



1. CPS Data	
Country: Ethiopia	
CPS Year: FY13	CPS Period: FY13 – FY16
CLR Period: FY13-FY16	Date of this review: June 7, 2017

2. Ratings

	CLR Rating	IEG Rating
Development Outcome:	<i>Moderately Satisfactory</i>	<i>Moderately Satisfactory</i>
WBG Performance:	<i>Good</i>	<i>Good</i>

3. Executive Summary

i. Ethiopia is a low income country—one of the eleven poorest in the world—with a GNI per capita of US\$590 (current US\$) in 2015. Its economy grew by 9.6 percent annually in real terms during the review period, faster than the Sub-Saharan Africa average (4.0 percent) and the rest of the world (2.6 percent), albeit the growth rate slowed to 6-7 percent in 2015-16 owing to a severe drought. The poverty headcount indicates that 33 percent of the population lived below the international poverty line of US\$1.90 PPP per day in 2011. Ethiopia is among the most equal countries in the world. Inequality—with a Gini coefficient of 0.33—is low by international and Sub-Saharan Africa standards, and comparable with some OECD countries. Ethiopia made good progress towards achieving the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) particularly in gender parity in primary education, child mortality, HIV/AIDS, and malaria. The country's HDI ranking remained broadly at the same level between 2012 (173 out of 187) and 2015 (174 out of 187). Political stability prevailed during the review period, notwithstanding the initial uncertainty created by a change in leadership with the death of the long-serving Prime Minister.

ii. The government set out its objectives in the Growth and Transformation Plan (GTP I and II) whose main goal is for Ethiopia to become a lower middle-income country by 2025 through average annual real growth of 10-11 percent. While the public sector will continue playing an important role, the GTP, especially GTP II, places emphasis on private sector development and Foreign Direct Investments (FDI), particularly in building an export-oriented manufacturing sector. The new government that took power just before the CPS was discussed by the Board in August 2012 affirmed its support for continued implementation of policies in the Growth and Transformation Plan, and for the WBG program in Ethiopia. In support of the government's objectives, the WBG's program pursued the strategic objectives of fostering competitiveness and employment, enhancing resilience and reducing vulnerabilities, and promoting good governance and state building. In line with the GTP, gender and climate were cross-cutting issues under the program, and IFC and MIGA contributed to competitiveness and employment. The selection of focus areas also was in line with broad areas identified subsequently as important by Ethiopia's Systematic Country Diagnostic (SCD).

iii. Concerns remain about macroeconomic policies. The Ethiopian birr is overvalued by 20 to 40 percent according to IMF estimates, which poses a significant constraint to export

CLR Reviewed by:	Peer Reviewed by:	CLR Review Manager/Coordinator
Juan José Fernández-Ansola	Florence Charlier, Senior Evaluation Officer, IEGEC	Pablo Fajnzylber Manager, IEGEC
Surajit Goswami Consultants, IEGHE	Takatoshi Kamezawa, Sr. Evaluation Officer, IEGEC	Lourdes Paganan CLRR Coordinator, IEGEC



competitiveness, especially in manufacturing. In addition, interest rates are not allowed to be determined flexibly, and the foreign exchange market functioning needs to be improved through a market-based price setting mechanism for the exchange rate and an increase in exchange rate flexibility. In the banking area, the government would need to phase out the requirement that private banks invest in National Bank of Ethiopia bonds 27 percent of their credit to finance the Development Bank. The IMF has also recommended recently that to curb an external current account deficit of about 11 percent of GDP will require a tighter fiscal policy in the period ahead.

iv. In FY16, Ethiopia was the largest IDA recipient, ahead of Vietnam (2nd) and Bangladesh (3rd). IDA approved US\$6.7 billion in new commitments during the CPS period, mostly for investment project financing (IPFs) and three PforRs. Trust-funded activities that accounted for about \$1.2 billion provided complementary financing, primarily in energy, and also for public finance and internal audit. This exceeded the proposed financing under the CPS/CPSPR of US\$4.2 billion, although such plans covered only the proposed amounts through FY15.

v. IEG rates the overall development outcome as *Moderately Satisfactory*. The program made good progress across focus areas and objectives. Under Focus Area I there was tangible progress on promoting a stable macroeconomic environment, increasing and improving infrastructure delivery, and fostering increased competitiveness and productivity. Progress fell short of program targets on regional energy integration in East Africa. In Focus Area II significant progress was made on both improving the delivery of social services and enhancing comprehensive social protection and risk management. In Focus Area III there was significant progress on enhancing public financial management, procurement, and accountability. Progress fell short, however, on improving public service performance management and responsiveness.

vi. On balance, IEG rates WBG performance as *Good*. The WBG strategy addressed key challenges facing the country, emphasizing the need for structural transformation to increase competitiveness and productivity in line with GTP I and II. The combination of WBG interventions supported reforms across the three focus areas. The overall program was selective, and built on adequate country diagnostics and ASA support, and was based on consultations with the authorities. On the whole, the work across the WBG was well articulated to support the main elements of the program. The design of the results framework was adequate—with some pitfalls in indicator appropriateness, measurement, and realism. The causal chain between WBG interventions and objectives was fairly clear. Ethiopia's portfolio at exit performed better than its comparators (Africa and Bank-wide) as measured by IEG's outcome ratings (MS or better). There was good internal cooperation between the Bank and IFC, which was manifested particularly in fostering competitiveness and employment. MIGA provided guarantees for agribusiness and manufacturing, complementing well the work of the Bank and IFC. The Bank also worked effectively with development partners, such as the IMF on macroeconomic issues, and with others by leveraging IDA financing on a number of operations, including the Productive Safety Net Program. However, there were nine investigations by INT during the review period, of which five were substantiated cases of corruption and collusion in four projects. In addition, the Inspection Panel (IP) was involved on a claim of severe harm and human rights abuses under the Promotion of Basic Services Project. The IP report concluded that the involuntary taking of land and use of force were not a consequence of the project, but that the Bank had failed to assess fully and mitigate the risks arising from the government's Commune Development Plan. According to the panel, as of February 2017, more than half of the Management Action Plan had been completed.

vii. IEG agrees with the CLR lessons about the need for forward-looking innovative work to engage with the government on long term issues, and risk management and ongoing evaluation to bring the best in operations. It also concurs with the view that the Bank is at its best when it does not operate in isolation.

viii. IEG adds the following lessons:

- Bank-IFC cooperation can be effective even in a context of significant challenges to private sector development. In the case of Ethiopia, the number of jobs created by IFC in



targeted manufacturing and services firms could serve as a pilot to be scaled up under further Bank-IFC collaboration.

- Complementing a lesson in the CLR, the appropriate use of analytical work can lead to a more fruitful dialogue on reforms with the client. In the case of Ethiopia, this was evidenced in the areas of competitiveness, labor markets, and urbanization.
- Risk financing mechanisms in Bank interventions can enable a client to scale up safety nets to address transitory shocks in a low income country. In the case of Ethiopia, the Productive Safety Net Program reflected such flexibility in the face of the severe drought that affected the country.

4. Strategic Focus

Relevance of the WBG Strategy:

1. **Congruence with Country Context and Country Program.** Ethiopia is a low income country—one of the eleven poorest in the world—with a GNI per capita of US\$590 in current US\$ in 2015. Its economy grew by an average of 9.6 percent annually in real terms during the review period, with a slowdown to 6-7 percent in 2015-16 owing to a severe drought. Ethiopia's exports remain concentrated on basic commodities such as coffee, oil seeds, and edible vegetables, which leave the country vulnerable to global commodity price developments. The poverty headcount indicates that 33 percent of the population lived below the international poverty line of US\$1.90 PPP per day in 2011. Ethiopia is among the most equal countries in the world. Inequality—with a Gini index of 0.33 in 2011—is low by international and Sub-Saharan Africa standards, and at par with some OECD countries. The country made good progress towards achieving the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) particularly in gender parity in primary education, child mortality, HIV/AIDS, and malaria. The country's HDI ranking remained broadly at the same level between 2012 (173 out of 187) and 2015 (174 out of 187).
2. For the past twenty- five years, Ethiopia adopted a development model underpinned by a strong state role on public investment—particularly on infrastructure—and agricultural development, with the private sector taking a secondary role. This “big push” in public investment and emphasis on agricultural development accounted for the high rates of growth of around 10 percent annually, and contributed to a significant reduction in poverty. According to the March 2016 Systematic Country Diagnostic, the direct effect of transfers to rural households coupled with public works investments in water management and land productivity have contributed to higher agricultural yields, agricultural income growth, and a relatively equal income distribution in the country. For Ethiopia to realize its ambition to become a lower middle income country by 2025, the private sector will need to play a more meaningful role, in order for the country to reduce its infrastructure gap and develop its manufacturing sector. Moreover, increasing the resilience and opportunities of the lowest income quintiles remain among the country's major challenges.
3. The government set out its objectives in the Growth and Transformation Plans (GTP I and II) whose main goal is for Ethiopia to become a lower middle-income country by 2025 through average annual real growth rates of 10-11 percent. While the public sector will continue playing an important role, the GTP, especially GTP II, places more emphasis on private sector development and FDI, particularly in building an export-oriented manufacturing sector. Growth targets are underpinned by the envisaged rapid structural transformation and investments in energy generation, transportation, and infrastructure to boost productivity and competitiveness. In support of the government's objectives, the WBG's program pursued two strategic objectives of fostering competitiveness and employment, enhancing resilience and reducing vulnerabilities, and a foundational objective of fostering good governance and state building.
4. **Relevance of Design.** The Bank program was aligned with the government priorities under the GTP, and the selection of focus areas was in line with broad areas identified subsequently as important by Ethiopia's Systematic Country Diagnostic. The combination of lending and analytical work was expected to underpin the achievement of program objectives by supporting reforms across



the focus areas and the foundational objective, and helping the dialogue with the government. The program linked well its objectives to Bank interventions, which also meant that in a number of instances indicators were based on specific project results. The design of the program exploited synergies between the Bank and IFC, for example on the Competitiveness and Job Creation Project (FY14) which provides firms with industrial land and buildings, with a one-stop-shop that reduces transaction costs for firms. IFC contributed also with several advisory services projects—for example to upgrade online trade registration and licensing—and investments to boost exports. According to the progress report there were efforts to move towards selective and transformational interventions, which meant larger interventions in size, and interventions that cut across a number of the program objectives. Some indicators were changed in the PLR to better reflect Bank support. The second half of the program emphasized the need for structural transformation to increase competitiveness and productivity in line with GTP II. Moreover, on basic services, the emphasis started to shift from access—on which Ethiopia made significant progress—to quality, and the Bank strengthened its engagement on urbanization in line with the government’s increasing emphasis on this agenda.

Selectivity

5. The overall program was selective in terms of the focus areas. It built on adequate country diagnostics and ASA support, and was based on consultations with the authorities. The non-lending program was focused on supporting the dialogue with the authorities—for example on macroeconomic issues—and informed some of the lending interventions. IFC investments and advisory activities were focused on enhancing private sector competitiveness, its capacity to create jobs through new investments, especially in SMEs, and devising an investment incentive framework. On the whole, the work across the WBG was well articulated to support the main program elements. The program aimed at having a long-term impact by fostering changes in competitiveness and productivity—in line with GTP II—that would help Ethiopia become a lower middle income country over time, and become sustainable without aid. While the volume of lending increased in Ethiopia during the program, the number of projects in the portfolio was reduced by scaling up generally well performing operations through Additional Financing, suggesting greater selectivity and a more compressed dialogue platform with the authorities.

Alignment

6. The Bank has been a supporter of the government in its pursuit of pro-poor, equity-enhancing policies. The government’s overall policies have been geared towards poverty reduction and greater equality, including regional equity, and Bank program interventions aimed at enhancing socio-economic conditions of key target groups. Taking into account ongoing projects and those approved during the CPS, 44 percent of Bank lending went to projects in social protection. The Productive Safety Net Program series, in particular, enhanced food security, livelihoods, skill development, and land management. It also committed the government to allocate more resources over time to the most vulnerable. The remaining 56 percent of the program was devoted—in order by size of commitments—to transport infrastructure, energy and mining, agriculture and rural development, and urban development—all areas that directly or indirectly supported the twin goals.

5. Development Outcome

Overview of Achievement by Objective:

7. The Bank program had two focus areas: (a) fostering competitiveness and employment, and (ii) enhancing resilience and reducing vulnerabilities. It also contained a foundational objective of fostering good governance and state building. For consistency, IEG’s review considers the outcomes of the foundational objective as objectives of a third pillar, in line with the assessment of the other two pillars.

Focus Area I: Fostering Competitiveness and Employment



8. This focus area had four objectives: (i) promote a stable macroeconomic environment; (ii) foster increased competitiveness and productivity; (iii) increase and improve infrastructure delivery; and (iv) enhance regional integration.

Objective 1: Stable macroeconomic environment

9. This objective had two outcomes: (i) introduce macroeconomic policies conducive to sustain external and internal balance (sound monetary and fiscal policies to control inflation), and (ii) increase domestic resource mobilization (local governments to increase own resources). The Bank supported this objective through knowledge services, particularly on debt management.

10. On the *first outcome*, CPI inflation was 7.5 percent as of June 2016, below the ceiling of 10 percent under the program. The 2016 IMF Article IV consultation report notes that a restrictive monetary policy stance contributed to this result. The report also notes that the fiscal stance was appropriately supportive to minimize the economic and social impact of the drought, but underscores that curbing an external deficit of about 11 percent of GDP will require a tighter fiscal policy in the period ahead. At the same time, the report indicates that the Ethiopian birr is overvalued by 20 to 40 percent, which poses a significant constraint to export competitiveness, especially in manufacturing. Economic policies have been inconsistent in some areas with Fund advice. Interest rates are not allowed to be determined flexibly, and the foreign exchange market functioning needs to be improved. Such improvement would include a market-based price setting mechanism for the exchange rate and an increase in exchange rate flexibility. Moreover, in the banking area, the government would need to phase out the requirement that private banks invest in National Bank of Ethiopia bonds a 27 percent of their credit to finance the Development Bank.

11. Typically, macroeconomic stabilization is an area where the IMF takes the lead. In this particular case, the Bank has been active, complementing the IMF on a number of issues related to macroeconomic stability, debt sustainability analysis, and capacity building for statistics and debt management. This outcome was *achieved*.

12. The *second outcome* as measured by an increase of their own municipal revenue of at least 10 percent over the previous year was also achieved. As of June 2016, 35 urban local governments have increased their own municipal revenues by at least 10 percent over the previous year (versus the target of 18 urban local governments). Although this outcome may be significant for the municipalities involved, it is of second order for national resource mobilization.

13. The two outcome measures under this objective focused on macroeconomic stability and public finance. On balance, this objective is rated as *Achieved*.

Objective 2: Increased competitiveness and productivity

14. The outcomes for this objective were to (i) increase agriculture productivity and marketing in selected areas; (ii) increase competitiveness in manufacturing and services; and (iii) increase Medium and Small Enterprises' (MSE) access to financial services. The Bank supported this objective through the Agriculture Growth Program (FY11), the Competitiveness and Job Creation project (FY14), and the Women Entrepreneurship Development project (FY12).

15. Achievement of the *increased agriculture productivity outcome* was measured by two indicators (i) average yields of selected crops in targeted woredas, and (ii) value of marketed agricultural products in targeted woredas. The CLR reports that the end-project sample survey has not been completed because the closing of Agriculture Project has been extended. It also notes that according to proxy data prepared by IFPRI for the project, yields per hectare nearly doubled from 16.4 qt/ha in 2011/12 to 28.4 qt/ha in 2014/15, but this information could not be verified. On the second indicator, there was a documented increase of 12.7 percent in the real value of marketed agricultural products per household as of March 2014 compared with the 22 percent expected for the whole program period.¹ The CLR reports a higher number of over 50 percent for the end of the project—based on an

¹ The indicator measure is in Ethiopian Birr (ETB)—Ethiopia's currency: a 22 percent increase in nominal terms. The project—Agriculture Growth Program (FY11)—documented a real increase of 12.7 percent of



evaluation prepared by USAID—but IEG’s review of USAID’s midterm report suggests a more nuanced assessment, where targets were achieved for some products but not others.² The outcome was *mostly achieved*.

16. The second outcome of *increased competitiveness in manufacturing and services*, was to be measured by two indicators (i) the number of new jobs created in targeted manufacturing and services firms and (ii) export share of total sales value of goods and services generated by firms located in the special Industrial Zone. The number of jobs created under different Bank and IFC interventions is estimated to be around 13,000—was close to the target under the program (15,000). The program expected that US\$28 million in exports would be generated by firms located in the special Industrial Zone. However, the CLR reports that the project supporting this outcome only became effective in August 2014, and hence there was not enough time during the program period to generate the needed increase in exports by firms supported in the Industrial Zone. The outcome was *partially achieved*.

17. On the *increased MSE access to finance outcome*, the Women Entrepreneurship Development project (WEDP) disbursed US\$43 million to Micro-Finance Institutions as of November 2015, which on-lent this same amount to SMEs, compared with the target of US\$28 million under the program. According to initial surveys, 76 percent of WEDP clients had never taken a loan before. For repeat borrowers, loan size increased on average by 8-9 times, enabling women-owned enterprises to scale up operations that were stuck in a small-size trap. This outcome was *achieved*.

18. On balance, this objective is rated as *Mostly Achieved*.

Objective 3: Increase and Improve Infrastructure Delivery

19. The three outcomes for this objective were to (i) increase access to electricity; (ii) improve roads and transport infrastructure; and (iii) increase access to improved water and sanitation services in urban and rural areas. The Bank supported this objective through the Electricity Access Rural Expansion project (FY06), the Second Electricity Access Rural Expansion project (FY08), the Electricity Network Reinforcement and Expansion project (FY12), the Road Sector Development Support Program III (FY07) and IV (FY09), the Productive Safety Net APL III project (FY10), the Productive Safety Net APL III (FY10) and IV (FY15), the Urban Water Supply and Sanitation project (FY04, FY07), the Water Supply, Sanitation, and Hygiene project (FY14), and the Tana and Beles Integrated Water Resources Development project (FY08).

20. On *increasing access to electricity*, the outcome was measured by off-grid and on-grid access. With respect to *off-grid* connection, according to the CLR, about 1 million households (versus the target of 250,000 people) now have access to off grid electricity as of November 2016, owing in large part to the Electricity Network Reinforcement and Expansion project (FY12). The CLR also notes mixed progress toward expanding *grid-connected electricity service*. The two supporting Bank interventions—Electricity Access Rural Expansion projects I (FY06) and II (FY08)—suffered delays owing to the government’s moratorium on new connections, and its sole-sourcing of meter procurement to a local public enterprise. Although the two projects connected more towns and villages to electricity services than originally planned, the Bank projects were unable to bring the on-grid electricity to households by the time they were closed. According to available information from the three energy operations supported by the Bank, less than one million people have on-grid electricity access in selected areas (compared to the target of 1.7 million people). On balance, the electricity access outcome is rated *mostly achieved*.

marketed agricultural products as of March 2014, and accumulated inflation between 2012 and March 2014 was more than 30 percent, implying that in nominal terms the marketed agricultural goods per household increased by significantly more than the 22 percent nominal increase targeted by the indicator.

² The Mid-Term evaluation of the Agriculture Growth Program by USAID (February 2015, page 6) notes an increase in coffee sales in US\$ of 32 million (127 percent of planned target). Sale of maize and sesame were 87 and 80 percent of target while sales of wheat and chickpeas were about 20 percent of target —indicating mixed progress.



21. The outcome on *improved roads and transport infrastructure* was measured by the additional km of roads—including rural—constructed or rehabilitated. Slightly more than 800 km of roads were constructed or rehabilitated to fair and good condition by WBG operations, compared with a target of 1,008 km under the program. In addition, 41,031 km of rural roads were rehabilitated and 26.864 km constructed, for a total of 67,895 km, close to the 71,500 km target under the program. Thus, the second outcome, was *mostly achieved*.

22. As regards the *third outcome—on increased access to water and sanitation services*—over 16 million people in WBG project areas obtained access to improved water resources as of June 2015 (compared with a 4.2 million target) and 2.22 million people obtained access to improved sanitation (compared to a target of 4.5 million). This outcome was *mostly achieved*.

23. On balance this objective is rated as *Mostly Achieved*.

Objective 4: Enhance Regional Integration

24. The three outcomes for this objective were to (i) improve the Eastern Africa Power Pool Mechanism, and (ii) enhance involvement in the regional agriculture technology generation and dissemination. The Bank supported this objective through the Eastern Electricity Highway project (FY13) and the Eastern Africa Agricultural Productivity project (FY09).

25. The target on the *first outcome—on power pool mechanism*—was to export 1,401 GWh (569 to Djibouti plus 832 to Sudan). The CLR reports that to date 781.9 GWh have been exported, but the Bank did not contribute to this outcome. There were extended procurement delays in the East Africa Power Pool project (FY14) and contracts for transmission lines and converter stations were not signed until end-October 2015. Therefore, the expected increase in energy export capacity is now envisaged to be achieved well beyond the CPS period (end-2018). The outcome was *not achieved*.

26. As regards the *second outcome—on agriculture technology generation and dissemination*—150 existing and new technologies—compared with a target of 82—were disseminated in more than one Eastern Africa Agricultural Productivity Program country. The outcome was *achieved*.

27. On balance this objective is rated as *Partially Achieved*.

28. IEG rates the outcome of WBG support under Focus Area 1 as *Moderately Satisfactory*. There was tangible progress on promoting a stable macroeconomic environment, on increasing and improving infrastructure delivery, and on fostering increased competitiveness and productivity. Progress was limited on enhancing regional energy integration in East Africa.

Focus Area II: Enhance Resilience and Reduce Vulnerabilities

29. This focus area had two objectives: (i) improve the delivery of social services; and (ii) enhance comprehensive social protection and risk management.

Objective 5: Improve the Delivery of Social Services

30. The two outcomes for this objective were to increase access to: (i) quality health services, and (ii) quality education. The Bank supported this objective through the Health MDG Support Operation (FY13), the General Education Quality Improvement Program I (FY09), and the Promotion of Basic Services III (FY13).

31. On quality *health services—the first outcome*—in line with program targets, there was a contraceptive prevalence rate of 40.4 percent as of April 2014. In addition, as of the same date, 16 percent of deliveries were attended by skilled birth providers, short of the 18 percent program target. No progress was reported on the increase in share of 12-23 months immunized with Pentavalent 3 vaccination. According to the CLR, updated information is expected to be released soon. This outcome was *partially achieved*.

32. On *education—the second outcome*—the program targeted a significant increase in the percentage of students attaining basic competencies. Data from the June 2016 of Ethiopia's National Learning Assessment reports notes the achievements for 2015: for grade 4: 47 percent in English



(target of 58 percent) and 63 percent in Mathematics (target of 56 percent); and for grade 8: 74 percent in English (target of 50 percent) and 62 percent in Mathematics (target of 50 percent). This outcome was *mostly achieved*.

33. On balance this objective is rated as *Mostly Achieved*.

Objective 6: Enhance comprehensive social protection and risk management

34. The three outcomes for this objective were to (i) enhance resilience to food insecurity of vulnerable households, (ii) increase the adoption of Disaster Risk Management Systems; and (iii) foster sustainable natural resource management and resilience to climate change. The Bank supported this objective through the Productive Safety Net APL III (FY10) and IV (FY15) projects, the Sustainable Land Management project I (FY08) and II (FY14), the Tana and Beles Integrated Water Resources Development project (FY08), the Agriculture Growth Program (FY11), and the Productive Safety Net APL II project (FY10).

35. On the *first outcome—resilience to food insecurity*—the average net number of months of household food insecurity has been reduced to below 3.2, meeting the program target. The Productive Safety Net Program (PSNP)—which targets chronically food-insecure rural households—is one of Sub-Saharan Africa’s largest, which the Bank supported with a series of adaptable program operations during 2005-16 as part of a consortium of donors. The program contributed to improved food security in all regions, helped rehabilitate the environment and natural resources, and improved access to education and health care. A WBG assessment³ shows how safety nets help households bounce back after shocks as compared to non-protected households, including through the use of risk financing mechanisms that allow a scale up of the PSNP in times of transitory crisis. This outcome was *achieved*.

36. On *Disaster Risk Management Systems—the second outcome*—against a target of 100, no additional woredas were connected to early warning systems during the CPS period. At the same time—in line with program targets—early warning information on disaster risk was provided to 122 additional woredas as of December 2013, and 267 woredas had contingency plans in place as of June 2015. This outcome was *mostly achieved*.

37. As regards the *third outcome—natural resource management and resilience*—about 1.9 million has were under sustainable land management practices as a result of WBG operations, exceeding the target of 1 million under the program. This outcome was *achieved*.

38. On balance, this objective is rated as *Achieved*.

39. IEG rates the outcome of WBG support under Focus Area 1 as *Moderately Satisfactory*. There was significant progress on both improving the delivery of social services and enhancing comprehensive social protection and risk management.

Focus Area III: Foster Good Governance and State Building

40. This focus area had three objectives: (i) improve public service performance management and responsiveness; and (ii) enhance space for citizen participation in development; and (iii) enhance public financial management, procurement, and accountability. The CPS and PLR refer to this focus area as a *foundation*. For consistency, IEG’s review considers its outcomes as objectives under this pillar, in line with the assessment of the other two pillars.

Objective 7: Improve public service performance management and responsiveness

41. The two outcomes for this objective were to (i) introduce the Balanced Score Card (BSC) in all ministries and 4 big regions, and (ii) increase significantly the percent of citizens confident that the government will address their service quality issues in key areas. The main Bank intervention that

³ *Ethiopia’s Productive Safety Net Program (PSNP): Integrating Disaster and Climate Risk Management*, World Bank Group and Global Facility for Disaster Reduction and Recovery, Washington DC, June 2013.



supported this objective was the Public Sector Capacity Program Support project (PSCPS), a multi-donor trust fund established in 2007 and extended until June 2014.

42. On the first *outcome—Balanced Score Cards*—BSC have been introduced and implemented in all federal ministries and all four big regions with Bank support under the PSCPS. This outcome was *achieved*.

43. On the second outcome—service quality in key areas—results from the Woreda and City Administrations Benchmarking Survey (WCBS) 2010-13 show a decline in confidence from 58 percent to 43 percent among citizens that their concerns about health service quality will be addressed, while confidence in water service responsiveness increased from 65 percent to 68 percent. The WCBS has been discontinued. This outcome could *not be verified*.

44. On balance this objective is rated as *Partially Achieved*.

Objective 8: Enhance space for citizen participation in development

45. The outcome for this objective was the number of woredas that facilitate the use of Social Accountability tools, and have developed joint action plans for service quality improvement. The main Bank interventions that supported this objective was the Promoting Basic Services Program Phase III project (FY13) and the Social Accountability Program Phase II.

46. During the review period, 223 woredas have facilitated the use of social accountability tools—compared with a program target of 320 (from a baseline of 50)—and 223 woredas developed joint action plans for service quality improvement as of February 2017 with Bank support (compared to the target of 300). Still, Ethiopia remains among the lowest-ranked countries in the ranking prepared by the Worldwide Governance Indicator for Voice and Accountability (11th percentile in 2010 and 14th percentile in 2014). The outcome was *partially achieved*.

47. This objective is rated as *Partially Achieved*.

Objective 9: Enhance public financial management, procurement, and accountability

48. The outcomes for this objective was to (i) enhance public financial management performance at the federal and regional levels, (ii) establish Citizen's Charters across the public service, and (iii) increase the number of audits for regional institutions. The main Bank intervention that supported this objective was the Public Sector Capacity Program Support project (FY04).

49. On the *first outcome—public financial management*—during 2010-14 PEFA A scores nearly doubled in number from 12 to 20, B scores increased from 30 to 42, while C and NA scores declined. This outcome was *achieved*.

50. On *Citizen's Charters (CC)—the second targeted outcome*—the CLR reports that to date 14 federal ministries have developed CC's and started to publicize them, in line with the target under the program. The Amhara region has developed charters for all regional bureaus and three other big regions have developed charters for their Civil Service Bureaus based on the charter developed by the Federal Ministry of Civil Service, also in line with the target of 4 big regions instituting citizen's charters. This outcome was *achieved*, although it is hard to judge how citizen's charters contribute to the objective of public financial management, procurement, and accountability.

51. Regarding the *audits of regional institutions—the third outcome*—the CLR reports that the number of regional institutions with annual financial audits increased to 80 percent (target 50 percent), which could not be verified based on WBG and PEFA documents. This outcome was *not achieved*.

52. On balance, this objective is rated as *Mostly Achieved*.

53. IEG rates the outcome of WBG support under Focus Area III as *Moderately Unsatisfactory*. There was significant progress on enhancing public financial management, procurement, and accountability. Progress fell short, however, on improving public service performance management and performance, and enhancing citizen participation.



Overall Assessment and Rating

54. IEG rates the overall development outcome as *Moderately Satisfactory*. The program made uneven progress across focus areas and objectives. Under *Focus Area I* there was tangible progress on promoting a stable macroeconomic environment, and increasing and improving infrastructure deliver, and fostering increased competitiveness and productivity. Progress fell short of program targets increasing regional energy integration in East Africa. In *Focus Area II* significant progress was made on both improving the delivery of social services and enhancing comprehensive social protection and risk management. In *Focus Area III* there was significant progress on enhancing public financial management, procurement, and accountability. Progress fell short, however, on improving public service performance management and responsiveness, and enhancing citizen participation. Cross-cutting issues were not measured explicitly in the results framework.

Objectives	CLR Rating	IEG Rating
Focus Area I: Fostering Competitiveness and Employment	<i>Moderately Satisfactory</i>	<i>Moderately Satisfactory</i>
<i>Objective 1: Stable macroeconomic environment</i>	<i>Achieved</i>	<i>Achieved</i>
<i>Objective 2: Increased competitiveness and productivity</i>	<i>Achieved</i>	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>
<i>Objective 3: Increased and Improved Infrastructure Delivery</i>	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>
<i>Objective 4: Enhance Regional Integration</i>	<i>Partially Achieved</i>	<i>Partially Achieved</i>
Focus Area II: Enhanced Resilience and Reduce Vulnerabilities	<i>Moderately Satisfactory</i>	<i>Moderately Satisfactory</i>
<i>Objective 5: Improved Delivery of Social Services</i>	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>
<i>Objective 6: Comprehensive social protection and risk management</i>	<i>Achieved</i>	<i>Achieved</i>
Focus Area III (Foundation): Foster Good Governance and State Building	<i>Moderately Satisfactory</i>	<i>Moderately Unsatisfactory</i>
<i>Objective 7: Improved public service performance management and responsiveness</i>	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>	<i>Partially Achieved</i>
<i>Objective 8: Enhanced space for citizen participation in the development process</i>	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>	<i>Partially Achieved</i>
<i>Objective 9: Enhance public financial management, procurement, and accountability</i>	<i>Achieved</i>	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>

6. WBG Performance

Lending and Investments

55. At the start of the CPS period, IDA had 25 ongoing operations totaling nearly \$3.2 billion. The portfolio was all in investment project financing (IPF) operations in energy, public sector capacity building, water and sanitation, road maintenance and buildings, irrigation, electricity access, urban development, protection of basic services, agriculture, and productive safety nets. There were 37 trust funded activities for over \$1 billion which provided complementary financing in all the areas supported by IDA operations. During the CPS period (FY12-FY16), IDA approved US\$6.7 billion in new commitments, a majority in project financing, including US\$2.5 billion of unplanned operations. This exceeded the proposed financing under the CPS/CPSRP of US\$4.2 billion, although such plans covered only the proposed amounts through FY15. Trust funded activities accounted for about \$1.2 billion provided complementary financing, primarily in energy, and also for public finance and internal audit.

56. In terms of number of projects, Ethiopia performed better (80 percent) than both the Bank as a whole (69 percent) and the Africa region (71). Of the fifteen projects validated by IEG during the



review period, 12 were rated MS or better and three MU or worse. The latter—an MU for the Energy Access SIL (FY03) and a U for a grant for Rural Electricity Expansion (Phase 2)—suffered from significant problems at every stage, from quality at entry, to supervision and overall implementation, including by the borrower. With respect to active operations, management assessments report that—except for the Renewable Energy project (FY14)—all projects were making satisfactory progress towards achieving their development objectives.

57. The Ethiopia portfolio showed lower risk—both in terms of number of projects and committed amounts—than the Africa region and Bank wide portfolios. During FY12-16, the Ethiopia portfolio had 18.5 percent of the projects at risk compared to 22 percent for the Africa Region and 21 percent Bank-wide. Ethiopia's portfolio at exit performed better than its comparators (Africa and Bank-wide) as measured by IEG's outcome ratings (MS or better). During the review period IDA committed resources were disbursed at a faster rate (33 percent disbursement ratio) than the Africa region (22 percent) and the Bank (21 percent), reflecting the good overall portfolio performance.

58. There were six IFC investment projects—with US\$86.7 million of net commitment—at the inception of the review period that were active during the review period. About two thirds of IFC investments went to a cement manufacturing company. During FY12-16, IFC committed another US\$157.3 million, through six new investments. At the end of the review period, about a third of the investments went to supporting refined gasoline imports. Of the twelve investments that were active during the review period, seven have closed. IEG has still not reviewed them. Yet, because equity investments were small compared to the average IFC investments, only about eight percent of the portfolio is considered sub-standard or lower.

59. MIGA gave coverage for US\$15.1 million that supported three investments, 71 percent of which went into supporting an agribusiness investment where IFC has invested as well.

Analytic and Advisory Activities and Services

60. During the review period, the Bank supported a program of analytic work and advisory activities and services including 34 Economic and Sector Works (ESWs) and 37 Technical Assistance (TA) tasks. The production of relevant knowledge work was effective by helping the dialogue with the government in sensitive reform areas such as macroeconomic stability, competitiveness, labor markets, and urbanization. Bank analytical work produced evidence of pros and cons in areas where the government was uncertain about continuing with reform. In other areas, such as access to finance, analytical work led to IDA operations. Technical assistance included work on poverty and migration, health, agriculture, public sector capacity—including procurement and debt management, service delivery impact, and external audit. All in all, the program of ASA supported well the Bank's lending program.

61. IFC had three advisory service (AS) projects, amounting to over US\$2.4 million that were approved before the review period and were implemented during the review period. During the review period, IFC approved nine new AS projects amounting to about US\$13.9 million of total funds. Of the twelve projects, four have closed, and IEG has reviewed two of these closed projects, rating the Development Effectiveness of one of them Mostly Successful but the other Mostly Unsuccessful. Of the two that have not been reviewed by the IEG, IFC's Project Completion Reports rated one of them as Successful and the other Mostly Unsuccessful.

Results Framework

62. The results framework reflected a logical chain beginning with the country's development goals, issues and obstacles, outcomes and intermediate indicators to which WBG expects to contribute, and WBG instruments supporting the program objectives. In this context, the CPS objectives addressed critical constraints facing Ethiopia, and the causal chain between WBG interventions and objectives was fairly clear. At the same time, some indicators were unrealistic. For example, the 2011 Joint Staff Advisory Note on the GTP raised significant concerns about projected growth rates of over 11 percent. Yet, the results framework picked targets directly from the GTP. Outcome indicators did not reflect well the objectives in some instances. For example, under certain objectives of Focus Area III on governance and state building, and on resource mobilization under



objective #1. Some indicators—such as those on agriculture productivity under objective #2—were difficult to monitor. Moreover, although gender was a cross-cutting issue, there were no gender-indicators in the results framework.

Partnerships and Development Partner Coordination

63. The WBG cooperated effectively with the IMF on issues related to macroeconomic stability. In addition, the results framework mentions the main development partners under each objective. For example, the EU, UNDP, and World Food Program for the social protection objective. DFID, Finland, Italian Development Cooperation, USAID, JICA, UNICEF, and Russia on issues related to education. USAID, Japan, CGIAR on agriculture. The CLR mentions—without much elaboration—that coordination with development partners was strong. It notes that the Bank helped leverage financing from multilateral organizations, traditional partners such as the EU, and non-traditional partners for projects, such as Promotion of Basic Services Program (PBS), Productive Safety Net Program (PSNP), General Education Quality Improvement Program (GQEIP), and Urban Local Government Development Program (ULGDP).

Safeguards and Fiduciary Issues (start with safeguards discussion followed by fiduciary issues)

64. According to the Vice Presidency for Integrity (INT), there were nine investigations by INT during the review period, of which five were substantiated cases of corruption or collusion in the Energy Access project, the Private Sector Capacity Building project, the Irrigation and Drainage project, and the Electricity Access (Rural) Expansion project Phase II.

65. Based on a complaint, the Inspection Panel (IP) was involved in a claim of severe harms and human rights abuses made regarding the Protection of Basic Services project. The IP report concluded that the involuntary taking of land and use of force were not a consequence of the project, but rather the associated government-financed Commune Development Program (CDP) in the Gambella region. The IP mentioned, however, that the Bank had failed to assess fully and mitigate the risks arising from the CDP. The IP also noted that a follow-up Management Action Plan (MAP) was issued and included activities to strengthen citizen engagement, safeguards, and financial management. According to the panel, as of February 2017, more than half of the MAP had been completed.

66. Based on fifteen IEG completion reviews, some additional safeguard issues were noted in relation to community involvement, ineffective application of policy instruments, weak impact assessment, and delayed preparation. Serious consequences—such as deaths and accidents by poor safety procedures and requirements by contractors—took place in the transport sector.

Ownership and Flexibility

67. The WBG has had an ongoing productive relationship with Ethiopia, with some uncertainties at times, like the political transition just before the CPS was discussed by the Board in 2012. Dialogue with the government was rebuilt and strengthened afterwards, and the government reaffirmed continued relevance of the CPS pillars to the GTP I and II. There was broad government commitment to the program as the authorities expressed strong interest in the areas of Bank intervention because these areas were closely aligned with the GTP I and II. The ASA agenda was also driven by ongoing dialogue with the government on current or future interventions, and in a number of cases fed directly into the Bank interventions. There were not many changes to the program or results framework at progress report stage.

WBG Internal Cooperation

68. The CLR reports effective cooperation between the Bank and IFC. The cooperation was manifested in Focus Area I (fostering competitiveness and employment), primarily in supporting the government's industrialization agenda and access to finance for Small and Medium Enterprises. According to the CLR, IFC and the Bank have also worked effectively in supporting the business environment and in the Competitiveness and Jobs Creation project. IFC also administered a trust fund for the Initiative to Support the Ethiopian Private Sector Development, but the CLR noted that



development partners voiced concerns regarding coordination and costs related to this fund. MIGA provided guarantees for agribusiness and manufacturing, complementing well the work of the Bank and IFC in these areas. The World Bank and IFC teams collaborated closely on the IFC Climate Innovation Center AS project.

Risk Identification and Mitigation

69. The CPS identified five main risks (external economic shocks, trade-off between growth and debt sustainability, corruption and governance, natural disasters, natural disasters). Of those five, fiduciary and safeguard risks—related to governance and corruption—remained significant features of the WBG program in Ethiopia. The government has pursued improvements to counter corruption, and the Bank has also taken a number of measures on internal controls, financial reporting, unaccounted advances, bank reconciliations, cash balances and follow up on auditing. However—as evidenced in the section on safeguards and fiduciary issues—these are areas where the Bank will need to redouble efforts. On safeguards, the Bank has suffered in particular where WBG operations are co-located with national government programs. In some such cases—as illustrated by the IP case—the Bank has not identified in a timely fashion and mitigated safeguard risks.

70. More broadly, the Bank program faced risks emanating from the macroeconomic and external fronts, natural disasters, political transitions, and regional security. The Bank is involved in macroeconomic issues which mitigates risks to some extent. It also supports the government's Climate Resilience and Green Economy program, which should mitigate disaster risks. Political risks are more difficult to mitigate, but the Bank works closely with development partners to respond in a coordinated way if these risk materialize. On regional security risks, the WBG has no independent way of mitigating possible unrest spilling over to Ethiopia from regional instability. Moreover, the Bank joined forces with other development partners to respond to food insecurity related to an unanticipated drought—see for details objective #6 and paragraph 36 on the resilience to food insecurity indicator.

Overall Assessment and Rating

71. IEG rates WBG performance as *Good*. The WBG strategy addressed key challenges facing the country, emphasizing the need for structural transformation to increase competitiveness and productivity in line with GTP I and II. Interventions supported reforms across the three focus areas, and analytical work helped the dialogue with the government, and in some areas, such as access to finance and urbanization, led to IDA operations. The overall program was selective, and built on adequate country diagnostics and ASA support, and was based on consultations with the authorities. IFC investments and advisory activities were focused on enhancing private sector competitiveness, its capacity to create jobs through new investments, especially in SMEs, and devising an investment incentive framework. On the whole, the work across the WBG was well articulated to support the main elements of the program.

72. The program aimed at having a long-term impact by fostering changes in competitiveness and productivity—in line with GTP II—that would help Ethiopia become a lower middle income country over time, and become sustainable without aid. The results framework was adequate—with some pitfalls on indicator appropriateness, measurement, and realism—and the CPS objectives addressed critical constraints facing Ethiopia. The causal chain between WBG interventions and objectives was fairly clear. A positive aspect of Ethiopia's results framework was that the higher level goals of the Government's GTP were made explicit at the beginning of each pillar, and therefore it was fairly clear how the WBG program would contribute to the government goals. In some instances, however, indicators did not reflect the objectives well or were difficult to measure.

73. Implementation also was generally good, and there was good internal cooperation. The cooperation was manifested particularly in Focus Area I (fostering competitiveness and employment), primarily in supporting the government's industrialization agenda and access to finance for Small and Medium Enterprises. According to the CLR, IFC and the Bank have also worked effectively in supporting the business environment and in the Competitiveness and Jobs Creation project. IFC also administered a trust fund for the Initiative to Support the Ethiopian Private Sector Development, but according to the CLR development partners voiced concerns regarding coordination and costs related



to this fund. MIGA provided guarantees for agribusiness and manufacturing, complementing well the work of the Bank and IFC in these areas. Ethiopia's portfolio at exit performed better than its comparators (Africa and Bank-wide) as measured by IEG's outcome ratings (MS or better). The main risks (outside fiduciary and safeguards) were mitigated properly where possible. The response to the unanticipated drought in Ethiopia was remarkable. As evidenced in the section on safeguards and fiduciary issues, these are areas where the Bank will need to redouble efforts in order to minimize such risks.

7. Assessment of CLR Completion Report

74. The CLR provided a candid assessment of program performance based on the results framework as modified in the progress report. The evidence for assessing objectives was generally sufficient. IEG would have liked to see a thorough analysis of risks to the program, particularly in light of the risks that materialized in the economic and political spheres. Discussion of within WBG synergies was adequate, but the CLR could have provided a more explicit assessment of cooperation with other development partners to extract lessons for the future in Ethiopia and other countries. The CLR would have benefited from an explicit comparison of proposed and actual financing. A more detailed discussion of fiduciary and safeguard issues, and of gender as a cross-cutting issue, also would have been helpful.

8. Findings and Lessons

75. IEG agrees with the CLR lessons about the need for forward-looking innovative work to engage with the government in the long term, and risk management and ongoing evaluation to bring the best in operations. It also concurs with the view that the Bank is at its best when it does not operate in isolation.

76. IEG adds the following lessons:

- Bank-IFC cooperation can be effective even in a context of significant challenges to private sector development. In the case of Ethiopia, the number of jobs created by IFC in targeted manufacturing and services firms could serve as a pilot to be scaled up under further Bank-IFC collaboration.
- Complementing a lesson in the CLR, the appropriate use of analytical work can lead to a more fruitful dialogue on reforms with the client. In the case of Ethiopia, this was evidenced for example in the areas of competitiveness, labor markets, and urbanization.
- Risk financing mechanisms in Bank interventions can enable a client to scale up safety nets to address transitory shocks in a low income country. In the case of Ethiopia, part of the success of the Productive Safety Net Program reflected such flexibility in the face of the severe drought that affected the country.

Annex Table 1: Summary of Achievements of CPS Objectives – Ethiopia

Annex Table 2: Ethiopia Planned and Actual Lending, FY13-FY16

Annex Table 3: Analytical and Advisory Work for Ethiopia, FY13-FY16

Annex Table 4: Ethiopia Grants and Trust Funds Active in FY13-16

Annex Table 5: IEG Project Ratings for Ethiopia, FY13-16

Annex Table 6: IEG Project Ratings for Ethiopia and Comparators, FY13-16

Annex Table 7: Portfolio Status for Ethiopia and Comparators, FY13-16

Annex Table 8: Disbursement Ratio for Ethiopia, FY13-16

Annex Table 9: Net Disbursement and Charges for Ethiopia, FY13-16

Annex Table 10: Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid

Annex Table 11: Economic and Social Indicators for Ethiopia, 2012 – 2015

Annex Table 12: List of IFC Investments in Ethiopia (US\$,000)

Annex Table 13: List of IFC Advisory Services in Ethiopia (US\$)

Annex Table 14: IFC net commitment activity in Ethiopia, FY12 - FY16 (US\$, 000)

Annex Table 15: List of Active MIGA Activities in Ethiopia, 2013-2016 (US\$, millions)



Annex Table 1: Summary of Achievements of CPS Objectives – Ethiopia

	CPS FY13-FY16 – Focus Area 1: Fostering Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results	IEG Comments
Major Outcome Measures	Objective 1: Stable Macroeconomic Environment		
	<p>Outcome (i): Structural and macroeconomic policies are conducive to sustain internal and external balance</p> <p>Indicator: Sound monetary and fiscal policies to control inflation implemented Baseline: CPI 21.6 (end of 2011/12) Target: CPI < 10%</p>	<p>The CLR reports that the CPI was 7.5% as of June 2016, after climbing to 10.4% in June 2015 and 11.8% in October 2015. The list of operations reported in the CLR to have contributed to this indicator mostly consists of knowledge services that supported policy dialogues. Given the nature of the AAAs, their direct contribution is difficult to assess. Likewise, the CLR reports that the WBG's technical assistance (TA) played a role in the efforts made by Ethiopia to strengthen its debt management capacity such as the Public Sector Capacity Building Facility, P144864, FY14 (see Working Paper) and the Debt Management Reform Plan (P147787, FY14). Achieved.</p>	<p>It is not clear which WBG operations contributed to this indicator, outside AAA.</p>
	<p>Outcome(ii): Increased domestic resource mobilization</p> <p>Indicator: Number of urban local governments that achieve an increase of own source municipal revenue of at least 10% over the previous year under ULGDP II Baseline: Zero (FY14) Target: 18 out of 44 participating ULGs (FY16)</p>	<p>As of June 2016, 35 urban local governments have achieved an increase of their own municipal revenue of at least 10% over the previous year, under the Urban Local Government (ULGDP) II project (P133592, FY12, see last ISR: S of December 2016). Achieved.</p>	
	Objective 2: Increased Competitiveness & Productivity		
<p>Outcome (i): Increased agriculture productivity and marketing in selected areas</p> <p>Indicator (i): Average yields of selected crops in targeted woredas (index, see AGP PDO). Baseline: 9.9 qt/ha Target: 11.5 qt/ha</p>	<p>The Agriculture Growth Program (P113032, FY11) supported this indicator. Mostly Achieved.</p> <p>(i) The last ISR: MS for project P113032 (June 2016) does not report progress on the indicator related to the percentage increase in agriculture yield. The CLR indicates that, due to the extension of the closing date (approved in September 2015, see Project Paper), the end of the project sample survey has not been completed and was scheduled for January 2017 (see last ISR: MS). The CLR reports that, according to proxy data prepared by IFRI, project yields per hectare nearly doubled from 16.4 in 2011/12 to 28.4 in 2014/15. This</p>		



	CPS FY13-FY16 – Focus Area 1: Fostering Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results	IEG Comments
	<p>Indicator (ii): Value of marketed agricultural products in targeted woredas. Baseline: 5,790 ETB per household Target: 7,064 ETB per household</p>	<p>information is not verified on the basis of the WBG project documents. Not Verified.</p> <p>(ii) The last ISR: MS for project P113032 (June 2016) reports a 12.70% increase, as of March 2014, in the total real value of marketed agricultural products per households, compared with the 22 % expected for the whole program period. The CLR reports a higher number of over 50% for the end of the project—based on an evaluation prepared by USAID—but IEG's review of USAID's midterm report suggest a more nuanced assessment, where targets were achieved for some products but not others; USAID's review reports an increase in coffee sales in US\$ of 32 million (127% of planned target) and that sale of maize and sesame were 87 and 80% of target—so targets likely to be achieved by end of the project—and sales of wheat and chickpeas were about 20% of target—indicating that the targets were unlikely to be achieved by the end of the project. Mostly Achieved.</p>	<p>(ii) The indicator measure is in ETB—the Ethiopian Birr—Ethiopia's currency: a 22% increase in nominal terms. The project—Agriculture Growth Program documented a real increase of 12.7% of marketed agricultural products as of March 2014, and accumulated inflation between 2012 and March 2014 was more than 30%, implying that in nominal terms the marketed agricultural goods per household increased by significantly more than the 22% nominal increase targeted by the indicator.</p>
	<p>Outcome (ii): Increased competitiveness in manufacturing and services</p> <p>Indicator (i): Number of new jobs created in targeted manufacturing and services firms Baseline: 0 Target: 15,000</p>	<p>The Competitiveness and Job Creation Project - CJCP (P143302, FY14) and the Private Sector Development Capacity Building Project – PSDCBP (P050272, FY05) supported this indicator. Partially Achieved.</p> <p>(i) The last ISR: MS (January 2017) for the CJCP project (P143302, FY14) does not report progress on the indicator related to the number of jobs created by activities linked to the supported activities. IEG: MS for the PSDCBP (P050272, FY05) reports that 5,719 jobs were created in the private sector in participating firms. The PLR also reported that 570 new jobs had been created through a Cement investment project. Based on IFC DOTS data, IEG estimates that IFC investees have created around 2,000 jobs, of which, over 700 were created through the IFC Investment project in Cement. Finally, the Tourism Development project (P098132, FY09) supported the creation of 5,553 jobs in tourism-related industries (see IEG: MS). The number of jobs created under different Bank and IFC interventions is estimated to be around 13,270—was close to</p>	



	CPS FY13-FY16 – Focus Area 1: Fostering Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results	IEG Comments
	<p>Indicator (ii): Export share of total sales value of goods and services generated by firms located in the supported Industrial Zone Baseline (2014): 0 Target: (2016) US\$28,000,000</p>	<p>the target under the program (15,000). Mostly Achieved.</p> <p>(ii) the CLR reports that the CJCP project became effective on August, 2014, and that there has been insufficient time to generate improvements in the export component of sales by supported firms - the last ISR: MS (January 2017) does not report progress on the related indicator. Not Achieved.</p>	
	<p>Outcome (iii): Increased MSE access to financial services</p> <p>Indicator: Volume of bank funding: Lines of credit to MSEs. Baseline: 0 Target: US\$ 28 million</p>	<p>The Women Entrepreneurship Development Project - WEDP project (P122764, FY12) has disbursed USD 43 million to Micro-Finance Institutions (MFIs), which on-lent this amount to SMEs, as of November 01, 2015. The last ISR: S (June 2016) reports that the outstanding SME loan portfolio was USD 43 million as of May 2016.</p> <p>According to initial surveys, 76 percent of WEDP clients had never taken a loan before. For repeat borrowers, loan size increased on average by 8-9 times, enabling women-owned enterprises to scale up operations that were stuck in a small-size trap Achieved.</p>	
Objective 3: Increased and Improved Delivery of Infrastructure			
	<p>Outcome (i): Increased Access to Electricity</p> <p>Indicator: Number of people provided with access to electricity in selected areas from WBG supported operations.</p> <p>Baseline: (i) <i>On-grid</i>: 0 (ii) <i>Off-grid</i>: 0</p> <p>Target: (i) <i>On-grid</i>: 1.7 million people (ii) <i>Off-grid</i>: 250,000 people</p>	<p>Mostly Achieved.</p> <p>(i) <i>On-grid</i>: The sum of the validated information listed below indicates that 62,371 households (or equivalent 311,855 people assuming 5 people per household) plus 615,000 or a total of 926,855 people were connected to on-grid access to electricity during the CPS period:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - IEG: MU for the Electricity Access Rural Expansion Project (P097271, FY06, closed December 2012) reports that 17,371 households were connected to the grid - Management: MU for the Second Electricity Access Rural Expansion Project (P101556, FY08, closed December 2014) reports that 45,000 households were provided with electricity by grid connection - IEG: U for the Energy Access Project (P049395, FY03, closed June13), reports that the project supported 615,000 people connections to the grid <p>Partially Achieved.</p>	



	CPS FY13-FY16 – Focus Area 1: Fostering Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results	IEG Comments
		<p>(ii) <i>Off-grid</i>: The target was achieved, on the basis of the verified projects:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Management: MU for the Second Electricity Access Rural Expansion Project (P101556, FY08) reports that 158,043 people were provided with electricity by off-grid connections (only renewable energy sources) - Management: MU for the Energy Access Project (P049395, FY03, closed FY13), reports that the project supported the provision of off-grid electricity to 10,500 persons. - the last ISR: S (December 2016) of the Electricity Network Reinforcement and Expansion Project - ENREP (P119893, FY12) reports that about 1 million (923,730) households got access to modern energy off-grid services, as of November 2016, through the development of solar-powered lanterns. <p>Achieved.</p>	
	<p>Outcome (ii): Improved roads, transport Infrastructure</p> <p>Indicator (i): Additional km of roads constructed (new or upgraded with asphalt) or rehabilitated to fair and good condition areas from WBG supported operations. <i>Baseline:</i> Federal constructed or rehabilitated/ upgraded: 0 <i>Target:</i> Federal Constructed or rehabilitated: 1,008 km</p> <p>Indicator (ii): Additional km of rural access roads constructed and/or rehabilitated to fair and good condition <i>Baseline:</i> 800km <i>Target:</i> 71,500km</p>	<p>Mostly Achieved.</p> <p>(i) IEG:MS for the Road Sector Development Support Program III (P091077, FY07) reports that 498km of federal trunk and link roads were upgraded and the last ISR: S for the Road Sector Development Support Program IV (P106872, FY09) reports that 307km of federal link roads were rehabilitated, as of January 2017. This totals 805km. Mostly Achieved.</p> <p>(ii) Management: S for the Productive Safety Net APL III Project (P113220, FY10) reports that, as of June 2015, 41,031 km of rural roads were rehabilitated and that 26,864km of rural roads were constructed (67,895km in total). Mostly Achieved.</p>	
	<p>Outcome (iii): Increased access to improved water and sanitation services in urban and rural areas</p> <p>Indicator (i): Additional people provided with improved water resources in selected urban and rural areas</p>	<p>Mostly Achieved.</p> <p>(i) as reported in the CLR, 16.1 million people in project areas obtained access to improved water resources, as of June 2015 – see</p>	



CPS FY13-FY16 – Focus Area 1: Fostering Competitiveness and Employment	Actual Results	IEG Comments
<p>Baseline: 0 Target: 4.2 million Indicator (ii): Additional rural/urban people with improved sanitation (latrines) Baseline: 0 Target: 4.5 million</p>	<p>Management: S for the Productive Safety Net APL III (P113220, FY10). Achieved.</p> <p>(ii) the last ISR: MS for the Urban Water Supply and Sanitation Project (P101473, FY07) indicates that 100,000 people in urban areas were provided with access to improved sanitation under the project.</p> <p>IEG: MS for the Ethiopia Water Supply and Sanitation Project (P076735, FY04) reports that 287,000 people benefited from improved latrines.</p> <p>The last ISR: MS (February 2017) of the Ethiopia Water, Supply, Sanitation and Hygiene project (P133591, FY14) also reports that about 1.83 million people got access to improved sanitation facilities as of January 2017. Finally, Management: MS for the Tana and Beles Integrated Water Resources Development Project (P096323, FY08) reports that improved sanitation facilities were constructed in the watershed areas including 8 latrines in the flood shelter areas but does not report on the number of people who got access to these latrines.</p> <p>On the basis of the information for these projects, about 2.22 million people obtained access to improved sanitation. Partially Achieved.</p>	
Objective 4: Enhance Regional Integration		
<p>Outcome (i): Improved Eastern Africa Power Pool Mechanism</p> <p>Indicator: Total quantity of electricity exported in GWh Baseline: 33 GWh (to Sudan) Target: 1401 GWh (569 to Djibouti + 832 to Sudan)</p>	<p>The last ISR: MS (November 2016) of the Eastern Electricity Highway Project (P126579, FY13) does not present an indicator related to the total quantity of electricity exported to Djibouti and Sudan while the CLR reports that to date 781.88 GWh of electricity have been exported. Not Achieved.</p>	
<p>Outcome (ii): Enhanced involvement in regional agriculture technology generation and dissemination</p> <p>Indicator: Number of existing and new technologies from Ethiopia disseminated in more than one EAAPP country compared to plan Baseline: 37 Target: 82</p>	<p>IEG: MS for the Eastern Africa Agricultural Productivity project (P112688, FY09) reports that the 150 existing and new technologies were disseminated in more than one EAAPP country, as of December 2015. Achieved.</p>	



	CPS FY13-FY16 –Focus Area 2: Enhanced Resilience and Reduced Vulnerabilities	Actual Results	IEG Comments
<p>Major Outcome Measures</p>	<p>Objective 5: Improved Delivery of Social Services</p> <p>Outcome (i): Increased Access to Quality Health Services</p> <p>Indicator (i): Penta 3 vaccination coverage Baseline (2013): 65.7 % Target (2016/2017): 75.7%</p> <p>Indicator (ii): Proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel Baseline (2014): 10% Target (2015/2016): 18%</p> <p>Indicator (ii): Contraceptive Prevalence Rate among currently married women: Baseline: 29%; Target: 35%</p>	<p>(i) The last ISR: S (November 2016) for the Health MDG support Operation (P123531, FY13) reports no progress on the indicator related to the increase in the share of 12-23 months immunized with Pentavalent 3 vaccination. As reported in the CLR and the ISR, updated information was expected to be released soon.</p> <p>(ii) The last ISR: S (November 2016) for project P123531 reports that 16% of deliveries were attended by skilled birth providers, as of April 2014. Partially Achieved.</p> <p>(iii) The last ISR: S (November 2016) for project P123531 reports a contraceptive prevalence rate of 40.4%, as of April 2014. Achieved.</p>	
	<p>Outcome (ii): Increased Access to Quality Education</p> <p>Indicator: Percentage of students attaining basic competency <i>Baseline (2006/07):</i> (i) Grade 4: Reading in English 48%; Mathematics 46% (ii) Grade 8: English 40%; Mathematics 40% <i>Target (2015/16):</i> (i) Grade 4: Reading in English 58%; Mathematics 56% (ii) Grade 8: English 50%; Mathematics 50%</p>	<p>The CLR reports the following progress: (i) Grade 4: English: 47% and Mathematics: 63% (ii) Grade 8: English: 74% and Mathematics: 68%</p> <p>Management: S for the General Education Quality Improvement Program I (P106855, FY09) reports the following results, for 2011-2012: (i) Grade 4: English: 59.6% and Mathematics: 56.3% (ii) Grade 8: English: 55.1% and Mathematics: 61.3%</p> <p>The last ISR: MS (March 2017) of the General Education Quality Improvement Program II (P129828, FY14) does not present indicators related to basic competency for Grades 4 and 8. However, data from the June 2016 WBG analysis of Ethiopia National Learning Assessments reports the following achievements for 2015: (i) Grade 4: English: 47% and Mathematics: 63% (ii) Grade 8: English: 74% and Mathematics: 62%</p>	



CPS FY13-FY16 –Focus Area 2: Enhanced Resilience and Reduced Vulnerabilities	Actual Results	IEG Comments
	<p>On the basis of these results, the target is Mostly Achieved for Grade 4 students and Achieved for Grade 8 Students Mostly Achieved.</p>	
<p>Objective 6: Comprehensive Social Protection and Risk Management</p>		
<p>Outcome (i): Enhanced resilience of vulnerable households to food insecurity</p> <p>Indicator: Average net number of months of household food insecurity Baseline (2014): To be established Target (2016): PW: 3.2</p>	<p>Management: S for the Productive Safety Net APL III Project (P113220, FY10) reports that, as of September 2014, the average net number of months of household reporting being food insecure decreased from 3.64 months to 1.8 months for clients receiving public works under the project and from 3.8 months to 1.6 months, for clients receiving direct support. The last ISR: MS for the Productive Safety Net APL IV Project (P146883, FY15), reports an average of 2.40 months, as of December 2015. Achieved.</p>	
<p>Outcome (ii): Increased Adoption of Disaster Risk Management Systems</p> <p>Indicator: Number of woredas with (i) Functional connectivity, (ii) Disaster Risk Profiles and (iii) Contingency Plans Baseline: (i) zero, (ii) zero, (iii) zero Target: (i) 100, (ii) 100, (iii) 100</p>	<p>Mostly Achieved.</p> <p>(i) Management: S for the Public Sector Capacity Building Programs Support Project (P074020, FY04, closed FY13) reports that the woreda net infrastructure expanded to additional 175 new woredas, before the CPS period. As reported in the CLR, no additional woredas were connected during the CPS period. Not Achieved.</p> <p>(ii) early warning information on disaster risks was provided in 122 additional woredas, as of December 2013, (see Management: MS for the Pastoral Community Development Project II, P108932, FY08), notably though support of the GFDRR Disaster Risk Management Country Plan (P129151, FY12). Achieved.</p> <p>(iii) Management: S for the Productive Safety Net APL III Project (P113220, FY10) reports that 267 woredas had contingency plans in place, as of June 2015. Achieved.</p>	
<p>Outcome (iii): Sustainable natural resource management and resilience to climate change</p> <p>Indicator: Area (ha) under sustainable land and water management practices in selected watersheds (PSNP, SLMP, Tana & Beles, AGP)</p>	<p>Various projects contributed to this indicator:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - under the Sustainable Land Management Project (P107139, FY08), 209,926 ha were under sustainable land management (SLM) practices in the targeted watersheds, as of September 2013 (see IEG: MS) - under the Sustainable Land Management Project II (P133133, FY14), 504,480 ha were brought under climate-smart/resilient and 	



	CPS FY13-FY16 –Focus Area 2: Enhanced Resilience and Reduced Vulnerabilities	Actual Results	IEG Comments
	Baseline (2010): zero Target: 1,000,000	SML as of October 2016 (see last ISR: MS , of February 2017) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Management: MS for the Tana and Beles Integrated Water Resources Development Project (P096323, FY08) reports that in 79,288 has of land areas, SLM practices have been adopted as of July 2016 - under the Agriculture Growth Program (P113032, FY11), in 217,598 ha of land under SLM practices have been adopted as of December 2015 - the CLR also reports the contribution of the Productive Safety Net APL III Project (P113220, FY10) for which Management: S reports 901,654 ha with improved land and water management technologies. As a result of these five WBG operations, about 1.9 million ha (1,912,946) were under SLM practices. Achieved.	
	CPS FY13-FY16 – Focus Area 3: Good governance and State building	Actual Results	IEG Comments
Major Outcome Measures	Objective 7: Improved Public Service Performance Management and Responsiveness Indicator (i): Balanced Score Card (BSC) implemented measuring both organizational and individual performance <i>Baseline:</i> Federal ministries: zero Regions: zero <i>Targets:</i> Federal ministries: all Regions: 4 big regions Indicator (ii): Percent of citizens confident that local government will address their service quality issues in key areas <i>Baseline:</i> Water:65% Health: 58% <i>Targets:</i> Water:70% Health: 65%	Partially Achieved. (i) as reported in the CLR, BSC have been introduced and implemented in all Federal ministries and all big four regions under the Public Sector Capacity Building Program Support Project – PSCAP (P074020, FY04, closed FY13), as of December 2012 (see Management: S). Achieved. (ii) the CLR reports that the results are not verified but that results from the Woreda and City Administrations Benchmarking Survey (WCBS) from 2010 (see 2010 report) to 2013 show a significant decline in confidence among citizen respondents that the concerns they raise regarding health service quality will be addressed (from 58% to 43%), while confidence in water service increased from 65% to 68%. The CLR also reports that since the CPSPR, the WCBS has been discontinued. Not Verified.	As reported in the CLR, the four big regions are Oromia, Amhara, Tigray and SNNP (Southern Nations, Nationalities and people's regions).



CPS FY13-FY16 – Focus Area 3: Good governance and State building	Actual Results	IEG Comments
Objective 8: Enhanced space for citizen participation in the development process		
<p>Indicator: Number of woredas that:</p> <p>i) facilitate the use of Social Accountability tools; ii) have developed joint action plans for service quality improvement <i>Baseline</i> (FY11): i) 50 ii) NA <i>Target</i> (FY16): i) 320 ii) 300</p>	<p>Partially Achieved.</p> <p>(i) 223 woredas have facilitated the use of social accountability tools (see the last ISR: S of April 2017 for the Promoting Basic Services Program Phase III Project, P128891, FY13) as of February 2017. Ethiopia is also benefiting from the Ethiopia social Accountability Program Phase 2 (see program). Partially Achieved.</p> <p>(ii) 223 woredas have developed joint actions plans for service quality improvement as of February 2017 (see the last ISR: S of April 2017 for Project, P128891). Mostly Achieved.</p>	<p>External data from the Worldwide Governance Indicators indicates that Ethiopia's ranking on Voice and Accountability remains among the lowest percentiles of the ranking: 11.4 in 2010 and 14.3 in 2015.</p>
Objective 9: Enhanced public financial management, procurement, transparency and accountability		
<p>Indicator (i): Improved PFM performance at Federal & regions <i>Baseline</i>: PEFA Score of 2.83 out of 4 in 2009 for the Federal Government <i>Target</i>: PEFA Score of 3.1 (top 10% of countries in the Africa Region (2011)</p> <p>Indicator (ii): Citizens' Charters in place across public service at all levels of government <i>Baseline</i>: Federal: one (Ministry of Civil Service) Regions: zero <i>Target</i>: Federal: All federal Ministries Regions: 4 big regions</p> <p>Indicator (iii): Percent of regional institutions (auditees) with annual financial audits <i>Baseline</i>: 30% <i>Target</i>: 50%</p>	<p>Mostly Achieved.</p> <p>(i) As reported in the CLR, a conversion of Ethiopia's 2010 (see data) and 2014 (see data) PEFA scores shows that A scores nearly doubled from 12 to 20, B scores increased by about 50% from 30 to 42 while C scores and NA/NS scores both declined. However, the information presented in the PEFA reports does not provide a total score out of 4, to compare results with the target. On balance, the target was achieved. Achieved.</p> <p>(ii) the CLR reports that to date 14 federal ministries have developed Citizen's Charters and that publicizing them has been initiated. It also reports that the Amhara region has developed charters for all regional bureaus and that three other big regions have developed charters for their Civil Service Bureaus as a model, based on the charter developed by the Federal Ministry of Civil Service (see Management: S for the Public Sector Capacity Building Program Support Project – (P074020, FY04, closed FY13). Achieved.</p> <p>(iii) the CLR reports that the number of regional institutions with annual financial audits increased to 80%. This information could not be verified by IEG on the basis of the WBG and PEFA documents. Not Achieved.</p>	<p>(i) It is not clear which WBG operations contributed to this indicator.</p>



Annex Table 2: Ethiopia Planned and Actual Lending, FY13-FY16

Project ID	Project Name	Proposed FY	Approved FY	Closing FY	Proposed Amount (CPS)	Proposed Amount (CSPSR)	Approved IDA Amount	Outcome Rating
Project Planned Under CPS/CSPSR 2013-2016								
DELAYED	Regional Eastern Africa Power Pool Project APL1 - EAPP	2013						
P117731	Transport Sector Project In Support of RSDP4	2013	2013	2019		415.0	415.0	LIR: MS
P123531*	Health MDG Support (PforR)	2013	2013	2018		100.0	100.0	LIR: S
P128891	Promotion of Basic Services (PBS) Phase III	2013	2013	2019		600.0	600.0	LIR: S
P129828	Education MDG Support (follow-up to GEQIP)	2013	2014	2019		130.0	130.0	LIR: MS
DROPPED	Eastern Africa Pastoral Livelihoods Recovery and Resilience	2015				25.0		
P130276	Pastoral Community Development (PSPD) III	2013	2014	2019		110.0	110.0	LIR: S
P133591	Water Supply, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) II	2014	2014	2019		205.0	205.0	LIR: MS
P131118	Transport Sector Project In Support of RSDP4 (Project 2)	2014	2014	2024		320.0	320.0	LIR: S
P133613	Renewable Energy Project	2014	2014	2020		178.5	178.5	LIR: U
P125316	Urban Local Government (ULGDP) II	2014	2012			380.0	150.0	
P133133	Sustainable Land Management (SLMP) II	2014	2014	2019		50.0	50.0	LIR: MS
P143302	Competitiveness and Employment Project	2014	2014	2020		250.0	250.0	LIR: MS
DROPPED	Macro DPO	2015-16						
DROPPED	Sector-specific DPOs	2015-16						
P148591	Agricultural Growth Program (AGP) II	2015-16	2015	2021		350.0	350.0	LIR: S
DROPPED	Halele-Werabesa Hydropower Project	2015-16						
DROPPED	Rural Infrastructure Support (PforR)	2015-16						
DROPPED	Strengthening Public Expenditure Management Project	2015-16						
DROPPED	Regional Drought Response Program	2015-16						
DROPPED	DRM Program/Scalable Safety Nets	2015-16						
DROPPED	Additional financing to successful operations	2015-16						
P146883	ET Productive Safety Nets Project 4	2015	2015	2021		600.0	600.0	LIR: MS
P148850	Ethiopia- Expressway Development Support	2015	2015	2022		300.0	370.0	LIR: MS
P150922	Ethiopia PFM Project	2015	2016	2020		50.0	33.0	LIR: S
P151819	Transport Systems Improvement Project	2015	2016	2024		100.0	300.0	LIR: S
	Total Planned				3,820.0	4,163.5	4,161.5	



Project ID	Project Name	Proposed FY	Approved FY	Closing FY	Proposed Amount (CPS)	Proposed Amount (CSPSR)	Approved IDA Amount	Outcome Rating
Project Unplanned Under CPS/CSPSR 2013-2016								
P119893	Elect. Network Reinforcement & Expansio		2012	2019			200.0	LIR: S
P122764	ET:Women Entrepreneurship Development		2012	2018			50.0	LIR: S
P133592*	ET-Local Govt Dev Project II		2014	2020			380.0	LIR: S
P148447	Ethiopia SME Finance Project		2016	2023			200.0	LIR: S
P151432*	Ethiopia Enhancing Shared Prosperity		2016	2019			600.0	LIR: S
P151712	Urban Productive Safety Net (UPSN)		2016	2022			300.0	LIR: MS
P126430	ET:PSNP (APL III) Additional Financing		2012				370.0	
P129174	ET-Urban WSS Additional Financing		2012				150.0	
P154680	Additional Finance for Tana Beles IWRM		2016				5.1	
P155563	ENREP ADDITIONAL FINANCING		2016				200.0	
P158770	Productive Safety Net APL4 AF		2016				100.0	
	Total Unplanned				0.0	0.0	2,555.1	
On-Going Project during the CPS/CSPSR period								
P049395	ET-Energy Access SIL (FY03)		2003	2013			132.7	IEG: MU
P050272	Priv Sec Dev CB		2005	2013			24.0	IEG: S
P074011	ET/Nile Basin Initiative :ET-SU Interconn		2008	2013			41.1	IEG: MS
P074020	ET-Pub Sec Cap Bldg Prj (FY04)		2004	2013			100.0	IEG: S
P076735	ET-Water Sply & Sanitation SIL (FY04)		2004	2014			100.0	IEG: S
P079275	ET- Cap. Building for Agric. Serv (FY06)		2006	2012			54.0	IEG: MU
P082998	ET-Road Sector Dev APL2 under RSDP		2005	2012			160.9	IEG: S
P091077	ET-APL3-RSDP Stage III Proj (FY07)		2007	2015			225.0	IEG: MS
P092353	ET-Irrigation & Drainage SIL (FY07)		2007	2018			100.0	LIR: U
P094704	Financial Sector Cap Bldg. Project		2006	2012			15.0	IEG: S
P096323	ET-Tana &Beles Int. Wat Res Dev Project		2008	2017			45.0	LIR: MS
P097271	ET-Electricity Access (Rural) Expansion		2006	2013			133.4	IEG: MS
P098031	ET-Multi-Sectoral HIV/AIDS II (FY07)		2007	2012			30.0	IEG: MS
P098132	ET-Tourism Develop. Project SIL		2009	2016			35.0	IEG: MS
P101473	ET-Urban WSS SIL FY07)		2007	2018			100.0	LIR: MS



Project ID	Project Name	Proposed FY	Approved FY	Closing FY	Proposed Amount (CPS)	Proposed Amount (CPSPR)	Approved IDA Amount	Outcome Rating
P101474	ET-Urban Local Govt Development (FY08)		2008	2015			150.0	IEG: S
P101556	ET-Elect. Access Rural II SIL (FY07)		2008	2015			130.0	IEG: MU
P103022	ET-Protect. Basic Serv. Phase II (FY09)		2009	2013			540.0	IEG: MS
P106228	ET-Nutrition SIL (FY08)		2008	2014			30.0	IEG: S
P106855	ET-General Educ Quality Improv. (FY09)		2009	2014			50.0	IEG: MS
P106872	ET-RSDP Stage IV APL (FY09)		2009	2017			245.0	LIR: S
P107139	ET-Sustainable Land Mngt SIL (FY08)		2008	2014			20.0	IEG: MS
P108932	ET-Pastoral Community Develpt II (FY08)		2008	2014			80.0	IEG: S
P113032	ET: Agricultural Growth Program		2011	2017			150.0	LIR: MS
P113220	ET Productive Safety Nets (APL III)		2010	2015			480.0	IEG: MS
	Total On-Going				0.0	0.0	3,171.1	

Source: Ethiopia CPS and CPSPR, WB Business Intelligence Table 2b.1, 2a.4 and 2a.7 as of 2/24/17

LIR: Latest internal rating. MU: Moderately Unsatisfactory. MS: Moderately Satisfactory. S: Satisfactory. HS: Highly Satisfactory.

*: Program-for-Results (PforR) project



Annex Table 3: Analytical and Advisory Work for Ethiopia, FY13-FY16

Proj ID	Economic and Sector Work	Fiscal year	Output Type
P068269	ET-Value Chain Analysis	FY13	Not assigned
P111428	ET-Rural Access to Solve Dev. Constraint	FY14	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P117761	ET: Decentralized Service Delivery SP HNP ED	FY14	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P123675	ET: Public Sector Reform Approach	FY13	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P130679	Accountability Issues in Power Sector	FY13	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P132760	Ethiopia Mining Sector Assessment	FY14	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P143203	MTDS Ethiopia	FY13	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P143270	FPD Policy Notes	FY15	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P143477	ET Skills for Competitiveness and Growth	FY15	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P144039	Review of Road Construction Costs	FY15	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P144704	Public Sector Staff Turnover Study	FY15	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P146355	Procurement Value Chain Analysis	FY15	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P146519	Ethiopia Urbanization Review	FY15	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P147357	Ethiopia Poverty Assessment	FY15	Poverty Assessment (PA)
P147500	Sustainability of Growth Model	FY16	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P147915	AML/CFT Assessment of Ethiopia	FY15	AML/CFT Assessment
P147972	ET Urban & Metropolitan Transport Review	FY15	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P148336	Ethiopia PER	FY16	Public Expenditure Review (PER)
P148696	IGFT Study	FY16	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P149510	Ethiopia PEFA 2014 Regional Reports	FY16	Public Expenditure Financial Accountability
P149693	Ethiopia PEFA 2014 - Federal Report	FY16	Public Expenditure Financial Accountability
P149707	Ethiopia PEFA 2014 - Synthesis report	FY16	Public Expenditure Financial Accountability
P153098	Ethiopia Health Financing	FY16	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P154767	Innovation Policy Note	FY16	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P155912	Review of education sector financing	FY16	Public Expenditure Review (PER)
P155913	Quality of education	FY16	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P155996	Health Equity: Reaching the bottom 40%	FY16	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P156813	Strengthening Urban Resilience Ethiopia	FY16	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
Proj ID	Technical Assistance	Fiscal year	Output Type
P099439	ET-Poverty and Migration	FY13	Technical Assistance
P116863	ET: GEQIP Student Assessment Phase 1&2	FY15	Technical Assistance
P118736	Insurance for High-Value Livestock in ET	FY13	Technical Assistance
P123637	ET-Gender & Impact Evaluation (FY14)	FY15	Technical Assistance
P123906	Ethiopia - ICT for Transformation	FY14	Technical Assistance
P127362	Ethiopia: EITI Implementation Support	FY14	Technical Assistance
P128935	ET-Sustainable Groundwater Devel	FY15	Technical Assistance
P129047	ET: TA for Land Administration	FY15	Technical Assistance
P129163	ET: Competitiveness and Job Creation	FY14	Technical Assistance



P129963	ET Support to Social Protection Strategy	FY14	Technical Assistance
P130424	Ethiopia #10108 Reg	FY14	Technical Assistance
P130993	Ethiopia Statistics for Results Project	FY14	Technical Assistance
P132042	Ethiopia #10279 Cheque Standard. Project	FY14	Technical Assistance
P132078	Building Capacity for Sanitation	FY16	Technical Assistance
P132079	Performance Monitoring for Sanitation	FY15	Technical Assistance
P132093	CFL and Incandescent Lamp recycling	FY15	Technical Assistance
P132844	ET CHYAO	FY14	Technical Assistance
P133472	Expanding rural ICT access in Ethiopia	FY14	Technical Assistance
P143359	Implementation of AML/CFT Proclamation	FY15	Technical Assistance
P143838	Et-International Health Partnerships Pro	FY14	Technical Assistance
P144864	Public Sector Capacity Building Facility	FY15	Technical Assistance
P145643	ET-Analysis of Urban LG Fiscal Position	FY15	Technical Assistance
P147742	Ethiopia TA for UHC	FY15	Technical Assistance
P147787	Ethiopia Debt Management Reform Plan	FY14	Technical Assistance
P148208	Ethiopia Gender, Agriculture and Entrepr	FY16	Technical Assistance
P149104	Ethiopia#A038 Improving eff of Pay. Sys	FY16	Technical Assistance
P149520	Service Delivery and Impact	FY15	Technical Assistance
P151586	Ethiopia: CSO Support	FY16	Technical Assistance
P151905	Capacity Building on Procurement Audit	FY16	Technical Assistance
P155853	Equity Impact of Block Grants	FY16	Technical Assistance
P155854	Health Equity-Child Nutrition	FY16	Technical Assistance
P156145	Support to poverty measurement	FY16	Technical Assistance
P156228	Capacity Building Needs Asst of FEAC	FY16	Technical Assistance
P156229	Training Support to FEACC and REACCs	FY15	Technical Assistance
P159432	Evaluation of MDG Specific Purpose Grant	FY16	Technical Assistance
P159915	External Audit Firms Assessment	FY16	Technical Assistance

Source: WB Business Intelligence 02/24/17



Annex Table 4: Ethiopia Grants and Trust Funds Active in FY13-16

Project ID	Project name	TF ID	Approval FY	Closing FY	Approved Amount	Outcome Rating
P155563	ENREP ADDITIONAL FINANCING	TF A2302	2016	2018	5,000,000	
P156400	Ethiopia: Supporting Open Data Initiative	TF A1329	2016	2018	300,000	
P146883	ET Productive Safety Nets Project 4 (PSNP 4)	TF A3267	2015	2021	1,388,981	
P146883	ET Productive Safety Nets Project 4 (PSNP 4)	TF A1426	2015	2021	77,684,381	LIR: MS
P116455	Ethiopia: Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative Implementation	TF 18161	2015	2018	600,000	
P133613	Ethiopia Geothermal Sector Development Project	TF 17206	2014	2020	24,500,000	LIR: U
P147356	Ethiopia Statistics for Results Project	TF 17115	2014	2017	10,000,000	LIR: MS
P133410	Sustainable Land Management Project	TF 15868	2014	2019	8,333,000	LIR: MS
P133410	Sustainable Land Management Project	TF 15869	2014	2019	4,629,000	
P133133	Sustainable Land Management Project-II	TF 15838	2014	2019	40,000,000	LIR: MS
P129828	Ethiopia General Education Quality Improvement Project II	TF 18053	2015	2019	184,550,772	LIR: MS
P129828	Ethiopia General Education Quality Improvement Project II	TF 16684	2014	2018	100,000,000	LIR: MS
P130142	Ethiopia Climate Innovation Center	TF 14509	2014	2018	5,000,000	NR
P123531	Ethiopia Health MDG Support Operation	TF 14815	2014	2018	400,000	
P123531	Ethiopia Health MDG Support Operation	TF 14107	2013	2018	20,000,000	LIR: S
P128891	Ethiopia Promoting Basic Services Program Phase III Project	TF 13952	2013	2019	615,743,000	LIR: S
P122764	Women Entrepreneurship Development Project	TF 16392	2014	2018	5,171,692	LIR: S
P129534	Ethiopia Protection of Basic Services Social Accountability Program	TF 99878	2012	2017	29,032,899	LIR: S
P129151	Ethiopia Disaster Risk Management Country Plan Project, Phase I	TF 11209	2012	2015	1,275,000	
P127507	Agricultural Growth Project - Additional Financing	TF 11306	2012	2016	50,000,000	IEG: MS
P125487	Ethiopia: Support to Artisan Miners (JSDF)	TF 98807	2012	2017	2,865,050	
P125475	LSMS-ISA Ethiopia Rural Socioeconomic Survey	TF 98979	2011	2016	1,832,356	
P119064	Ethiopian Diaspora Health and Education Professionals Mobilization Project	TF 99283	2011	2013	640,000	
P121226	Strengthening Capacity for Mobilizing and Engaging the Ethiopian Diaspora	TF 98159	2011	2014	485,735	
P121863	Support to Accountancy Profession in Ethiopia	TF 98157	2011	2014	499,800	
P113032	ET: Agricultural Growth Program	TF 99729	2012	2016	56,200,000	LIR: MS
P120040	BEIA-Promotion of Ethanol Micro-Distilleries in Ethiopia	TF 96664	2011	2014	148,000	
P118700	EFA FTI CF Grant 2 - GEQIP APL 1	TF 97263	2011	2014	98,000,000	IEG: MS
P121010	Innovative Pilot Scheme Would Match Seeds to the Needs of Women Farmers	TF 96713	2010	2013	200,000	
P113220	Productive Safety Net APL III	TF 17669	2015	2015	79,055,471	IEG: MS
P113220	Productive Safety Net APL III	TF 11173	2012	2015	8,508,090	IEG: MS
P113220	Productive Safety Net APL III	TF 99450	2011	2015	122,181,697	IEG: MS
P124074	Ethiopia-FCPF REDD READINESS	TF A2005	2016	2018	6,266,817	NR



Project ID	Project name	TF ID	Approval FY	Closing FY	Approved Amount	Outcome Rating
P124074	Ethiopia-FCPF REDD READINESS	TF 17284	2014	2018	10,000,000	NR
P124074	Ethiopia-FCPF REDD READINESS	TF 13450	2013	2016	3,600,000	
P106855	General Education Quality Improvement Project - APL 1 (GEQIP)	TF 94224	2010	2014	218,000,000	IEG: MS
P106855	General Education Quality Improvement Project - APL 1 (GEQIP)	TF 93227	2009	2014	70,000,000	IEG: MS
P105651	Ethiopia Electricity Access Rural Expansion Project, Phase II - GPOBA	TF 92601	2009	2013	1,800,000	
P105651	Ethiopia Electricity Access Rural Expansion Project, Phase II - GPOBA	TF 92600	2009	2013	6,200,000	IEG: MU
P103022	Ethiopia Protection of Basic Services Program Phase II Project	TF 12730	2013	2013	67,582,623	IEG: MS
P103022	Ethiopia Protection of Basic Services Program Phase II Project	TF 97831	2012	2013	6,262,129	IEG: MS
P103022	Ethiopia Protection of Basic Services Program Phase II Project	TF 97830	2012	2013	863,742	
P103022	Ethiopia Protection of Basic Services Program Phase II Project	TF 95106	2010	2013	36,996,764	IEG: MS
P090789	ET-Sustainable Land Management Program (FY08)	TF 92320	2009	2014	9,000,000	NR
P096323	Tana & Beles Integrated Water Resources Development	TF 95045	2010	2015	3,484,679	
P106228	Ethiopia Nutrition (FY08)	TF 10247	2012	2013	650,000	
P106228	Ethiopia Nutrition (FY08)	TF 93946	2009	2014	1,810,434	
P076735	Ethiopia Water Supply and Sanitation Project	TF 91704	2008	2014	111,675,531	IEG: S
Total					2,108,417,643	

Source: Client Connection as of 02/27/17

* IEG Validates RETF that are 5M and above

** NR: No rating - ISR not available



Annex Table 5: IEG Project Ratings for Ethiopia, FY13-16

Exit FY	Proj ID	Project name	Total Evaluated (\$M)	IEG Outcome	IEG Risk to DO
2013	P049395	ET-Energy Access SIL (FY03)	163.3	UNSATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2013	P050272	Priv Sec Dev CB	15.4	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2013	P074011	ET/Nile Basin Initiative:ET-SU Interconn	39.3	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	NEGLIGIBLE TO LOW
2013	P074020	ET-Pub Sec Cap Bldg Prj (FY04)	130.9	SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2013	P097271	ET-Electricity Access (Rural) Expansion	111.8	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2013	P103022	ET-Protect. Basic Serv. Phase II (FY09)	981.4	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2013	P105651	GPOBA W3: Ethiopia Rural Elect Expn, Ph2	0.0	UNSATISFACTORY	HIGH
2014	P076735	ET-Water Sply & Sanitation SIL (FY04)	169.5	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2014	P106228	ET-Nutrition SIL (FY08)	26.7	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2014	P106855	ET-General Educ Quality Improv. (FY09)	51.0	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2014	P107139	ET-Sustainable Land Mngt SIL (FY08)	17.8	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
2014	P108932	ET-Pastoral Community Develpt II (FY08)	74.4	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2015	P091077	ET-APL3-RSDP Stage III Proj (FY07)	228.2	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT
2015	P101474	ET-Urban Local Govt Development (FY08)	288.1	SATISFACTORY	NEGLIGIBLE TO LOW
2016	P098132	ET-Tourism Develop. Project SIL	34.8	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	MODERATE
Total			2,332.4		

Source: AO Key IEG Ratings as of 02/24/17

Annex Table 6: IEG Project Ratings for Ethiopia and Comparators, FY13-16

Region	Total Evaluated (\$M)	Total Evaluated (No)	Outcome % Sat (\$)	Outcome % Sat (No)	RDO % Moderate or Lower Sat (\$)	RDO % Moderate or Lower Sat (No)
Ethiopia	2,332.4	15	88.2	80.0	65.8	53.3
AFR	13,361.9	275	78.9	68.8	36.8	32.6
World	73,278.0	898	84.9	71.5	58.8	44.8

Source: WB AO as of 02/24/17

* With IEG new methodology for evaluating projects, institutional development impact and sustainability are no longer rated separately.



Annex Table 7: Portfolio Status for Ethiopia and Comparators, FY13-16

Fiscal year	2013	2014	2015	2016	Ave FY13-16
Ethiopia					
# Proj	24	26	25	29	26
# Proj At Risk	6	5	4	4	5
% Proj At Risk	25.0	19.2	16.0	13.8	18.5
Net Comm Amt	4,260.8	5,442.2	5,209.9	6,863.2	5,444
Comm At Risk	830.0	677.9	560.0	581.4	662
% Commit at Risk	19.5	12.5	10.7	8.5	12.8
AFR					
# Proj	566	620	643	659	622
# Proj At Risk	128	138	136	144	137
% Proj At Risk	22.6	22.3	21.2	21.9	22.0
Net Comm Amt	42,649.1	49,142.6	54,586.3	59,033.9	51,353
Comm At Risk	14,310.8	16,548.2	16,000.3	18,949.8	16,452
% Commit at Risk	33.6	33.7	29.3	32.1	32.2
World					
# Proj	1,964	2,048	2,022	1,975	2,002
# Proj At Risk	414	412	444	422	423
% Proj At Risk	21.1	20.1	22.0	21.4	21.1
Net Comm Amt	176,202.6	192,610.1	201,045.2	220,331.5	197,547
Comm At Risk	40,805.6	40,933.5	45,987.7	44,244.9	42,993
% Commit at Risk	23.2	21.3	22.9	20.1	21.8

Source: WB BI as of 02/27/17



Annex Table 8: Disbursement Ratio for Ethiopia, FY13-16

Fiscal Year	2013	2014	2015	2016	Overall Result
Ethiopia					
Disbursement Ratio (%)	39.1	42.5	24.2	27.1	32.7
Inv Disb in FY	884.9	943.5	559.4	805.8	3,193.7
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY	2,263.4	2,217.9	2,310.8	2,969.6	9,761.7
AFR					
Disbursement Ratio (%)	22.5	23.1	24.5	19.6	22.4
Inv Disb in FY	5,652.1	6,143.9	6,473.2	5,572.5	23,841.8
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY	25,175.9	26,540.4	26,463.6	28,377.1	106,557.0
World					
Disbursement Ratio (%)	20.6	20.8	21.8	19.5	20.6
Inv Disb in FY	20,510.7	20,757.7	21,853.7	21,152.9	84,275.0
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY	99,588.3	99,854.3	100,344.9	108,600.3	408,387.7

* Calculated as IBRD/IDA Disbursements in FY / Opening Undisbursed Amount at FY. Restricted to Lending Instrument Type = Investment.
AO disbursement ratio table as of 05/10/17

Annex Table 9: Net Disbursement and Charges for Ethiopia, FY13-16

Period	Disb. Amt.	Repay Amt.	Net Amt.	Charges	Fees	Net Transfer
FY13	889,748,726.5	12,034,096.7	877,714,629.7	-	19,872,509.4	857,842,120.4
FY14	923,545,873.6	12,629,233.6	910,916,640.1	-	25,993,287.0	884,923,353.0
FY15	744,234,563.2	18,787,859.8	725,446,703.4	-	29,609,903.8	695,836,799.7
FY16	1,103,218,287.5	18,527,658.3	1,084,690,629.2	-	35,024,776.1	1,049,665,853.1
Report Total	3,660,747,450.8	61,978,848.4	3,598,768,602.4	-	110,500,476.3	3,488,268,126.2

World Bank Client Connection 02/28/17



Annex Table 10: Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid

Development Partners	2013	2014	2015
Australia	12.77	9.94	4.69
Austria	10.79	9.67	9.52
Belgium	2.54	3.36	2.12
Canada	125.17	108.12	119.57
Czech Republic	3.46	3.72	3.79
Denmark	12.21	16.64	7.17
Finland	20.95	40.89	29.52
France	46.84	52.41	16.77
Germany	87.39	58.34	57.62
Greece	0.09	0.09	0.08
Iceland	0.21	0.42	0.45
Ireland	45.79	48.27	44.86
Italy	-18.31	10.63	22.21
Japan	140.69	82.77	60.58
Korea	28.58	42.91	48.41
Luxembourg	0.78	0.88	0.69
Netherlands	77.19	89.95	95.98
New Zealand	0.04	0.21	0.28
Norway	57.24	60.06	62.47
Poland	0.27	23.48	32.55
Portugal	0.04	0.05	0.05
Slovak Republic	0.02	0.02	0.01
Spain	8.18	7.96	8.26
Sweden	28.71	35.21	41.29
Switzerland	10.01	14.21	21.01
United Kingdom	551.46	529.72	551.37
United States	690.21	664.84	738.95
DAC Countries, Total	1943.33	1914.77	1980.28
EU Institutions	121.67	267.85	183.64
International Monetary Fund, Total	..	-5.08	-39.62
IMF (Concessional Trust Funds)	..	-5.08	-39.62
Regional Development Banks, Total	349.64	173.18	164.73
African Development Bank, Total	349.64	173.18	164.73
African Development Bank [AfDB]	1.45	..	0.44
African Development Fund [AFDF]	348.18	173.18	164.29
United Nations, Total	145.23	124.75	125.03
Food and Agriculture Organisation [FAO]	0.37
International Atomic Energy Agency [IAEA]	1.21	0.86	0.74



Development Partners	2013	2014	2015
IFAD	55.36	31.53	25.5
International Labour Organisation [ILO]	0.48	0.33	0.49
UNAIDS	1.76	1.26	0.98
UNDP	13.91	15.17	12.62
UNFPA	5.74	6.53	7.95
UNICEF	44.03	40.22	45.9
WFP	18.98	26.49	26.72
World Health Organisation [WHO]	3.39	2.37	4.13
World Bank Group	958.65	877.44	770.88
World Bank, Total	958.65	877.44	770.88
International Development Association [IDA]	958.65	877.44	770.88
Multilateral, Total	1969.32	1660.3	1537.52
Arab Bank for Economic Development in Africa [BADEA]	4.84	1.55	3.49
Climate Investment Funds [CIF]	0.23
Global Alliance for Vaccines and Immunization [GAVI]	108.44	114.45	150.03
Global Environment Facility [GEF]	6.35	6.93	7.73
Global Fund	272.72	101.4	170.31
Global Green Growth Institute [GGGI]	2.39	1.78	..
Nordic Development Fund [NDF]	-0.63	-0.74	-0.74
OPEC Fund for International Development [OFID]	0.02	-3.23	1.81
Other Multilateral, Total	394.14	222.15	332.85
Estonia	0.01	0.02	0.12
Hungary	0.13	0.03	0.07
Israel	0.79	0.35	0.14
Kuwait (KFAED)	3.44	3.09	6.71
Malta	..	0.05	0.04
Romania	..	0	0.01
Russia	2.65	..	0.27
Thailand	0.02	0.04	0.03
Turkey	2.81	3.65	0.82
United Arab Emirates	0.04	2.42	2.51
Non-DAC Countries, Total	9.89	9.66	10.72
Development Partners Total	3922.55	3584.72	3528.51

Source: OECD Stat, [DAC2a] as of 02/27/17

Annex Table 11: Economic and Social Indicators for Ethiopia, 2012 – 2015

Series Name					Ethiopia	AFR	World
	2012	2013	2014	2015	Average 2012-2015		
Growth and Inflation							
GDP growth (annual %)	8.6	10.6	10.3	9.6	9.8	4.0	2.6
GDP per capita growth (annual %)	5.9	7.8	7.5	6.9	7.0	1.2	1.4
GNI per capita, PPP (current international \$)	1,250.0	1,370.0	1,500.0	1,620.0	1,435.0	3,407.1	14,878.1
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$) (Millions)	410.0	470.0	550.0	590.0	505.0	1,669.2	10,672.7
Inflation, consumer prices (annual %)	22.8	8.1	7.4	10.1	12.1	4.8	2.7
Composition of GDP (%)							
Agriculture, value added (% of GDP)	48.0	44.9	41.9	41.0	43.9	17.8	3.9
Industry, value added (% of GDP)	10.3	11.9	14.7	16.3	13.3	25.8	28.1
Services, etc., value added (% of GDP)	41.8	43.2	43.4	42.8	42.8	56.1	67.9
Gross fixed capital formation (% of GDP)	37.1	34.1	38.0	39.3	37.1	20.5	23.3
Gross domestic savings (% of GDP)	19.2	17.6	20.5	21.8	19.8	18.4	24.5
External Accounts							
Exports of goods and services (% of GDP)	13.8	12.5	11.6	9.8	11.9	28.6	30.2
Imports of goods and services (% of GDP)	31.6	29.0	29.1	27.3	29.3	31.3	29.6
Current account balance (% of GDP)	(6.9)	-6.9		
External debt stocks (% of GNI)	24.2	26.4	29.9	33.3	28.5		
Total debt service (% of GNI)	1.0	1.4	1.4	1.7	1.4	1.8	
Total reserves in months of imports		4.9	13.2
Fiscal Accounts ¹							
General government revenue (% of GDP)	15.9	15.2	15.4	15.4	15.5		
General government total expenditure (% of GDP)	17.1	18.2	17.7	17.5	17.6		
General government net lending/borrowing (% of GDP)	(1.2)	(3.0)	(2.3)	(2.1)	-2.1		

Series Name					Ethiopia	AFR	World
	2012	2013	2014	2015	Average 2012-2015		
General government gross debt (% of GDP)	21.6	23.0	23.8	24.0	23.1		
Health							
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	62.8	63.4	64.0	..	63.4	58.1	71.2
Immunization, DPT (% of children ages 12-23 months)	69.0	72.0	77.0	86.0	76.0	73.5	85.3
Improved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)	24.3	25.5	26.8	28.0	26.2	29.2	66.7
Improved water source (% of population with access)	42.7	44.7	46.7	48.6	45.7	54.5	83.4
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	46.2	44.5	42.9	41.4	43.8	58.9	33.2
Education							
School enrollment, preprimary (% gross)	17.6	..	25.1	..	21.3	20.6	43.0
School enrollment, primary (% gross)	94.8	..	100.1	..	97.5	98.0	105.2
School enrollment, secondary (% gross)	36.2	36.2	42.2	74.7
Population							
Population, total	92,191,211	94,558,374	96,958,732	99,390,750	95,774,767	961,632,590	7,218,239,265
Population growth (annual %)	2.6	2.5	2.5	2.5	2.5	2.8	1.2
Urban population (% of total)	18.2	18.6	19.0	19.5	18.8	37.0	53.2

Source: DDP as of 02/27/17

*International Monetary Fund, World Economic Outlook Database, November 2016



Annex Table 12: List of IFC Investments in Ethiopia (US\$,000)
Investments Committed in FY13-FY16

Project ID	Cmt FY	Project Status	Primary Sector Name	Project Size	Net Loan	Net Equity	Net Comm
36565	2016	Active	Finance & Insurance	375,000	35,000	-	35,000
33201	2015	Active	Accommodation & Tourism Services	37,720	9,430	-	9,430
35023	2015	Closed	Agriculture and Forestry	9,012	8,976	-	8,976
35938	2015	Active	Agriculture and Forestry	96,660	55,848	-	55,848
33523	2014	Active	Food & Beverages	6,000		3,000	3,000
32846	2014	Closed	Finance & Insurance	75,000	45,000	-	45,000
Sub-Total				599,392	154,254	3,000	157,254

Investments Committed pre-FY12 but active during FY13-16

Project ID	CMT FY	Project Status	Primary Sector Name	Project Size	Net Loan	Net Equity	Net Comm
32023	2012	Closed	Oil, Gas and Mining	1,303		1,058	1,058
32433	2012	Closed	Oil, Gas and Mining	2,021		2,021	2,021
29979	2011	Closed	Oil, Gas and Mining	17,905		10,532	10,532
29228	2011	Closed	Agriculture and Forestry	10,000	3,655		3,655
29440	2010	Closed	Oil, Gas and Mining	15,635		14,433	14,433
26410	2008	Active	Nonmetallic Mineral Product Manufacturing	351,000	55,000	-	55,000
Sub-Total				397,864	58,655	28,044	86,700
TOTAL				997,257	212,910	31,044	243,954

Source: IFC-MIS Extract as of end 1/31/17



Annex Table 13: List of IFC Advisory Services in Ethiopia (US\$)
Advisory Services Approved in FY13-16

Project ID	Project Name	Impl Start FY	Impl End FY	Project Status	Primary Business Line	Total Funds, US\$
601053	Ethiopia - Livestock - MIRA	2016	2020	ACTIVE	TAC	2,100,000
601522	Secured Transactions & Collateral Registries Ethiopia	2016	2019	ACTIVE	FAM	462,318
600201	Lighting Africa Ethiopia	2015	2018	ACTIVE	CAS	2,921,328
600316	Ethiopia Investment Policy	2015	2017	ACTIVE	TAC	1,800,000
600666	Sub Saharan Africa Credit Bureau African Countries Consolidated	2015	2018	ACTIVE	FAM	510,000
600108	Ethiopian Geothermal Advisory Services	2014	2016	CLOSED	CAS	1,443,718
599466	Ethiopia IC: Trade Logistics Project	2013	2017	ACTIVE	TAC	1,900,000
599467	Ethiopia IC: Business Taxation Project	2013	2017	ACTIVE	TAC	1,140,000
599468	Ethiopia IC: Business Regulation	2013	2017	ACTIVE	TAC	1,580,000
Sub-Total						13,857,364

Advisory Services Approved pre-FY12 but active during FY13-16

Project ID	Project Name	Impl Start FY	Impl End FY	Project Status	Primary Business Line	Total Funds, US\$
553065	Ethiopia Business Forum	2011	2016	CLOSED	TAC	1,084,206
582987	Ethiopia CIC Project	2011	2013	CLOSED	IC	202,653
570287	Access to Finance for Producers/Farmers	2009	2014	CLOSED	A2F	1,142,037
Sub-Total						2,428,896
TOTAL						16,286,260

Source: IFC AS Data as of 3/15/17



Annex Table 14: IFC net commitment activity in Ethiopia, FY12 - FY16 (US\$, 000)

	Pre FY-13	2013	2014	2015	2016	Total	Percentages
Financial Markets		-	45,000	-	35,000	80,000	32.8%
Agribusiness & Forestry	3,655	-		64,824		68,480	28.1%
Packaged Food & Beverages		-	3,000		-	3,000	1.2%
Other MAS Sectors	55,000	-				55,000	22.5%
Tourism, Retail, Construction & Real Estates (TRP)		-	-	9,430	-	9,430	3.9%
Oil, Gas & Mining	28,044					28,044	11.5%
Total	86,700	-	48,000	74,254	35,000	243,954	100.0%

Source: IFC MIS as of 4/4/17

Annex Table 15: List of Active MIGA Activities in Ethiopia, 2013-2016 (US\$, millions)

ID	Contract Enterprise	FY	Project Status	Sector	Investor	Max Gross Issuance
7879	Africa Juice Tibila Share Company, Ethiopia	2015	Active	Agribusiness	South Africa	1.1
9334	National Cement Share Company	2011	Active	Manufacturing	Virgin Islands (British)	4.0
7879	Africa Juice Tibila Share Company	2010	Active	Agribusiness	Netherlands - South Africa	10.0
					Total	15.1

Source: MIGA 4/3/17