

Completion and Learning Review Review

Gabon

FY12 -FY18 Country Partnership Strategy

September 12, 2022

Ratings

	CLR Rating	CLRR (IEG) Rating
Development Outcome:	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory
WBG Performance:	Good	Fair

I. Executive Summary

i. **This review of the World Bank Group's Completion and Learning Review (CLR) covers the FY12-16 Country Partnership Strategy (CPS) and its adjustments through the FY16 Performance and Learning Review (PLR), which extended the CPS period by two years to FY18.**

ii. **The WBG-supported program was consistent with the Emerging Gabon Strategic Plan (PSGE) and addressed major constraints to development.** It was based on a foundational pillar on governance and public sector capacity, a cross-cutting theme of improving gender equity and two strategic themes: (i) competitiveness and employment; and (ii) vulnerability and resilience. The WBG program was responsive to country demand and changing circumstances, particularly the decrease in oil prices that affected Gabon's growth performance and deteriorated macroeconomic stability. As a result of this shock, public expenditures were cut dramatically, impacting the PSGE and progress towards CPS objectives. While reasserting the CPS core themes, the PLR responded with a rapid increase in portfolio size as per government request. IEG's assessment is that the areas selected for scaled-up support (information and management systems for health services; skills development; electricity and water in rural areas; roads, water, and sanitation in urban areas; and statistical development) were appropriate to the country's challenges and CPS objectives. The CPS was also well aligned with the WBG corporate goal of reducing poverty and boosting shared prosperity, with this alignment increasing after the PLR stage.

CLR Reviewed by:	Peer Reviewed by:	CLR Review Coordinator
Eduardo Fernandez Maldonado, Evaluation Officer, IEGHC Rafael Dominguez, Consultant IEGEC	Luis Alvaro Sanchez, Consultant, IEGEC	Jeff Chelsky, Manager, IEGEC Melissa Metz, CLRR Coordinator, IEGEC

iii. **IEG rates the CPS development outcome as Unsatisfactory.** Of the eight objectives, one was mostly achieved, four were partially achieved, and three were not achieved. Under Focus Area I, there was little progress in improving transparency and accountability in the extractives sector (Objective 1). Some progress was made towards improving social and economic data (Objective 3). With respect to public financial management (Objective 2), progress was good with tangible contributions towards budget preparation, more competitive procurement, and wage bill containment. In contrast, limited progress was achieved with respect to budget execution, non-oil revenue mobilization, and debt management. Under Focus Area II, there was limited progress towards an improved vocational skills-building system (Objective 5). In contrast, there was good progress in improving Gabon's digital infrastructure and in reducing the time and cost to register a business (Objective 4). However, progress under these areas did not translate into a measurable improvement in investment climate beyond digital infrastructure. Under Focus Area III, broadband connectivity for localities increased but there was negligible progress towards increasing access to electricity and water in rural and urban areas and towards establishing a National Health Information system to improve health services nationwide (Objective 6). Good progress was made towards sustainable management of national parks, but limited progress was made towards sustainable management of critical ecosystems and reducing illegal poaching of elephants (Objective 7). Finally, little progress was made towards improving knowledge, tools, and policies for social delivery (Objective 8).

iv. **World Bank Group performance was Fair.** The CPS objectives lacked selectivity, with many of them chosen in areas where there was insufficient ownership. This lack of selectivity was augmented at the PLR stage with the introduction of vaguely defined and overlapping objectives. As acknowledged by the CLR (p. 7), the PLR also introduced an objective that could not be achieved within the CPS timeframe. With net commitments increasing from US\$25.9 million in 2015 to US\$422.9 million in 2016, a significant scale up was introduced at the PLR stage that quickly overburdened the client's capacity, affecting the timely delivery of the WBG-supported program. Although weak country systems had been identified as a risk, WBG mitigation measures were insufficient to avoid implementation delays, particularly after this sizable portfolio scale up. The results framework had shortcomings: some objectives were not well covered by results indicators; outputs were often over-emphasized relative to outcomes; and there were no properly defined indicators for capturing IFC and MIGA contributions. The WBG also failed to adequately supervise safeguards, with one project not implementing its resettlement action plan. There were no Inspection Panel registrations or INT investigations during the CPS period. WBG collaboration with development partners was effective but there were shortcomings in coordination with regional institutions. Collaboration among WBG institutions focused on strengthening investment climate and transparency in the extractives sector. The WBG demonstrated learning ability, with the prime example being the strategic use of ASA to design policy options for mitigating the macro-economic deterioration that followed the 2015 decline in oil prices.

v. **Some of the WBG supported achievements in Gabon included:**

- Strategically using ASA to inform the Government's public finance reform agenda and to design policy options for mitigating the macro-economic shock that followed the 2015 decline in oil prices.
- Improving budget preparation, which was a necessary condition for improved budget execution.
- Improving procurement transparency and efficiency and strengthening technical capacity to carry out performance audits (though audit coverage has not increased).
- Contributing to wage bill containment (15 percent decline in real terms between 2016 and 2019) and to a recovery in non-oil revenue mobilization (which started to materialize in 2019 when it reached 17.8 percent of GDP, from a 16.4 percent in 2018).
- Making Gabon the country with the largest digital capacity in the region, bringing down retail prices for internet, and increasing mobile internet penetration.
- Rehabilitating the existing railway infrastructure between Libreville and Franceville, to connect landlocked iron ore and manganese mines with international markets.
- Substantially increasing the number of national park hectares under protection and improving management effectiveness in national parks.

vi. **IEG broadly concurs with the CLR's lessons, particularly the following, with some adaptation:** (i) a focus on agendas owned by the government is key to achieving progress; (ii) rapid increases in lending require a better understanding of delivery systems and greater up-front attention by the WBG to build client absorptive and implementation capacity; and (iii) support for the digital economy can have positive spillover effects both for the private and public sector.

II. Strategic Focus

Relevance of the CPF

1. **Country Context.** Gabon is a sparsely populated country with a high urbanization rate, income inequality, and human development outcomes that fall short of countries with similar per capita income. Gabon was one of the least populated countries in Africa. It nonetheless has one of the highest urbanization rates in Africa with more than four in five Gabonese citizens living in cities. GNI per capita averaged US\$ 15,418 for the period 2012-2018, which placed Gabon at upper middle-income level, significantly above the GNI per capita for the Africa region at US\$ 3,907. Income inequality was high with one-third of the population living in poverty and the richest quintile receiving half of national income. As per the 2011 UNDP Human Development Index, Gabon ranked 106 out of 187 countries, well below countries with similar GNI per capita. Its Human Capital Score was 0.46 in 2020, indicating that future earnings potential of children born in that year would be 46 percent of what they could have been with complete education and full health. Oil dependency characterized the country: on

average during the 2012-2016 period, the oil sector accounted for roughly 80% of exports, 45% of GDP, and 60% of fiscal revenue.

2. **The country's main development challenges center around diversifying its economy away from oil and ensuring equal opportunity to all Gabonese.** The CPS FY12-16 was approved in the context of a relatively favorable macroeconomic environment that worsened in 2015 when a dramatic decrease in international oil prices caused a slowdown in growth, rising public debt, a decline in foreign exchange reserves, and a 3.4 percent of GDP budget deficit. In response to the macroeconomic deterioration, the government adopted fiscal consolidation measures while protecting spending in social sectors. From 2005 to 2017 the national poverty headcount ratio declined from 41.8 to 33.4 percent in 2017. Although poverty declined at 1.6 percent rate per year, rapid population growth of around 3 percent a year resulted in a 38 percent increase in the absolute number of poor people (SCD, p. 20). Political stability and rule of law deteriorated during the evaluation period with the opposition carrying out sometimes violent demonstrations in December 2014, April 2015, and in August 2016 following the election that narrowly re-elected President Ali Bongo Ondimba.

3. **The macroeconomic outlook improved after 2018, but the positive outlook was derailed by the COVID-19 pandemic.** Following the end of the CPS FY12-18 period, GDP growth recovered from 0.8 percent in 2018 to 3.9 percent in 2019. Fiscal consolidation measures were effective, with the overall budget balance reaching a surplus of 1.4 percent of GDP by 2019. The COVID-19 pandemic pushed Gabon into a recession, with GDP experiencing 1.8 percent negative growth in 2020. The pandemic also increased poverty, which was estimated at 33.8 percent in 2020, up from 32.3 percent in 2019. Rural areas were the most affected, with 70 percent of households reporting income loss. Unanticipated health and other COVID-19 related expenditures led to a fiscal deficit in 2020 of approximately 3.5 percent of GDP and debt reached almost 75 percent of GDP in December 2020, a record for Gabon. In 2021, GDP growth recovered to an estimated 1.5 percent, on the back of a booming mining sector and the rebound in the wood and construction sectors. Growth in the services sector remained subdued as containment measures weighed on the trade and transportation sectors.

4. **Government Strategy and CPF.** Since 2012, Gabon has been implementing the Emerging Gabon Strategic Plan (PSGE), which seeks to make the country an emerging economy by 2025. The plan has three overarching goals: (i) acceleration of economic growth and economic diversification, (ii) reduction of poverty and social inequalities and (iii) sustainable management of the country's resources. For the Emerging Gabon Vision to materialize, the Plan follows three strategic paths. The first path focuses on buttressing the foundations required for becoming a globally competitive country: human capital, sustainable natural resource management, governance, and infrastructure. The second path focuses on establishing three pillars that can accelerate sustainable development: Industrial Gabon, seeking to develop industrial capacity particularly in the oil, mining, and metallurgy sectors; Green Gabon, seeking to strengthen the timber, agriculture, livestock, and fisheries sectors; and Gabon Services, seeking to promote tourism and financial services. The third strategic path seeks to facilitate the well-being of and equitable sharing by all segments of the population of the benefits of growth through five levers: health services, water and sanitation, housing, and employment.

5. **Relevance of Design.** The CPS FY12-16 objectives addressed major constraints to development and were consistent with the PSGE, supporting Gabon in diversifying its economy and making progress in poverty reduction. The program reflected lessons learned from the previous CPS FY05-11, which included the need for simpler projects, and the importance of using country systems. The CPS FY12-16 was based on a foundational pillar on governance and public sector capacity, a cross-cutting theme of improving gender equity and two strategic themes: (i) competitiveness and employment; and (ii) vulnerability and resilience. The CPS had six objectives: (i) improved governance, transparency, and accountability in the management of the national budget, debt management, and mining resources; (ii) improved access to infrastructure services (electricity and communications); (iii) improved investment climate and private sector development; (iv) improved vocational skills and capacity; (v) more transparent and sustainable management of natural resources; and (vi) improved knowledge of basic service delivery for health and social protection. The program was not selective, with some CPS objectives covering areas where there was insufficient ownership (e.g., the CLR acknowledges that Objective 5 (“Improved vocational skills-building system”) lacked ownership). Likewise, under Objective 6 (“Improved access and quality of services”), the originally envisioned institutional and financing framework for the provision of electricity and water services in rural areas supported by the Bank was not adopted by the Government. Program design was well coordinated with other development partners in areas where there were overlapping activities.

6. **At the PLR stage (March 2016), the original structure was replaced by three focus areas and eight objectives.** The gender equality cross-cutting theme was retained. This structure was in essence almost identical to the original structure except for three changes. First, the CPS objective on “Improved governance, transparency, and accountability in management of the national budget, debt, and mining resources” was unbundled into three objectives: increased transparency and accountability in the extractives sector, ii) strengthened public financial management; and (iii) improved social and economic data. Second, the CPS objectives on “Improved access to energy, infrastructure, and telecommunications and “Improved investment climate and private sector development” were merged into a single objective (“Improved investment climate”). Finally, a new objective (“Improved access and quality of services”) was introduced.

7. **The above changes eroded selectivity by:** (a) duplicating objectives, as there was considerable overlap between the objective on “Improved access and quality of basic services” and the objective on “Improved knowledge, tools, and policies for social delivery”; (b) introducing an objective (improved access and quality of services) that was very broad (encompassing roads, water and sanitation in urban areas; electricity and water in rural areas; and telecommunications nationwide) and which could not realistically be achieved in the remainder of the CPS period. Moreover, as acknowledged in the CLR lessons, a significant scale up in World Bank lending was introduced at the PLR stage that was not commensurate with country capacity.

Results Framework

8. **The results frameworks had several shortcomings that reduced its quality.** By and large, results indicators were measurable, with baselines and targets specified. With some exceptions, data was available for all other indicators. However, the results framework had several shortcomings:

- First, the results framework had 35 indicators, which was an excessively high number reflecting unfocused measurement.
- Second, many of these indicators were not adequate for measuring achievement of objectives. For instance, under Objective 5, indicators only measured increased access to vocational trainings rather than “an improved vocational skills-building system”. Likewise, indicators under Objective 6 (“Improved access and quality of services”) did not capture the elements of improved reliability and quality.
- Third, in some cases, the results chain linking interventions, indicators, and CPS objectives was poorly structured. For instance, the results framework included an indicator (development of a debt management strategy) that had no clear link with Objective 1 (Increased transparency and accountability of the extractives sector).
- Fourth, the results framework lacked outcome indicators for IFC and MIGA activities and for some World Bank activities. For instance, IFC’s rail project (approved in June 2015) and MIGA’s project to support import inspections (approved in April 2013) could have made a significant contribution to the achievement of Objective 4 (Improved investment climate), but the results framework did not capture their contributions. With respect to the World Bank, the results framework lacked an objective to capture contributions towards curbing carbon emissions (under Objective 7) and indicators to capture contributions towards wage bill containment and more efficient procurement (under Objective 2)
- Fifth, many indicators under Objective 5 and Objective 6 included targets that could not be realistically achieved within the CPS period given the implementation schedule of the Word Bank projects supporting these objectives.

Alignment

9. **The program implemented during the CPS was well aligned with the WBG corporate goal of reducing poverty and boosting shared prosperity.** To reduce poverty and boost shared prosperity in a sustainable manner, the WBG program sought to advance more diversified and sustainable economic development while making opportunities more equitable for all and promoting a better use of public resources to address poverty and inequality. Diversification was to be achieved through interventions to address: (i) weak investment climate; (ii) inadequate supply of specialized skills for growth-oriented non-oil sectors; and (iii) unsustainable natural resource management. To make opportunities more equitable for all, the CPS supported infrastructure investments in vulnerable communities in nine provincial capitals (roads and water and sanitation) and in target rural areas (electricity and water). In addition,

the CPS provided support for nationwide telecommunications improvements and support for knowledge and tools for improved social service delivery. To promote better use of public resources to address poverty and inequality, the CPS supported strengthened public financial management, revenue mobilization, and debt management. The alignment with the twin goals was emphasized after the PLR stage when the CPS increased its poverty focus by introducing an objective on “improved access and quality of services” and by deploying development policy financing to address the effects of the decline in oil prices that worsened Gabon’s economic outlook and the government’s ability to spend in social sectors.

III. CPF Description and Performance Data

Advisory Services and Analytics

10. **ASA activities are aligned with the areas covered by the CPS.** Throughout the CPS period, the World Bank delivered 17 activities. Several ASAs contributed directly to CPS objectives. For instance, the *Extractive Sector Non-Lending Technical Assistance* (FY14) contributed to Objective 1 (Increased transparency and accountability in the extractives sector) while the *Statistics Development in Gabon Technical Assistance* (FY17) contributed to Objective 3 (Improved social and economic data). In other cases, ASA contributed indirectly by filling out knowledge gaps, informing reform options, and underpinning lending operations. Under Objective 8, the *Health Financing Study* (FY14) and the *Public Expenditure Review* (FY18) informed the design of the *E-Gabon Project* (FY16-22) and health and social protection prior actions under the *Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPO* (FY18). Under Objective 2, two ASAs on tax system reform and a *Public Expenditure Review* (FY18) underpinned the *Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPO* prior actions on tax reforms, while the *Gabon Export Diversification and Competitiveness Report* (P127623) (FY15) contributed to the design of business climate prior actions.

11. **IFC’s advisory services focused on Objective 4 (Improved investment climate).** IFC approved one advisory services project, the *Central African Economic and Monetary Community¹ (CEMAC) Investment Climate IC* (601693), supporting reforms to improve regulations related to doing business reforms such as starting a business, registering property, and investor protection. This IFC AS was designed to complement the *World Bank CEMAC Technical Assistance on Regional Economic and Trade Integration* (P163175). When the latter project was dropped, this IFC AS was terminated. No PCR was prepared for IFC advisory services during the CPS period. Beyond the CPS period, IFC approved a US\$175 thousand advisory services project in FY19 to support an affiliate of a client company seeking IFC investment support in developing a comprehensive community engagement approach in the areas affected by its manganese mining operations.

¹ The CEMAC is a monetary union composed of six member states, including Gabon, Cameroon, Chad, the Central African Republic, the Republic of Congo, and Equatorial Guinea

Lending and Investments

12. **At the start of the CPS period, the World Bank had one active US\$ 25 million investment operation and two trust-funded operations for US\$ 10.4 million.** The vacuum that followed the death of President Omar Bongo Ondima in 2009 after 41 years in office resulted in a small portfolio (CPS, p. vi). The *Local Infrastructure Development Project FY06-12* supported increased access of the population living in low -income settlements to basic services and sustained access of small and medium enterprises (SMEs) to civil works and construction contracts with the public sector. The two trust-funded operations supported capacity building for managing national parks and biodiversity and capacity building for environmental management of large infrastructure projects.

13. **New World Bank commitments totaled US\$ 665 million in FY12-18.** This was above the CPS FY12-16 base case commitments (US\$ 236 million) and well above the amount committed during the CPS FY05-11 period (US\$ 40 million). Commitments comprised seven investment lending projects (plus one additional financing) totaling US\$ 465 million and one development policy operation for US\$ 200 million. Fifty-four percent of the total investment lending volume was committed to “Competitiveness and Employment” (Focus Area 2) while roughly one-third (34 percent) was committed to “Human Development and Environmental Sustainability” (Focus Area 3). Governance and public sector capacity (Focus Area 1) received nearly 11 percent of investment lending commitments. The development policy operation, which was not planned at the CPS stage, spanned all focus areas, and responded to the acute need for financing that followed the 2015 decline in oil prices. Trust funds financed 3 operations, which focused on supporting the external audit function (Focus Area 1) and improving natural resource management and wildlife conservation (Focus Area 3).

14. **During the CPS period, two operations were closed and reviewed by IEG, with one rated moderately satisfactory and the other moderately unsatisfactory.** This performance at exit, as measured by outcomes rated moderately satisfactory or higher (50 percent), was worse than for the Africa region (63.7 percent) and for the World Bank (72 percent). When weighted by commitment value, performance (72 percent) was better than the Africa region (63.7 percent) but below the World Bank (82 percent). There were 2 projects at risk (23 percent) at any given time during the program, similar to averages for the Africa region and the World Bank. Weighted by the value of commitments, Gabon’s portfolio (30 percent) was at par with the Africa region (29 percent) but was riskier than the World Bank portfolio (21 percent).

15. **New World Bank commitments totaled US\$ 291.5 million between FY19-22.** Commitments comprised two investment projects (plus one additional financing) totaling US\$ 89.5 million and one development policy operation for US\$ 200 million. Investment projects included support for COVID-19 Response (*the Gabon COVID-19 Response Project* for US\$ 9 million plus additional financing for US\$ 12 million) and support for digital infrastructure (Digital Gabon Project for US\$ 68.5 million). The second *Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPO* was the last in a programmatic series of two that started with the first *Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPO* in FY18.

16. **IFC's strategic approach on its investment services was centered on increasing competitiveness in both oil and non-oil sectors amidst a challenging business environment with limited private sector opportunities.** IFC committed US\$ 57.4 million through three projects between FY12-18. IFC had no active portfolio at the beginning of the CPS period. In line with CPS Objective 1 (Increased transparency and accountability in the extractive sector), , IFC made an investment of US\$15.4 million to support a long-term client in a new phase of its ongoing oil exploration and development program. In FY16 and FY17, IFC supported the non-oil sector through the rehabilitation of the rail track infrastructure between Libreville and Franceville and the acquisition of new rolling stock. Combined investment commitments made for this project amounted to US\$42 million. The CLR highlighted IFC's support for the development of an integrated ammonia-urea fertilizer plant but the project was eventually dropped before it reached commitment stage.

17. **Following the CPS period, IFC made two additional investment commitments totaling US\$90 million.** One investment commitment made in FY21 was to support the next phase of the existing IFC rail project. The other commitment, made in FY22, involved a Build Operate and Transfer (BOT) 35 MW hydro power plant. At year end, IFC's outstanding portfolio stood at US\$32.5 million. Given the relatively small size of IFC's investment portfolio in Gabon, no project was included in the IFC-wide random sample of XPSRs prepared during the extended CPS period. One project was evaluated post CPS period in FY19. This project, which supported investments in the oil and gas sector, had a good development outcome generating positive externalities for its broad stakeholder group while significantly contributing to the business success of the project company.

18. **MIGA underwrote one guarantee for US\$ 7.5 million between FY12-18.** In FY13, MIGA offered a guarantee of an investment in the "Société de Scanning du Gabon S.A" to support the installation and operation of import inspection equipment, as well as related maintenance, training, and technical assistance (US\$7.5 million gross exposure). Beyond the CPS period, MIGA issued two guarantees in FY22 totaling US\$27.8 million to support a BOT 35 MW hydro power plant that was also supported by IFC (CLR para. 13).

IV. Development Outcome

A. Overall Assessment and Rating

19. **IEG rates the CPS development outcome as Unsatisfactory.** Of the eight objectives, one was mostly achieved, four were partially achieved, and three were not achieved. Under Focus Area I, there was little progress in improving transparency and accountability in the extractives sector (Objective 1). Albeit limited, some progress was made towards improving social and economic data (Objective 3). With respect to public financial management (Objective 2), progress was good with tangible contributions towards budget preparation, more competitive procurement, and wage bill containment. In contrast, limited progress was achieved with respect to budget execution, non-oil revenue mobilization, and debt management. Under Focus Area II, there was limited progress towards an improved vocational skills-building system

(Objective 5). In contrast, there was good progress in improving Gabon's digital infrastructure and in reducing the time and cost to register a business (Objective 4). However, progress under these areas did not translate into a measurable improvement in investment climate beyond digital infrastructure. Under Focus Area III, broadband connectivity for localities increased but there was negligible progress towards increasing access to electricity and water in rural and urban areas and towards establishing a National Health Information system to improve health services nationwide (Objective 6). Good progress was made towards improving the sustainable management of national parks, but limited progress was made towards improving sustainable management of critical ecosystems and reducing illegal poaching of elephants (Objective 7). Finally, little progress was made towards improving knowledge, tools, and policies for social delivery (Objective 8).

Objectives	CLR Rating	CLRR (IEG Rating)
Focus Area I: Governance and Public Sector Capacity		Moderately Unsatisfactory
Objective 1: Increased transparency and accountability in the extractives sector	Partially Achieved	Not Achieved
Objective 2: Strengthened public financial management	Mostly Achieved	Mostly Achieved
Objective 3: Improved social and economic data	Mostly Achieved	Partially Achieved
Focus Area II: Competitiveness and Employment		Unsatisfactory
Objective 4: Improved investment climate	Mostly Achieved	Partially Achieved
Objective 5: Improved vocational skills-building system	Partially Achieved	Partially Achieved
Focus Area III: Human Development and Environmental Sustainability		Unsatisfactory
Objective 6: Improved access and quality of services	Not Achieved	Not Achieved
Objective 7: Improved transparency and sustainability in natural resource management	Mostly Achieved	Partially Achieved
Objective 8: Improve knowledge, tools, and policies for social service delivery	Not Achieved	Not Achieved

B. Assessment by Focus Area/Objective

Focus Area 1: Governance and Public Sector Capacity

Objective 1

20. **Objective 1: Increased transparency and accountability in the extractives sector.** This objective was supported by the *Extractive Sector Non-Lending Technical Assistance* (FY14) which focused on improving the regulatory and institutional framework for the management of the extractives sector with the aim of enabling Gabon to regain EITI candidate status. IFC also

contributed to this objective by requiring its investee, the Vaalco Energy Company², to publicly disclose its contracts with and any payment to the government. Objective 1 had two indicators, with only one being relevant for the objective. The assessment of performance is as follows:

Indicator	Baseline (Year)	Target (Year)	IEG Validated Result (June 2018)	Results beyond FY18*	IEG Rating
Gabon readmitted as EITI candidate	Non-EITI compliant (2013)	Readmitted as an EITI candidate country (2016)	Gabon was not admitted as a candidate country	Gabon was admitted as s candidate country (October 2021)	Not achieved

* For information only, not considered in the rating of performance during the CPS period

21. **Beyond the indicator above, this objective had an additional indicator on debt management that was unrelated to the objective** (Indicator 1.2: Development of a governance and debt management strategy) but relevant to Objective 2 (“Strengthened public financial management”). Support for debt management and progress with respect to this indicator are discussed under Objective 2 in this IEG CLR Review.

22. **Not Achieved.** Gabon remained non EITI-compliant by the end of the CPS period, with EITI candidacy status only achieved by October 2021.

Objective 2

23. **Objective 2: Strengthened public financial management.** To support this objective, the World Bank delivered a mix of analytical work and investment and policy lending covering: (i) public financial management, which included support for improving budget preparation and execution, increasing the coverage of the external audit function, containing the wage bill, and decreasing the use of single source contracting; (ii) revenue mobilization, and (iii) debt management.

- **Budget Preparation and Execution.** The *Gabon Public Expenditure Review* (PER) (FY12) identified weaknesses in budget preparation and execution and assessed the effectiveness of public resources allocated to key social and poverty reducing sectors. The *Public Financial Management Reimbursable Technical Assistance* (FY14) and the *Public Financial Management Reimbursable Advisory Service* (FY17) provided technical assistance to: (i) strengthen the budget preparation, execution, and reporting in all line ministries and (ii) develop capacity to carry out performance audits with the aim of assessing the value-for-money of public spending.
- **External Audit.** The *Supreme Audit Institution Capacity Building* (FY15-18) focused on increasing the efficiency and accountability in the use of public resources through

² IFC Vaalco III (33781)

improvements in the professionalism and quality of the audit work of the Supreme Audit Institution.

- **Wage Bill.** The *Public Sector Wage Bill* (FY16) identified two main factors behind wage bill growth: the lack of control in recruitments and increased unit costs driven by bonuses. Against the backdrop of commodity price-driven fiscal stress, the *Public Expenditure Review* (FY18) assessed the adequacy, quality (effectiveness, efficiency, and equity) and sustainability of public expenditures in Gabon with a special focus on health, education, and social protection; and (ii) provided the government with options to rationalize spending through measures to improve wage bill and public investment management. The *Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPO* (FY18) included a prior action to reduce the wage bill through a recruitment freeze and stringent hiring controls.
- **Procurement.** The *Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPO* (FY18) aimed to improve the efficiency of procurement practices by decreasing the use of single source contracting and increasing the use of competitive and transparent procurement processes. In addition, the DPO included a prior action to reduce the wage bill through a recruitment freeze and stringent hiring controls.
- **Revenue mobilization.** The *Review of Tax System Reimbursable Technical Assistance* (FY13) (i) revealed that the tax burden on investment in Gabon was internationally competitive, but that the country suffered from a complex and discretionary tax incentives system, and (ii) identified bottlenecks and administrative burdens that added unnecessary costs to businesses. The *Tax System Reform Reimbursable Technical Assistance* (FY17) financed technical assistance activities to reform tax incentives systems and to simplify tax administration. The *Public Expenditure Review* (P159858) (FY18) provided options on how to increase non-oil revenue mobilization through tax expenditure rationalization. This work informed the *Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPO* (P159508) (FY18), which included a prior action on reducing tax expenditures.
- **Debt Management.** Debt management was supported through the Gabon DeMPA and Action Plan (FY14), which financed a Debt Management Performance Assessment (DeMPA) and the design of a Debt Management Reform Plan.

24. The assessment of performance on each of the indicators is as follows:

Indicator	Baseline (Year)	Target (Year)	IEG Validated Result (Year)	Results beyond FY18*	IEG Rating
Number of line ministries equipped with tools to better plan, execute,	0 (2012)	3 (2016)	6 (2013)	IEG was unable to verify whether this achievement was sustained for	Achieved

and report on their budgets				the remained of the CPS period	
Development of a public finance strategy	No (2012)	Yes (2016)	Although a “strategy” per se was not developed, the World Bank analytical work contributed to the articulation of a public finance reform agenda.	Not available	Mostly Achieved
Aggregate expenditure outturn (PEFA Investment Budget Execution Score PI-1)	87.5 percent (equivalent to a C score for PEFA PI-1) by 2013.	90 percent (equivalent to a B score for PEFA PI-1) by 2017	85 percent (equivalent to a D score for the PEFA P1-1) by 2017	Not available	Not Achieved
Improve transparency and accountability of external audit as measured by the number of performance audit reports published	1 (2015)	3 (Dec 2017)	3 value-for-money audits in infrastructure and social sectors (Dec 2017)	Not available	Achieved
Operational risk-based system for selection of tax payments subject to audit implemented	No (2015)	Yes (2017)	The Gabonese Tax Department developed and implemented an operational risk-based system for the selection of tax payments subject to audit by 2017.	Not available	Achieved
Development of a governance and debt management strategy * *	No (2012).	Yes (2014)	The DeMPA assessment and a Debt Management Reform were completed in 2012/2013.	The CLR provided no information on the plan’s implementation status.	Achieved

* For information only, not considered in the rating of performance during the CPS period

** As mentioned before, the CPS Results Framework placed this indicator under Objective 1, but this indicator was unrelated to that objective. For this reason, this IEG CLR Review discusses this indicator under objective 2, an objective with which the indicator has a stronger connection.

25. Additional evidence of the achievements under each of the World Bank supported areas is discussed below:

- **Budget Preparation and Execution.** Between 2006 and 2014, the PEFA Budget Preparation Process score (Indicator PIII-11) increased from a C to an A, a score that was maintained in the 2017 PEFA (Indicator PIV-17). However, budget execution did not improve (see indicator 2.3 above) as the efficacy of the budget management tools supported by the World Bank was hampered by the weak maturity of investment projects included in the budget (CLR, para. 47).
- **External Audit.** World Bank support for the external audit function achieved its proposed target but did not translate into increased external audit coverage, as evidenced by a decrease in the PEFA Audit Coverage Score (PVII-30.1) from a C to a D between 2014 and 2017.
- **Wage Bill.** World Bank support for reforms to contain the wage bill brought about an estimated 15 percent decline in real terms between 2016 and 2019. (ICR *Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPO*).
- **Procurement.** World Bank support for procurement reforms contributed to improving the efficiency and transparency of public spending with the percentage of contracts (above CFAF 100 million) allocated through competitive process increasing from 29 percent in 2015 to 61 percent in 2018 (ISR #1 for the *Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPO*).
- **Revenue Mobilization.** World Bank support did not translate into increased non-oil revenue mobilization within the CPS period. Between 2015 and 2018, non-oil revenue (as a percentage of non-oil GDP) decreased from 21.0 percent to 16.4 percent. The non-oil revenue decline was caused by the late adoption of the 2017 Amended Finance Law (which included provisions to reduce tax expenditures), strikes in tax and customs administrations, and a slowdown of the non-oil sectors due to a reduction in government spending as part of fiscal consolidation efforts. As of 2019, Bank interventions had contributed to increasing non-oil revenue (as a percentage of GDP) to 17.8 percent (ICR *Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPO*).
- **Debt Management.** Although the overall PEFA score for debt management remained unchanged at B, a comparison of debt management sub scores shows a deterioration in quality of debt data recording and reporting between 2014 and 2017, and the 2020 SCD noted that the Government did not have in place a credible medium debt management strategy to address challenges related to its elevated financing needs. Moreover, the CLR noted that overall debt management capacity remained weak with Gabon having one of the worst repayment records amongst IBRD borrowers and with the Paris Club creditors reporting frequent arrears from Gabon (CLR para. 8).

26. **Mostly Achieved.** Although a “strategy” per se was not developed, World Bank analytical work contributed to the articulation of a public finance reform agenda that was implemented through a mix of technical assistance and lending. World Bank support for budget management tools contributed to improving budget preparation but did not improve budget execution. External audit and debt management targets were met but they did not translate into increased external audit coverage and improved debt management capacity. Likewise, although the tax reform target was met, non-oil revenue mobilization did not increase. Although not included in the results framework, World Bank support for procurement reforms contributed to reducing single source contracting while support for a recruitment freeze and procedures to strengthen hiring controls helped contain the wage bill.

Objective 3

27. **Objective 3: Improved social and economic data.** The *Statistics Development in Gabon Technical Assistance* (FY17) provided support for the implementation of the national household survey as well as strategic advice on the longer-term development of the Direction Generale de Statistiques (DGS) and the effective implementation of the National Statistical Development Strategy (NSDS). When the government was unable to fund data collection activities for the national household survey, it requested the World Bank to develop the *Statistical Development Project* (FY17-24) that focused on (i) filling key data gaps pertaining to poverty, national accounts, prices, and agriculture and health statistics; and (ii) supporting the implementation of a statistical institutional reform.

28. The assessment of performance on each of the indicators was as follows:

Indicator	Baseline (Year)	Target (Year)	IEG Validated Result (June 2018)	Results beyond FY18*	IEG Rating
Household and poverty data available for use in policy- and decision-making	No (2012)	Yes (December 2017)	Household data collected but not available for public use (December 2017)	Household data available for public use (December 2018)	Mostly Achieved
New Statistical Agency is operational	No (2012)	Yes (December 2017)	The Bank supported the elaboration of a legal framework for a National Institute of Statistics	No	Partially Achieved
Reducing the National Statistical Institute’s backlog in producing provisional national accounts	4-year backlog (2012)	1-year backlog (June 2018)	Backlog not reduced (June 2018)	Reduced backlog in the production of GDP series and external trade	Partially Achieved

				statistics (October 2021)	
The consumer price index uses a new base year and the number of cities covered increases from 1 to 4	Old base year and 1 city covered (2012)	New base year and 4 cities covered (December 2017)	Consumer price index not updated and no increase in the number of cities verified (December 2017)	Consumer price index updated (August 2019)	Partially Achieved

* For information only, not considered in the rating of performance during the CPS period

29. **Partially Achieved.** Good progress was made towards improving the availability of household and poverty data and updating the base year for the CPI. But limited progress was achieved in improving the timelines of national accounts and in expanding the coverage of the CPI outside Libreville. Limited progress was achieved with respect to planned organizational reforms in the statistical sector. In addition, a review of Gabon's Statistical Capacity Index shows no improvement, with the score remaining without change during the review period at 36.7 points, a decline from the pre-review period (47.8 points in 2005). This placed Gabon as the 8th lowest among 155 developing countries, well below the Sub-Saharan African and IBRD country averages of 59.9 and 75.3, respectively. In 2019, the score improved to 43.3 but most of the improvement was reversed in 2020.

30. **IEG rates the outcome of WBG support under Focus Area I as Moderately Unsatisfactory** based on the assessment of objectives 1-3 above.

Focus Area 2: Competitiveness and Employment

Objective 4

31. **Objective 4: Improved investment climate.** To support this objective, the WBG delivered a mix of analytical and advisory support and both World Bank and IFC investments and through several regional IDA projects.

32. **World Bank Lending.** The *Central African Backbone Project* (P122776) (FY06-20) and its *Additional Financing* (FY16) aimed to increase geographical reach and usage of regional broadband network services and reduce their prices in Gabon. The *Investment Promotion and Competitiveness Project* (FY12-19) aimed to improve the investment climate and to foster enterprise development. The *E-Gabon Project* (FY16-22) fostered the emergence of a digital innovation ecosystem through the development of a digital incubator in Libreville and smaller-scale incubators in Port-Gentil and Franceville. The *First Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPO* (FY18) included prior actions to streamline business registration and spur business creation and to strengthen regulations with respect to electronic communications and transactions.

33. **IFC Investments.** To improve the connection between landlocked iron ore and manganese mines to international markets, as well as enhance mobility of the general population, IFC provided loans to the operating company of the Trans-Gabon Railway (SETRAG) to rehabilitate the railway infrastructure between Libreville and Franceville.

34. **Analytical and Advisory Services (ASA).** Key analytical and advisory support included the *Gabon Economic Diversification and Competitiveness* (FY15), which advised on economic diversification including time bound action plans for selected sectors (agroindustry, palm oil, plantain, manioc, tourism, and wood transformation) and cross cutting constraints. The *Gabon Export Diversification and Competitiveness Report* (FY15) identified major constraints to export diversification and provided the government with specific policy options for addressing those constraints. This analytical work was used to inform the design of the *First Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPOs* (FY18).

35. **World Bank Regional Projects.** As a member of the Organization for the Harmonization of Business Law (OHADA)³, Gabon benefited from the IDA-funded *Improved Investment Climate within OHADA Project* (FY12-23) which aimed to improve investment climate through harmonization of all business and commercial laws within member countries. In addition, Gabon benefited from the *CEMAC Regional Institutions Support Project* (FY09-16) and the *Strengthening the Capacity of Regional Financial Institutions in the CEMAC Region* (FY18-24) which aimed to increase access to finance by strengthening the transparency and competitiveness of financial systems in member countries.

36. The assessment of performance on each of the indicators was as follows:

Indicator	Baseline (Year)	Target (Year)	IEG Validated Result (June 2018)	Results beyond FY18*	IEG Rating
Increased coverage and use of regional broadband and network services as measured by the number of subscribers per 100 people	14 (December 2011)	65 (December 2017)	102 (2017)	Not available	Achieved
Average monthly price of wholesale international E1 capacity link from capital city to Europe	US\$10,000 (December 2011)	US\$500 (December 2017)	US\$ 270 (June 2018)	Not available	Achieved

³ OHADA – Organization for the Harmonization of Business Law in Africa – was established in 1993 through a Treaty to improve the legal security and predictability of doing business in West and Central Africa.

Number of days to register a business	58 days (2012)	28 days (June 2018)	33 days (June 2018)	10 days (2020)	Mostly Achieved
Cost to register a business as a share of per capita income	17 percent (2012)	12.5 percent (June 2018)	7.2 percent of per capita income (2018)	13.3 percent of per capita income (2020)	Achieved
Kilometers of fiber optic network built	0 km (2011).	1,561 km (December 2017)	1,140 (December 2017)	1,760 (June 2020)	Partially Achieved
Retail price of internet services (per Mbit/s per Month)	US\$ 218 (December 2011)	US\$ 80 (December 2017)	US\$ 8 (2017)	Not available	Achieved
Number of digital economy start-up projects incubated	0 (December 2015)	8 (December 2017)	0 (June 2018)	10 (April 2021)	Not Achieved

* For information only, not considered in the rating of performance during the CPS period

37. **Partially Achieved.** Although falling short of some targets within the CPS period (“kilometers of fiber optic network built” and “number of digital economy start up projects incubated”), Bank support contributed to significant improvements in Gabon’s digital infrastructure as evidenced by: (a) an increase in the geographical reach and usage of regional broadband network services (Indicator 4.1); (b) a decrease in the average monthly price of wholesale international E1 capacity link from capital city to Europe (Indicator 4.6) and (c) a decrease in the average monthly price of internet services (Indicator 4.6). The 2020 SCD (p. 74) noted that Gabon possesses today the largest digital capacity of the region – ranked 6th among African countries by the International Telecommunications Union in 2017—and is way ahead of its neighbors in terms of equipment, retail prices for internet, and mobile internet penetration. However, other critical investment climate constraints were not addressed, including those identified in the 2020 SCD: access to and reliability of electricity supply; poor state of transportation infrastructure and slow project implementation; and poor state of education infrastructure. There is no evidence that procedures to start a business were a major constraint to investment. While there were decreases in the cost and number of days to register a business (Indicator 4.4), the overall investment climate as measured by Doing Business only improved marginally with Gabon’s ease of doing business score increasing from a 44 in 2015 (earliest measurement available) to a 45 in 2020 (latest measurement available). Despite this marginal improvement, Gabon’s overall doing business ranking deteriorated from 156th in 2012 to 169th in 2020, placing the country far behind most of its sub-Saharan Africa and upper-middle-income peers. Without evidence that critical constraints beyond broadband were addressed, the objective is rated as partially achieved.

Objective 5

38. **Objective 5: Improved vocational skills-building system.** This objective was supported by the *Skills Development and Employability Project* (FY16-22), which made investments and

provided technical support to improve effectiveness of vocational training, short term skills development, and entrepreneurship programs in key sectors. In addition, the *E-Gabon Project* (FY16-22) aimed to advance youth skills through the development of a digital incubator in Libreville and, as extensions, smaller-scale incubators in Port-Gentil and Franceville.

39. The assessment of performance on each of the indicators was as follows:

Indicator	Baseline (Year)	Target (Year)	IEG Validated Result (June 2018)	Results beyond FY18*	IEG Rating
Number of public-private joint management agreements signed for TVET institutions based on performance contracts	0 (2015)	5 (February 2018)	0 (June 2018)	3 (February 2022)	Not Achieved
Number of participants in new skills development programs	0 (2015)	200 (2017)	150 (June 2018)	7,027 (February 2022)	Mostly Achieved
Number of participants in training sessions organized by incubators (digital economy).	0 (December 2015)	300 (December 2017)	0 (December 2017)	953 (April 2021)	Not Achieved

* For information only, not considered in the rating of performance during the CPS period

40. **Partially Achieved.** Of three indicators under the objective, one was mostly achieved (Indicator 5.2) and two were not achieved (Indicator 5.1 and 5.3) within the CPS period. These indicators were not adequate as they were too output oriented and did not measure important dimensions of “an improved vocational skills-building system” such as quality (e.g., through satisfaction of employers with vocational training graduates) and relevance (e.g., through employment rates of graduates). Significant delays in the implementation of the *Skills Development and Employability Project* (FY16-22) may explain the lack of progress with respect to Indicator 5.1. This project was affected by weak implementation unit capacity and several leadership changes in the government that affected ownership and commitment. As of February 2022, the project had still not met the target for Indicator 5.1. Meanwhile, a delay in project effectiveness for the *E-Gabon Project* explains the failure to meet the target for Indicator 5.1 within the CPS period. As of April 2021, the project had surpassed the target for Indicator 5.3.

41. IEG rates the outcome of WBG support under Focus Area II as Unsatisfactory based on the assessment of objectives 4 and 5 above.

Focus Area 3: Human Development and Environmental Sustainability

Objective 6

42. **Objective 6: Improved access and quality of services.** The *Rural Electrification and Water Services Sustainability Mechanism* (FY18) assisted the government in the design of a sustainable delivery model for basic electricity and water services in rural areas. The *Access to Basic Services in Rural Areas and Capacity Building Project* (FY16-22) aimed to expand access to water and energy services in targeted rural areas and to establish mechanisms to improve sustainability of service provision. The *Second Local Infrastructure Development Project* (FY16-22) made investments to improve access to urban infrastructure and services in selected underserved neighborhoods and provided training and technical assistance to build basic capacities for municipal management in target cities. To improve nationwide connectivity, the *Central African Backbone Project* (FY02-20) and its *Additional Financing* (FY16) financed infrastructure to increase coverage of broadband internet and the *E-Gabon Project* (FY16-22) supported the delivery and management of public health services through ICT systems seeking to improve the timeliness and availability of information.

43. The assessment of performance on each of the indicators was as follows:

Indicator	Baseline (Year)	Target (Year)	IEG Validated Result (June 2018)	Results beyond FY18*	IEG Rating
Number of people provided with access to electricity by household connections in target areas, including women	0 (2015)	7,500 (June 2018)	0 (June 2018)	1,200 (May 2022)	Not Achieved
Number of new community electricity connections including communities, schools, and health clinics, water pumping systems	0 (2015)	30 (June 2018)	0 (June 2018)	Not available	Not Achieved
Percentage of households in villages covered by an Operation and Maintenance (O&M) operator with functional electricity and water services	0 (2015)	90 (June 2018)	0 (December 2018)	Not available	Not Achieved

Number of people provided with access to “improved water sources” in target areas, including women	0 (2015).	7,500 (June 2018)	0 (December 2018).	No additional progress	Not Achieved
Number of people in urban areas provided with access to all season roads within a 500-meter range and other urban infrastructure and services	0 (2015)	20,000 (February 2018).	4,000 (December 2018)	No additional progress	Not Achieved
Number of localities with broadband internet	3 (December 2011)	18 (December 2018)	42 (June 2018)	225 (October 2020)	Achieved
Working level achieved with the National Health Information system among health professionals (in percentage)	0 (2015)	30 percent (December 2017)	0 (June 2018)	No additional progress	Not Achieved

* For information only, not considered in the rating of performance during the CPS period

44. **Not Achieved.** The objective was broadly and vaguely defined, seeking to address too many infrastructure gaps: electricity and water in rural areas; roads and water and sanitation in urban areas; and broadband connectivity and a health information system at the nationwide level. Moreover, the measurement impact was too output oriented, with no indicators measuring quality of services and no indicators to measure the outcomes associated with improved access. Overall, the World Bank contribution towards expanded access to electricity and water services in rural areas was negligible during the CPS period. Likewise, negligible progress was achieved with respect to urban infrastructure (roads and water and sanitation). With respect to ICT services, progress was mixed with the target for broadband connectivity being exceeded for localities but falling short of implementing a National Health Information system to improve health services nationwide.

Objective 7

45. **Objective 7: Improved transparency and sustainability in natural resource management.** Three GEF funded operations supported this objective: (i) the *Strengthening Capacity for Managing National Parks and Biodiversity* (FY06-13), which aimed to enhance the conservation of biological diversity in Gabon through capacity support for the National Parks Agency, technical assistance to expand Gabon’s protected areas coverage, and infrastructure investments and trainings to ensure effective park management and wildlife management outside of national parks; (ii) the *Sustainable Management of Critical Wetlands Ecosystems* (FY14-21), aimed at advancing biodiversity conservation in selected forested wetlands through support for an increased knowledge base for effective design of conservation and management

of wetlands and support for the implementation of surveillance programs and income income-generating activities (IGAs) for communities surrounding wetlands; (iii) and the *Wildlife and human-elephant conflicts management in the South of Gabon* (FY17-22), which sought to reduce elephant poaching and human-elephant conflicts in four national parks through support for the development of national tools and measures for elephant management and the implementation of park management plans and cross-border (Gabon-Congo) anti-poaching activities. The World Bank also delivered the Gabon Forestry Study (FY17), which supported the elaboration of a plan for sustainable forest management.

46. The assessment of performance on each of the indicators was as follows:

Indicator	Baseline (Year)	Target (Year)	IEG Validated Result (June 2018)	Results beyond FY18*	IEG Rating
Number of national parks land hectares under protection	0 (2010)	900,000 (2013)	900,000 (in June 2013)	No additional progress	Achieved
Percentage increase in management effectiveness in three national parks covering 700,00 hectares as per the GEF Protected Area Management Tracking Tool	57% Loango (May 2010) 58% Mayumba (May 2010) 50% for Moukalaba-Doudou (May 2010)	65% for each park (2013)	75% Loango (June 2013) 65.6% Mayumba (June 2013) 71.9% Moukalaba-Doudou Park (June 2013)	No additional progress	Achieved
Number of ecosystem services valuation undertaken	0 (2013)	3 (June 2018)	0 (June 2018)	4 (April 2020)	Not Achieved
Development stage reached in management plans prepared for forested wetlands	0 (2013)	2 (June 2018)	0 (June 2018)	2 (April 2020) **	Partially Achieved
Proportion of elephants killed illegally in four targeted national parks (Moukalaba Doudou, Loango, Mayumba, Waka)	30 % (2015)	25 % (June 2018)	30% (June 2018)	21% (July 2020) 25% (April 2021)	Not Achieved

* For information only, not considered in the rating of performance during the CPS period

** The Gabon Sustainable Management Critical Wetlands (P143914) supported the implementation of two management plans for Petit Loango and Birougou that were prepared by the Government before the project. In addition, this project had a target of elaborating three additional plans. Only two management plans, for the Bas-Ogooué and Setté-Cama sites, were prepared under the project. They were finalized

outside the CPS period (in later half of December 2020, just before the project closing date of December 31, 2020).

47. **Partially Achieved.** Sustainable management of national parks substantially improved, with the targets for number of national land park hectares under protection and improved management effectiveness in three national parks met during the CPS period (Indicator 7.1 and 7.2). There was limited progress towards sustainable management of critical ecosystems, with the targets for ecosystem services valuation not achieved (Indicator 7.3) and the target for elaboration of management plans for forest wetlands partially achieved (Indicator 7.4). Finally, illegal poaching did not improve with the target for the proportion of elephants killed illegally (Indicator 7.5) not met during the CPS period.

Objective 8

48. **Objective 8: Improve knowledge, tools, and policies for social service delivery.** Support was provided through a mix of analytical work and investment and policy lending. Key analytical work included the [Country Status/Health Financing](#) (FY14) and the [Public Expenditure Review](#) (PER, FY18). The former generated knowledge on health financing in Gabon while the latter assessed the effectiveness, efficiency, equity, and sustainability of public expenditures in Gabon, with a special focus on human development sectors. This analytical work informed the design of the *E-Gabon Project (FY16-22)*, which focused on designing and implementing a national health plan; a results-based financing pilot for the health sector; and a National Health Information System (NHIS) to support health service delivery and management. In addition, this analytical work informed the design of the *Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPO* (FY18), which sought to improve the efficiency of health service delivery and social protection services through prior actions to operationalize: a performance-based reform in selected health regions and to improve funding, targeting, and performance of social protection services. The objective had two indicators:

49. The assessment of performance on each of the indicators was as follows:

Indicator	Baseline (Year)	Target (Year)	IEG Validated Result (June 2018)	Results beyond FY18*	IEG Rating
Roll out of the National Health Information System achieved	No (2012)	Yes (2018)	No (June 2018)	No additional progress	Not Achieved
Design of Results-Based Financing (RBF) Pilot completed	No (2012)	Yes (December 2017)	No (June 2018)	No additional progress	Not Verified

* For information only, not considered in the rating of performance during the CPS period

50. **Not Achieved.** The objective was vaguely defined, with many of its supporting activities having considerable overlap with the ones supporting the objective on “Improved access and quality of services”. None of the targets were achieved during the CPS period, reflecting important delays in the implementation of the *E-Gabon Project* (FY16-22) which, as of February 2022 was making Moderately Unsatisfactory progress towards achievement of its objectives. Likewise, the reforms for increasing the efficiency of health care delivery and social protection services supported by the *Fiscal Consolidation and Inclusive Growth DPO Series* have faced considerable delays, thus leading to an unsatisfactory achievement of results (ICR DPO P159508).

51. **IEG rates the outcome of WBG support under Focus Area III as Unsatisfactory** based on the assessment of objectives 6-8 above.

V. WBG Performance

Learning and Adaptation

52. **The WBG was responsive to country demand and demonstrated learning ability.** The decrease in oil prices deteriorated Gabon’s growth performance and deteriorated macroeconomic stability. As a result of this shock, public expenditures were cut dramatically, impacting the PSGE and progress towards CPS objectives. While reasserting the CPS core themes, the PLR responded with a rapid increase in portfolio size as per government request. IEG’s assessment is that the selected areas for scaled-up support (information and management systems for health services; skills development; electricity and water in rural areas; roads, water, and sanitation in urban areas; and statistical development) were appropriate to the country’s challenges and CPS objectives however they exceeded absorptive and implementation capacity of the government. Between FY15 and FY16, the number of projects increased from 3 to 8 while net commitments increased from US\$ 25.9 million to US\$ 422.9 million. In addition, the WBG demonstrated learning ability, with the prime example being the strategic use of ASA to design policy options for mitigating the macro-economic deterioration that followed the 2015 decline in oil prices. Key work included: the Wage Bill Study 2018, the Public Expenditure Review 2018, and the CEMAC Policy Note 2017. These ASA programs informed the design of a DPO series focused on strengthening the fiscal balance through increased revenue mobilization, wage bill containment, more competitive procurement, and improved value-for-money in health and social protection.

53. **However, the WBG was unable to effectively address uneven government commitment and did not adequately prepare for the rapid increase in portfolio size.** The rapid increase in portfolio size was agreed without ensuring adequate WBG and government capacity. As a consequence, the scaled-up program quickly overburdened the client and the WBG’s ability to support the client. By and large, ownership was high for those CPS areas whereby the government had clear vision and strong leadership (e.g., digital infrastructure). In contrast, the government exhibited less ownership for other areas such as strengthening Gabon’s vocational skills-building system where frequent changes in government and weak project implementation capacity diluted commitment.

Risk Identification and Mitigation

54. **Risks for the WBG-supported program were mostly well identified but not always adequately mitigated.** The CPS identified four potential risks: macroeconomic, institutional capacity, political, and social. No overall risk rating nor individual ratings for each risk were provided since the CPS was prepared before enactment of the Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool (SORT). The macroeconomic risk materialized, throwing the country into a macroeconomic crisis that jeopardized progress towards PSGE goals and CPS objectives. Overall, World Bank mitigating measures for macroeconomic risks, which were focused on continued support for governance and public financial management, worked to weather the crisis reasonably well. Limited institutional capacity to implement national development plans and World Bank projects was also identified as a risk by the CPS. This risk was driven by limited government capacity for preparing and executing budgets effectively, weak procurement practices, inadequate coordination between ministries, and weak analytical underpinnings to design policies. World Bank mitigating measures focused on supporting public financial management, filling out knowledge gaps, designing simpler projects (to avoid the need for excessive coordination between ministries), and using a centralized project implementation unit for all World Bank-supported projects. The centralized project implementation unit worked well early in the CPS period but, as acknowledged in the CLR (p. 14), its performance deteriorated with the rapid increase in to expand an already strained capacity and a two- year leadership vacuum. Uneven government commitment to the WBG program was not identified as a risk. The risk materialized and affected progress towards CPS Objective 5 (“Improved vocational skills-building system”)

WBG Collaboration

55. **WBG collaboration was focused on transparency in the extractives sector where it worked reasonably well and investment climate where it failed to materialize.** The envisaged collaboration between the World Bank and IFC to strengthen investment climate did not materialize as planned. Originally, IFC was to develop a regional CEMAC advisory project (June 2017) to complement World Bank analytical and investment lending support. But the IFC regional advisory project was unable to go beyond pre-implementation stage and was cancelled in FY20. IEG found evidence of complementary work to increase transparency of extractives, whereby the World Bank supported EITI compliance while IFC requested its investee, Vaalco Energy Company, to publicly disclose its contracts with the government. Beyond these two examples, IEG was unable verify further WBG collaboration and could not find concrete evidence of collaboration for the implementation of the WBG Maximizing Finance of Development (MFD) approach. Finally, as noted by this CLR Review (Section II), the results framework lacked properly defined objectives and measurable outcome indicators for IFC and MIGA activities.

Partnerships and Development Partner Coordination

56. **The WBG effectively coordinated its efforts with development partners but coordination with regional institutions was not always effective.** Coordination with

development partners was effective, with the World Bank establishing a strong coordination with other development partners for national parks conservation and wildlife management. Under these coordination arrangements, the World Bank provided support to four national parks in the southwest of the country while other development partners targeted national parks in other regions. Moreover, whenever activities intersected at the national level, the World Bank coordinated well with development partners to avoid duplication and maximize synergies. Coordination to improve transport infrastructure was also strong, with IFC and the French Development Agency (AFD) working together to rehabilitate the existing railway infrastructure. Likewise, coordination for reducing gas flaring was also effective, with the World Bank partnering with the government and the private sector to implement flaring reduction plans for all operators with support from the Global Gas Flaring Reduction Partnership (GGFR). In contrast, partnership arrangements with regional institutions were not always effective. For instance, World Bank's partnership with CEMAC regional institutions through the *Regional Institutions Support Project* (FY09-16) was too complex and fell short from achieving its intended objectives with IEG rating the overall development outcome as unsatisfactory. Building on the lessons from this unsuccessful project, the *Strengthening the Capacity of Regional Financial Institutions in the CEMAC Region* (FY18-24) has simplified partnership arrangements by reducing the number of beneficiary institutions and better focusing technical assistance activities.

Safeguards and Fiduciary Issues

57. **Safeguards compliance had shortcomings during the CPS period.** Despite efforts to comply with all safeguards requirements, two projects had shortcomings. Safeguards compliance was initially rated unsatisfactory during implementation of the *Local Infrastructure Development Project* (FY12-16) because of specialist shortages, weak capacity, and budget limitations. Following recommendations of the mid-term review, the implementing agency recruited a consultant to monitor progress and ensure that World Bank procedures were strictly followed. At project closing, the overall safeguards rating was satisfactory. In contrast, the *Strengthening Capacity for Managing National Parks and Biodiversity* (FY06-13) project faced more serious safeguards issues with no physical resettlement of the households living within the three parks supported by the project. Although a Resettlement Action Plan was prepared, the local agency did not follow through with implementation and resettlement of the households living within the three parks supported by the project. With the implementation of the parks management plans approved after project closing, the ICR acknowledged that shortcomings in safeguards compliance could potentially create environment and social risks of unknown magnitude. No inspection Panel Cases were registered during the CPS.

58. **No INT investigations occurred during the CPS period.** INT reviewed only one complaint related to Gabon during the FY12-18 which did not lead to an investigation and no previously opened cases were closed.

Overall Assessment and Rating

59. Overall, IEG rated World Bank Group performance as **Fair**.

Design

60. The CPS objectives addressed major development constraints to country development goals and were consistent with country priorities as reflected in the PSGE but lacked selectivity, with some of them lacking adequate government ownership. This problem was exacerbated at the PLR stage with the introduction of vaguely defined and overlapping objectives. As acknowledge by the CLR (p.7), the PLR also introduced an objective that could not be achieved within the CPS timeframe. Moreover, World Bank engagement was significantly scaled up at the PLR stage, which quickly overburdened client capacity. In areas where other development partners were active, the WBG adequately coordinated its program design to avoid overlaps and maximize synergies.

Implementation

61. In response to the need for increased financing that affected Gabon following the 2015 oil price decrease, the WBG significantly expanded its lending to Gabon from US\$ 25.9 million to US\$ 422.9 million in net commitments between 2015 and 2016. But, as noted, this was not commensurate with the client capacity, affecting the timely delivery of the WBG program. Although weak country systems had been identified as a risk, WBG mitigation measures were insufficient to avoid implementation delays, particularly after the sizable portfolio scale up. Changes to the results matrix that were detrimental to program focus were introduced at the PLR stage, such as the duplication of objectives and the introduction of an objective that could not realistically be achieved within the CPS period. Moreover, the PLR failed to rectify shortcomings in the design of the results framework and to include indicators to capture IFC and MIGA contributions. The WBG also failed to adequately supervise safeguards: although there were no inspection panel cases during the CPS period, safeguards compliance had shortcomings, with one project not implementing its resettlement action plan. WBG collaboration with development partners was effective but not so coordination with regional institutions. The WBG demonstrated learning ability, with the prime example being the strategic use of ASA to design policy options for mitigating the macro-economic shock that followed the 2015 decline in oil prices.

VI. Assessment of CLR

62. **The CLR provided a candid assessment of the CPS achievements based on the objectives proposed in the results framework (as updated by the PLR).** However, given that many of the indicators measuring these objectives were output oriented, the CLR needed a discussion of the extent to which these outputs led to outcomes. The discussion of WBG's adaptation to changing circumstances was adequate but there was no discussion of safeguards compliance or fiduciary issues. The CLR presented evidence and analysis of IFC and MIGA interventions, although in some cases this information was not sufficiently precise. For instance, an IFC investment services support for a fertilizer project was highlighted in the CLR although it did not go through as subsequently confirmed by the country team.

VII. Lessons

63. **IEG broadly concurs with the CLR's lessons, particularly the following, with some adaptation:** (i) a focus on agendas owned by the government is key to achieving progress; (ii) rapid increases in lending require a better understanding of delivery systems and greater up-front attention by the WBG to build client absorptive and implementation capacity; and (iii) support for the digital economy can have positive spillover effects both for the private and public sector.

Annexes

Annex 1: Achievement of CPF Objectives (Results Framework)

Annex 2: Comments on Lending Portfolio

Annex 3: Comments on ASA Portfolio

Annex 4: Comments on Trust Fund Portfolio

Annex 5: IEG Ratings for Gabon

Annex 6: IEG Project Ratings for Gabon and Comparators, FY12-18

Annex 7: Comments on IFC Investments in Gabon

Annex 8: Comments on IFC Advisory Services in Gabon

Annex 9: Comments on MIGA Guarantees

Annex 10: Economic and Social Indicators

Annex 1: Achievement of CPF Objectives (Results Framework)

CPS FY12-FY18	Results Validated by IEG	Interventions Supporting Objectives
Pillar One: Governance and Public Sector Capacity		
CPS Outcome 1: Increased transparency and accountability in the extractives sector		
Indicator 1: Gabon readmission as EITI candidate. Baseline (2012): Non-EITI compliant Target (2016): Gabon to be readmitted as an EITI candidate country.	Not Achieved Gabon was re-admitted as an EITI implementing country in October 2021. It had formerly joined the EITI in 2007 but lost its status as an EITI implementing country when it was delisted in February 2013. Source: EITI Additional Evidence Re-admitted in October 2021 Source: EITI	Gabon DeMPA and Action Plan AAA (P130681, FY13); Gabon RTA Extractive Sector Technical Assistance Project (P130949, FY14); Gabon RTA Public Financial Management I AAA (P130564, FY14); Gabon RTA Public Financial Management II AAA (P146379, FY17); VAALCO III IFC Investment (33781, FY14); Asonha Energie SA MIGA (14314, 2021)
Indicator 2: Development of a governance and debt management strategy. Baseline (2012): No strategy Target (2013): Strategy developed.	Achieved The DeMPA assessment and a Debt Management Reform Plan were completed in 2012/2013. The CLR provided no information on the plan's implementation status. Source: P130681 Ops Portal-Completion Report	Gabon DeMPA and Action Plan AAA (P130681, FY13); Gabon PFM RTA (P130564, FY13); FISCAL CONSOLIDATION & INCLUSIVE GROWTH DPO (P159508, FY18); Gabon Economic Updates ESW (P151536, FY16); Gabon Economic Update II ESW (P157510, FY16); Gabon Public expenditure review AA (P159858, FY18); Gabon - Policy Notes ESW (P127623, FY15); Gabon Supreme Audit Institution Capacity Building TF (P152449, 2017)
CPS Outcome 2: Strengthened public financial management		
Indicator 3: Number of line ministries equipped with tools to better plan, execute, and report on their budgets Baseline (2012): 0 Target (2016): three-line ministries	Achieved The number of line ministries equipped with budget management tools was 6 by 2013 (Education, Health, Infrastructure, Energy, Budget, and Economy). IEG was unable to verify whether this achievement was sustained for the remainder of the CPS period Source: P130564 Ops Portal - Completion Report	Gabon PFM RTA (P130564, FY13); Gabon DeMPA and Action Plan AAA (P130681, FY13); FISCAL CONSOLIDATION & INCLUSIVE GROWTH DPO (P159508, FY18); Gabon Economic Updates ESW (P151536, FY16); Gabon Economic Update II ESW (P157510, FY16); Gabon Public expenditure review AA (P159858, FY18); Gabon - Policy Notes ESW (P127623, FY15); Gabon Supreme Audit Institution Capacity Building TF (P152449, 2017); Public Expenditure Review (P159858, FY18); Gabon Supreme Audit Institution Capacity Building (P152449, FY14); Gabon Tax
Indicator 4: Development of a public finance strategy. Baseline (2012): none Target (2016): strategy developed	Mostly Achieved Although a "strategy" per se was not developed, the World Bank analytical work contributed to the articulation of a public finance reform agenda. Although a "strategy" per se was not developed, the World Bank analytical work contributed to the articulation of a public finance reform	

CPS FY12-FY18	Results Validated by IEG	Interventions Supporting Objectives
	agenda. Many elements of this reform agenda were supported by the World Bank through a mix of non-lending technical assistance and investment and policy lending. Source: CLR	System Reform TA (P148329, FY17).
Indicator 5: Aggregate expenditure outturn (PEFA Investment Budget Execution Score) Baseline (2013): 87.5 percent or C PEFA PI 1 Target (2017): 90 percent or B PEFA PI 1	Not Achieved 2017: 85 percent (equivalent to a D score for the PEFA P1-1) Source: PEFA 2017	
Indicator 6: Improved transparency and accountability of external audit by publication of 3 performance audit reports Baseline (2015): 1 Target (2017): 3 by December 2017	Achieved 2017: 3 Value for Money (VFM) audits performed in infrastructure and social sectors. Source: P152449 - Implementation Status Results Report : Sequence 04, Page#4	
Indicator 7: Operational risk-based system for selection of tax payments subject to audit in place Baseline (2015): 0 Target (2017): 1 by December 2017	Achieved 2017: The Gabonese Tax Department developed and implemented an operational risk-based system for the selection of tax payments subject to audit. Source: P148329 Completion Report page #2.	
CPS Outcome 3: Improved social and economic data		
Indicator 8: Household and poverty data available for use in policy- and decision-making by December 2017.	Mostly Achieved The data collection for the household survey started in mid-July 2017 and was completed on December 19, 2017. Additional Evidence The dissemination of the household and poverty data was achieved outside the CPS period (December 2018).	Gabon Statistical Development Project (P157473, FY17); Gabon RAS 2 -Statistics Dev. in Gabon (P149230, FY17); Gabon Review of Tax Systems TA (P130956, FY13); Gabon Tax System Reform TA (P148329, FY17); Gabon RAS 2 -Statistics Dev. in Gabon (P149230, FY17); Gabon Macro modeling RAS (P164219, FY19); Support to Targeting Reform and Social Protection Policy Dialogue AA (P169767, FY19).
Indicator 9: The new Statistical Agency is operational by December 2017.	Not Achieved In 2014, the government adopted a new Statistics Act that included the establishment of an autonomous National Statistical Agency at the apex of the National Statistical System. But the government changed its preference later and chose to create a National Statistics Institute rather than a National Statistics Agency. In June 2022, the Parliament approved a new statistics law confirming	

CPS FY12-FY18	Results Validated by IEG	Interventions Supporting Objectives
	the creation of the National Statistics Institute. The law is awaiting President's enactment.	
Indicator 10: Reducing the National Statistical Institute's backlog in producing provisional national accounts from 4 years to 1, by June 2018.	Partially Achieved IEG could not find evidence that the indicator was achieved within the CPS period, but as of October 2021, the World Bank had supported the National Directorate of Statistics (DGS) in the production of GDP series for the years 2010 to 2017 and the production of quarterly external trade statistics for the period 2010-2017 and for the year 2020 (Source: restructuring paper Statistical Development Project). Additional support for updating national accounts was still ongoing. Source: Statistical Development Project	
Indicator 11: The consumer price index uses a new base year and number of cities covered increases from 1 to 4 by December 2017.	Partially Achieved The consumer price index base year was updated in August 2019, thus not meeting the target date. The CLR claims that the number of cities covered by the CPI increased to three in 2018. This claim could not be verified by IEG. Source: P157473 - Sequence No: 02 Page #4	
CPS Pillar Two: Competitiveness and Employment		
CPS Outcome 4: Improved investment climate		
Indicator 12: Increased coverage and use of regional broadband and network services: access to internet services (number of subscribers per 100) Baseline (December 2011): 14 Target (December 2017): 65	Achieved 2017: The number of subscribers per 100 people increased was 102. Source: P122776 - Sequence No: 13, Page #3	Central African Backbone APL4 (P122776, FY12); Gabon Investment Promotion & Competitiveness Project (P129267, FY14); GA-Loc Infrastructure DevSIL(P082812,FY06);eGabon (P132824, FY16); Gabon Economic Updates ESW(P151536, FY16; Gabon Economic Updates ESW (P15710,FY16); eGabon (P132824, FY16); Unlock private investment to support job growth and economic transformation AA (P172589, FY21); Rural Electrification and Water Services Sustainability Mechanism AA (P152126, FY18).
Indicator 13: Average monthly price of wholesale international E1 capacity link from the capital city to Europe Baseline (December 2011): US\$10,000 Target (December 2017): US\$500	Achieved 2017: US\$ 390 June 2018: US\$ 270 Source: P122776 - Sequence No: 14 Page #3	

CPS FY12-FY18	Results Validated by IEG	Interventions Supporting Objectives
Indicator 14: Time to register a business Baseline (2012): 58 days Target (June 2018): 28 days	Mostly Achieved June 2018: 33 days Source: P129267 - Sequence No: 09	
Indicator 15: Cost to register a business Baseline (2012):17 percent of per capita income Target (June 2018):12.5 percent of per capita income	Achieved 2018: 7.2 % per capita income Source: DB 2018 Page #161	
Indicator 16: Length of fiber optic network built (in km) Baseline (December 2011): 0 Target (December 2017): 1,561	Partially Achieved December 2017: 1,140 km June 2020: 1,760 km Source: P122776 – Sequence No: 13, Page #5	
Indicator 17: Retail price of Internet Services (per Mbit/s per Month, in US\$) Baseline (December 2011): 218 Target (December 2017): 80	Achieved 2017: US\$ 8 Source: P122776 - Sequence No: 14, Page 5	
Indicator 18: Number of start-up projects incubated (digital economy) Baseline (December 2015): 0 Target (December 2017): 8	Not Achieved 2017: 0 April 2021: 10 Source: P132824 – Sequence No: 04 Page #3	
CPS Outcome 5: Strengthened vocational skills-building system		
Indicator 19: Number of public-private joint management agreements signed for TVET institutions based on performance contracts Baseline (2015):0 Target (February 2018): 5	Not Achieved The number of public public-private joint management agreements signed for TVET institutions based on performance contracts was 0 (June 2018), not meeting the 5 target. As the per the February 2022 ISR from Skills Development and Employability Project, the number was 3. Source: P146152 – Sequence No: 05 Page #4	Gabon – Skills Development and Employability Project (P146152, FY16);GA- Investment Promotion and Competitive (P129267, FY12);GA-Loc Infrastructure Dev SIL (P082812, FY06); Unlock private investment to support job growth and economic transformation AA; Gabon Public Procurement Assessment using MAPS II AA (P168979, FY19) Gabon Economic Updates ESW(P151536, FY16; Gabon Economic Updates ESW (P15710,FY16); eGabon (P132824, FY16); Unlock private investment to support job growth and economic transformation AA (P172589, FY21);Gabon Civil Service Reform Project AA (P163632, FY20); eGabon (P132824, FY16)
Indicator 20: Number of participants in new skills development programs (apprenticeship, internships, entrepreneurship training) Baseline (2015):0 Target (2017): 200. Percentage of female:30 percent	Mostly Achieved As of June 2018, the number of participants in new skills development programs was 150, short of the 200 target. The breakdown was as follows: 130 participants in apprenticeship with 35 percent female participation; 0 participants in entrepreneurship trainings; and 20 participants in internships with 40 percent female participation. After the end of the CPS period, the number of	

CPS FY12-FY18	Results Validated by IEG	Interventions Supporting Objectives
	participants increased substantially: per the February 2022 ISR from Skills Development and Employability Project (FY16-22), there were 7,027 participants as follows: 2,218 participants in apprenticeship with 39 percent female participation; 4,172 participants in entrepreneurship trainings with 58 percent female participation; and 637 participants in internships with 52 percent female participation.	
Indicator 21: Number of participants in training sessions organized by incubators (digital economy) Baseline (December 2015):0 Target (December 2017): 300	Not Achieved The number of participants in training sessions organized by incubators was 0 in December 2017. As the per February 2022 ISR from the E-Gabon Project (P132824) (FY16-22), the number of participants had reached 953 by April 2021, surpassing the project target of 750. Source: P132824 - Sequence No : 04 Page #8	
CPS Pillar Three: Human Development and Environmental Sustainability		
CPS Outcome 6: Improved access and quality of services		
Indicator 22: Number of people provided with access to electricity by household connections in target areas, including women Baseline (2015): 0 Target (June 2018): 7,500	Not Achieved June 2018: 0 May 2022: 1,200 Source: P144135 - Sequence No:07 and Sequence No:13	Access to Basic Services in Rural Areas and Capacity Building Project (P144135, FY16); Support to Targeting Reform and Social Protection Policy Dialogue AA (P169767, FY19); Rural Electrification and Water Services Sustainability Mechanism AA (P152126, FY18) Infrastructure and Local Development Project II (P151077, FY16) Central African Backbone - APL4 - Gabon (P122776, FY12); eGabon (P132824, FY16); Gabon Economic Updates ESW (P151536, FY16); Gabon Economic Update II
Indicator 23: Number of new community electricity connections including communities, schools, and health clinics, water pumping systems electrified Baseline (2015): 0 Target (June 2018): 30	Not Achieved The CLR reports that the number of new community electricity connections was 0 (June 2018). No data is available beyond FY18.	ESW(P157510, FY16); Gabon Public expenditure review AA (P159858, FY18); Gabon - Policy Notes ESW (P127623, FY15).
Indicator 24: Percentage of households in villages covered by project operations and maintenance operator having functional electricity and water services Baseline (2015): 0 percent Target (June 2018): 90 percent	Not Achieved The percentage was 0 by December 2018. When the government was unable to secure funding to subsidize O&M operators as intended in the project's original design, the Access to Basic Services in Rural Areas and Capacity Building Project (FY16-22) was restructured in June 2019 to appoint the Gabonese Energy and Water Utility (SEEG) as the O&M operator of the	

CPS FY12-FY18	Results Validated by IEG	Interventions Supporting Objectives
	assets to be constructed under the project. Because of this change, the indicator was no longer relevant and dropped at project restructuring. Source: P144135 - Sequence No: 07 page 3	
Indicator 25: Number of people provided (under the project) with access to “improved water sources” in target areas, including women Baseline (2015): 0 Target (June 2018): 7,500	Not Achieved 2018: 0 May 2022: 0 Source: P144135 - Sequence No: 07 page 3	
Indicator 26: Number of people in urban areas provided with access to all season roads within a 500-meter range and other urban infrastructure and services Baseline (2015): 0 Target (Feb 2018): 20,000	Not Achieved The number of people in urban areas with access to all season roads within a 500-meter range was 4,000 (December 2018) whereas the number of people with access to other urban infrastructure and services was 0 (December 2018). The overall IEG outcome rating for the Second Local Infrastructure Development Project (FY16-22) was Unsatisfactory.	
Indicator 27: Number of localities with broadband internet Baseline (December 2011): 3 Target (December 2017): 18	Achieved The number of localities with broadband internet was 42 (June 2018). When the Central African Backbone Project (P122776) (FY02-20) closed, 225 localities had gained broadband access, surpassing the project target of 30. The overall IEG outcome rating for this project was Satisfactory.	
Indicator 28: Working level achieved with the National Health Information system among health professionals (in percentage) Baseline (December 2015): 0 Target (December 2017): 30 percent	Not achieved The percentage was 0 as the new system was not yet in place by June 2018. As per the February 2022 ISR from E-Gabon Project (FY16-22), the system was still not in place and the project was making Moderately Unsatisfactory progress towards achievement of its objectives.	
CPS Outcome 7: Improved transparency and sustainability in natural resource management		
Indicator 29: Number of national parks land hectares under protection Baseline: 0 (2010) Target: 900,000 (2013)	Achieved June 2013: 900,000 hectares Source: P070232 - Implementation Status Results Report: Sequence 13 page 3	Gabon-Strengthening Capacity for Managing National Parks and Biodiversity (P070232 FY06); Gabon Economic Updates ESW (P151536, FY16); Gabon Economic Update II ESW (P157510, FY16); GABON - SUSTAINABLE MANAGEMENT
Indicator 30: Percentage increase in management effectiveness in three national parks (700,000 hectares) per the GEF tracking tool	Achieved June 2013: Increase in management effectiveness in three national parks	

CPS FY12-FY18	Results Validated by IEG	Interventions Supporting Objectives
Baseline: Loango: 57 percent; Mayumba: 58 percent; Moukalaba-Doudou: 50 percent Target (2013) Loango: 65 percent; Mayumba: 65 percent; Moukalaba-Doudou: 65 percent	(700,000 hectares), as per the GEF Protected Area Management Tracking Tool (PAMETT) Loango: 75% Mayumba: 65% Moukalaba-Doudou: 71.9% Source: P070232 - Implementation Status Results Report: Sequence 13 page 3	OF CRITICAL WETLANDS ECOSYSTEMS (P143914, FY14)
Indicator 31: Number of ecosystem services valuations undertaken (selected sites) Baseline: 0 (2013) Target: 3 (June 2018)	Not Achieved June 2018: 0 April 2020: 3 Source: P143914 - Sequence No: 10 page 2	
Indicator 32: Development stage reached in management plans prepared for forested wetlands (selected sites) Baseline: 0 (2013) Target: 2 (June 2018)	Not Achieved 2018: 0 April 2020: 2 Source: P143914 - Sequence No: 10 page 2	
Indicator 33: Proportion of elephants killed illegally in four targeted national parks (Moukalaba Doudou, Loango, Mayumba, Waka) Baseline: 30 percent (2015) Target: 25 percent (June 2018)	Not Achieved June 2018: 30% July 2020: 21% April 2021: 25% Source: ISRs P157249	Wildlife and human-elephant conflicts management in the South of Gabon (P157249, FY17)
CPS Outcome 8: Improved knowledge, tools, and policies for social service delivery		
Indicator 34: Begin roll out of National Health Information System (2017)	Not Achieved The National Health Information systems was not rolled out by December 2018. As the per the February 2022 ISR from the E-Gabon Project (FY16-22), procurement process for the national Health Information System was still ongoing.	eGabon (P132824, FY16); Gabon RAS 2 -Statistics Dev. in Gabon (P149230, FY17).
Indicator 35: Design of RBF pilot completed by December 2017	Not Verified The CLR reports that the RBF pilot was completed but IEG could not find evidence to substantiate this claim in the ISRs of the E-Gabon Project (FY16-22).	

Annex 2: Comments on Lending Portfolio

IEG's review found the following lending projects that were not presented in the CLR:

Project ID	Project Name	Approval FY	Closing FY	Approved IBRD Amount	Practice
P099833	ECONOMIC & MONETARY COMMUNITY OF CENTRAL AFRICA FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS	2008	2016	42.63	Finance, Competitiveness and Innovation
P126663	IMPROVED INVESTMENT CLIMATE WITHIN THE ORGANIZATION FOR THE HARMONIZATION OF BUSINESS LAWS IN AFRICA (OHADA)	2012	2022	30.0	Finance, Competitiveness and Innovation
P161368	STRENGTHENING THE CAPACITY OF REGIONAL FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS IN THE CEMAC REGION	2018	2023	35.0	Finance, Competitiveness and Innovation

Source: Gabon CPF, WB Business Intelligence Table 2a.1, 2a.4 and 2a.7 as of 05/11/2022

Annex 3: Comments on ASA Portfolio

IEG's review found no differences in ASA portfolio data vs. what is presented in the CLR.

Annex 4: Comments on Trust Funded Portfolio

IEG's review found no differences in Trust Fund activities vs. what is presented in the CLR.

Annex 5: IEG Project Ratings

IEG Project Ratings for Gabon, FY 12-18

Exit FY	Proj ID	Project name	Total Evaluated (\$M) *	IEG Outcome	IEG Risk to DO
2012	P082812	GA-Loc Infrastructure Dev SIL (FY06)	24.9	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2013	P070232	GA-Strengthening Cap. for Manag. NP&B	9.6	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
		Total	34.6		

Source: WB Business Intelligence Key IEG Ratings as of 5/11/2020

IEG Project Ratings for Gabon and Comparators, FY12-18

Region	Total Evaluated (\$M)	Total Evaluated (No)	Outcome % Sat (\$)	Outcome % Sat (No)	RDO % Moderate or Lower Sat (\$)	RDO % Moderate or Lower Sat (No)
Gabon	24.9	2	100.0	50.0	0.0	0.0
All Africa	35,460.1	628	66.0	63.7	31.2	29.3
World	188,855.5	1,998	81.8	71.9	47.1	41.2

Source: WB Business Intelligence March 29, 2022

Annex 6: Portfolio Status for Gabon and Comparators, FY 12-18

Fiscal year	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	Ave FY12-18
Gabon								
# Proj	1	0.00	2	3	8	10	10	5
# Proj At Risk	0	0.00	0	1	3	5	4	2
% Proj At Risk	0	0	0	3.0	2.7			1
Net Comm Amt	10.0	0.0	25.7	25.9	422.9	481.9	681.6	235
Comm At Risk	0.0	0.0	0.0	18.0	159.0	334.0	225.1	105
% Commit at Risk	0	0	0	1.44	2.66			1
Africa								
# Proj	627	566	620	643	659	711	726	650
# Proj At Risk	127	128	138	136	144	173	159	144
% Proj At Risk	4.94	4.42	4.49	4.73	4.58			5
Net Comm Amt	40,416.8	42,649.1	49,142.6	54,586.3	59,033.9	63,922.0	73,466.6	54,745
Comm At Risk	6,504.6	14,310.8	16,548.2	16,000.3	18,949.8	20,995.4	20,486.8	16,257
% Commit at Risk	6.214	2.980	2.970	3.412	3.115			4
World								
# Proj	2,029	1,964	2,048	2,022	1,975	2,071	2,059	2,024
# Proj At Risk	387	414	412	444	422	449	431	423
% Proj At Risk	5.24	4.74	4.97	4.55	4.68			5
Net Comm Amt	173,706.1	176,202.6	192,610.1	201,045.2	220,331.5	224,420.1	241,895.6	204,316
Comm At Risk	24,465.0	40,805.6	40,933.5	45,987.7	44,244.9	52,549.1	49,306.5	42,613
% Commit at Risk	7.10	4.32	4.71	4.37	4.98			5

Source: WB BI as of 5/11/2020

Note: Only IBRD and IDA Agreement Type are included

Annex 7: Comments on IFC Investments in Gabon

IEG's review found no differences in IFC investment data vs. what is presented in the CLR.

Annex 8: Comments on IFC Advisory Services in Gabon

There were no IFC AS during the FY11-18 review period.

Annex 9: Comments on MIGA Guarantees

IEG's review found no differences in MIGA guarantees vs. what is presented in the CLR.

Annex 10: Economic and Social Indicators

Series Name								Gabon	Africa	World
	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	Average 2012-2018		
Growth and Inflation										
GDP growth (annual %)	5.25	5.64	4.31	3.88	2.09	0.5	0.8	3.21	3.62	3.04
GDP per capita growth (annual %)	1.34	1.72	0.62	0.47	-0.97	-2.3	-1.8	-0.1	0.86	1.84
GNI per capita, PPP (current international \$)	14,890	15,460	16,630	16,340	16,450	14,060	14,100	15418.6	3906.9	15328.8
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$) (Millions)	15,886	16,952	17,562	15,520	14,206	13,441	14,479	15435.0	0.73	78.82
Inflation, consumer prices (annual %)	2.65	0.51	4.69	-0.31	2.08	2.7	4.7	2.4	2.3	2.3
Composition of GDP (%)										
Agriculture, value added (% of GDP)	3.35	3.33	3.62	4.31	4.97	5.27	5.44	4.33	20.60	4.10
Industry, value added (% of GDP)	58.82	56.61	52.72	48.18	45.04	45.47	47.13	50.57	25.50	27.16
Services, etc., value added (% of GDP)	29.57	31.86	35.35	39.03	41.74	42.65	41.12	37.33	49.68	63.57
Gross fixed capital formation (% of GDP)	27.74	29.95	35.70	29.23	26.98	21.30	19.26	27.16	18.71	24.84
Gross domestic savings (% of GDP)	56.52	53.26	50.66	47.35	44.92	46.80	50.82	50.05	20.42	26.67
External Accounts										
Exports of goods and services (% of GDP)	60.95	57.36	44.52	46.03	44.04	50.23	54.30	51.06	22.69	29.15
Imports of goods and services (% of GDP)	31.39	33.28	29.00	27.92	26.10	24.84	22.74	27.89	22.08	28.35
Current account balance (% of GDP)	11.52	8.31	6.12	0.98	6.73		
External debt stocks (% of GNI)	20.44	29.00	26.36	38.38	40.89	46.5	43.2	34.97		
Total debt service (% of GNI)	2.64	7.22	2.47	3.21	2.78	4.5	4.6	3.91	1.25	
Total reserves in months of imports	3.65	4.72	4.32	4.25	4.23	4.99	12.69
Fiscal Accounts ¹										
General government revenue (% of GDP)
General government total expenditure (% of GDP)
General government net lending/borrowing (% of GDP)	6.20	-3.07	5.98	-1.12	-4.71			0.7		..
General government gross debt (% of GDP)
Health										
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	62.92	63.65	64.32	64.91	65.42	65.84	66.19	64.75	56.50	71.93
Immunization, DPT (% of children ages 12-23 months)	82.00	79.00	70.00	80.00	75.00	75	70	75.86		85.00
People using at least basic drinking water services (% of population)	84.56	84.79	85.00	85.47	85.63	84.55	84.87	84.98	66.47	88.16

People using at least basic sanitation services (% of population)	45.25	46.19	47.15	47.32	47.37	49.20	49.49	47.42	31.76	72.72
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	39.60	38.30	37.40	36.30	34.80	33.7	32.5	36.09	67.95	31.51
Education										
School enrollment, preprimary (% gross)	56.25
School enrollment, primary (% gross)	103.19
School enrollment, secondary (% gross)	75.07
Population										
Population, total (Millions)	1.75	1.82	1.88	1.95	2.01	2.06	2.12	1.94	402.10	7347.07
Population growth (annual %)	3.79	3.78	3.61	3.34	3.04	2.80	2.60	3.28	2.74	1.18
Urban population (% of total)	86.63	87.16	87.65	88.12	88.56	88.976	89.37	88.07	44.77	53.92
Poverty										
Poverty headcount ratio at \$1.90 a day (2011 PPP) (% of pop)	3.40	..	3.40	..	10.30
Poverty headcount ratio at national poverty lines (% of pop)	33.40	..	33.40
Rural poverty headcount ratio at national poverty lines (% of rural pop)
Urban poverty headcount ratio at national poverty lines (% of urban pop)
GINI index (World Bank estimate)			38.00	..	38.00