

<b>1. CAS Data</b>	
<b>Country: Benin</b>	
<b>CAS Year: FY09</b>	<b>CAS Period: FY09 – FY12</b>
<b>CASCR Review Period: FY09 – FY12</b>	<b>Date of this review: 3/27/2013</b>

<b>2. Executive Summary</b>
<p>i. This Review examines the implementation of the Benin FY09-FY12 Country Assistance Strategy (CAS) and assesses the CAS Completion Report (CASCR). Although relevant IFC activities were discussed in both documents, the CAS was not a joint IDA-IFC strategy, and this review covers only IDA.</p> <p>ii. The broad objective of the Bank's assistance to Benin was to selectively support implementation of the Growth Strategy for Poverty Reduction (SCRP) of the Government. The CAS was organized under three pillars: (i) strengthening competitiveness and accelerating private sector-led growth through supporting macroeconomic stability and public financial management, improving the investment climate and revitalizing the private sector, enhancing the contribution of agriculture to growth, promoting telecommunications and energy services, and increasing regional integration and reducing trade costs; (ii) improving access to basic services by improving environment and urban sanitation, improving access to safe drinking water, improving quality education, health and nutrition services, as well as treatment for HIV/AIDS and malaria; and (iii) promoting better governance and strengthening institutional capacities via support to improve public administration, transparency and anti-corruption, to strengthen budget accounting, implementation and control, and to support the decentralization process.</p> <p>iii. IEG rates the overall outcome of IDA assistance as <i>moderately satisfactory</i>, concurring with the CASCR. There was progress in strengthening public financial management and fiscal discipline; the provision of communication, energy, urban sanitation, safe drinking water and health services were all improved; a procurement code was adopted; and the decentralization efforts through community development were successful. However, in many of these areas, the progress was slow and partial. Moreover, there were limited results from the efforts to improve the investment climate, to promote agricultural growth and economic diversification, and to ensure quality education. In several areas, signs of improvement only began to appear towards the end of the CAS period. The indicators of governance show little or no improvement.</p> <p>iv. The CASCR contains several useful lessons: broad-based political support for successful CAS implementation; an understanding of the political economy and dynamics of consensus-building and internal decision-making in formulating institutional reforms; the mix of policy-based and investment operations in country programming; concentration of IDA assistance; the need for technical support in policy reforms; donor coordination; longer CAS period and flexibility; and adequate indicators. Among these, two seem especially relevant. First, reform progress in Benin has been very slow and partial. Given the many challenges facing the country and IDA's limited resources, a more focused assistance in fewer areas will be more likely to have stronger impact. Second, lack of good information is a common issue and Benin is no exception. A result-based CAS needs concrete, measurable and monitorable indicators. It is worth spending more effort on data issues.</p>

<b>CASCR Reviewed by:</b>	<b>Peer Reviewed by:</b>	<b>CASCR Review Coordinator</b>
<b>Bernard Kwindja Consultant, IEGCC</b>	<b>Rene Vandendries Consultant, IEGCC</b>	<b>Xiaolun Sun Senior Evaluation Officer, IEGCC</b>

### 3. Assessment of WBG Strategy

#### Overview of CAS Relevance:

##### Country Context:

1. Following the political change towards democracy in 1989, Benin enjoyed two decades of good economic performance, with real GDP growth averaging 5% in the 1990s and 4.5% in 2000-09. During the CAS period, however, growth slowed to 3.2% per annum, barely in pace with the expansion of the population. Despite modest progress in per capita income growth, poverty remains widespread. The economy is undiversified and relies on agriculture, especially cotton, and on re-export and transit trade, mainly with Nigeria but also landlocked Burkina Faso and Niger. Given its high dependence on imports, often of basic goods, Benin runs a structural trade deficit, although accurate data is scarce as a large portion of Benin's imports are diverted to Nigeria where much of its petroleum products are smuggled in at the same time, making the country also vulnerable to policy changes in Nigeria. Economic reforms have focused on fiscal consolidation, which has kept fiscal deficits at manageable levels and contributed to low public debt. On the other hand, structural reforms have been slow due to a difficult political environment, although the results of the 2011 presidential and legislative elections improved the prospects for further reforms. In June 2010, the IMF approved a 3 year Extended Credit Facility Arrangement, whose reviews have been successful thus far.

2. The Government's long-term vision was presented in *Alafia Benin 2025*, which articulated the goal of making Benin an emerging economy by 2025. The Strategic Development Orientations (SDO) defined the development policy framework for 2006-2011 to put Benin on a path to becoming an emerging economy. The SDO had two key objectives: stimulating growth through improved competitiveness, and reducing poverty while improving the quality of life of the population. The Government's second poverty reduction strategy paper – the Growth Strategy for Poverty Reduction (SCRIP) - provided the specifics for implementing the SDO over 2007-2009. It was built around five pillars: accelerating growth, developing infrastructure, developing human capital, improving governance, and promoting balanced and sustainable development.

##### Objectives of the WBG Strategy:

3. The broad objective of the Bank's assistance to Benin was to selectively support implementation of the SCRIP. The CAS was organized under three pillars: (i) strengthening competitiveness and accelerating private sector-led growth through supporting macroeconomic stability and public financial management, improving the investment climate and revitalizing the private sector, enhancing the contribution of agriculture to growth, promoting telecommunications and energy services, and increasing regional integration and reducing trade costs; (ii) improving access to basic services by improving environment and urban sanitation, improving access to safe drinking water, improving quality education, health and nutrition services, as well as treatment for HIV/AIDS and malaria; and (iii) promoting better governance and strengthening institutional capacities via support to improve public administration, transparency and anti-corruption, to strengthen budget accounting, implementation and control, and to support the decentralization process.

##### Relevance of the WBG Strategy:

4. **Congruence with country context and country program.** In view of the many challenges facing Benin, it is undeniable that the CAS objectives were relevant - they recognized and responded to the country's key development challenges, including its changing needs brought about by external shocks. By firmly anchoring the Bank's assistance in supporting implementation of the SCRIP, the CAS program was also well aligned with the Government's development program. However, while the SCRIP covered only 2007-2009, the CAS was for the period FY09-FY12. There was no indication in

the CAS of what the country's program was expected to be after the SCRPs; and there was no CAS Progress Report (CASPR) to provide an update. Consequently, it is unclear whether the CAS remained consistent with the country's own development agenda throughout the CAS period.

5. **Relevance of Design.** Although the strategy aimed to be selective and the focus areas were chosen based on a client survey and consultations on IDA's comparative advantages, the design of the CAS was far too ambitious - in one way or another, it attempted to cover almost every area in need of reform. The program was diffuse, making it nearly impossible to achieve truly significant progress in any particular area. Nevertheless, the combination of budget support for institutional reforms and investment lending to expand the basic facilities was appropriate, and there was also adequate attention to donor coordination.

6. **Strength of the results framework.** The results matrix was consistent with the main text of the strategy and clearly articulated the results chain linking Bank activities to CAS objectives to higher-level country goals. The CAS objectives were set at the appropriate level and reflected the combined contribution of the CAS program, rather than individual CAS projects. However, as recognized in the CASCR, it was deficient in some ways. For example, there was no clear link between proposed CAS activities and the ultimate goal of increased cotton production. A variety of issues also existed with the outcome indicators: some were poorly defined (e.g., rationalization of business development infrastructure), some lacked baseline data (e.g., producers receiving extension services), some were not monitored (e.g., access gap to basic social services) or not available (e.g., productivity increase at national level), while others were absent (e.g., education quality).

7. **Risk identification and mitigation.** The CAS identified three main risks: weak commitment or lack of consensus for reforms, weak absorptive capacity, and external shocks and risks to the macroeconomic framework. All of these risks materialized to some extent. The CASCR notes that the depth of the political divisions and the difficulties in building reform coalitions were not fully recognized in the CAS as the proposed mitigation measures, such as new dialogue with parliamentarians, were inadequate to maintain reform momentum. The CASCR also indicates that despite considerable donors' technical support, weak absorptive capacity continued to pose a constraint to the full implementation of the PFM action plan. Finally, although no specific measures were proposed in the CAS to mitigate the risks of food crisis and flood, when they hit, IDA responded quickly and successfully.

#### **Overview of CAS Implementation:**

##### Lending:

8. With a few deviations and delays, some in response to emergencies, IDA's program was largely delivered as planned. In all, 17 operations for a total of \$398 million were approved over the CAS period, of which six were non-planned and four were regional operations. This exceeded the planned total of \$312 million in 14 operations. Close to one third of IDA's financial assistance (\$112 million) was for policy-based lending (PRSCs 5-7). There were also nine projects totaling \$328 million on-going at the start of the CAS period, and 17 operations financed by trust funds (TFs) for a total of \$141 million active during the CAS period. In response to the food crisis in FY09-10, two TF-financed food security projects and one nutrition project for \$20 million were delivered; following major floods in FY11, IDA increased its allocation for an Urban Environment project from \$30 to \$50 million and approved supplemental financing for PRSC6 of \$22 million.

9. IEG reviewed the completion reports of two projects that were closed during the CAS period and rated their development outcomes as *satisfactory* for one and *moderately unsatisfactory* for the other. This is too small of a sample to be compared with the average satisfactory rates of African region (63.5%) and the Bank (71.8%).

Analytic and Advisory Activities and Services

10. The CAS outlined the planned AAA program – 11 studies - with little articulation of the rationale behind the choice of the topics. With some delays and modifications, the planned program was largely delivered. In addition, four non-planned reports and three non-planned technical assistance tasks were completed. The CASCR does not explain the reasons for their addition, and does not provide any information on the dissemination and the use of the AAA work, even though the CAS promised that “the Bank will ensure that sufficient resources are devoted to the dissemination of programmed ESW and that key stakeholders are engaged during all phases.”

Partnerships and Development Partner Coordination

11. The CAS identified a large number of multilateral (e.g., the European Commission, the African Development Bank and the UN) and bilateral (e.g., France, Denmark, Germany, the Netherlands and the US) development partners that were active in Benin. It reported on the Bank’s progress in implementing Paris Declaration, but noted that greater efforts would be needed in areas such as coordination of technical cooperation and joint missions. The relevant discussion in the CASCR suggests that donor activities were well coordinated in several Bank lending (e.g., health) and non-lending (e.g., public finance, health, education) projects, although the program-based approach was not used to the extent planned due to insufficient institutional framework and fiduciary controls in some ministries.

Safeguards and Fiduciary Issues

12. The CASCR does not report on these issues. During the CAS period, there were no safeguards complaints brought before the Inspection Panel; but INT recorded more than 6 allegations of fraud and corruption, and found sufficient basis to open 2 cases. One of these was substantiated, leading to a sanction process.

***Overview of Achievement by Objective:***

**Pillar I: Strengthening competitiveness and accelerating private sector-led growth**

13. Under this pillar, IDA sought to support Benin in a variety of areas, including the stabilization of the macroeconomic framework, strengthening competitiveness and revitalization of the private sector, diversification of the economy, development of ICT, energy and regional integration.

14. **Support a stable macroeconomic framework and improve public financial management.** Amid negative shocks and economic slowing-down, the Government maintained the fiscal discipline that had been gradually established since the mid 2000’s under the guidance of, among others, a PRSC process. A three year Extended Credit Facility Arrangement was agreed with the IMF in June 2010 and program performance has remained broadly satisfactory. To keep expenditures in line with revenues, the Government imposed strict expenditure controls with the result that two main CAS indicators in this area – an increase in the overall budget execution rate and an increase in investment spending execution – were not met. Also, targets on social spending in the IMF program were not met (although the CASCR reports that execution of priority social expenditure exceeded 100% in 2012), while the number of Public Expenditure and Financial Accountability “B” score indicators increased from 4 to 7 (against the CAS target of 8). Structural reform also took place, albeit at a slow pace: progress was made in customs administration, while public financial management was strengthened with the submission of a draft Organic Budget Law to the Supreme Court and the preparation of the 2010 budget execution accounts, among others. IDA support in the area came primarily from the three PRSCs and supplemental financing (FY09, FY10, FY11 and FY12) for a total of US\$112 million, as well as a Public Expenditure Review (PER, FY11).

15. **Improve the investment climate and revitalize the private sector.** Some private sector reform took place over the CAS period, including the concession award of the container terminal at the port of Cotonou, the sale of the cotton ginning, cement and wood companies to private investors, changes in the tax system to make it more business friendly, and the elimination of the company registration fee. However, the CASCR notes that cotton sector reforms were reversed in early 2012 when the State, following nearly two decades of progressive government disengagement, took control over cotton production, ginning and marketing activities. Also the major legislative reforms to improve the Doing Business (DB) rankings (several CAS indicators) were not submitted to parliament and, despite some improvement in select DB indicators, Benin's overall DB ranking deteriorated from 151 out of 178 countries in 2008 to 175 out of 185 countries in 2013. Private investment stagnated over the period, while Benin's Global Competitiveness Index ranking dropped from the 104<sup>th</sup> to the 119<sup>th</sup> place between 2011/12 and 2012/13. IDA support in this area came through the PRSC series, which had very disappointing results in the private sector development component, and a Competitiveness and Integrated Growth Opportunity project (CIGOP, FY08) that encountered significant implementation delay with limited results. Meanwhile, IFC provided advisory services to implement Doing Business reforms and OHADA's Uniform Acts.

16. **Enhance the contribution of agriculture to growth.** Data is not available on the contribution of agriculture to GDP growth, although the CASCR reports a higher than expected increase in non-cotton agricultural exports, a CAS indicator. Due to the combined effects of long-standing obstacles to agricultural growth (e.g., constraints in input procurement, low productivity) and adverse weather conditions, cotton production declined instead of increasing by 30% as expected in the CAS (although the CASCR reports exceptional harvest in 2012). Measures for some outcome indicators, such as the percentage of producers receiving extension services or productivity increases for food crops, were not available. The planned new system for input distribution (for cotton and food crops) was not developed, but a study led to an action plan for delivery of inputs for food crop farmers, which would be piloted under the Agricultural Productivity and Diversification project (FY11). The one bright spot was the impact of the TF-financed Emergency Food Security Support (FY09) and the Emergency Support to Enhance Food Security projects (FY10), which succeeded in providing access to extension services for 70% of the beneficiaries (rice and maize producers) and in increasing the provision of fertilizers in project areas. In addition, IDA supported the sector through the PRSCs and a study on options for agricultural diversification (FY08).

17. **Promote growth-inducing infrastructure: telecommunications and energy.** There was progress in this area, although some CAS targets were not met. Teledensity increased significantly from 13 to 81% during 2007-2010 largely as a result of expansion in mobile phones. On the other hand, privatization of the Benin Telecom SA did not proceed as planned because the Government deemed the offer to be too low, which meant that the fiscal contribution target was not met. There was also progress in the energy sector. The CASCR reports that access to electricity increased from 26 to 30% of the population in 2011 (no baseline year provided); reliability of supply has improved; the capacity is up; northern Benin is now connected to the national grid; and the financial health of the distribution utility has improved but remains fragile. A regulatory agency was created in 2009. However, energy efficiency has not improved and losses remain substantial. IDA support in this area included an Electricity Services Delivery project with supplemental financing (FY05 and FY08), the CIGOP mentioned above, which included a PPP component to support the Government in the privatization of Benin Telecom SA, and an eBenin project (FY10) to improve ICT services and to enable the development of e-applications.

18. **Increase competitiveness through greater regional integration and reduced trade costs.** As the CASCR reports, achievements in this area included the creation of a one-stop shop for port transactions, streamlining of import/export procedures, and subcontracting of some port operations to the private sector. IDA supported Benin's regional integration agenda through the PRSCs, the Abidjan – Lagos Trade and Transport Facilitation (FY10), which focused on the corridor's road infrastructure

but had a trade facilitation component, including customs and port reforms. On the other hand, IDA had a limited role in the third outcome above as the Millennium Challenge Corporation led the support for reforms in the port sector, with IFC facilitating in identifying the private operator. Nevertheless, cargo dwell time in the port (a CAS indicator) has not reduced even though the DB's Trading Across Border indicator shows reduced time to import and export. In addition, the CASCR reports increasing participation of Benin in the regional energy pool, which should bring down costs and increase reliability. IDA's main instrument was the West Africa Power Pool APL - 2<sup>nd</sup> Phase Coastal Transmission Backbone project (FY06), which was rated as *moderately unsatisfactory* by the project team for slow pace of implementation of the Benin components.

19. IEG rates the outcome of IDA assistance under Pillar I as *moderately unsatisfactory*. There has been slow progress overall toward achieving the five objectives. While reforms in public financial management were encouraging, maintaining good PFM remains a major challenge; infrastructure services (telecommunication and energy) improved, but important structural reforms did not proceed as planned and energy efficiency remained low; some progress was achieved in simplifying the procedures for port transactions and in improving port operations, although this has not led to speedier port clearance as cargo dwell time increased. Moreover, there was limited progress towards agricultural growth and in the overall investment climate despite some signs of improvement towards the end of the CAS period.

#### **Pillar 2: Improving access to basic services**

20. Under this pillar, IDA sought to improve environmental and urban sanitation, improve rural and urban water supply, improve development-oriented education and improve accessibility and quality of health and nutrition services.

21. **Improve environmental quality and urban sanitation.** The main objective was to improve sanitary conditions in some neighborhoods of major cities and at the same time provide the residents with better access to social and economic services. The CAS outcome targets of increasing the number of people with access to paved roads and of improving management procedures and budget allocations for priority expenditures in pilot cities were met, but other indicators, including a reduced gap in access to basic social services between the poorest and average communities and increased use of waste water management systems, were not monitored or no data were available. IDA supported this objective through the PRSCs, additional financing for a Second Decentralized City Management project (FY08) that financed road and drainage work in the major cities, and an Emergency Urban Environment project (FY11) to improve drainage, municipal waste management and flood preparedness

22. **Improving access to safe and sustainable drinking water and sanitation.** The goal of the Bank was to continue to support, in collaboration with other partners, the sector-wide approach for the development of the rural water supply system, leading to improved service delivery and access, as well as transferring of responsibility from the central administration to local governments, private operators and consumer associations. The latest data available (2010) suggest that the CAS targets of increased access to safe water for the rural population and increased percentage of water systems functioning are on track to be achieved. IDA support was provided primarily through the PRSCs.

23. **Improve quality education services to better respond to development needs.** Little progress appears to have been made in this area. Although access to primary education increased with enrolment rising from 98.5 to 110.6% for boys and from 92 to 106% for girls during 2007-2010, completion rates (CAS target) have not improved. The CASCR notes the continued high repetition and drop-out rates and little or no improvement in education quality (not tracked) as key reasons for the disappointing results. IDA support was mainly through a trust-funded Education for all-Fast Track Initiative (FY08). The CAS also aimed to improve higher education and vocational training through

better information, financing and university management, as well as new regulatory framework for private education. However, few results have been achieved and the key support instrument – a study on Higher Education and Skills Development proposed for FY10 - was postponed to FY13.

24. **Increase access to health and nutrition services and treatment for HIV/AIDS and Malaria.** The CAS envisioned a health SWAp to achieve the expected improvements in the sector. However, IDA interventions during the CAS period focused on specific health issues, including coverage of maternal and children's health services, and HIV/AIDS and malaria control. Good progress was made in all CAS outcome areas: birth medical assistance increased from 78% in 2006 to 84% in 2011 (CAS target: 90% in 2012), the percentage of children with diarrhea receiving oral rehydration therapy rose from 23% in 2006 to 50% in 2011 (above CAS target of 36% in 2012), preventive measures for malaria control expanded, although the share of children with fever being treated promptly reached less than half of CAS target, and the percentage of people with advanced HIV infection receiving treatment far exceeded the CAS targets. However, the CASCR notes that limited progress was made in improving the overall performance of the health sector. IDA's support in the area, apart from the PRSCs, included a Malaria Control Booster program (FY06), a Second Multisectoral HIV/AIDS Control project (FY07), a Health System Performance project and additional financing (FY10 and FY12) focusing on maternal and neonatal services and the institutional capacity of the Ministry of Health, and a TF-financed Benin Community Nutrition project (FY11). The Bank's Health Country Status Report (FY09) underpinned the Government's and the donor's programs.

25. IEG rates the outcome of IDA assistance under Pillar II as *moderately satisfactory*. There is evidence of improved access to health services, to urban roads, water and sanitation services, and to safe water in rural areas. There is also indication that municipal budget allocation for social expenditures has increased, although significant management and service delivery gaps remain. In the education sector, however, little progress has been achieved.

### **Pillar 3: Promoting better governance and strengthening institutional capacities**

26. Under this pillar, IDA sought to help Benin improve public administration and fight corruption, to strengthen budget accounting, implementation and control, and to support decentralization through community development.

27. **Improve public administration, transparency and anti-corruption.** The CAS intended to support, along with other partners, the Government's implementation of its Results-Oriented Budget Management (GBAR) and its Public Financial Management (PFM) action plan through the PRSCs. The CASCR reports that these goals were partially achieved: detailed PFM action plan was completed in 2009 with results-based budgeting applied at ministry level; a revised Organic Law of Finance that was consistent with West Africa Economic and Monetary Union directives was approved by the National Assembly; a Public Sector Code of Ethics was adopted in 2009; and a Law on Corruption and other Economic and Financial Crimes was approved by the National Assembly in 2011. However, budgets are not yet consolidated at the national level, and the auditors are not yet authorized to audit ministries and other central government departments. The Worldwide Governance Indicators show little change (from -0.49 to -0.46) between 2008 and 2011 in term of Government Effectiveness, while the Control of Corruption indices show deterioration (from -0.53 to -0.67). In addition to the PRSCs, IDA delivered a Public Expenditures Review (PER, FY11), and TF-financed institutional capacity building projects.

28. **Strengthen budget accounting, implementation and control.** The main result in this area was that a procurement code was adopted in 2009, with the regulatory framework almost in place (six of the seven implementing decrees approved). IDA support included an Accounting and Auditing Report on the Observance of Standards and Codes (ROSC, FY09), the PER (FY11) and training of auditors under an IDF grant.

29. **Support decentralization through community development.** This is an area where tangible progress was made. By 2009, more than the targeted number of communities had received grassroots management training (1518 communities out of a total of 3,500 nation-wide), in 2010 the mechanism for transferring funds to communities was expanded, and by 2011 some 20% of public capital spending on basic services was carried out by communities. Projects included construction or rehabilitation of classrooms, health centers and community water points. IDA support included a successful Community Driven Development project (FY05) that received additional financing in FY11.

30. IEG rates the outcome of IDA assistance under Pillar III as *moderately satisfactory*. Good progress was made in the area of community development. Important reforms in public administration and budget accounting took place, but their impact remains to be seen. International governance indicators show little improvement in public administration between 2008 and 2011, while corruption was perceived to have worsened.

Objectives	CASCR Rating	IEG Rating
<b>Pillar I:</b> Strengthening Competitiveness and Accelerating Private Sector-led Growth	Not Rated	<i>Moderately Unsatisfactory</i>
<b>Pillar II:</b> Improving Access to Basic Services	Not Rated	<i>Moderately Satisfactory</i>
<b>Pillar III:</b> Promoting better governance and strengthening institutional capacities	Not Rated	<i>Moderately Satisfactory</i>

#### 4. Overall IEG Assessment

	CASCR Rating	IEG Rating
<b>Overall Outcome:</b>	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory
<b>IDA Performance:</b>	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory

#### Overall outcome:

31. IEG rates the overall outcome of IDA assistance as *moderately satisfactory*, concurring with the CASCR. There was progress in strengthening public financial management and fiscal discipline; the provision of communication, energy, urban sanitation, safe drinking water and health services were improved; a procurement code was adopted; and the community development efforts were successful. However, in many of these areas, the progress was slow and partial. Moreover, there was a lack of tangible results from the efforts to improve the investment climate, to promote agricultural growth, and to ensure quality education, while indicators of governance show little or no improvement.

#### IDA Performance:

32. IEG rates IDA performance as *moderately satisfactory*, below the CASCR rating of *satisfactory*. The CAS responded to the key development challenges facing Benin. It was well aligned with the Government's poverty reduction strategy. With some deviations and delays, the program was largely delivered as planned. IDA was also flexible when a food crisis and floods arose and adjusted its program to respond to these emergencies. However, the design of the program was too ambitious in attempting to address an excessively large number of challenges, which made it very difficult to achieve significant results in any particular area. A monitoring framework was not set up due to staffing issues. Despite the intentions, a CASPR was not prepared to take stock of the lessons learned during the first phase of CAS implementation and to introduce program adjustments in the context of changing external conditions.

## **5. Assessment of CAS Completion Report**

33. The CASCR is easy to read, albeit repetitive at times. It follows the results matrix closely and provides a candid assessment of the achievements and failures of the IDA program. While it correctly points to the shortcomings of the program design, it is nevertheless too positive in rating the Bank's performance. It could have elaborated on whether Benin needs assistance in developing its data base to make program monitoring more effective. Some more specificity on the relative roles among the donors would have been useful. It is pointed out, for example, that the European Union was conducting a PER for 2011, the year in which IDA's PER was delivered, without reporting on how the workload may have been divided between the two institutions.

## **6. Findings and Lessons**

34. The CASCR contains several useful lessons: broad-based political support for successful CAS implementation; an understanding of the political economy and dynamics of consensus-building and internal decision-making in formulating institutional reforms; the mix of policy-based and investment operations in country programming; concentration of IDA assistance; the need for technical support in policy reforms; donor coordination; longer CAS period and flexibility; and adequate indicators. Among these, two seem especially relevant. First, reform progress in Benin has been very slow and partial. Given the many challenges facing the country and IDA's limited resources, a more focused assistance in fewer areas will be more likely to have stronger impact. Second, lack of good information is a common issue and Benin is no exception. A result-based CAS needs concrete, measurable and monitorable indicators. It is worth spending more effort on data issues.



<b>Annex Table 1:</b>	<b>Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives</b>
<b>Annex Table 2:</b>	<b>Benin Planned and Actual Lending, FY09-FY12</b>
<b>Annex Table 3:</b>	<b>Grants and Trust Fund Active in FY09-FY12 (in US\$ million)</b>
<b>Annex Table 4:</b>	<b>Planned and Actual Analytical and Advisory Work, FY09-FY12</b>
<b>Annex Table 5:</b>	<b>IEG Projects Ratings for Benin, Exit FY09-FY12</b>
<b>Annex Table 6:</b>	<b>IEG Project Ratings for Benin and Competitors, Exit FY09-FY12</b>
<b>Annex Table 7:</b>	<b>Portfolio Status for Benin and Competitors, FY09-FY12</b>
<b>Annex Table 8:</b>	<b>IDA Nets Disbursements and Charges Summary Report for Benin (in \$US million)</b>
<b>Annex Table 9:</b>	<b>Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid, 2008-10 (in \$US million)</b>
<b>Annex Table 10:</b>	<b>Economic and Social Indicators for Benin and Competitors, 2008-11</b>
<b>Annex Table 11:</b>	<b>Benin: Millennium Development Goals</b>



**Annex Table 1: Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives.**

CAS 09-12: Pillar 1 Strengthening Competitiveness and Accelerating Private Sector-led Growth		Actual Results (as of current month year)	Comments
<b>Major Outcome Measures</b>	<b>1. Support stable macroeconomic framework and improve public financial management</b>		
	Increase the overall budget execution rate from 76.5% in 2006 to 90.0% in 2012.	Overall budget execution rate decreased from 69.3% in 2008 to 60.7% in 2010.	Source: CASCR
	Increase investment spending execution from 56.3% in 2006 to 70.0% in 2012.	Execution rate for investment was 27.3% in 2010 and 24.2% in 2011.	Source: CASCR
	Increase the number of PEFA indicators with a "B" score from 4 in 2007 to 8 in 2012.	Number of PEFA indicators, in the 2012 PEFA, rated as "B" was 7.	Source: CASCR
	Maintain spending by payment orders below 6 percent of total spending in 2012.	Spending by payment orders was 4.9% of total spending in 2009, 4.8% in 2010 and 4.4% in 2011.	Source: CASCR
	<b>2. Improve the investment climate and revitalize the private sector</b>		
	Reduction in company registration fee by 10% by 2011.	Fees at the one stop shop have been restructured and reduced from XOF 249,200 (DB12) to XOF139,300 (DB13). The main reduction relate to the Registration with RCCM (from XOF 77,900 to XOF 12,000). Also the payment of the cost (6,000 XOF) related to the registration of the articles of incorporation with the Tax authorities is suspended.	Source: CASCR
	Reduce the time to create a company from 31 days in 2008 to 20 days by 2011.	26 days in Doing Business 2013.	Source: Doing Business.
	Reduce the cost of formalization from 195% of GNI per capita in 2006 to 135 in 2011.	Company registration cost ((% of income per capita) was reduced from 198.1% (DB 2009) to 126.8% (DB 2013).	Source: Doing Business.
	Develop and Implement a business friendly taxation system	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Individual Taxpayer Identification System extended and implemented: companies receive tax id number at time business is registered.</li> <li>- Tax centers opened in regions to inform and facilitate payments by small companies.</li> <li>- Elimination of customs identification practices for small imports (generic code) which should reduce tax evasion.</li> <li>- Tax and customs systems computerized which enables tracking of payments due.</li> <li>- Exemption of all tax</li> </ul>	Source: CASCR

CAS 09-12: Pillar 1 Strengthening Competitiveness and Accelerating Private Sector-led Growth	Actual Results (as of current month year)	Comments
	payments for new businesses registered during the first year of operation.	
Rationalization and strengthening of the business development infrastructure	No data available yet	Source: CASCR Activities contemplated under CIGOP project (Minimum Integrated Trade Expansion Infrastructure-MITEP) to be implemented.
<b><u>3. Enhance the contribution of agriculture to growth</u></b>		
By 2012, 40% of producers receive extension services	The value of this indicator at the national level is not available.	Source: CASCR In the areas covered by the Emergency Food Security Support Project (FY09) and the Emergency Support to Enhance Food Security Project (FY10), about 70% of the beneficiaries (rice and maize producers) have access to extension services.
A new system for input distribution (cotton & food crops) developed and put in place.	<p>A Study commissioned under the Emergency Food Security Support Project (completed July 2010) led to a concrete action plan under the Emergency Support to Enhance Food Security Project to support the design of innovative and market based mechanisms for the sustainable delivery of agricultural inputs (fertilizers and others) to <u>food crop</u> farmers. The report is available (August 2011) and the pilot phase of the implementation of the new mechanism under the Agricultural Productivity and Diversification Project has reached an advanced stage.</p> <p>Assets of <u>cotton</u> producing company, SONAPRA, transferred to new public-private cotton ginning company SODECO. SODECO continues to arrange for input distribution for cotton. By October 2009, 51% of the new company's assets were privately owned. But in April 2012, after allegations of mismanagement by AIC, the Government annulled the Accord Cadre defining respective Government and AIC roles in cotton sector and took over management of all activities for the ongoing 2012/2013 cropping season and probably also for the forthcoming 2013/2014 season.</p>	Source: CASCR
Increase of cotton production by 30% during CAS period to about 360,000 tons.	Cotton production declined (in '000 tons) from 243 in 2008 to 174 in 2011. However big increase in 2012 (350).	Source: CASCR

CAS 09-12: Pillar 1 Strengthening Competitiveness and Accelerating Private Sector-led Growth		Actual Results (as of current month year)	Comments
Increase in agricultural exports revenues (other than cotton) by 3% per year during the CAS period.	Agricultural exports revenues (other than cotton) increased from around 75 (CFA F million) in 2008 to around 140 in 2010.	Source: INSAE Benin <a href="http://www.insae-bj.org/2012/doc/Publications/EXPORTNATIONALE.pdf">http://www.insae-bj.org/2012/doc/Publications/EXPORTNATIONALE.pdf</a>	
Irrigate and exploit 5,000 ha additional by 2012 (10,000 ha in 2008).	Under the Emergency Support to Enhance Food Security Project, 5 000 additional ha were developed under small scale irrigation schemes	Source: CASCR	
Productivity increases by 15% for food crops by 2012.	The value of this indicator at the national level is not available.	Source: CASCR As a result of increased access to improved seeds and fertilizers under the Emergency Food Security Support Project, productivity of food crops (namely maize and rice) in project areas has increased. For example the average yield for rice increased from 2.97 tons /ha to 4.22 tons/ha. For maize, the average yield increased from 1.2 tons per ha to about 2 tons per /ha.	
<b>4. Promote growth inducing infrastructure – Telecommunications</b>			
Increase direct fiscal contribution to the Government by 75% from 2008 to 2012.	The CASCR recognize that the outcome indicator was not achieved.	Source: CASCR Revenue increase expected to be derived from privatization of the Benin Telecommunications Company. International tender brought lower offer than in neighboring countries, largely a reflection of a changed global environment. Process completed in April 2011 but Government did not accept offer.	
Increase global teledensity (fixed & mobile subscribers) from 13% in 05/07 to 45% in 12/ 12.	9% in 2005 to 82% in 2010.	Source: MDG The CASCR reports 80.6% as of September 2012.	
Increase Broadband access (Above 256 Kbytes) from 0.01% in 2007 to 0.2% in 2012.	Broadband access stood at 0.104% in 2010 and reached 0.3% in September 2012.	Source: CASCR	
Reduce overall telecom basket cost by 30% from 2007 to 2012.	Information not available	Source: CASCR	
<b>5. Promote growth inducing infrastructure - Energy services</b>			
Improve reliability of electricity provision in northern Benin to reduce voltage punctuation in the major cities to within +/- 7% by 2012.	Completion of North Togo– North Benin transmission infrastructure has improved reliability of electricity in Northern Benin. Voltage drop on transmission lines is within +/- 7% range.	Source: CASCR	
Increase effective new connections from 18,000/year to 25,000/ year in 2012.	SBEE (power distribution utility) annual new connections were 21,000 in 2011.	Source: CASCR	
Improve efficiency of electricity sector: losses reduced below 16% from 18% by 2012.	Losses of 21.76% in 2011.	Source: CASCR IDA project supporting efficiency improvements effective on 4/10.	
<b>6. Increase competitiveness through greater regional integration and reduced trade costs</b>			
IFC finds a private operator to manage two new quays to be built 54%by Millennium Challenge Account (MCA).	Private operator (Bollere-SMTC) contracted in 2009 to operate two new wharfs and improved port management system. IFC work was	Source: CASCR	

	CAS 09-12: Pillar 1 Strengthening Competitiveness and Accelerating Private Sector-led Growth	Actual Results (as of current month year)	Comments
		important in bringing operator.	
	Reduce in cargo dwell time in the port of Cotonou from 15 to 12 days by 2012.	Most recent data on cargo dwell time is that dwell time in the port is 19 days.	Source: CASCR
	Reduce transport and facilitation bottlenecks.	<p>A one stop window to handle port transactions has been put in place (Guichet Unique pour le Commerce Extérieur).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Import verification program was implemented including the installation of scanners and a GPS truck tracking system, though this was reversed in early 2012</li> <li>• An electronic truck management system was implemented (With MCC assistance)</li> <li>• A single entry point for trucks was established</li> <li>• Port security and surveillance system was implemented</li> <li>• Plan to improve port management procedures including installation of computerized systems (underway).</li> </ul>	Source: CASCR
	Improve access to regional energy through WAPP (West Africa Power Pool).	Benin is increasingly participating in the regional power pool, which should bring down costs and improve reliability. Annual imports by <i>Compagnie Electrique du Benin</i> from WAPP have increased by 54% from 2006 to 2010. The West African Gas Pipeline was completed in 2011 and compressed gas is available at CEB's premises.	Source: CASCR

CAS 09-12: Pillar 2 Improving Access to Basic Services		Actual Results (as of current month year)	Comments
<b>Major Outcome Measures</b>	<b>1. Improve environmental and urban sanitation improvements</b>		
	Increase people with access to paved roads in Cotonou, Porto-Novo, Parakou Abomey-Calavi, Lokossa and Kandi from 483 000 in 2006 to 755 000 in 2011.	787,000 as of April 2011.	Source: CASCR
	Reduce the access-gap to basic social services between poorest and average communities by 50% in 2011.	CASCR recognizes that the indicator was not monitored.	Source: CASCR
	Improve management procedures & quality expenditures of pilot cities (Cotonou, Porto-Novo, Parakou Abomey-Calavi, Lokossa and Kandi) during the CAS period.	Budget allocation for <u>priority expenditures</u> increased in key cities (% of total): Cotonou, Porto Novo, Parakou, A-Calavi, Lakoosa and Lakoosa.	Source: CASCR
	Increase the use of waste-water management system in urban/ peri-urban areas from 33% in 2004 to 50% in 2012.	34% as of 2008 (latest data available)	Source: CASCR
	<b>2. Improve access to safe and sustainable drinking water and sanitation service</b>		
	Increase access to safe water for the rural population from 44% in 2006 to 60% in 2012.	Improved water source in rural areas (% of rural population with access) Increased from 64% in 2006 to 68 in 2010.	Source: WDI  WDI data differs from the data presented in the CASCR
	At least 50% of piped water systems managed by domestic private sector operations in 2012	No data provided in the CASCR	Source: CASCR
	92% of the water systems functioning by 2012 compared to 87% in 2007.	90.4% as of 2010	Source: CASCR
	<b>3. Improve quality education services to better respond to development needs</b>		
	Increase the completion rate of primary education from 66% in 2006/07 to 80% in 2012 (for girls: from 54% in 2005/2006 to 72% in 2012).	Estimate for 2011 are: - Completion rate of primary education: 66% -Completion rate of primary education for girls: 59%	Source: CASCR  WDI has only data until 2009.
	Make operational the instruments to pilot the higher education and vocational training systems: Information and orientation system for students; budget programming / contract-based financing; university management system.	-Delay in implementation. -Information /orientation system for students exists but is not fully operational because it has not been implemented at the regional/local level. -A document has been prepared to inform students of fields available in higher education a few weeks before the beginning of each academic year. -For other actions, significant improvement has not been achieved.	Source: CASCR  The recommendations of the higher education ESW to be completed in 2013 should enable preparation of an action plan to address budget, programming financing and management issues.
	New regulatory framework for private sector investment in education in place.	In higher education, National council (Conseil Consultatif National de l'Enseignement Supérieur) established to control the quality of private education. Decree passed to define degree requirements, but is not yet operational because regulations are not ready.	Source: CASCR
	<b>4. Increase access to health and nutrition services and treatment for HIV/MDS and Malaria</b>		
	Increased availability of health services for pregnant women:	Birth medical assistance increased from 78% in DHS	Source: DHS 2006 and DHS 2011

CAS 09-12: Pillar 2 Improving Access to Basic Services		Actual Results (as of current month year)	Comments
	% of facilities with basic obstetrical and neonatal services from 23% in 2006 to 90% in 2012.	2006 to 84% in DHS 2011.	
	Improved nutrition services: % of children with diarrhea get oral re-hydration therapy from 23% in 2006 to 36% in 2012	From 23% in DHS 2006 to 50% in DHS 2011	Source: DHS 2006 and DHS 2011
	Number of people with advanced HIV infection receiving ARV combination therapy increases from 0 in 2007 to 3,300 adults and 300 children in 2012 in the whole country.	For adults: From 9,765 in 2007 to 16,450 in 2010. For children: From 238 in 2007 to 1,635 in 2010.	Source: UNGASS Report for 2010
	By 2012, at least 60% of children < 5 years with fever are treated adequately within 24 hours from onset of symptoms.	26.5% in 2011.	Source: DHS 2011
	By 2012, at least 60% of children under 5 years and pregnant women sleep under an ITN/LLIN	Children: 71% in 2011. Pregnant women: 59.7% in 2010.	Malaria Indicator Survey 2010 and DHS 2011
	By 2012, at least 60% of pregnant women receive a prophylactic treatment during the pregnancy	78.1% in 2011.	Source: DHS 2011

CAS 09-12: Pillar 3 Promoting better governance and strengthening institutional capacities		Actual Results (as of current month year)	Comments
<u>Major Outcome Measures</u>	<b>1. Improve public administration, transparency and anti-corruption</b>		
	Full implementation of results-based budgeting (GBAR) by 2011.	Program-based budgets are prepared at the ministerial/sectoral level but these budgets are not yet consolidated at the national level.	Source: CASCR
	Implementation of the Government's PFM action plan prepared by the authorities to address the weaknesses and key challenges identified by the 2007 PEFA diagnostic by 2012.	Detailed PMF Action Plan completed in 2009. Key reforms being introduced are: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Results-based budgeting applied at the ministry level.</li> <li>- Organic Law of Finance revised and consistent with WAEMU directive approved by the National Assembly.</li> <li>- Broad lines of budget presented mid-year and approved in 2010. (RA10)</li> <li>- Satellite connection between central agencies and decentralized units being established to enable reporting of fiscal (SIGFIP) and accounting (ASTER) data.</li> <li>- MTEF approach used by sector ministries.</li> </ul>	Source: CASCR
	Developing and implementing country action plans to reduce corruption and to improve institutional capacity in accounting and auditing.	-Public Sector Code of Ethics adopted in 2009 (RA 09). Training in Cotonou and Porto Novo; planned for the rest of the country. -Law on Corruption and other Economic and Financial Crimes approved by National Assembly in 2011 (RA 10) -Institutional capacity in accounting. All members of the Order of Accountants were trained in public financial management practices and government audits. Auditors are auditing public enterprises but Government has not authorized audit of ministries and other central government departments.	Source: CASCR
	<b>2. Strengthen budget accounting, implementation and control</b>		
Financial reports, measures to accelerate budget execution, and internal control mechanisms under implementation operational by 2010	Same that the second outcome indicator in the first objective: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Results-based budgeting applied at the ministry level.</li> <li>- Organic Law of Finance revised and consistent with WAEMU directive approved by the National Assembly.</li> <li>- Broad lines of budget</li> </ul>	Source: CASCR	

CAS 09-12: Pillar 3 Promoting better governance and strengthening institutional capacities		Actual Results (as of current month year)	Comments
		<p>presented mid-year and approved in 2010. (RA10)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Satellite connection between central agencies and decentralized units being established to enable reporting of fiscal (SIGFIP) and accounting (ASTER) data.</li> <li>- MTEF approach used by sector ministries.</li> </ul>	
	Procurement code adopted and operational by 2010.	Procurement code adopted in 2009. Six of the seven implementing decrees have been approved. Approved decrees include those determining responsibilities of the agencies charged with procurement; establishing contracting thresholds and the code of ethics in public procurement. Remaining decree, setting maximum times for government approvals, expected to be passed before the end of 2011 is still delayed to 2013.	Source: CASCR
<b>3. Support decentralization through community development</b>			
	By 2012, the CDD approach is part of a decentralization process supported by a SWAP.	By 2011 some 20% of public capital expenditures on basic services implemented by communities.	Source: CASCR The new Decentralized Community Driven Services Project will use the SWAP approach.
	By 2012, the flow of funds to local governments & communes uses the country financial system.	Process of transfer begun. In 2010 FCFA 4.5 billion were transferred to communes FADeC for health primary education, water and energy (RD 10). Proposed project will transition to use FADeC once modern accounting and auditing systems can be put in place for FADeC.	Source: CASCR
	By 2012, 80% of communities have received grassroots management training (GMT).	By 2009 all 1518 communities had received GMT training (of a total of some 3500 communities nation-wide.	Source: CASCR

**Annex Table 2: Benin Planned and Actual Lending, FY09-FY12**

Project ID	Project name	Proposed FY	Approval FY	Proposed Amount	Approved Amount	Outcome rating
<i>Programmed projects</i>						
P107498	Fifth Poverty Reduction Support Grant-PRSC 5	2009	2009	30	30	LIR: MS
P110075	Increased Access to Modern Energy	2009	2009	45	70	LIR: S
P108583	Regional: 3A W/C Africa Air Transport Phase II-B	2009	2009	3	3*	LIR: MS
P117287	BJ- Poverty Reduction Support Grant - PRSC 6	2010	2010	20	30	LIR: MS
P115886	Agricultural Productivity and Diversification	2010	2011	20	31	LIR: MS
P113370	eBenin Project	2010	2010	10	15	LIR: MS
P113202	Health System Performance	2010	2010	15	22.8	LIR: S
P096407	Regional: Abidjan-Lagos Trade and Transport Facilitation Project (ALTTFP)	2010	2010	9	14*	LIR: MS
P122803	BJ- Poverty Reduction Support Grant - PRSG 7	2011	2012	20	30	LIR: S
P113145	Benin Emergency Urban Env. Project	2011	2011	30	50	LIR: S
P121104	Benin Community Development Project Additional Financing	2011	2011	30	12	LIR: S
	BJ-PRSC 8-Eighth Poverty Reduction Support Credit	2012	Pipeline	20		
	Energy Services	2012	Dropped	40		
	Regional Operations	2012	Dropped	20		
<b>Total Programmed projects CAS FY09-FY12</b>				<b>312.0</b>	<b>307.8</b>	
<i>Non-programmed projects</i>						
P117764	Decentralized Community Driven Services Project		2012		46	LIR: S
P122419	Support to Protected Areas Management		2011		5	LIR: S
P122065	Regional: West Africa Agricultural Productivity Program APL (WAAPP-1C)		2011		5*	LIR: S
P129024	Benin - Health System Performance Project - Additional Financing		2012		10	LIR: S
P125114	BJ-PRSC 6 Supplemental Credit		2011		22	LIR: MS
P112456	Regional: Regional Trade Facilitation II		2011		2.5*	LIR: S
<b>Total non-programmed projects</b>					<b>90.5</b>	
<b>Total projects FY09-FY12</b>					<b>398.3</b>	
Project ID	Project name	Approval FY	Closing FY		Approved Amount	
<i>Ongoing projects</i>						
P104881	Competitiveness and Integrated Growth Opportunity Project (CIGOP)	2008	Active		25	LIR: MS
P096056	Second Multisectoral HIV/AIDS Control Project	2007	2012		35	LIR: S
P082725	Second Decentralized City Management	2006	2012		35	LIR: S
P094917	WAPP APL 1 (2nd Phase - Coastal Transmission Backbone)	2006	Active		60	LIR: MU
P081484	BN-National Community Driven Development Project	2005	2012		50	LIR: S
P079633	Electricity Services Delivery Project	2005	Active		45	LIR: S
P096482	Malaria Control Booster Program	2006	2011		31	IEG: S
P111019	Additional Financing for the Benin Energy Services Delivery Project	2008	Active		7	LIR: S
P109209	Second Decentralized City Management Project - Additional Financing	2008	2012		40	LIR: S
<b>Total ongoing projects FY09-FY12</b>					<b>328.0</b>	

Source: Benin CAS and WB Business Warehouse Table 2a.1, 2a.4 and 2a.7 as of 08/06/2012

\*LIR: Latest internal rating. MU: Moderately Unsatisfactory. MS: Moderately Satisfactory. S: Satisfactory. HS: Highly Satisfactory.

\* Amount of the regional project accorded to Benin

**Annex Table 3: Grants and Trust Funds Active in FY09-FY12 (in US\$ million)**

Project ID	Project name	TF ID	Approval FY	Closing FY	Approved Amount
P096193	Support for the Implementation of Law Against Female Genital Mutilation/Cutting	TF 55876	2006	2009	0.45
P095882	Building a Results-Based M&E System for a Decentralized MAEP Administration	TF 55461	2006	2009	0.45
P069896	Forests and Adjacent Lands Management Project	TF 57165	2007	Active	6.00
P110576	Education For All-Fast Track Initiative Program	TF 91947	2008	2012	76.10
P104473	Strengthening Capacity of the Accountancy Profession	TF 90665	2008	2011	0.37
P113374	Benin: Emergency Food Security Support Project	TF 93250	2009	2011	9.00
P071579	Community-Based Coastal and Marine Biodiversity Management Project	TF 91739	2009	Active	4.30
P113202	Health System Performance	TF 96654	2010	Active	11.00
P120052	Emergency Support to Enhance Food Security (ESEFS)	TF 96893	2010	2012	8.41
P110075	Increased Access to Modern Energy	TF 94664	2010	Active	1.82
P115886	Agricultural Productivity and Diversification	TF 99692	2011	Active	15.00
P115963	Support to Protected Areas Management	TF 99643	2011	Active	1.90
P124191	Benin Community Nutrition	TF 97920	2011	Active	2.80
P119962	BEIA-Promotion of Social Biofuels in Benin	TF 96657	2011	Active	0.09
P122775	Implementation of AML/CFT for Benin	TF 98975	2011	Active	0.43
P124077	Institutional Strengthening of the Ministry of Development	TF 99838	2012	Active	0.48
P110075	Increased Access to Modern Energy	TF 99823	2012	Active	2.00
	<b>Total</b>				<b>140.59</b>

Source: Benin CAS, CASPR and WB Business Warehouse Table 2a.1, 2a.4 and 2a.7 as of 08/22/2012

**Annex Table 4: Planned and Actual Analytical and Advisory Work, FY09-FY12**

AAA ID	Economic and Sector Work	Proposed FY	Delivered to Client FY	Output Type
	<i>Planned (CAS FY09-FY12)</i>			
P109145	Benin Health Country Status Report (ESW)	2009	2009	Report
P115822	Benin Agricultural Diversification (ESW)	2009	2011	Report
P113144	Country Environmental Assessment (ESW)	2009	2010	Report
P112771	BENIN Accounting and Auditing ROSC (ESW)	2009	2009	Report
	Higher Education and Employment/Skill Needs	2010	Postponed to FY13	
P118480	BJ-Public Expenditure Review (ESW)	2010	2011	Report
P118054	Poverty Assessment (ESW)	2010	2013	Report
	Investment Climate Assessment	2011	Replaced by Doing Business in Benin 2011 FY10 (Report ID: 58333 )	
	National Governance and Anti-corruption Strategy	2011	Replaced by the IDF Implementation of AML/CFT for Benin (P122775). Not yet completed.	
	Energy Sector Review	2012	Postponed to FY13	
	Decentralization and Local Development	2012	Combined with Public Expenditure Review (FY11)	
	<i>Non-planned</i>			
P094122	Stimulating the rural economy: investment climate for non-farm enterprises in Benin (ESW)		2008	Report
	WB/IMF Debt Sustainability Analysis (Report ID 51780)		2009	Report
	Benin Stepping Up Growth (Report ID 51974)		2010	Report
P122059	DeMPA Assessment - Benin		2011	Report
P127439	Customs Assessment Trade Toolkit		Planned for FY13	Policy Note
P119788	Tertiary Education Capacity and Training Assessment		Planned for FY13	Report
AAA ID	Technical Assistance	Proposed FY	Delivered to Client FY	Output Type
	<i>Planned (CAS FY09-FY12)</i>			
	NA			
	<i>Non-planned</i>			
P111231	PRTSR-Benin-Review of Poverty Reduction and Transport Strategies		2009	Client Document Review
P124825	GFDRR: Benin Flood Recovery - Post-Disaster Needs Assessment		2011	"How-To" Guidance
P117626	Health Systems for Outcomes - Benin		2011	"How-To" Guidance
	Civil Service Reform TA		Undertaken under PRSC-7	

Source: Benin CAS, CASPR and WB Business Warehouse Table 2a.1, 2a.4 and 2a.7 as of 08/22/2012

**Annex Table 5: IEG Project Ratings for Benin, Exit FY09-FY12**

Exit FY	Proj ID	Project name	Total Evaluated (US\$M)	IEG Outcome	IEG Risk to Development Outcome*
2009	P072503	Cotton Sector Reform Project	18.0	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Significant
2011	P096482	Malaria Cntrl Booster Prgm SIL (FY06)	33.1	Satisfactory	Moderate

Source: WB Business Warehouse Table 4a.6 as of as of 08/20/2012.

\* With IEG new methodology for evaluating projects, institutional development impact and sustainability are no longer rated separately.

**Annex Table 6. IEG Project Ratings for Benin and Comparators, Exit FY09-FY12**

Region	Total Evaluated (\$M)	Total Evaluated (No)	Outcome % Sat (\$)	Outcome % Sat (No)	RDO% Moderate or Lower Sat (\$)*	RDO% Moderate or Lower Sat (No)*
Benin	51.1	2	64.8	50.0	64.8	50.0
Africa	7,015.2	138	74.8	63.5	36.0	36.5
World	41,871.8	543	85.4	71.8	68.2	54.7

Source: WB Business Warehouse Table 4a.5 as of as of 07/3/2012.

\* Risk to Development Outcome (RDO). With IEG new methodology for evaluating projects, institutional development impact and sustainability are no longer rated separately.

**Annex Table 7. Portfolio Status for Benin and Comparators, FY09-FY12**

Fiscal year	2009	2010	2011	2012
<b>Benin</b>				
# Proj	11	15	18	14
# Proj At Risk	4	5	4	2
% Proj At Risk				
Net Comm Amt	435.2	511.4	596.2	346.3
Comm At Risk	121.4	147.4	184.4	35.3
% Commit at Risk	27.9	28.8	30.9	10.2
<b>Africa</b>				
# Proj	440	454	470	452
# Proj At Risk	131	137	117	108
% Proj At Risk				
Net Comm Amt	28,177.8	34,188.5	37,466.4	38,962.9
Comm At Risk	6,950.5	9,494.2	7,949.7	6,299.8
% Commit at Risk	24.7	27.8	21.2	16.2
<b>World</b>				
# Proj	1,552	1,590	1,595	1,500
# Proj At Risk	344	366	337	333
% Proj At Risk				
Net Comm Amt	131,076.4	158,287.4	168,248.7	168,407.7
Comm At Risk	19,929.9	28,186.1	22,978.5	23,723.1
% Commit at Risk	15.2	17.8	13.7	14.1

Source: WB Business Warehouse Table 3a.4 as of 08/22/2012.

**Annex Table 8. IDA Net Disbursements and Charges Summary Report for Benin  
(in US\$ million)**

FY	Disb. Amt.	Repay Amt.	Net Amt.	Charges	Fees	Net Transfer
2009	80.1	0.0	80.1	0.0	1.9	78.2
2010	57.4	0.2	57.2	0.0	2.1	78.2
2011	87.3	0.4	87.0	0.0	2.7	78.2
2012	92.3	0.8	91.5	0.0	3.0	78.2
<b>Total (FY09-FY12)</b>	<b>317.1</b>	<b>1.4</b>	<b>315.8</b>	<b>0.0</b>	<b>9.8</b>	<b>78.2</b>

Source: WB Loan Kiosk, Net Disbursement and Charges Report as of 08/20/2012

**Annex Table 9. Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid, 2008- 2010 (in US\$ million)**

Development Partners	2008	2009	2010	2008-2010
<i>Bilaterals</i>				
Australia	..	0.16	0.38	0.54
Austria	0.02	0.01	0.09	0.12
Belgium	21.92	25.58	28.97	76.47
Canada	6.97	7.04	6.37	20.38
Denmark	48.15	51.36	39.11	138.62
Finland	0.17	0.45	0.69	1.31
France	66.41	50.39	48.79	165.59
Germany	46.61	43.12	34.67	124.40
Greece	0.10	..	..	0.10
Ireland	0.06	0.04	0.12	0.22
Italy	1.14	1.79	2.11	5.04
Japan	27.21	25.84	29.13	82.18
Korea	2.44	0.02	0.15	2.61
Luxembourg	0.86	1.16	1.96	3.98
Netherlands	35.33	41.97	31.26	108.56
Norway	..	..	0.05	0.05
Spain	2.01	3.45	1.09	6.55
Sweden	0.47	0.88	1.88	3.23
Switzerland	10.58	13.47	13.25	37.30
United Kingdom	..	0.03	..	0.03
United States	34.56	58.90	98.93	192.39
<i>DAC Countries, Total</i>	305.01	325.66	339.00	969.67
Czech Republic	0.04	..	0.02	0.06
Israel	0.05	0.05	0.04	0.14
Kuwait (KFAED)	3.26	3.20	0.95	7.41
Poland	0.01	..	..	0.01
Turkey	0.97	..	0.03	1.00
United Arab Emirates	0.10	0.18	0.17	0.45
<i>Non-DAC Countries, Total</i>	4.43	3.43	1.21	9.07
<i>Multilaterals</i>				0.00
AfDF	31.55	46.13	46.51	124.19
BADEA	8.03	4.36	3.52	15.91
EU Institutions	127.62	146.64	122.75	397.01
GAVI	4.47	4.16	5.15	13.78
GEF	5.62	5.19	2.90	13.71
Global Fund	13.10	10.58	43.54	67.22
IAEA	0.27	0.30	0.29	0.86
IDA	93.39	90.34	85.31	269.04
IFAD	0.69	1.57	1.65	3.91
IMF (Concessional Trust Funds)	18.85	15.73	16.20	50.78
Isl.Dev Bank	5.51	8.90	6.02	20.43
Nordic Dev.Fund	5.51	1.44	-0.14	6.81
OFID	-0.59	1.56	-0.30	0.67
UNAIDS	0.47	0.49	0.47	1.43
UNDP	5.84	5.85	5.00	16.69
UNFPA	2.69	2.08	2.00	6.77
UNHCR	0.74	0.61	0.37	1.72
UNICEF	5.41	4.92	6.39	16.72
UNTA	0.84	..	..	0.84
WFP	2.03	2.12	1.27	5.42
<i>Multilateral, Total</i>	332.04	352.97	348.90	1033.91
<b>All Development Partners Total</b>	<b>641.48</b>	<b>682.06</b>	<b>689.11</b>	<b>2012.65</b>

Source: OECD DAC Online database, Table 2a. Destination of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid - Disbursements, as of 08/20/2012.

**Annex Table 10. Economic and Social Indicators for Benin and Comparators, 2008- 2011**

Series Name	Benin				Benin	Sub-Saharan Africa	World
	2008	2009	2010	2011	Average 2008-2011		
<b>Growth and Inflation</b>							
GDP growth (annual %)	5.1	3.8	3.0	3.1	4.0	4.1	1.5
GDP per capita growth (annual %)	2.0	0.8	0.1	0.3	1.0	1.5	0.4
GNI per capita, PPP (current international \$)	1,531.4	1,560.6	1,580.3	1,627.8	1,557.4	2,238.8	10,980.8
GNI, Atlas method (millions current US\$)	6,063.3	6,729.4	6,918.4	7,119.6	6,570.4	993,936.3	61,583,625.0
Inflation, consumer prices (annual %)	7.9	2.2	2.3	2.7	4.1	..	..
<b>Composition of GDP (%)</b>							
Agriculture, value added (% of GDP)	..	..	..	..	..	12.6	2.8
Industry, value added (% of GDP)	..	..	..	..	..	30.7	26.2
Services, etc., value added (% of GDP)	..	..	..	..	..	56.7	71.0
Gross fixed capital formation (% of GDP)	20.7	25.3	26.1	27.4	24.9	21.5	20.1
Gross domestic savings (% of GDP)	7.1	10.8	12.3	14.1	11.1	16.1	20.1
<b>External Accounts</b>							
Exports of goods and services (% of GDP)	15.2	14.0	14.3	14.9	14.6	32.3	27.6
Imports of goods and services (% of GDP)	28.8	28.5	28.0	28.2	28.4	35.5	27.9
Current account balance (% of GDP)	-8.0	-9.9	..	..	-8.9	..	..
External debt, total (% of GNI)	13.7	16.2	18.4	..	16.1	..	..
Total debt service (% of GNI)	0.9	0.6	0.6	..	0.7	1.4	..
Total reserves in months of imports	6.2	6.4	..	..	6.3	6.0	13.4
<b>Fiscal Accounts <sup>1/</sup></b>							
Revenue and Grants (% of GDP)	21.2	21.5	..	..	..	..	..
Total Expenditure (and net lending, % of GDP)	21.4	25.3	..	..	..	..	..
Overall Balance (% of GDP)	-1.7	-4.1	..	..	..	..	..
Public Sector Gross Debt (% of GDP)	24.5	26.2	..	..	..	..	..
<b>Social Indicators</b>							
<b>Health</b>							
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	54.8	55.2	55.6	..	55.2	53.7	69.4
Immunization, DPT (% of children ages 12-23 months)	78.0	83.0	83.0	..	81.3	74.5	84.4
Improved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)	12.0	13.0	13.0	..	12.7	30.4	62.0
Improved water source (% of population with access)	73.0	74.0	75.0	..	74.0	60.7	87.9
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	76.2	74.7	73.2	..	74.7	78.3	42.0
<b>Population</b>							
Population, total (in million)	8.4	8.6	8.8	9.1	8.7	843.9	6,855.3
Population growth (annual %)	3.0	2.9	2.8	2.8	2.9	2.5	1.2
Urban population (% of total)	..	..	42.0	..	42.0	36.9	50.3
<b>Education</b>							
School enrollment, preprimary (% gross)	13.3	14.1	18.2	..	15.2	17.3	46.8
School enrollment, primary (% gross)	118.4	123.9	125.9	..	122.7	99.4	106.2
School enrollment, secondary (% gross)	..	..	..	..	..	37.8	69.3

Source: WB World Development Indicators (08/20/2012) for all indicators excluding those noted.

<sup>1/</sup> IMF Article IV

**Annex Table 11: Millennium Development Goals**

	1990	1995	2000	2005	2010
<b>Goal 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</b>					
Employment to population ratio, 15+, total (%)	72	72	72	72	72
Employment to population ratio, ages 15-24, total (%)	66	64	60	57	57
GDP per person employed (constant 1990 PPP \$)	..	..	..	..	..
Income share held by lowest 20%	..	..	..	7	..
Malnutrition prevalence, weight for age (% of children under 5)	..	27	22	20	..
Poverty gap at \$1.25 a day (PPP) (%)	..	..	..	16	..
Poverty headcount ratio at \$1.25 a day (PPP) (% of population)	..	..	..	47	..
Vulnerable employment, total (% of total employment)	..	..	..	90	..
<b>Goal 2: Achieve universal primary education</b>					
Literacy rate, youth female (% of females ages 15-24)	27	..	33	..	43
Literacy rate, youth male (% of males ages 15-24)	55	..	59	..	65
Persistence to last grade of primary, total (% of cohort)	..	..	76	64	..
Primary completion rate, total (% of relevant age group)	19	31	40	54	63
Total enrollment, primary (% net)	41	60	..	88	94
<b>Goal 3: Promote gender equality and empower women</b>					
Proportion of seats held by women in national parliaments (%)	3	7	6	7	11
Ratio of female to male primary enrollment (%)	52	57	66	76	87
Ratio of female to male secondary enrollment (%)	..	..	44	54	..
Ratio of female to male tertiary enrollment (%)	15	22	24	..	38
Share of women employed in the nonagricultural sector (% of total nonagricultural employment)	20 7	..	24 3	..	..
<b>Goal 4: Reduce child mortality</b>					
Immunization, measles (% of children ages 12-23 months)	79	65	70	61	69
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	10 7	98	89	81	73
Mortality rate, under-5 (per 1,000 live births)	17 8	160	143	129	115
<b>Goal 5: Improve maternal health</b>					
Adolescent fertility rate (births per 1,000 women ages 15-19)	..	123	120	114	103
Births attended by skilled health staff (% of total)	..	60	66	75	..
Contraceptive prevalence (% of women ages 15-49)	..	16	19	17	..
Maternal mortality ratio (modeled estimate, per 100,000 live births)	77 0	660	530	430	350
Pregnant women receiving prenatal care (%)	..	80	87	84	..
Unmet need for contraception (% of married women ages 15-49)	..	26	27	30	..
<b>Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria, and other diseases</b>					
Children with fever receiving antimalarial drugs (% of children under age 5 with fever)	..	..	60	54	..
Condom use, population ages 15-24, female (% of females ages 15-24)	..	9	9	10	..
Condom use, population ages 15-24, male (% of males ages 15-24)	..	..	32	39	..
Incidence of tuberculosis (per 100,000 people)	77	80	85	89	94
Prevalence of HIV, female (% ages 15-24)	..	..	..	..	0.7
Prevalence of HIV, male (% ages 15-24)	..	..	..	..	0.3
Prevalence of HIV, total (% of population ages 15-49)	0.2	1.1	1.4	1.3	1.2
Tuberculosis case detection rate (% , all forms)	57	53	49	48	45
<b>Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability</b>					
CO2 emissions (kg per PPP \$ of GDP)	..	..	..	..	..
CO2 emissions (metric tons per capita)	..	..	..	..	..
Forest area (% of land area)	52. 1	..	45. 8	43.5	41.2
Improved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)	5	7	9	11	13
Improved water source (% of population with access)	57	62	66	70	75
Marine protected areas (% of territorial waters)	..	..	..	..	..
Net ODA received per capita (current US\$)	56	50	37	45	78
<b>Goal 8: Develop a global partnership for development</b>					
Debt service (PPG and IMF only, % of exports, excluding workers' remittances)	9	7	14	7	4
Internet users (per 100 people)	0.0	0.0	0.2	1.3	3.1
Mobile cellular subscriptions (per 100 people)	0	0	1	8	80
Telephone lines (per 100 people)	0	0	1	1	2
Fertility rate, total (births per woman)	7	6	6	6	5
<b>Other</b>					
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$)	36 0	340	370	570	780

GNI, Atlas method (current US\$) (billions)	1.7	1.9	2.4	4.3	6.9
Gross capital formation (% of GDP)	14.2	19.6	18.9	19.6	26.1
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	49	51	53	54	56
Literacy rate, adult total (% of people ages 15 and above)	27	..	35	..	42
Population, total (millions)	4.7	5.7	6.5	7.6	8.8
Trade (% of GDP)	40.6	53.2	43.3	39.6	42.3

Source: World Development Indicators database as of 08/20/2012