centre-Nord on food storage management best practices. Two workshops to raise awareness among 40 transporters from all over the country, on security and capacity issues generated by a fast-developing humanitarian emergency, were also organized." (ICR, p. 16) The task team could have reflected these additional benefit streams in the economic analysis.

The ICR also identifies a number of intangible benefits which would support project efficiency. For instance, the training of 54,717 teachers in CARs will definitely reap benefits for future generations for years to come ; the catch-up exams for 6,612 students, whose classes were disrupted due to violent attacks, will increase their opportunities in the future; the improvement of SONAGESS's management capabilities will improve the country's food security for years to come; the transfers to support public health centers and medical consultations financed by free health care excluding drugs will, if sustained, improve the well-being of the



population at large and more specifically vulnerable people; and the development of a governance crisis response framework for enhanced crisis management at the national level will increase the GoBF's preparedness to respond more efficiently to a crisis." (ICR, p. 43) The ICRR notes, however, that catch-up examinations for 6,612 students is not considered an intangible benefit, but a tangible benefit for which an economic analysis could have been performed.

The task team indicated to the IEG as part of this ICR Review that an efficiency analysis which measures the cost of each activity (by multiplying the unit cost of each output times the total output) was not conducted. As such, it is impossible to judge how efficiently the project's funding was deployed.

Efficiency Rating

Modest

a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR) and/or Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation:

	Rate Available?	Point value (%)	*Coverage/Scope (%)
Appraisal		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable
ICR Estimate	✓	0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable

* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.

6. Outcome

The project's outcome is rated **Moderately Satisfactory**. The project outcome is rated Moderately Satisfactory until the 2021 restructuring given the fact it failed to meet the original PDO level targets on Objective 1. The project outcomes is rated Satisfactory following the 2021 restructuring with the project meeting the revised and less ambitious targets on Objective 1. (Table 2)

Table 2: Overall Outcome Ratings Prior to and Following the 2021 Restructuring

Rating Dimension	Original targets prior to 2021 restructuring	Revised targets following the 2021 restructuring
Relevance of objectives	Substantial	
Efficacy	Substantial	Substantial
Objective 1: Support the delivery of core services in education in the crisis-affected regions	Modest	Substantial



Objective 2: Support the delivery of core services in health in crisis-affected regions	Substantial	
Objective 3: Enhance food security readiness	Substantial	
Efficiency	Modest	
Outcome ratings	Moderately Satisfactory	Satisfactory
Disbursement	US\$93.68 million	US\$6.92 million
Share of disbursement	93.1%	6.9%
Weighted value of the outcome rating	3.72	0.34
Final outcome rating	Moderately Satisfactory	

a. Outcome Rating
Moderately Satisfactory

7. Risk to Development Outcome

The main risk to the development outcome relates to progress with delivering public services and enhancing food security not being sustained due to the intensification of the security crisis, which is being exacerbated by inflationary pressures and by the lack of political continuity. The ICR reports that the conflict has spread to other regions, including, the Boucle du Mouhoun, Center-East, Cascades and Center-North regions. Some 3,680 school were reported to be closed as of January 2022, with 590,000 children and 14,900 teachers remaining out of classrooms. Some 500 health facilities were reported to be affected, with 160 being closed in January 2022. An estimated 3.5 million individuals are in need of humanitarian assistance according to the United Nations. The military coup d'état of January 2022 also introduced additional uncertainty regarding the government's ability to address these multifaceted challenges and maintain the fiscal deficit below 6 percent of GDP in 2022. The war in Ukraine is also leading to higher inflation due to the rising cost of fuel, and agricultural products and inputs, eroding the population's purchasing power, and thereby raising their vulnerability to join armed groups.

The ICR recognized that the project made gains with regards to the three PDO indicators in the short-term, but that additional financial resources and technical assistance are required to consolidate and build upon gains in light of the evolving context. The ICR states that "the project supported the increase of the strategic stock of SONAGESS to 60,000 tons by January 2021, beyond the recommended level of 50,000 tons. However, stocks replenished by the project were used to support IDPs and vulnerable people affected by the worsening security crisis, COVID-19, and floods. Therefore, stock levels have plummeted since March 2021, reaching 13,000 tons by December 2021. As a result, at project closure, there was a need to further replenish the stock with at least 37,000 tons of cereals to face the upcoming food security crisis. Additional support is also required to unblock governance challenges to service delivery, helping consolidate and build upon current gains within the rapidly evolving country context." (ICR, p. 27) Governance challenges related to human resources management, and financial management and procurement challenges. Challenges in human resources management pertained to the high concentration of civil servants at the central rather than at the local level, the inefficient cooperation between the central and local governments, and the inadequate regulation to manage internally displaced civil servants. Financial management and



procurement challenges related to delays in fiscal transfers from the central to local governments, the insufficient amount of money being transferred from the central to the local governments, poor budget planning, and inadequate procurement procedures.

The ICR states that risks to the sustainability of development outcomes will be partly addressed by the Burkina Faso Local Governance for Basic Services and Resilience Program with planned Board delivery in FY23. This project is expected to respond to some of the challenges presented in this review and to specific population needs at the decentralized level. The project will place significant emphasis on state redeployment for service delivery, with plans to invest in prevention, build resilience, and respond to emergency crises. The project is informed by the recommendations of the 2019 World Bank Risk and Resilience Assessment, the Governance Strategy for the Sahel, and findings of functional reviews carried out in four key service delivery ministries (Labor and Civil Service, Education, Health, and Justice).

8. Assessment of Bank Performance

a. Quality-at-Entry

The PAD articulated the link between project activities and PDO results indicators. The results chain was further elaborated in the 2021 Restructuring Paper.

While IEG agrees that the PDOs were highly relevant to the country context, it is not clear how project design was linked to the undertaking of broader institutional reforms to address the underlying causes of fragility and conflict.

IEG concedes with the project team that the speed of project preparation impeded quality-at-entry. As the ICR indicates, 95 percent of the project financing was disbursed within the first two weeks of project implementation. This most likely contributed to the shortcomings pertaining to the design of the M&E framework, which led to ambiguities regarding M&E responsibility and inappropriate results targeting. The task team indicated that the FY18 results data were not made available to the task team before or during the first supervision mission in 2019 and as a result, more realistic targets at appraisal could not have been established. The project was effective over three years starting December 8, 2018. By end December 2018, 95 percent of the total project funds were disbursed for expenditures incurred in 2018 (40 percent) and as an advance for expenditures to be incurred in 2019 (55 percent). By mid-2019, the advance was fully used for expenses incurred in 2019 as reported in the audit report issued by ASCE-LC. However, the project remained effective for two more years, initially to implement a TA for the deployment of State resources (4 percent of total project funds). The activity was subsequently cancelled, and in 2021, US\$3 million was reallocated to recurrent costs in the health and education sectors (Component 1) and recurrent costs for the MFSNF to implement the National Solidarity and Crisis Management Program (Component 2). IEG agrees with the project team that project implementation costs could have been reduced had the team designed the project such that it would be implemented over a one-year period, with a grace period of a few months being offered.

Quality-at-Entry Rating



Moderately Satisfactory

b. Quality of supervision

The IEG agrees that the project team was proactive in adapting to the fluid security condition by expanding the geographic coverage of the project to all 13 regions of the country and increasing the allocation to the National Solidarity and Crisis Management Program. But the fact that 95 percent of project financing was front-loaded limited to scope of the Bank's intervention.

The IEG agrees that planning for capacity building activities in a project where the focus was on meeting immediate needs may have caused inefficiencies in project implementation. Unsurprisingly, activities under Component 3 on technical assistance for enhanced deployment of state resources could not be completed under the project due to condensed up-front stakeholder coordination.

IEG agrees with the project team that project supervision could have benefited from more frequent missions until mid-2020 when full-time in-country presence was inexistent.

IEG concedes that project performance could have been improved, including, as it related to the overshooting or undershooting of some PDO indicators relative to target through a better M&E framework.

Quality of Supervision Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

Overall Bank Performance Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

9. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization

a. M&E Design

The IEG acknowledges the adequacy of the PDO results indicators. The six key indicators and eight intermediate results indicators allowed to monitor progress toward the achievement of the PDO through a credible results chain. The articulation of the results chain was, however, missing at appraisal. The ICR indicates that "[t]he original project design illustrated the links between project activities and PDO indicators, but a clear theory of change was only retroactively traced and updated during project restructuring." (ICR, p. 21) The ICR states that "three PDO-level indicators were linked to the financing of recurrent costs to deliver core services in education and health. These indicators measured the provision of free health care to women and children and the number of students and schoolgirls in particular, taking remedial school examinations. Three other PDO indicators were linked to the outcome of enhancing food security readiness. More precisely, they measured the quantity of cereals purchased to replenish the depleted food security stock and the number of vulnerable people benefiting from food assistance, with a focus on IDPs. Intermediate indicators were properly linked to activities being implemented and, for the most part, they properly tracked the progress toward project implementation." (ICR, p. 21)



There were a number of issues with the M&E arrangements as reported in the ICR. First, project-specific M&E arrangements were not documented in a dedicated manual, leading to challenges in stakeholders' understanding of procedures and methods for tracking project results. Second, "medical consultations" and "medical care acts", which constitute different medical procedures with only 30 to 35 percent of reported care acts consisting of consultations, were used interchangeably until the project restructuring in April 2021. Third, the end targets for PDO indicators did not consider the feasibility of such achievements based on past experience. Out of the four PDO indicators introduced at appraisal (excluding gender-aggregated sub-indicators), two had significantly underestimated targets and one appeared to have overly ambitious targets. Original targets for the number of free medical consultations and the number of teachers benefiting from professional trainings were set significantly below the preliminary results of FY18. Given the objective of maintaining the provision of basic services, the ICR team believes that the end targets in the health and education sectors should have been at least equal to the preliminary results of the first semester of 2018. This assessment is reinforced by the fact that while the project was approved in November 2018, it retroactively funded recurrent costs in the health and education sectors for FY18. The original target of students benefiting from catch-up exams could also be considered overly ambitious compared to the preliminary results of FY18.

The challenges with targeting were identified by the World Bank supervision team and addressed through the April 2021 restructuring. The end targets for medical care acts financed by free health care in regions affected by the crisis and teachers benefiting from the professional training organized to support the regions affected by the crisis were revised upward to better reflect expected results from the project. The same was intended for the indicator measuring students benefiting from catch-up exams. While acknowledging that the original end target of 20,000 students could not be achieved due to school closures caused by the increased insecurity and the COVID-19 pandemic, the team retrofitted targets to actual achievement at the time of restructuring. This was not intended to mislead but was reflective of the misunderstanding on the part of the team, which should have maintained the original targets, allowing for a single ex post evaluation of achievement of the originally foreseen education outcomes that built in due consideration for the emergence of unexpected security constraints.

b. M&E Implementation

The M&E framework proved to be inadequate, with challenges in explaining large discrepancies between planned targets and actual outturns. The ICR states that "as early as February 2019 (three months after project effectiveness), there were clear indications that end targets set to measure PDO outcomes were not appropriate and needed to be revised. More precisely, the Aide Memoire of the first project implementation support mission reported that 29,000 teachers had benefited from professional training in CARs in 2018, compared to the project's end target of 500 teachers. It also reported that, in 2018, 6,241,254 medical consultations were funded in CARs, while the end target in the RF was 15,000. These results were then reported for the first time in the April 2019 and January 2020 Implementation Status and Results Reports (ISRs), respectively. However, the significant result variances were not properly explained during project implementation, except that the project performance had significantly exceeded targets. There was therefore a missed opportunity to revise targets much earlier into project implementation than the eventual April 2021 project restructuring." (ICR, p. 23)

The M&E framework did not allow for direct engagement with project beneficiaries. While a grievance redress mechanism was established by the Project Coordination Unit, the front-loading of activities did not allow for grievances to be addressed and considered in project implementation.



Furthermore, the complaints management committees in the Center and North regions were established but only project completion. Contrary to what was initially planned, the project did not put in place a mechanism to engage with its beneficiaries on time. The ICR also states that "while the project succeeded in establishing an IBM system, it could not be used by the PCU to monitor the implementation of project activities. This was due to the IBM approach requiring an electronic list of IDPs, while IDPs were listed manually at the time of project implementation. However, the project financed the deployment of the IBM approach on the Social Safety Nets Project (P124015). As a result, by its closure, the project had not succeeded in putting in place the promised robust mechanism to ensure feedback from its beneficiaries." (ICR, p. 23)

c. M&E Utilization

The ICR indicates that the M&E framework developed for this project informed the discussions during the mid-term review. The ICR concedes, however, that some of the targets of the M&E framework should have been reconsidered prior to the 2021 restructuring.

M&E Quality Rating

Modest

10. Other Issues

a. Safeguards

None noted. There was no environmental assessment conducted at appraisal or at the ICR stages.

b. Fiduciary Compliance

None noted.

c. Unintended impacts (Positive or Negative)

There were no unintended positive or negative impacts reported in the ICR or through the interview with the task team.

d. Other

First, the project reduced the incidence and depth of poverty. The ICR indicates that "the project has made key contributions toward alleviating the high costs of health services to the most vulnerable,



supplementing insufficient public financing of the health sector, and temporally mitigating low and unequal access to education for a subset of school children in areas affected by widescale school closures. Overall, the project maintained a focus on CARs, benefiting the most vulnerable populations, including IDPs and flood-affected populations in need of food and access to basic services, ensuring that food was distributed to close to 840,000 people in need." (ICR, p. 18)

Second, the project emphasized the provision of education and healthcare services targeting girls and women. As indicated earlier, the key outcome indicator under Objective 1 allowed 3,021 girls out of a total of 6,612 displaced children to complete their school year in affected regions, representing 46 percent of the total number of children. Also, as indicated earlier, the key outcome indicator under Objective 2 allowed more than 9 million medical care acts for women and children under the age of five. This included assisted childbirth, caesarean sections, prenatal and postnatal care, emergency obstetric care, and screening for precancerous lesions of the cervix and breast cancer. Furthermore, the provision of healthcare services to children below the age of five was viewed as directly benefiting women, who are the main caretakers to children, especially among the poor and vulnerable.

Third, the project strengthened the institutional setting for supporting basic public service delivery and enhancing food security in crises situations. The project was designed to strengthen the GoBF's capacity to respond to crises by funding the salary payments of civil servants, and operating expenditures, in targeted sectors and regions. The ICR states that "this has enabled the GoBF to better absorb the impact of various shocks and maintain delivery of essential services in CARs ahead of undertaking broader longer-term institution reforms." (ICR, p. 18) With regard to the objective of enhanced food security, the ICR states that "other key project inputs toward equipping the GoBF to better manage crises include the new crises response framework, additional food storage capacity, and the new computerized stock management system." (ICR, p. 18)

11. Ratings

Ratings	ICR	IEG	Reason for Disagreements/Comment
Outcome	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	
Bank Performance	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	
Quality of M&E	Modest	Modest	
Quality of ICR	---	Substantial	

12. Lessons

The IEG concurs with the lessons drawn from the ICR, which are:

1. The speed of disbursements is supported by prior knowledge of a government's financial management capacity and expanded reliance on *ex post* controls. A detailed assessment of the Government's financial management capacity early during implementation and expanded



support to implement risk mitigating measures are therefore essential to provide reasonable fiduciary assurance in rapid response investment operations." (ICR, p. 28)

2. The eligibility criteria for retroactive payments must be clearly communicated to governments. In order to reduce reputational, fiduciary, and environmental and social safeguard risks, the task team ensured that retroactive payments to salaries for defense and security forces, civil works and other construction; medical drugs, and fuel, vehicles, equipment purchases, and staff costs paid outside the payroll were excluded. This was particularly important given that 40 percent of the total financial envelope for the project was allocated to funding retroactive expenses.

In addition to these lessons, it would be important for project teams to coordinate an emergency operation of this nature with an operation that aims at addressing the underlying drivers of fragility and conflict in order to ensure that immediate gains reaped through an emergency operation can be sustained over time.

13. Assessment Recommended?

No

14. Comments on Quality of ICR

The quality of the ICR is judged Substantial. The ICR document provides a relatively detailed analysis of the project context, the objectives which were sought by the project, and the achievement of results. The overview of World Bank performance, the M&E, and other issues were also relatively detailed and clear. The ICR could have been improved if the task team undertook analysis to measure the efficiency with which the financial resources allocated through this project generated outputs, and at explaining how the targets for the indicators in the Results Framework were established. For example, it is not clear how the end target of 50,000 teachers benefitting from the professional training organized to support the regions affected by the crisis was determined while the end target of only 6,600 displaced children completing the school year in crisis-affected regions was established, and the ICR should have provided the rationale for these targets.

a. Quality of ICR Rating

Substantial

