



1. CAS/CPS Data	
Country: Niger	
CAS/CPS Year: FY13	CAS/CPS Period: FY13 – FY16
CLR Period: FY13 – FY16	Date of this review: March 28, 2018

2. Ratings		
	CLR Rating	IEG Rating
Development Outcome:	<i>Moderately Satisfactory</i>	<i>Moderately Satisfactory</i>
WBG Performance:	<i>Good</i>	<i>Good</i>

3. Executive Summary

i. This review of Niger’s Completion Report of the World Bank Group’s (WBG) Country Partnership Strategy (CPS) covers the period of the original CPS, FY13-16, and the Performance and Learning Review (PLR) of the CPS.

ii. Niger is a landlocked and sparsely populated country in the Sahel region of Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA), with significant deposits of uranium, gold, coal, and petroleum. Given its reliance on mining and oil exports, the country is exposed to external economic shocks directly and indirectly through the impact on its main trading partner, Nigeria. During the CPS period, GDP grew at a yearly average of 5.2 percent and its population at 3.9 percent. The country’s average GNI income per capita was \$395, considerably well below the SSA average of \$1,642. The deterioration in the primary budget deficit led to an increase in the public debt over GDP driven by an ambitious public investment program. Poverty incidence declined from 53.7 percent in 2005 to 44.5 percent in 2014, but remained stagnant in rural areas at 51.4 percent, while it dropped to 8.7 percent in the capital city and other urban areas. The 2016 UNDP Human Development Index (HDI) and the Gender Inequality Index ranked Niger amongst the lowest in the world-- 187 out of 188 and 157 out of 159 countries, respectively. Niger has suffered from conflict in neighboring countries. Niger hosts around 340,000 refugees and internally displaced persons. Climate change is affecting (rain-fed) agriculture -- the source of income for most of its population.

iii. After a military coup in 2010, the new government elected in 2011 issued a Plan for Social and Economic Development (PDES) which identified five programmatic areas: (i) strengthening the credibility and efficiency of public institutions; (ii) creating the conditions for inclusive, sustainable and balanced development; (iii) food security and sustainable agricultural development; (iv) competitive and diversified economy for accelerated, inclusive growth; and (v) promotion of social development. The government envisaged rapid economic growth, high levels of public investment, and greater connection to the external world. The CPS, discussed by the WBG Board in March 29, 2013, was organized around two main pillars or focus areas: (a) promoting resilient growth and (b) reducing vulnerability and a cross-sectional pillar focused on governance and gender mainstreaming. The CPS had 11 objectives that were to address the critical challenges in the country. The Performance and Learning Review (PLR), discussed on May 29, 2015, retained the CPS structure, while introducing adjustments to take account of the implementation pace.

CLR Reviewed by: Luis Alvaro Sanchez Consultant, IEGEC Takatoshi Kamezawa, Senior Evaluation Officer, IEGEC	Panel Reviewed by: Lev Freinkman Consultant, IEGEC	CLR Review Manager/Coordinator: Pablo Fajnzylber Manager, IEGEC Lourdes Pagaran Senior Evaluation Officer, IEGEC
--	---	---



iv. IEG rates the achievement of the CPS objectives as **Moderately Satisfactory**. Six out of eleven objectives were either achieved or mostly achieved. Delivery on CPS objectives was strong under the second focus area of reducing vulnerability. The number of poor and food insecure people covered by safety nets has increased; primary education completion rates have improved; more people in urban areas have access to water and sanitation services; and, more agricultural and silvo-pastoral areas have adopted sustainable land management practices in selected communes and local communities have incorporated climate resilience in their local development plans. The business environment has improved as evidenced by the number of registered enterprises and the country's improved ranking in the 2018 Doing Business Report, yet there are remaining challenges. In addition, progress has been made in increasing productivity for selected agricultural crops. However, there was limited progress in fiscal consolidation and access to finance, as well as in transparency of budget outcomes. Niger's withdrawal from the EITI is a concern.

v. On balance, IEG rates WBG performance as **Good**. The CPS objectives were relevant to the country context, aligned with the Government Program and the corporate twin goals, and consistent with the comparative advantage of the WBG in the country. The program was ambitious relative to the limited country capacity and the multitude of risks the country was facing, which were well identified in the CPS. IDA's financial support for Niger increased significantly compared to the previous CPS. The ASA program was focused and substantive, and supportive of new operations and the delivery of several CPS objectives. However, portfolio performance at exit as measured by IEG's outcome rating of Moderately Satisfactory or better was well below the SSA and Bank-wide average. The risks to the sustainability of outcomes were significant to high, reflecting the underlying fragile environment. To manage the impact of the continued state of conflict in the neighboring countries, the Bank demonstrated flexibility during project implementation by tapping third parties, including Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) and Monitoring agencies, to help with project supervision. The Bank also mainstreamed a large contingency component in Investment Project Financing (IPF) operations although there is no information on whether this facility was used during the CPS period. The Bank worked closely with Development Partners in critical areas through various modalities including co-financing in areas such as education. However, opportunities for internal WBG cooperation were few. Compliance with safeguards and fiduciary requirements appears strong. The main challenge has been the construction of the dam at Kandadji. The mid-term corrections at the PLR stage were minimal. With hindsight, a more thorough stock taking could have contributed to a sharpening of the results framework.

vi. IEG concurs with the lessons in the CLR. IEG adds three additional lessons.

- Institutional reforms would need to be more selective and sequenced and underpinned by a keen understanding of priorities in the context of weak capacity and high-risk environment. In the case of Niger, the institutional reforms were ambitious and broad as in the case of objective 1 (fiscal consolidation) in an environment deeply affected by external shocks (drop in export prices) and internal challenges (difficult political economy and low capacity).
- In a fragile environment, the Bank's flexibility is critical to ensure continued and effective program implementation. In the case of Niger, the Bank demonstrated flexibility during implementation by contracting third parties to help with project supervision. In following a flexible approach, the challenge is to build capacity to monitor contracts with third parties and to formalize and standardize the approach to facilitate scaling it up.
- The effectiveness of Bank interventions in fragile environments is enhanced through working with other development partners and in partnership with local communities and established NGOs to mobilize resources, deepen knowledge of local circumstances and facilitate implementation. In Niger, the Bank has successfully worked with other development partners through co-financing and to deliver results in education, food security, managing climate change and extending coverage of safety nets. The



community and NGO engagements have been critical to the successful delivery of results in HIV/AIDS, climate change and food security.

4. Strategic Focus

Relevance of the WBG Strategy:

1. **Congruence with Country Context and Country Program.** Niger is a landlocked and sparsely populated country in the Sahel region of Sub-Saharan Africa. Most of the 19.9 million inhabitants¹ live in the south of the country where most arable land is located. Niger has significant deposits of uranium, gold, coal, and petroleum. During the CPS period (2013-2016), GDP grew at a yearly average of 5.2 and population at 3.9 percent. Poverty incidence declined from 53.7 percent in 2005 to 44.5 percent in 2014; rural poverty, at 51.4 percent, was far higher than in the capital city and in other urban areas, at 8.7 percent. The 2016 UNDP Human Development Index (HDI) and the Gender Inequality Index ranked Niger at 187 out of 188 countries, and 157 of 159 countries, respectively. Niger hosts around 340,000 refugees and internally displaced persons. Most the population generates its income from rain-fed agriculture and livestock rearing and are vulnerable to climatic hazards and climate change. The country is also exposed to external economic shocks given its reliance on mining and oil exports and on Nigeria, its main economic partner.

2. After a military coup in 2010, and following elections in 2011 brought a new government that, in 2012, issued a Plan for Social and Economic Development (PDES), the country's poverty reduction strategy. The PDES targeted 11 strategic results and identified 86 programs, clustered in five programmatic areas: (i) strengthening the credibility and efficiency of public institutions; (ii) creating the conditions for inclusive, sustainable and balanced development; (iii) food security and sustainable agricultural development; (iv) competitive and diversified economy for accelerated, inclusive growth; and (v) promotion of social development. The government envisaged rapid economic growth, high public investment, and greater connection to the global economy.

3. The WBG CPS was discussed at the Board in March 29, 2013. The CPS objectives were organized around three pillars: (a) promoting resilient growth and (b) reducing vulnerability. The third pillar was a cross-cutting theme on governance and gender mainstreaming. Under these three pillars were 11 CPS objectives. The Performance and Learning Review (PLR) discussed with the Board on May 29, 2015 retained the CPS structure while introducing adjustments to reflect the pace of implementation.

4. **Relevance of Design.** The CPS objectives were aligned with Niger's development objectives. They were well-grounded on analytical work and anchored on a program that reflected the comparative advantage of the WBG. The objectives were supported by relevant WBG operations and ASA products. The WBG also worked closely with other development partners that provided related funding and technical assistance to the government directly or through co-financing. In a few cases, the instruments to support the objectives and deliver results were not well identified in the CPS, as in the case of SMEs and improving trade infrastructure. Several objectives, such as on fiscal consolidation, were pitched at a high level and were not aligned with WBG's interventions. Finally, some important activities under the WBG's country program were not captured and linked to the CPS objectives. For instance, the work around the Niger Basin Water Resources Development (i.e. the Kandadji Initiative) was not reflected in the results framework.

Selectivity

5. Overall, the CPS program was not selective enough when considering the ambitious agenda and the internal and external challenges to implement it. The eleven objectives and the twenty-two targets/indicators were to be delivered in a low capacity, conflict environment. Policy design and reform coordination at the central government was weak, which was further aggravated by low capacity at the sector ministries and agencies and the local governments.

¹ World Development Indicators, 2015



Alignment

6. The CPS program was well aligned with the WBG corporate goals. Interventions that were directly focused on the poor included the work on safety nets, agricultural productivity, and climate change resilience. The interventions on water, sanitation and health education and skills were also aligned with the twin goals and were both relevant for poverty reduction and inclusion. The interventions on fiscal consolidation, improving the business environment and improving trade infrastructure sought to create an enabling environment for business and job creation and were critical to both shared prosperity and poverty reduction.

5. Development Outcome

Overview of Achievement by Objective:

7. The assessment of CPS objectives is based on the updated program presented at the Progress and Learning Review (PLR) stage.

Focus Area I: Promoting Resilient Growth

8. **Objective 1: Fiscal Performance consolidated.** This objective was supported by Shared Growth Credit DPO Series – Credits I, II, III (FY12, FY13, FY14); Reform Management and Technical Assistance Project (FY10); Debt Management Performance Assessment (DeMPA) (FY14); and PEMFAR Update (FY14). This objective had two outcomes and associated indicators.

- Efficiency of tax and customs collections has improved. This outcome was to be measured by PEFA indicator 15 (PEFA-15) on the efficacy in collecting taxes and customs contributions, which was to improve from D+ (2013) to C (2016). PEFA-15 remained at D+, per the 2016 PEFA Report. Although taxes and customs were transferred relatively promptly to the treasury, a substantial amount of revenue arrears remained as full consolidation of the tax and customs accounts materialized only at the end of the year. Recent progress has been made in improving customs valuations. Since July 2017, a transaction-price valuation of imports for border tax purposes was introduced, backed by the newly adopted ASYCUDA software and a dedicated valuation unit, resulting in valuations substantially higher than previously applied. These recent gains notwithstanding, the outcome target was not achieved.
- Treasury and debt management has improved. This outcome was to be measured by PEFA indicator 17 (PEFA-17) on monitoring and management of cash balances, debts and guarantees, which was to improve from C (2012) to B (2016.) The rating remained at C per the PEFA 2016 Report. Niger has yet to implement a Single Treasury Account, which could realize major improvements in cash management. This outcome target was not achieved.
- In sum, the two outcome indicators did not fully capture the objective of fiscal consolidation. The February 2017 IMF Niger Ex-Post Assessment for the 2012-2016 Extended Credit Facility (ECF) noted a deterioration in the fiscal stance² and pointed to several factors as drivers of fiscal deterioration including exogenous shocks, repeated underperformance of revenue, short-falls in external financing, and the failure of the government to adjust spending in response to the shocks. Given the lack of progress in

² The basic fiscal deficit (revenues minus expenditures net of externally financed capital expenditure) increased from 2.1 percent of GDP in 2013 to 6.4 percent in 2014, 7.5 percent in 2015 to then drop to 4.2 percent in 2016. The gross public debt rose from 26.9 percent of GDP in 2012 to 46.3 percent in 2016. Source: 2016 Article IV Consultation and Request for a Three-year Arrangement under the Extended Credit Facility, February 2017. IMF Country Report No. 17/59.



selected PEFA indicators, and limited progress towards broader fiscal consolidation. Objective 1 was *Not Achieved*.

9. **Objective 2: Improved Investment Climate and Access to Finance for SMEs.** This objective was supported through the Competitiveness and Growth Support Project (FY12); Shared Growth Credit DPO Series – Credits I, II, III (FY12, FY13, FY14); Niger Investment Climate Support (FY16); Strengthening Domestic Private Sector (FY13); Financial Sector Development Strategy (FY13); Financial Sector Strategy Implementation (FY16); Advisory on Rural Finance (FY14); and the IFC's Trade Finance Guarantee (FY13). This objective had two outcome indicators.

- Average number of new enterprises registered per year. The target was that 3,000 new enterprises would register in 2015, with 20 percent led by women. The June 2017 ISR for the Competitiveness and Growth Support Project reports 7,000 enterprises were registered by June 2016, of which 20 percent were led by women. The increase in enterprise registration was facilitated by regulatory improvements: the distance from the frontier for the 'Opening a Business' Doing Business (DB) indicator increased from 54.48 in DB2014 to 93.65 in DB2018. The outcome target was achieved.
- SMEs loan portfolio increased. The outcome target was to expand a loan portfolio to \$23 million in 2016, with 20 percent of the loans benefitting female-owned SMEs. The CLR reports that information to verify this target is not available. The PLR had revised the target to fit IFC estimates of the impact. Through a regional bank present in Niger, IFC provided trade finance guarantees that amounted to a total of \$6.8 million by 2015; but, the extent to which the IFC engagement contributed to this outcome target is unclear. Alternative sources on the SME lending trend in Niger are not available. The outcome target could not be verified.
- The business environment showed improvements since 2013. The overall Doing Business distance relative to the frontier improved from 44.31 in DB2014 to 52.34 in DB2018. The IMF noted that while there were improvements in creating an enabling business environment, including shortening the time and procedures required to start a business, improving access to credit information, and making contract enforcement easier, there are remaining challenges including dealing with construction permits and paying taxes.³ Given the overall improvement in the investment climate, Objective 2 was Mostly Achieved.

10. **Objective 3: Increased Agricultural Productivity of Selected Crops in Selected Areas.** This objective was supported through the Second Emergency Food Security Support Project (FY11); West Africa Agricultural Productivity Program (FY11); and the Climate Smart Agriculture Support Project (FY16). This objective had only one outcome indicator.

- Average yield of cereal crops (millet, sorghum & rice) in targeted rain-fed areas increased by 25 percent by 2015. Average rice productivity for 2014 dry season harvest reached 7076 kg per ha, an increase of 29 percent over the 2008-2012 average, per the ICRR (IEG:S) for the Second Emergency Food Security Support Project. Information on the productivity of millet and sorghum was not provided in the CLR or any of the Bank's documents. Data from the Food and Agriculture Organization suggest that the national average yield of sorghum increased from 364 kg/ha during the 2008-2012 period to 561.4 kg/ha in 2015, an increase of 54 percent. The national average yield of millet increased from an average of 364 kg/ha during the 2008-2012 period to 561.4 in 2015, an increase of 11 percent. Based on this alternative source of information, the outcome target was mostly achieved— sorghum and rice surpassed the target, while millet did not. According to the ICRR, partnering with donors and working with communities and established NGO

³ See paragraph 39 of 2016 Article IV Consultation and Request for a Three-year Arrangement under the Extended Credit Facility, February 2017. IMF Country Report No. 17/59



partners (such as veterinarians without borders) has been a key contributor to the progress made under this objective. On balance, Objective 3 was Mostly Achieved.

11. **Objective 4: Improved Selected Trade Infrastructures.** This objective was supported through the Niger Port IFC Advisory Services project; Local Urban Infrastructure Development project (FY08); Competitiveness and Growth Project (FY12); and Transport Sector Support Program SIM (FY08). This objective had three outcome indicators.

- Setting up of Dry Port Authority. The CLR informs that the IFC-supported activity to help set up the Dry Port Authority was dropped due to shifting priorities of the authorities. The PLR had reported the target as achieved. Indeed, in 2014, the Government set up a Dry Port Authority. Furthermore, on October 28, 2014, the Government signed a PPP agreement with Bollore Africa Logistics (B.A.L.) for a 20-year concession of the dry port. The two-site facility would comprise a new dry port infrastructure in Dosso (corridor of Benin) and the development of the existing Niamey Rive Droite platform (corridors of Togo, Ghana and Cote d'Ivoire). The B.A.L. undertook to build, develop and operate two ports, committing \$77 million to the project. IFC advised the Government of Niger (GoN) on the concession for the dry ports, helped mobilize the funds for \$74 million and drafted all the necessary documents. The GoN proceeded with the transaction afterwards without IFC support. There is no available information on the implementation of the concession (PPP agreement) and the investor's compliance with its commitments. [Partially Achieved.]
- Kilometers of inter-urban roads rehabilitated in targeted areas. The target was to reconstruct 300 kilometers of inter-urban roads. There are mixed reports on the progress of this indicator. On one hand, the CLR reports that this activity was dropped under the Competitiveness and Growth Project (FY12) due to shifting priorities of the authorities. The CLR also notes the mounting trade barriers that are limiting regional trade and reducing the impact of the infrastructure investments. On the other hand, the PLR reported that work was in progress through the Transport Sector Support Program (FY08). The ICR for this project reports major gains in connectivity including reduction in travel times on the three important sections of the national road network. Given the ambiguity about the inter-urban character of the rehabilitated roads, progress of this indicator is considered as not verified.
- Rehabilitation of Maradi Central Market. The CLR informs that the activity was dropped due to shifting priorities of the authorities. The PLR, however, had reported the target as achieved. According to the ICRR for the Local Urban Development Project (FY08). The market rehabilitation was completed in 2013 and became operational in November 2014. Per the available public information, the market remains in operation. [Achieved]
- On balance, Objective 4 is rated as Partially Achieved.

12. On balance, Focus Area I is rated as Moderately Unsatisfactory. Two objectives were mostly achieved, one was partially achieved and one was not achieved.

Focus Area II: Reducing Vulnerability

13. **Objective 5: Increased Access of Poor and Food Insecure People to Safety Net Programs.** This objective was supported through the Niger Safety Net Project (FY11) and additional financing (FY16); the Community Action Program Phase 3 (FY13); the Social Protection and Building Resilience Report Technical Assistance (FY14); the Integrated Surveys on Agriculture (LSMS-ISA) (FY11). This objective had one outcome indicator.

- Number of households with access to the safety net programs (cash transfer and cash for work programs). The target was 100,000 additional households would have access to safety nets by the end of 2015 (from a baseline of zero). As of August 2017, 143,542 additional households had access to cash transfers and 47,030 households had access to



the cash for work program, per the ISR (December 2017) for the Niger Safety Net Project (FY11)

- As of August 2017, over 1 million people have been benefiting from access to safety net programs and around 83 percent of the beneficiaries are poor, per the ISR (December 2017) for the Niger Safety Net Project (FY11). Objective 5 is rated as Achieved.

14. Objective 6: Increased Adoption of Climate Resilience Policies and Actions in Targeted Communes. This objective was supported through the Community Action Program for Climate Resilience (CAPCR (FY11)), the Community Action Program 2 (FY09), and the Community Action Program Phase 3 project (FY13). This objective had three indicators:

- Additional agricultural area under sustainable land management (SLM). The target was at least 2000 ha of additional agricultural areas with improved SLM. By December 31, 2015, 1,407 additional ha of agricultural areas were under sustainable land management. An additional 3,101 additional ha of agricultural areas were under SLM per the June 2017 ISR of the FY11 project. [Achieved].
- Additional silvo-pastoral areas under SLM. The target was at least 5,000 ha of additional silvo-pastoral areas with SLM. By December 31, 2016, 22,677 additional ha of silvo-pastoral areas were under SLM. [Achieved].
- Number of Local Development Plans (LDPs) incorporating climatic resilience. The target was 25 plans by the end of 2015. By December 31, 2016, 38 LDPs incorporated climatic resilience. [Achieved].
- Objective 6 is rated as Achieved.

15. Objective 7: Improved Education and Employment Skills for Youth. This objective was supported through the Support to Quality Education Project (FY15); and Skills Development for Growth Project (FY13). This objective had two indicators.

- Primary completion rate. The target was set at 60 percent for 2015, with the target for girls at 53 percent. As of December 2015, the primary completion rate was reported at 62.2 percent, and of which 53.5 percent were girls. [Achieved].
- Number of youth who completed dual apprenticeship programs. The target was set as 800 for 2015, with at least 20 percent are women. By December 2015, 1,103 out of school youth were enrolled in dual apprenticeship programs and 109 had completed their training by February 2016. By the end of 2016, 620 apprentices were reported to have completed their training, of which 48 percent were women. [Mostly Achieved].
- The objective is rated as Mostly Achieved.

16. Objective 8: Increased Access to Water, Sanitation, Health and Population Service. This objective was supported through the Urban Water and Sanitation Project (FY11) and additional financing (FY16); Second HIV/AIDS Support Project (FY11); the Strengthening Water Supply and Sanitation Planning and Monitoring Systems in Niger TA; Population and Health Support Project (FY15); and Multi-Sector Demographic Project (FY12). This objective had four indicators.

- Number of additional people in selected urban areas provided with access to improved water sources. The number of additional people with access to improved water sources was reported at 536,750 by November 2015, compared to the target of 509,000. [Achieved]
- Number of additional students provided with access to sanitation services in their schools. The target was set at 60,000 for 2015. By November 2015, there were 52,530 students who had access to appropriate sanitation facilities in their schools. By August 2017, the corresponding number reached 60,000. [Achieved].



- Number of sex workers seen at health facilities after referral by NGO. The target was set at additional 5,000 by 2015. The number of sex workers seen at health facilities after referral by NGOs increased to 7,500 in 2014 and to 12,907 in 2016 (from a baseline of 0 in 2011). [Achieved].
- Number of sex workers treated for Sexual Transmitted Infection (STI). The target was set at additional 500 by 2015. By August 2014, additional 5,000 sex workers had been treated for STI; the number had increased to 12,621 by the end of 2016. [Achieved].
- This objective lumped together several sectors (water, sanitation and health) without providing a rationale on how the various sectors would work towards a common objective. Objective 8 is rated as Achieved.

17. Focus Area II is rated as Satisfactory. All four objectives are rated as either Achieved or Mostly Achieved.

Focus Area III—Cross-cutting: Mainstreaming Gender and strengthening governance and capacity for service delivery

18. **Objective 9: Improved Budget Execution and Efficiency.** This objective was supported through the Reform Management and Technical Assistance Project (FY10); the Shared Growth credits I, II and III (FY12, FY13, FY14); and IDF grant for Procurement Reform (FY13). This objective had two indicators.

- Budget execution ratio of own funded expenditures (actual/budget). The target was set at 80 percent in 2015. Given the ambiguity of the indicator, the CLR, proposes using PEFA-1 indicator that measures variation between actual expenditures and initial budget allocations. The overall budget execution rate is estimated to have risen to 83.5 percent for 2016 by the ICRR for the Reform Management and Technical Assistance Project (FY10). PEFA-1 improved from D in 2012 to B in 2016, as validated by the ICRR for the FY10 Project. [Achieved]
- Share of public procurement contracts awarded through competitive bidding. The target was set as maintaining this share at 75 percent or above. The CLR suggests using PEFA indicator 19 (PEFA-19) measuring the degree of transparency and competitiveness in national public procurement, given concerns about the government methodology used to define competitive bidding. Per the ICRR for the Shared Growth Credits DPO, the share of procurement contracts competitively tendered by both number and value increased from 68 percent and 81 percent, to 93 percent and 91 percent respectively. ⁴ But PEFA-19 remained unchanged at B+ since 2012 PEFA. The PEFA 2016 Report informs that the percentage of contracts assigned through competitive bidding has declined since 2012. [Not Achieved]
- Objective 9 is rated as Partially Achieved.

19. **Objective 10: Improved Transparency of Sector Budget Allocations.** This objective was supported through the First Public Investment Reform Support credit (FY16), Support to Niger Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) TF (FY13); PEFA Update (FY14), and PER (FY14). This objective had one indicator.

⁴ The DPO ICRR notes that although the procurement processes were audited and reports were published for all years up to program closure, only two out of a planned ten physical inspections of the implementation of public procurement contracts took place. The DPO ICRR points that this lack of follow-up through physical inspections undermines the sustainability of reforms.



- Number of budgetary documents published based on the Open budget initiative classification. The target was set at two documents for 2015. Two of the eight key budget documents were made publicly available online consistent with international standards, per the Open Budget Index survey of 2015. However, the 2016 update for the Open Budget Index survey reports that none of the eight budget documents are available, signaling backtracking on the budget transparency agenda. [Not Achieved].
- Objective 10 is rated as Not Achieved.

20. **Objective 11: Improved Transparency in the Mining and Oil Sector.** This objective was supported through the EITI Post Compliance Trust Fund Grant (FY11). This objective had one indicator.

- Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI) Reports published annually. EITI annual progress reports for the 2010-2017 period as well as reports from the earlier periods are available at the Niger page of the EITI website. Following the October 2017 validation against 2016 EITI standards, EITI's board suspended Niger for failure to make meaningful progress on key issues in the 2016 EITI standards. Outstanding EITI requirements included non-transparent systems for license allocation, lack of a comprehensive public license register, gaps between the government policy on contract transparency as mandated by the constitution and the practice of limited disclosure of contracts. On November 14, 2017, the government of Niger announced its withdrawal from EITI implementation. At that time, the EITI board pointed to the significant progress Niger has made to improve its mineral governance. Specifically, progress was made on the publication of exploration activities, production and export data, and mining revenue management and expenditure⁵. Moreover, there has been a significant increase in government revenues from license fees, as reported by the EITI Secretariat.
- The selected indicator did not reflect well on the actual progress towards Objective 11. A better measure of progress towards the sector's transparency would have reflected attainment of some specific transparency benchmark, such as the establishment of a comprehensive register of mining licenses and making it publicly available. Despite some improvements in the sector's transparency that have been noted above, significant gaps remain, and currently there is no government commitment to address them with the government's withdrawal from EITI implementation.
- Objective #11 is rated as Partially Achieved.

21. Achievement of objectives under Focus Area III is rated Unsatisfactory – all three objectives are rated as either Not Achieved or Partially Achieved

Overall Assessment and Rating

22. On balance, IEG rates the achievement of the CPS objectives as Moderately Satisfactory. Six out of 11 objectives were either achieved or mostly achieved. Under Focus Area I, progress has been made in increasing productivity for selected crops and improving the environment for doing business. However, there was no progress in fiscal consolidation and access to finance, as well as transparency of budget outcomes. Under Focus Area II, three of the four objectives were achieved and one was mostly achieved. The number of poor and food insecure people accessing safety nets has increased; primary completion rates are higher; more people in urban areas have access to water and sanitation; and more agricultural lands in selected communes have adopted sustainable land management practices. Under focus Area III, two objectives were not achieved and one partially achieved. Niger's withdrawal from EITI implementation impedes further progress on addressing outstanding issues on non-transparent practices.

⁵ <https://eiti.org/news/niger-progressing-slowly-against-eiti-standard>



Objectives	CLR Rating	IEG Rating
Focus Area I: Promoting Resilient Growth	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory
Objective 1: Fiscal Performance Consolidated	<i>Partially Achieved</i>	<i>Not Achieved</i>
Objective 2: Improved Investment Climate and Access to Finance for SMEs	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>
Objective 3: Increased Agricultural Productivity of Selected Crops in Selected	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>
Objective 4: Improved Selected Trade Infrastructures	<i>Not Achieved</i>	<i>Partially Achieved</i>
Focus Area II: Reducing Vulnerability	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
Objective 5: Increased Access of Poor and Food Insecure People to Safety Net Programs	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>	<i>Achieved</i>
Objective 6: Increased Adoption of Climate Resilience Policies and Actions in Targeted Communes	<i>Achieved</i>	<i>Achieved</i>
Objective 7: Improved Education and Employment Skills for Youth	<i>Achieved</i>	<i>Mostly Achieved</i>
Objective 8: Increased Access to Water, Sanitation, Health and Population Service	<i>Achieved</i>	<i>Achieved</i>
Focus Area III: Mainstreaming Gender and strengthening governance and capacity for service delivery	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory
Objective 9: Improved Budget Execution and Efficiency	<i>Partially Achieved</i>	<i>Partially Achieved</i>
Objective 10: Improved Transparency of Sector Budget Allocations	<i>Achieved</i>	<i>Not Achieved</i>
Objective 11: Improved Transparency in the Mining and Oil Sector	<i>Achieved</i>	<i>Partially Achieved</i>

6. WBG Performance

Lending and Investments

23. At the beginning of the CPS period, 13 IDA projects were under implementation with approved commitments of \$475 million. During the CPS period, 18 IDA projects were approved with total commitments of \$1.153 billion. The amount of IDA resources made available to Niger significantly increased under this CPS compared to the previous CAS (FY08-FY11), when IDA new commitments amounted to \$418.5 million. Most of the new lending (or 90 percent of new commitments) approved during the CPS period were investment project financing (IPF), including four regional projects and additional financings. The remaining two operations were development policy financing (or \$120 million in net commitments). Nineteen Grants and Trusts Funds were active during the CPS period, with total commitments of \$198 million. Nine new TFs were approved during the CPS period (or \$110.3 million) equivalent to more than 50 percent of the active TFs during the CPS period. Notable among them are two grants: one grant in support for Quality Education, for \$84.2 million; and the other, is the Second Emergency Food Security and two Community Action Plan for Climate Resilience grants (\$63 million). Both contributed to the delivery of CPS results.

24. Niger's portfolio performance at exit is well below its comparators, (SSA and Bank-wide). During the CPS period, five projects exited, including the three DPO credits, and validated by IEG. In terms of number of projects, 60 percent were rated Moderately Satisfactory or better (MS+), compared



to 66 percent of the Africa region and 71 percent Bank-wide. In terms of commitments, the percentage of projects with MS+ is 45 percent for Niger, well below the SSA average (74.5 percent) and Bank-wide (83.9 percent). All five closed operations have ratings of significant to high risk to development outcome, in line with the fragile and conflict affected context of the country.

25. The average disbursement ratio during the CPS period was 21.6 percent, slightly below the percentage for Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) (22.1 percent), and above the Bank-wide average (20 percent). The disbursement ratio improved during the CPS period from 18.1 percent in 2013 to 26.1 percent in 2016. In terms of number of projects, the average percentage of projects at risk during the CPS period was 25 percent, higher than for Sub-Saharan Africa (22 percent), and the Bank (21 percent). By commitments, the average percentage of project at risk at 29 percent is much higher than the average for the Bank (22 percent) but lower compared to SSA (32 percent).

26. Overall, the active portfolio shows good performance as measured by Management's own self-assessment (MS+ ISR ratings), with the exception of a regional project supporting the Kandadji initiative. However, this may also suggest over optimism and lack of candor in rating given the portfolio performance at exit and the underlying fragility of the environment. The CLR reports that the average disbursement ratio could have been higher given the age and profile of the portfolio. It also notes that the limited number of Bank staff based in Niamey and the unstable security environment hampered the implementation of Bank projects.

27. During the CPS period, IFC made total net commitments of \$6.3 million. These investments were for IFC's short-term trade finance guarantee, except for a very small investment of \$20,000 IFC made in the retail sector. During the review period, IEG validated one IFC advisory service project and assigned a Mostly Unsuccessful rating for its Development Effectiveness. Under the Africa MSME program, IFC supported its client bank to improve marketing, product development, and loan monitoring. IFC also helped mobilize \$74 million for the Niger Dry Port project.

28. During the CPS, MIGA maintained an ongoing exposure of US\$5.2 million in Niger, supporting the import verification and scanning operations of Cotecna Inspection S.A.

Analytic and Advisory Activities and Services

29. During the CPS period, 23 Advisory Services and Analytics (ASA) products were delivered, corresponding to ten Economic and Sector Work (ESW) and 13 Non-Lending Technical Assistance. The ASA supported all the CPS across the board. For the first results area, support included: Debt Management Performance Assessment (DeMPA); a PEMFAR Update; Access to finance, and a Note on growth and poverty. The Country Health Status Report (CHSR) and reports on water and sanitation contributed to the second results area. Work on gender, and governance and corruption provided cross-cutting support. The first PER in the security sector was an example of innovation – Niger, is exposed to high security risks, and therefore security is a topic of critical importance for the country, but this is usually considered to be outside WBG's core competencies. ASA products informed the preparation of the lending program and, in several cases, contributed to the delivery of CPS objectives. Overall, the ASA program was strong and effective.

30. IFC delivered two advisory services. IFC partnered with the private sector to develop a commercial irrigation project, which has been delayed due to concerns about security, availability of water resources, and commercial viability of the possible irrigation sites. On trade and commerce, IFC was the lead transaction advisor appointed by the Government to attract private sector participation to develop and operate the Dosso Dry Port as well as operate the already existing Niamey Rive Droite Dry Port. The advisory work led to the award by the Government of Niger of a 20-year concession for the development and management of the ports.

Results Framework

31. The results framework (RF) reflected the logic of intervention from country goals and priorities to CPS objectives and interventions. The results framework had baselines and targets and the indicators were generally measurable and verifiable, with some exceptions. However, the RF had several shortcomings. First, some indicators did not sufficiently measure their corresponding



objectives, as in the case of Objective 1 (fiscal consolidation) and Objective 11 (transparency in mining and oil). Second, some major WBG engagements were not reflected in the RF, as in the case of the Kandadji initiative. Third, the supporting activities and indicators were not well linked, as in the case for the SME credit indicator under Objective 2 and for Objective 4 (transport infrastructure). Fourth, Objective 8 (water, health, sanitation and population) was too broad in its scope and would have benefitted from further unbundling. Fifth, some of the indicators were set at the project level and not at program level.

Partnerships and Development Partner Coordination

32. The Bank Group established strong partnerships in delivering its Niger country program. The CPS identified seventeen development partners in Niger. The key development partners include European Union, France, UNDP, Germany, Switzerland, Austria, Japan, USA and DFID. The Bank's collaboration with development partners took several forms including through co-financing. For example, the Bank's Support to Quality Education Project has been co-financed by several development partners who also participated in joint project supervision. The DPO series operations were prepared in close coordination with the IMF. The Bank also worked with the European Union and the African Development Bank to develop a harmonized, multi-donor framework for budget support. Still, the CLR and various ICRs note deficiencies in the donor coordination due in part to a limited government leadership.

Safeguards and Fiduciary Issues

33. During the CPS period, three of four, investment operations validated by IEG (in agriculture and urban development) triggered environmental and social safeguard policies. The project ICRs and ICRRs noted satisfactory compliance with the triggered policies, with adequate preparation, disclosure of the policy instruments and capacity building at all levels. Nevertheless, compliance with safeguards was impaired by the inability to access some project sites due to the unstable security environment. The ICRs and ICRRs reported that by the projects' closure, all safeguard-related issues had been resolved. No inspection panel case was filed during the CPS period.

34. Major safeguards concerns have arisen during the implementation of the WBG's Niger Basin Water Resources Development and Sustainable Ecosystems Management Program supporting the regional Kandadji initiative. As the CLR indicates, the considerable number of people to be resettled (over 60,000) caused continued implementation challenges that led to a partial suspension of disbursements in September 2016. The latest ISR (December 21, 2017) stated that two out of three pending actions identified in the Bank's response to the lifting of suspension in November 2016 were fully completed and the remaining one is expected to be fully met by March 2018. However, concerns remain regarding the unfinished Resettlement Action Plan (RAP1) completion and the adequacy of RAP2 preparation. Follow-up consultations on RAP1 are expected in early 2018. It is estimated that implementation of RAP1 Corrective Action Plan would take about two years (2018-2020).

35. INT substantiated two cases related to the Niger program: one case pertained to misrepresentation of a fake guarantee by a bidder and the other concerned misuse of public funds. Both cases had minor impact on the project development objectives for the corresponding operations.

Ownership and Flexibility

36. The Government was highly committed to implement its strategy (PDES). The PLR noted that the Government, had sustained its implementation effort, which had helped improve the quality of the Bank's portfolio. The commitment of the government to structural reform, however, seems to be weaker, due in part to an overambitious reform agenda relative to weak capacity and aggravated by a difficult political economy. The CLR notes that in some cases, there was insufficient government involvement during the early part of the project preparation that resulted in weak ownership during implementation. Over-reliance on strong PIUs also exacerbated the risk of weakening government ownership. The issuance of the PPP agreement for the Dry Ports was delayed due to slow progress in developing an enabling environment for the private sector to participate.



37. To manage the impact of the continued state of conflict in the neighboring countries, the Bank demonstrated flexibility during project implementation by tapping third parties, CSOs, NGOs and Monitoring agencies, to help with project supervision. The Bank also mainstreamed a large contingency component in IPFs, but the extent to which this flexibility was used remains unclear. The CPS also considered the possibility of using financing mechanisms, such as the Crisis Response Window (CRW) and Contingent Emergency Response Components, to act flexibly and in a timely manner should a crisis arise. However, no information is available if such mechanisms were considered and/or utilized. The PLR introduced only slight changes to the program. A more thorough stock taking and retro-fitting of the Results Framework at the PLR stage would have been welcome.

WBG Internal Cooperation

38. During the CPS period, the opportunities for cooperation within WBG were few. IFC intervention regarding credit to Small and Medium Enterprises was not coordinated with the Bank's work on Financial Inclusion. Likewise, IFC's work on the Dry Port PPP could have been better integrated with Bank efforts at facilitating trade across the borders. More concerted engagements could possibly expand opportunities for both IFC and MIGA in Niger in the future.

Risk Identification and Mitigation

39. The CPS and PLR identified four major risks: (i) the Sahel crisis and security risks; (ii) climatic exogenous shocks e.g. droughts, locust infestation, floods; (iii) capacity constraints; and (iv) natural resources related risks. The continued state of conflict in the neighboring countries handicapped project implementation in the Northern and Eastern regions of Niger -- the Bank tapped third parties, CSOs, NGOs and Monitoring agencies, to help with project supervision. The weak capacity of government, including central agencies, remained a challenge that affected implementation of the reform agenda on governance and capacity building, where progress has been slow. The political economy risk could also have received greater prominence, especially to better access government capacity to effectively deliver on its formal commitments. The PLR noted the risks associated with the regional program on the Kandadji Growth Pole, but despite this awareness and efforts, the project performance has been wanting. The risk from changes in the global commodity markets could have figured more prominently; as it turned out, the drop in the oil price in 2014 affected Niger, both directly as an oil producer and indirectly through Nigeria, its major economic partner. Managing the impact of the oil price drop proved challenging and the fiscal stance suffered, affecting delivery of Objective 1 on fiscal consolidation.

Overall Assessment and Rating

Design

40. The CPS objectives were relevant to the challenges that Niger faced, and were aligned with the Government Program and the corporate twin goals, and reflected well the comparative advantage of the WBG in the country. The program was not selective enough, given the limited capacity of the country and the multitude of risks (both internal and external). The CPS objectives reflected to some extent the high ambitions of the government program. The Results Framework reflected a good logic of intervention overall, but had some shortcomings including indicators that did not adequately measure the objectives and reliance on project indicators. The link between ASA products and WBG projects was sufficiently strong. The CPS identified well critical risks to the program. Some, however, were not highlighted enough, including difficult political economy and fluctuations in commodity prices.

Implementation

41. WBG financial support for Niger increased during this CPS period compared to the previous one. The ASA program was focused and substantive and supported the preparation of new operations, the delivery of several CPS objectives and helped build the analytical foundations for the new CPF. Performance. However, portfolio performance at exit as measured by IEG's outcome rating of Moderately Satisfactory or better, was well below the SSA and Bank-wide average. The risks to the sustainability of outcomes were significant to high, reflecting the underlying fragile environment. To manage the impact of the continued state of conflict in the neighboring countries, the Bank



demonstrated flexibility during project implementation by tapping third parties, including Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) and Monitoring agencies, to help with project supervision. The Bank also mainstreamed a large contingency component in IPFs, but the extent to which this flexibility was used remains unclear. The Bank worked closely with Development Partners in several critical areas, including education, climate change, health and population, fiscal consolidation, and private sector development. Compliance with safeguards and fiduciary requirements appears strong, the main challenge has been the construction of the dam at Kandadji. The cooperation across the WBG institutions was limited. The mid-term corrections at the PLR stage were minimal. With hindsight, a more thorough stock taking could have contributed to a sharpening of the results framework.

42. WBG performance during this CPS is rated as good.

7. Assessment of CLR Completion Report

43. The CLR is clear and concise. The analysis is consistent with the Results Framework as presented by the PLR. The CLR provides adequate evidence on the delivery of outcome targets and the contribution of the WBG. It considers the main implementation challenges and it draws relevant lessons. However, it could have addressed certain issues with greater depth. For instance, it does not explain why flagship initiatives like the Kandadji program were not reflected in the results framework. Given the size of the relevance of this program for the country, the region and the Bank, an in-depth discussion of design and implementation issues would have been welcome. Likewise, the CLR could have informed on the use of the contingency components in projects to manage risks, given their relevance for Niger and other conflict affected countries. The ratings for Objectives 10 and 11 could have gone beyond the indicators to take stock of the delivery of the objectives by considering the adequacy of the selected indicators and the sustainability of the achievements. The CLR's comments on the government shifting priorities on trade infrastructure was not adequately explained.

8. Findings and Lessons

44. The CLR drew eight lessons: (i) encourage government leadership of WBG-financed projects through early involvement and simpler program design and better linkages across the WBG portfolio; (ii) strengthen the results matrix to provide a firm basis for monitoring and evaluation; (iii) combine short term economic and humanitarian needs with longer term development objectives to maximize the impact of emergency operations; (iv) ensure sufficient preparation and motivate key counterparts engage with hard-to-reach communities; (v) integrate further climate change across the portfolio; (v) develop strategies to mitigate the effect on Bank project implementation of insufficient counterpart government staff in regions experiencing prolonged insecurity; (vii) double-up efforts to mainstream gender dimension across the portfolio; and (viii) capitalize on the gains associated with a firm but supportive dialogue on aligning the GoN's and Bank's views on safeguards as exemplified by the Kandadji Program.

45. IEG concurs with the lessons in the CLR. IEG adds three additional lessons.

- Institutional reforms would need to be more selective and sequenced and underpinned by a keen understanding of priorities in the context of weak capacity and high-risk environment. In the case of Niger, the institutional reforms were ambitious and broad as in the case of objective 1 (fiscal consolidation) in an environment deeply affected by external shocks (drop in export prices) and internal challenges (difficult political economy and low capacity).
- In a fragile environment, the Bank's flexibility is critical to ensure continued and effective program implementation. In the case of Niger, the Bank demonstrated flexibility during implementation by contracting third parties to help with project supervision. In following a flexible approach, the challenge is to build capacity to monitor contracts with third parties and to formalize and standardize the approach to facilitate scaling it up.



- The effectiveness of Bank interventions in fragile environments is enhanced through working with other development partners and in partnership with local communities and established NGOs to mobilize resources, deepen knowledge of local circumstances and facilitate implementation. In Niger, the Bank has successfully worked with other development partners through co-financing and to deliver results in education, food security, managing climate change and extending safety nets. The community and NGO engagements have been critical to the successful delivery of results in HIV/AIDS, climate change and food security.

- Annex Table 1: Summary of Achievements of CPS Objectives – Niger
- Annex Table 2: Niger Planned and Actual Lending, FY13 - FY16
- Annex Table 3: Advisory Services and Analytics Deliveries for Niger, FY13-16
- Annex Table 4: Niger Grants and Trust Funds Active in FY13-16
- Annex Table 5: IEG Project Ratings for Niger, FY13-16
- Annex Table 6: IEG Project Ratings for Niger and Comparators, FY13-16
- Annex Table 7: Portfolio Status for Niger and Comparators, FY13-16
- Annex Table 8: Disbursement Ratio for Niger, FY13-16
- Annex Table 9: Net Disbursement and Charges for Niger, FY13-16
- Annex Table 10: Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid, 2013-2015
- Annex Table 11: Economic and Social Indicators for Niger, 2013 – 2016
- Annex Table 12: List of IFC Advisory Services in Niger Advisory Services Approved in FY13-16
- Annex Table 13: IFC net commitment activity in Niger, FY13 - FY16 (US\$, 000)
- Annex Table 14: List of MIGA Activities 2013-2016 (US\$, millions)



Annex Table 1: Summary of Achievements of CPS Objectives – Niger

	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus area I: Promoting Resilient Growth	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
<p><u>Major Outcome Measures</u></p>	<p>1. CPS Objective: Fiscal Performance consolidated</p> <p>Outcome (i): Efficiency of tax and customs collections has improved.</p> <p>Indicator: PEFA performance indicator 15 (Effectiveness in collection of tax payments).</p> <p>Baseline: D+ (2012) Target: C (2015)</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by the Shared Growth Credit DPO series I (P125272, FY12), II (P132757, FY13), and III (P145251, FY14) This DPO series sought to establish a competitive and diversified economy for accelerated and inclusive growth by among others, reforming the tax administration, modernization of the investment code, and removing internal obstacles to trade and commerce. The DPO program series included an indicator on the number of visits by tax officials to individual enterprises as a measure of the extent to which running a business is free from official harassment, as well as of the efficiency of tax officials.</p> <p>This outcome also received support from the Reform Management and Technical Assistance project (P108253; FY10) which sought to lower the deviation in aggregate revenue for tax and customs Directorates.</p> <p>Support for this outcome was also provided through a Public Expenditure Review delivered in FY14.</p> <p>According to the management completion report for the Reform Management TA project (ICR:MS), the deviation in aggregate revenue for tax and customs directorates began to show an initial decrease, however, by the end of the project tax revenue deviation was 21.6 percent and customs revenue deviation was 10.6 percent, which marked almost no changed from their 2009 baseline values of 21.8 and 11.0 percent, respectively</p> <p>The tax revenue to GDP ratio increased during the period from 14.5% in 2012 to 16.1% in 2015. The budget deficit on the other hand increased from 1.1% in 2012 to 9.1% in 2015.</p>	<p>In the 2011 PEFA methodology, PI-15 referred to the Effectiveness in collection of tax payments and was therefore an appropriate indicator for this outcome. In the 2016 PEFA methodology PI-15 was changed to "Fiscal strategy".</p> <p>Nevertheless, to allow for direct comparability between the 2012 and 2016 PEFA scores, the 2016 Niger PEFA report included a standardization of the two sets of scores based on the 2011 methodology.</p>



	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus area I: Promoting Resilient Growth	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
	<p>Outcome (ii): Treasury and debt Management has improved.</p> <p>Indicator: PEFA performance indicator 17 (Recording and management of cash balances, debt and guarantees).</p> <p>Baseline: C (2012) Target: B (2015)</p>	<p>According to the 2016 PEFA report, the score for PEFA indicator 15 did not improve and was assessed as D+ in 2016. Target Not Achieved</p> <p>This outcome was also supported by the three Shared Growth Credit DPOs I (P125272 FY12), II (P132757, FY13), and III (P145251, FY14). In particular, the Third Shared Growth Credit supported the adoption of measures to prevent the accumulation of new arrears by four state-owned enterprises.</p> <p>IEG: MU for the project series reported that there was a significant reduction in total domestic arrears, which were reduced by CFAF22.4 billion (or some 0.6% of GDP) in 2013, and by a further CFAF9.5 billion (0.3% of GDP) in 2014. It also noted that despite these reductions, arrears to the principal state-owned industries remained high.</p> <p>Support for this outcome was also provided through a Debt Management Performance Assessment (DeMPA) delivered in FY14 (P130410) and a Debt Management Reform Plan in FY15 (P144949).</p> <p>According to data from the IMF's World Economic Outlook database, the gross debt to GDP ratio increased over the period from 26.9% in 2012 to 46.3% in 2016.</p> <p>According to the 2016 PEFA report, the score for PEFA indicator 17 did not improve and was assessed as C in 2016. Target Not Achieved</p>	<p>In the 2011 PEFA methodology, PI-17 referred to the "<i>Recording and management of cash balances, debt and guarantees</i>" and was therefore an appropriate indicator for this outcome. In the 2016 PEFA methodology PI-17 changed to "Budget preparation process".</p> <p>Nevertheless, to allow for direct comparability between the 2012 and 2016 PEFA scores, the 2016 Niger PEFA report included a standardization of the two sets of scores based on the 2011 methodology.</p>
	<p>2. CPS Objective: Improved Investment Climate and Access to Finance for SMEs</p>		
	<p><u>Indicator:</u> Average number of new enterprises registered per year</p> <p>Baseline: 2094 (2012) Target: 3000 (2015) (of which 20 % led by women)</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by the Competitiveness & Growth Support project (P127204, FY12) which sought to: i) improve selected aspects of Niger's business environment, ii) support the development of the meat industry, and iii) increase local business participation in the extractive industries sector. This outcome was also</p>	<p>At PLR stage, the baseline was revised to 2094 instead of 2500 initially estimated because of implementation delay of Maison de l'Entreprise</p>



	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus area I: Promoting Resilient Growth	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
		<p>supported by the Shared Growth Credit DPOs which sought to improve the business environment for investment and trade in Niger and included relevant prior actions such as modification of rules for the National Private Investor Council, a new regulatory framework for PPPs, (P125272, FY12), and the submission of a new investment code to the National Assembly (P145251, FY14).</p> <p>Niger's ease of doing ranking improved during the period from 173 in 2012 to 150 in 2017 and then to 144 in 2018. The Doing Business distance relative to the frontier for 'Opening a business' indicator improved from 54.48 in DB2014 to 93.65 in DB2018</p> <p>According to the June 2016 management supervision report of the Competitiveness & Growth support credit ISR:MS, by December 2015, there were 2,372 enterprises registered per year, 20% of which were led by women. The same report indicated that by June 2016, the number enterprises registered per year, 20% of which were led by women, had increased to 7000.</p> <p>Target Achieved.</p>	
	<p><u>Indicator:</u> SMEs Loan Portfolio</p> <p>Baseline: US\$19 million (2012) Target: US\$23 million (2016) (of which 20% are received by female-owned SMEs)</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by the Competitiveness & Growth Support project (P127204, FY12) which sought to improve selected aspects of Niger's business environment, to support the development of the meat industry and to increase local business participation in the extractive industries sector.</p> <p>IFC also supported this outcome through a regional bank with a presence in Niger, that provided trade finance guarantees totaling \$6.8 million by 2015.</p> <p>None of the projects in the Niger portfolio reported on this indicator. As such, there was no available data to validate this indicator.</p>	<p>At the PLR stage, the target and end-date revised, respectively from US\$33 million to US\$23 million, and from 2015 to 2016 because of IFC's new projections.</p> <p>The CLR indicated that there were no data available to validate the indicator on the SME loan portfolio of banks, nor gender disaggregated data for this outcome.</p>



	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus area I: Promoting Resilient Growth	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
		<p>Nevertheless, Niger's ranking for Access to credit in the Doing Business index declined steadily from 126 in 2012 to 139 in 2017 and then to 149 in 2018. However, as a share of GDP, the domestic credit provided by the financial sector increased from 12.7% in 2012 to 16.8% in 2016 (WDI database)</p> <p>Target Not Achieved</p>	
<p>3. CPS Objective: Increased Agricultural Productivity of Selected Crops in Selected Areas</p>			
	<p>Indicator: Average yield of cereal crops (millet, sorghum & rice) in targeted rain fed areas increased by 25% by 2015</p> <p>Baseline: average yield in kg/ha in 2008-2012 period: - Millet: 506; - Sorghum: 354, and - Rice: 5500).</p> <p>Target: Increase in average yield of cereal crops by 25% in 2015</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by the Second Emergency Food Security Support Project (P123567; FY11) which sought to support improvement of food security in Niger in general and of poor farmers and herders' households highly-exposed to the recurrent food and livestock crisis, in the Regions of Maradi, Tahoua and Tillabery. The outcome was also supported by the regional West Africa Agricultural Productivity Program (P122065, FY11) which sought to generate and accelerate the adoption of improved technologies in the participating countries' top agricultural commodity priority areas that are aligned with the sub-region's top agricultural commodity priorities and by the Climate Smart Agriculture Support Project (P153420; FY16) that supported the (i) enhancement of adaptation to climate risks, (ii) improving agricultural productivity among the Targeted Communities, and (iii) in the event of an Eligible Crisis or Emergency, providing immediate and effective response to said Eligible Crisis or Emergency.</p> <p>IEG:S for the Second Emergency Food Security Support Project reported that by project completion average rice productivity for 2014 dry season harvest reached 7076 kg per ha compared to a baseline of 4354.5 kg per ha in 2010, an increase of 29% over the 2008-2012 average.</p> <p>According to data from the Food and Agriculture Organization, the national average yield of Sorghum in kg/ha increased from an average of 364</p>	<p>At the PLR stage, the baseline for Millet was corrected to 506 instead of the erroneous 5061 shown in the CPS.</p>



	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus area I: Promoting Resilient Growth	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
		<p>during the 2008-2012 period to 561.4 in 2015, an increase of 54%. The national average yield of millet in kg/ha increased from an average of 364 during the 2008-2012 period to 561.4 in 2015, an increase of 11%.</p> <p>Target Mostly Achieved</p>	
<p>4. CPS Objective: Improved Selected Trade Infrastructures</p>			
	<p>Indicator: Setting up of Dry Port Authority</p> <p>Baseline: No dry port authority Target: Dry port authority established.</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by the Niger Port IFC Advisory Services project (28148; FY10). The objective of the project was to (i) provide recommendations to the Government of Niger regarding the appropriate structuring of a future dry port, and (ii) to select through a transparent competitive process private operator to develop and operate the dry port operations. For the long-term sustainability of the project, the Government would need a solidly established grantor for the concession project. The government of Niger approved the idea and worked with IFC and consultants on the legal paperwork required.</p> <p>The Niger PLR informs that the Dry Port had been created. In addition, according to the AS completion report, the Dry Port Authority was created on October 10, 2014. IFC advised the Government of Niger (GoN) on the concession for the dry ports, helped mobilize funds for \$74 million and drafted all the necessary documents. The GoN proceeded with the transaction afterwards without IFC support. There is no available information on the implementation of the concession (PPP agreement) and the investor's compliance with its commitments.</p> <p>Partially Achieved</p>	<p>At PLR stage, the original objective was changed to reflect the new trade-oriented infrastructure objective. The original CPS objective was <i>Improved Selected Economic Infrastructures</i></p> <p>This indicator was introduced at PLR stage to replace the original indicator which was dropped because the government fell short in meeting universal access condition. The original indicator was <i>"Connection of the country to regional fiber backbones established."</i></p> <p>Considering that this indicator was added at the PLR stage (May 2015) and that the Dry Port Authority was created October 2014, the indicator was added after it had already been completed.</p> <p>There also seems to be a contradiction between the CLR and the IFC AS completion report. The CLR suggests that the activity was dropped due to shifting priorities of the authorities while the AS completion report indicates that the Authority was created on October 10, 2014. After</p>



	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus area I: Promoting Resilient Growth	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
			the advisory on the concession, the advisory project to set up the dry port authority was dropped – the dry port was set up by GoN without IFC.
	<p>Indicator: Kilometers of inter-urban roads rehabilitated in targeted areas.</p> <p>Baseline: 0 km of roads rehabilitated Target: 300 Kilometers of inter-urban roads rehabilitated in targeted areas by 2015.</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by the Transport Sector Support project (P101434, FY08) and the related additional financing project (P131107, FY13). These projects sought to improve the physical access of rural populations to markets and services on selected unpaved sections of the national road network. According to the management completion report, ICR:MS, by December 2015, the projects had supported the rehabilitation of <u>1,056 km of rural roads</u> resulting in an increase in the rural accessibility index from 33.4% to 39.5%. The projects also contributed to a substantial increase in the percentage of the national road network in good and fair condition, from 69% in 2008 to 81.6% by the closing date. It is unclear that the work under the Transport program corresponds to the inter-urban indicator under the PLR.</p> <p>Target not verified</p>	<p>There seems to be a contradiction between the CLR and the project Implementation Completion Report (ICR). The CLR suggests that the activity was dropped due to shifting priorities of the authorities while the ICR indicates that 1,056 km of roads was rehabilitated. A possible explanation for this contradiction could be that the 1,056 km of roads rehabilitated were strictly rural roads and not inter-urban roads as per the indicator.</p>
	<p>Indicator: Rehabilitation of Maradi Central Market.</p> <p>Baseline: Maradi Central market not rehabilitated.</p> <p>Target: Maradi Central market rehabilitated.</p>	<p>The Local Urban Infrastructure Development project (P095949, FY08) supported this outcome by aiming to increase and sustain access of urban residents to basic infrastructure and services, particularly those living in deprived settlements.</p> <p>IEG:MS reported that the rehabilitation of the Maradi central market had been completed at project closure (January 2013) although the market was not yet operational. The PLR mentioned that the market was inaugurated in 2014.</p> <p>A newspaper article from November 2014 also suggests that the market was built with funding from the World Bank and was inaugurated on November 12, 2014</p> <p>Target Achieved</p>	<p>At the PLR stage this indicator was added to reflect the new trade oriented infrastructure outcome.</p> <p>Although this indicator was added at the PLR stage, the PLR also noted that the indicator had been reached; And that the rehabilitated central market of Maradi was completed in 2013 and inaugurated in 2014.</p> <p>There seems to be a contradiction between the CLR and IEG's Implementation</p>



	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus area I: Promoting Resilient Growth	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
			Completion Report review (ICRR). IEG's report indicates that the rehabilitation of the market was completed by January 2013 and the PLR maintains that the market was inaugurated in 2014. However, the CLR suggests that this activity was dropped due to shifting priorities of the authorities.

	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus Area II: Reducing Vulnerability	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
--	---	--	--------------

	5. CPS Objective: Increased Access of Poor and Food Insecure People to Safety Net Programs		
Major Outcome Measures	<p>Indicator: Number of households with access to the safety net programs (the cash transfer and cash for work programs) by 2015</p> <p>Target: At least 100,000 additional households with access to the safety net programs (the cash transfer and cash for work programs) by 2015</p>	<p>The Niger Safety Net Project (P123399, FY11) and related additional financing (P155846, FY16) supported this outcome by supporting the establishment of a safety nets system which would increase access of poor and food insecure households to cash transfer and cash for work programs. This outcome was also supported by a Social Protection and Building resilience report (P143820) delivered as a Non-Lending Technical Assistance project in FY14.</p> <p>It was also supported by the Social Protection for building resilience report delivered as a Non-Lending Technical Assistance and by the Trust funded Integrated Surveys on Agriculture (LSMS-ISA).</p> <p>The project paper for the additional financing project mentioned that by June 2015, 73,634 households had access to the safety net programs established by the Project (from a baseline of 0 households in December 2011).</p> <p>The December 2017 management supervision (ISR:S) report indicated that by February 2017, 124,764 households had access to the cash transfer system established by the Project. The report also noted that by August 2017, the</p>	<p>The March 2016 project paper for the additional financing project indicated that by June 2015, there were 73,634 households benefiting from Cash transfers and cash for work programs.</p> <p>The August 2016 management supervision report ISR:S noted by June 2016, there were 82,026 Households with access to the cash transfer system and 55,610 Households with access to the cash for work programs. The CLR figure of 137,636 households is arrived at by obtaining the sum of these two groups of households. However, there is a risk of double counting the number of households because some households could potentially benefit from both the cash transfer system and the cash for work program.</p>



	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus Area II: Reducing Vulnerability	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
		number had increased to 143,542 (from a baseline of 0 households in December 2011). Target Achieved.	
	6. CPS Objective 6: Increased Adoption of Climate Resilience Policies and Actions in Targeted Communes		
	<p>Indicator: Additional agricultural area under sustainable land management</p> <p>Target: At least 2000 ha of additional agricultural areas with improved Sustainable Land Management.</p>	<p>This outcome had the support of the trust funded Community Action Program for Climate Resilience (CAPCR) (P125669, FY11), the Community Action Program 2 (P102354, FY09) and the Community Action Program Phase 3 (P132306, FY13) projects. Activities in these projects aimed to promote sustainable land management and expand sustainable land management practices in covered areas.</p> <p>The December 2016 ISR for CAPCR ISR:MS reported that by December 31 2015, 1,407 additional ha of agricultural areas were under SLM.</p> <p>The June 2017 ISR for CAPCR ISR:MS reported that by December 31 2016, 3,101 additional ha of agricultural areas were under SLM.</p> <p>Target Achieved</p>	
	<p>Indicator: Additional silvo-pastoral areas under Sustainable Land Management (SLM)</p> <p>Target: At least 5000 ha of additional silvo-pastoral areas with improved SLM</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by the trust funded Community Action Program for Climate Resilience (P125669, FY11) whose objective was to improve the resilience of agro-silvo-pastoral systems and local populations to climate variability and change by scaling up sustainable land and water management practices.</p> <p>The December 2016 management supervision report (ISR:MS) noted that by December 31 2015, 7,584 additional ha of silvo-pastoral areas were under SLM.</p> <p>The June 2017 management report (ISR:MS) indicated that by December 31 2016, 22,677 additional ha of silvo-pastoral areas were under SLM.</p> <p>Target Achieved</p>	
	<p>Indicator: Number of Local Development Plans (LDPs) incorporating climatic resilience.</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by the trust funded Community Action Program for Climate Resilience (P125669, FY11). Activities in the project aimed at making</p>	



	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus Area II: Reducing Vulnerability	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
	Baseline: Zero (2012) Target: 25 (2015)	<p>socio-economic development policies more responsive to climate change and at defining and implementing a comprehensive communication strategy and a system of effective knowledge management.</p> <p>The December 2016 ISR:MS reported that by December 31 2015, 38 LDPs and Annual Investment Plans (AIPs) incorporated climatic resilience.</p> <p>The latest ISR (June 2017) ISR:MS reported that by December 31 2016, the same number of LDPs and AIPs (38) incorporated climatic resilience.</p> <p>Target Achieved</p>	
7. CPS Objective: Improved Education and Employment Skills for Youth			
	Indicator: Primary completion rate Baseline: 52% (2012) Target 60% (2015) (including girls: 53%);	<p>The Support to Quality Education Project (P132405, FY15) supported this outcome by tackling supply and demand-side constraints to enrollment and retention. The objective of the project was to improve access to schooling, retention of students in school, and the quality of the teaching and learning environment at the basic education level in Niger.</p> <p>The June 2016 ISR:S reported that as of December 2015, the primary completion rate was 62.2%.</p> <p>The May 2017 management supervision report ISR:S indicated the primary completion rate of 78.3% as of December 2016. According to the World Bank's World Development Indicators Database the 2015 Primary combined completion rate was 69% while the rate for girls was 62.2%.</p> <p>Target Achieved</p>	At PLR stage, the target was updated to reflect the latest development in the sector by increasing the end target from 55% to 60% including girls at 53%;
	Indicator: Number of youth who completed dual apprenticeship programs. Baseline: 0 (2012) Target: 800 in 2015 (with at least 20% of women)	<p>The Skills Development for Growth project (P126049, FY13) supported this outcome by supporting improvements in the effectiveness of formal technical and vocational training, short term skills development and apprenticeship programs in priority sectors.</p> <p>The June 2016 management supervision report for the Skills Development for Growth project ISR:S</p>	The indicator was changed at PLR stage due to an initial formulation issue. The indicator at CPS stage was "Youth who completed dual apprenticeship programs increased from 0 in 2012 to 30% in 2015 (with at least 20% of women)." <i>The indicator was changed at PLR stage due to an initial formulation issue. The indicator at CPS stage was "Youth who completed dual apprenticeship programs increased from 0 in 2012 to 30% in 2015 (with at least 20% of women)."</i>



	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus Area II: Reducing Vulnerability	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
		<p>indicated that, by mid December 2015, 1,103 out of school youth were enrolled in dual apprenticeship programs as a result of the project and that 109 apprentices of the first cohort have completed their training in February 2016.</p> <p>The June 2017 management supervision report for the same project noted that by December 2016, 2359 youth were enrolled in dual apprenticeship programs of which, 27 percent were women. (ISR:MS). The ISR also noted that a group of 620 (of which 48 percent were women) had completed their training in various domains of agriculture such as poultry, agri-food processing, and fish farming and that 392 would be completing their training by early June 2017</p> <p>Target Achieved</p>	
8. CPS Objective: Increased Access to Water, Sanitation, Health and Population Services			
	<p>Indicator: Number of additional people in selected urban areas provided with access to improved water sources. Target: 509,000 (2015)</p>	<p>The Urban Water and Sanitation Project (P117365, FY11) and the related additional financing project (P159240, FY16) supported this outcome by seeking to expand access and sustainability of water services in Niamey, three other cities, and 18 secondary urban centers. The urban water component would focus on distribution (except in some secondary centers where expanding production is necessary) including social connections to improve the quality of services.</p> <p>The June 2016 ISR:S noted that the number of people in urban areas provided with access to Improved Water Sources under the project was 536,750 in 2015. The June 2017 ISR:S indicated that by May 2017, the number still stood at 536,750 (ISR:S)</p> <p>Target Achieved</p>	<p>At PLR stage, the target of 480,000 was replaced by 509,000 following the Urban Water and Sanitation project's restructuring new indicators).</p>
	<p>Indicator: Number of additional students provided with access to sanitation services in their schools: Target: 60,000 (2015)</p>	<p>The Urban Water and Sanitation Project (P117365, FY11) and the related additional financing project (P159240, FY16) supported this outcome by seeking to expand access to improved school sanitation services.</p>	<p>At the PLR stage and following the Urban Water and Sanitation project's restructuring, the original indicator was replaced. The original indicator was "Number</p>



	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus Area II: Reducing Vulnerability	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
		<p>To support this outcome, the Bank also delivered a NLTA report titled "Strengthening Water Supply and Sanitation Planning and Monitoring Systems in Niger," in FY15.</p> <p>The June 2016 ISR:S for the Urban Water and Sanitation project noted that the number of students provided with access to appropriate sanitation facilities in their schools under the project was 52,530 in November 2015. By October 2016, the number of students with access stood at 60,000 (ISR:S)</p> <p>Target Achieved</p>	<p><i>of additional people provided with access to improved Sanitation in selected urban areas: 235,000 by 2015."</i></p>
	<p>Indicator: Number of sex workers seen at health facilities after referral by NGOs. Baseline: 0 Target: 5,000 (2015)</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by the Second HIV/AIDS Support Project (P116167, FY11) whose objective was to increase access to HIV/AIDS and STI-related services by high risk groups. According to the management completion report, ICR:S, the number of sex workers seen at health facilities after referral by NGOs increased from 0 in 2011 to 7,500 in 2014 and to 12,907 in 2016.</p> <p>Target Achieved</p>	<p>At the PLR stage and following the 2nd phase HIV/AIDS Support project's restructuring, the original indicator was replaced. The original indicator was "Number of sex workers screened for sexually transmitted diseases increased from 0 in 2012 to 3000 in 2015."</p>
	<p>Indicator: Number of sex workers treated for Sexual Transmitted Infection (STI). Baseline: 0 Target: 500 (2015)</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by the Second HIV/AIDS Support Project (P116167, FY11). According to the ICR:S, the number of sex workers treated for STIs increased from 0 in 2011 to 5,000 in 2014 and 12,621 by June 2016.</p> <p>Target Achieved</p>	<p>At the PLR stage and following the 2nd phase HIV/AIDS Support project's restructuring, the original indicator was replaced. The original indicator was "Percentage of modern contraceptive use among women increased from 16% in 2012 to 20% by 2015"</p>
	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus Area III: Mainstreaming Gender and Strengthening Governance and Capacity for Public Service Delivery	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
	9. CPS Objective: Improved Budget Execution and Efficiency		
Major Outcome Measures	<p>Indicator: Budget execution ratio of own funded expenditures (actual/budget) Baseline: 75% (2011)</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by the Reform Management and Technical Assistance Project (P108253, FY10) which sought to improve: (i) the credibility and reliability of budgets</p>	<p>At the PLR stage, the target for the budget execution ratio was lowered from 90% to 80%.</p>



	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus Area III: Mainstreaming Gender and Strengthening Governance and Capacity for Public Service Delivery	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
	Target: 80% (2015)	<p>allocated to budget managers in each ministry; and (ii) the internal controls of the use of said budgets. The outcome was also supported by the Capacity for Service Delivery project (P145261, FY14) which sought to improve investment budget execution in selected priority sectors. The three Shared Growth Credit DPOs I (P125272 FY12), II (P132757, FY13), and III (P145251, FY14) also supported this outcome.</p> <p>The management completion report for the Shared Growth Credit DPOs ICR:MU indicated that by 2014 the overall budget execution rate had risen to an estimated 82 percent. A recent project appraisal report for an African Development Bank project indicated that the Budget Execution rate in 2015 was 85.77%</p> <p>Based on the new indicator proposed in the CLR, this target is rated as: Achieved</p>	<p>The CLR suggests that this indicator was not well defined because the precise basis on which execution rates were to be calculated, was not specified. Instead, the CLR proposes an increase in the PEFA performance indicator 1 as a substitute i.e. Total expenditure realized relative to initially approved budget. Based on this modified indicator, the CLR rates this outcome as Not achieved because "the score for PEFA indicator 1 remained unchanged during the period" However, according to the Niger 2016 PEFA report, the score for PI-1 improved from D in 2012 to B in 2016. The 2016 PEFA report indicated that "<i>Excluding debt service financing and externally financed projects, deviations in budget execution from the amounts initially forecast are lower than in the 2012 evaluation.</i>"</p>
	<p>Indicator: Share of public procurement contracts awarded through competitive bidding.</p> <p>Baseline: Target: Share maintained above 75 %</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by the Shared Growth credits I (P125272, FY12), II (P132757, FY13) and III (P145251, FY14) all of which sought to improve public financial management in part by supporting several policy reforms in the area of procurement. This outcome was also supported by an IDF grant for Procurement reform (P130134, FY13). The objective of the grant was to support Niger Government 's procurement system by i) strengthening the institutional capacity of the actors involved in</p>	<p>The CLR maintains that this indicator was not well defined and proposes the following alternative indicator: Increase in rating of PEFA performance indicator P-19 (Public competitive bidding, optimal use of resources, and public procurement thresholds. The CLR then rates the outcome as Achieved</p>



	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus Area III: Mainstreaming Gender and Strengthening Governance and Capacity for Public Service Delivery	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
		<p>procurement (regulatory agency, governments institutions and control agencies, supreme audit institutions, private sectors and civil society) and ii) improving the transparency through the development of tools for implementing the Procurement Code (simplified Standard bidding documents, sanctions study, disseminations campaigns on specific points of the Code).</p> <p>According to IEG:MU for the Shared Growth Credits, the share of procurement contracts competitively tendered by both number and value increased from 68% and 81% to 93% and 91% respectively.</p> <p>Based on the new indicator proposed in the CLR, this target is rated as: Target Not Achieved</p>	<p>because the score for PEFA indicator 19 did not change during the period.</p> <p>In the 2012 PEFA report, the procurement indicator (PI-19: Competition, value for money and controls in procurement) was assigned a score of B+.</p> <p>In the 2016 PEFA report, the new Procurement indicator (PI-24: Procurement) also received a score of B+.</p> <p>Therefore, there was no increase in the score for the procurement indicator across the two reports.</p> <p>Furthermore, the 2016 PEFA report mentions that the percentage of contracts awarded through competitive bidding seems to have deteriorated compared to the situation evaluated in 2012.</p>
10. CPS Objective: Improved Transparency of Sector Budget Allocations			
	<p>Indicator: Number of budgetary documents published based on the 'Open budget initiative classification'</p> <p>Baseline: 1 (2012) Target: 2 (2015)</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by the First Public Investment Reform Support credit (P151487, FY16) which supported policy measures to progressively improve the timeliness, comprehensiveness and detail of quarterly budget execution reports.</p> <p>According to the results of the Open Budget survey of 2015, two of the eight key budget documents were publicly available online in a timeframe consistent with international standards.</p> <p>It is worth noting however that the 2016 update of the Open Budget</p>	<p>At the PLR stage, the target for the number of budgetary documents published was lowered from 6 to 2.</p>



	CPS FY13-FY16: Focus Area III: Mainstreaming Gender and Strengthening Governance and Capacity for Public Service Delivery	Actual Results (as of current month/year)	IEG Comments
		<p>survey found that none of the eight key budget documents were publicly available online in a timeframe consistent with international standards signaling a backtracking on the budget transparency agenda.</p> <p>Target Not Achieved</p>	
11. CPS Objective: Improved Transparency in the Mining and Oil Sector			
	<p>Indicator: EITI Reports published annually</p> <p>Baseline:</p>	<p>This outcome was supported by an EITI Post Compliance trust fund grant (P126186, FY11) which supported the drafting of a proposed law on transparency in the full disclosure of information on revenue generated from extractive industry activities in the Recipient's territory.</p> <p>The Niger page of the EITI website shows the availability of the 2010-2017 EITI annual progress reports as well as reports from earlier periods.</p> <p>Nevertheless, following the 2017 EITI validation exercise for Niger, the board of the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative, EITI, suspended the Niger Republic for failure to make meaningful progress against key issues in the 2016 EITI Standards.</p> <p>Outstanding EITI requirements included transparent systems for license allocation, the lack of a comprehensive public license register, gaps between the government policy on contract transparency as mandated by the constitution and the practice of limited disclosure of contracts.</p> <p>In November 2017, the government of Niger announced its withdrawal from EITI implementation.</p> <p>Target Partially Achieved.</p>	<p>No baseline specified</p>



Annex Table 2: Niger Planned and Actual Lending, FY13 - FY16

Project ID	Project name	Proposed FY	Approval FY	Closing FY	Proposed Amount	Approved IDA Amount	Outcome Rating	Comments	Lending Instrument Type
Project Planned Under CPS/PLR 2012-2016									
						CPS/ PLR			
P126049	NE Skills Development for Growth Project	2013	2013	2020	30.0	30.0	LIR: MS		INVESTMENT
P131107	NE - Transport Sector Prog Spt Proj (AF)	2013	2013	2016	19.5	19.5			INVESTMENT
P132306	Niger Community Action Programm Phase 3	2013	2013	2020	40.0	40.0	LIR: S		INVESTMENT
P130174	First Part of the Second Phase of the Niger Basin Water Resources Development and Sustainable Ecosystems Management Program - APL 2A		2013	2021		203.0	LIR: U	REGIONAL	INVESTMENT
P132757	NE-Second Shared Growth Credit	2013	2013	2014	50.0	50.0	IEG: MU		ADJUSTMENT
P145251	NE-Third Shared Growth Credit	2014	2014	2015	50.0	70.0	IEG: MU		ADJUSTMENT
P145261	NE-Capacity for Service Delivery	2014	2014	2019	20.5	40.0	LIR: MS		INVESTMENT
P145268	Niger DRM and Urban Development Project	2014	2014	2020	100.0	100.0	LIR: MS		INVESTMENT
P147674	Regional Sahel Pastoralism Support Project		2015	2022	45.0	45.0	LIR: S	REGIONAL	INVESTMENT
P149526	Sahel Malaria and Neglected Tropical Diseases		2015	2020	37.0	37.0	LIR: MS	REGIONAL	INVESTMENT
P150080	Sahel Women's Empowerment and Demographics Project		2015	2020	53.6	53.5	LIR: MS	REGIONAL	INVESTMENT
P147638	Population and Health Support Project	2015	2015	2022	103.0	103.0	LIR: S		INVESTMENT
P148681	PRODEX Additional Financing	2015	2015	2018	13.8	13.8			INVESTMENT
P151487	First Pub Inv Reform Sppt	2016	2016	2017	80.0	80.0	LIR: MS		INVESTMENT
P153420	Climate Smart Agricult Support Project	2016	2016	2023	111.0	111.0	LIR: S		INVESTMENT
P153743	Electricity Access Expansion Project	2016	2016	2022	65.0	65.0	LIR: S		INVESTMENT
	WARCIP - Regional WA Com. Infrastructure	2014			10.0			DROPPED	INVESTMENT
Total Planned					828.4	1,060.8			
Unplanned Projects during the CPS and PLR Period									
P155846	NE-Adaptive Social Safety Nets Project (AF)		2016	2019		22.5			INVESTMENT
P159240	URB WAT & SAN (AF)		2016	2020		70.0			INVESTMENT
Total unplanned						92.5			



On-going Projects during the CPS and PLR Period		Proposed FY	Approval FY	Closing FY	Proposed Amount	Approved IDA Amount	Outcome Rating	Comments	Lending Instrument Type
P096198	NE-MS Demographic SIL (FY07)		2007	2013		10.0	IEG: MU		INVESTMENT
P095949	NE-Loc Urb Infrastructure Dev SIL (FY08)		2008	2013		30.0	IEG: MS		INVESTMENT
P101434	NE-Transport Sector Program SIM (FY08)		2008	2016		30.0	LIR: S		INVESTMENT
P093806	Niger Basin Water Resources Development and Sustainable Ecosystems Management Project		2008	2018		15.0	LIR: S	REGIONAL	INVESTMENT
P095210	NE - Agro-Pastoral Export Promotion Proj		2009	2018		40.0	LIR: S		INVESTMENT
P102354	Community Action Program (APL-2)		2009	2013		30.0	IEG: MS		INVESTMENT
P108253	Niger Reform Management and TA		2010	2017		10.0	ICR: MS		INVESTMENT
P116167	NE-HIV/AIDS Support Project II (FY11)		2011	2017		20.0	IEG:S		INVESTMENT
P117365	NE-Urban Water and Sanitation Project		2011	2020		90.0	LIR: S		INVESTMENT
P123399	Niger Safety Net Project		2011	2019		70.0	LIR: S		INVESTMENT
P122065	West Africa Agricultural Productivity Program APL (WAAPP-1C)		2011	2020		30.0	LIR: S	REGIONAL	INVESTMENT
P125272	NIGER - Shared Growth Credit I		2012	2013		50.0	IEG: MU		ADJUSTMENT
P127204	Competitiveness & Growth Support		2012	2019		50.0	LIR: MS		INVESTMENT
Total On-going						475.0			

Source: WB Business Intelligence 12/08/2017



Annex Table 3: Advisory Services and Analytics Deliveries for Niger, FY13-16

Proj ID	Economic & Sector Work	Fiscal year	Output Type
P127537	NIGER - PEMFAR update and dialogue	FY14	Public Expenditure Review (PER)
P127544	NIGER - Policy Notes on Growth and Poverty	FY14	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P130410	DeMPA Assessment - Niger	FY14	Debt management Performance Assessment(DeMPA)
P132794	Gender, Agency and Economic Development	FY14	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P133792	Security Sector Public Expenditure Review	FY14	Public Expenditure Review (PER)
P143617	Country Status Report for Health	FY14	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P148852	NE - Country Statistical Assessment Mgt	FY14	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P149721	Niger Allocative Efficiency Study	FY14	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P144949	Niger Reform Plan	FY15	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
P146536	Niger - Policy Notes Series 2	FY15	Sector or Thematic Study/Note
Proj ID	Non-Lending Technical Assistance	Fiscal year	Output Type
P125257	Niger #10091 Financial Sector Devt Strategy	FY13	Technical Assistance
P098637	Energy Sector Assessment (FY10)	FY14	Technical Assistance
P119212	NE-Local Development (Kandadji)	FY14	Technical Assistance
P128243	NE:GAC Strategy and Institutional Development.	FY14	Technical Assistance
P133229	Advisory on Rural Finance	FY14	Technical Assistance
P143820	Social Protection for building resilience	FY14	Technical Assistance
P127161	CSO - Niger	FY15	Technical Assistance
P133119	Strengthening Enabling Environment Sanitation	FY15	Technical Assistance
P133120	Strengthening WSS planning and monitoring	FY15	Technical Assistance
P146896	NE- Extended GAC Review	FY15	Technical Assistance
P133121	Strengthening the Domestic Private Sector	FY16	Technical Assistance
P147750	Niger Electricity Access Expansion	FY16	Technical Assistance
P152010	Financial Sector Strategy Implementation	FY16	Technical Assistance

Source: WB Business Intelligence 12/08/2017

Annex Table 4: Niger Grants and Trust Funds Active in FY13-16

Country	Project ID	Project Name	TF ID	Approval FY	Closing FY	Approved Amount (US\$ M)	Outcome Rating
Niger	P095346	Carbon Sequestration and Rural Livelihoods Improvements through Acacia Plantations	TF 57572	2007	2019	2.1	
Niger	P107841	Integrated Ecosystems Management in Niger (APL phase 2)	TF 92411	2009	2013	4.7	
Niger	P123567	Niger Second Emergency Food Security Support Project	TF 99561	2011	2015	15.0	IEG: S
Niger	P125669	Niger Community Action Project for Climate Resilience	TF 98930	2011	2013	0.6	
Niger	P123802	LSMS-ISA Niger	TF 97661	2011	2017	1.6	
Niger	P117209	Support to National Statistical Office: Trust Fund for Statistical Capacity Building - III	TF 95560	2011	2014	0.2	
Niger	P125669	Niger Community Action Project for Climate Resilience	TF 11426	2012	2019	35.0	LIR: MS
Niger	P125669	Niger Community Action Project for Climate Resilience	TF 11338	2012	2019	28.0	LIR: MS
Niger	P126186	Niger EITI - Post Compliance I	TF 99427	2012	2013	0.2	
Niger	P096198	Multi-Sector Demographic Project	TF 98265	2012	2013	0.4	IEG:MU
Niger	P130134	NE PROCUREMENT REFORM	TF 14973	2013	2016	0.5	
Niger	P143079	PSG: Integrated Ecosystems Management	TF 14700	2013	2018	4.5	
Niger	P131092	Support to Niger Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)	TF 14017	2013	2016	0.5	
Niger	P145932	Niger Disaster Risk Management and Urban Development Project	TF 16000	2014	2020	6.6	LIR: MS
Niger	P129572	National Strategy for the Development of Statistics - 2	TF 12013	2014	2017	0.3	
Niger	P150108	Niger Africa Extrative Industries Trust Fund	TF 18145	2015	2018	1.4	
Niger	P132405	Niger - GPE - Support to Quality Education Project	TF 16565	2015	2019	84.2	LIR: S
Niger	P148839	Niger Investment Climate Support	TF A0809	2016	2019	3.8	
Niger	P123399	Niger Safety Net Project	TF A2304	2016	2018	8.5	LIR: S
		Total				198.0	

Source: Client Connection as of 11/14/17
IEG Validates RETF that are 5M and above



Annex Table 5: IEG Project Ratings for Niger, FY13-16

Exit FY	Country	Proj ID	Project Name	IEG Outcome	IEG Risk to DO Rating	Net Commitments
2013	Niger	P095949	NE-Loc Urb Infrastructure Dev SIL (FY08)	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT	19.9
2013	Niger	P096198	NE-MS Demographic SIL (FY07)	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT	10.4
2013	Niger	P102354	Community Action Program (APL-2)	MODERATELY SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT	28.9
2013	Niger	P125272	NIGER - Shared Growth Credit(s)	MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY*	HIGH	49.5
2015	Niger	P123567	NE: Second Emergency Food Security Project	SATISFACTORY	SIGNIFICANT	0.0
Total						108.6

Source: Business Intelligence IEG Ratings as of 02/06/18

Note: *This project rating is for the Shared Growth Credits I, II, and III (P125272, P132757, P145251)

Annex Table 6: IEG Project Ratings for Niger and Comparators, FY13-16

Country/Region	Total Evaluated (\$M)	Total Evaluated (No)	Outcome % Sat (\$)	Outcome % Sat (No)	RDO % Moderate or Lower Sat (\$)*	RDO % Moderate or Lower Sat (No)
Niger	108.6	5	44.9	60	0.0	0
AFR	15,501.4	300	74.5	66	36.0	31
World	86,654.3	1,016	83.9	71	53.5	43

Source: Business Intelligence as of 02/06/18

*Refer to Annex Table 5 for IEG Ratings for Risk for Development Outcome (RDO).



Annex Table 7: Portfolio Status for Niger and Comparators, FY13-16

Fiscal year	2013	2014	2015	2016	Average FY13-16
Niger					
# Proj	13	14	15	18	15
% At Risk	23	29	27	22	25
Net Comm Amt	532.2	698.7	816.0	1,116.5	791
# Proj At Risk	3	4	4	4	4
Comm At Risk	163.0	225.0	268.7	219.6	219
% Commit at Risk	31	32	33	20	29
AFR					
# Proj	566	620	643	659	622
% At Risk	23	22	21	22	22
Net Comm Amt	42,649.1	49,142.6	54,586.3	59,033.9	51,353
# Proj At Risk	128	138	136	144	137
Comm At Risk	14,310.8	16,548.2	16,000.3	18,949.8	16,452
% Commit at Risk	34	34	29	32	32
World					
# Proj	1,964	2,048	2,022	1,975	2,002
% At Risk	21	20	22	21	21
Net Comm Amt	176,202.6	192,610.1	201,045.2	220,331.5	197,547
# Proj At Risk	414	412	444	422	423
Comm At Risk	40,805.6	40,933.5	45,987.7	44,244.9	42,993
% Commit at Risk	23	21	23	20	22

Source: Business Intelligence as of 02/06/18

Note: Includes both IDA projects and Trust Fund grants.



Annex Table 8: Disbursement Ratio for Niger, FY13-16

Fiscal year	2013	2014	2015	2016	Overall Result
Niger					
Disbursement Ratio (%)	18.1	17.2	22.9	26.1	21.6
Inv Disb in FY	45.23	51.77	81.59	102.62	281.20
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY	250.4	301.2	355.7	392.5	1,299.8
AFR					
Disbursement Ratio (%)	22.1	22.8	24.2	19.4	22.1
Inv Disb in FY	5,299.00	5,733.50	6,065.10	5,161.20	22,258.80
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY	23,950.4	25,191.6	25,054.6	26,631.7	100,828.3
World					
Disbursement Ratio (%)	19.8	20.2	21.2	18.8	20.0
Inv Disb in FY	19,050.00	19,414.20	20,317.90	19,401.10	78,183.20
Inv Tot Undisb Begin FY	96,038.8	96,254.9	95,816.0	103,447.2	391,556.8

* Calculated as IBRD/IDA Disbursements in FY / Opening Undisbursed Amount at FY. Restricted to Lending Instrument Type = Investment.

Business Intelligence disbursement ratio table as of 12/08/17

Annex Table 9: Net Disbursement and Charges for Niger, FY13-16

Period	Disb. Amt.	Repay Amt.	Net Amt.	Charges	Fees	Net Transfer
FY13	103.9	1.9	102.0	0.0	3.0	98.9
FY14	108.9	2.6	106.3	0.0	3.9	102.4
FY15	164.9	3.1	161.9	0.0	4.1	157.8
FY16	203.4	3.4	200.1	0.0	4.6	195.5
Report Total	581.2	11.0	570.2	0.0	15.6	554.6

World Bank Client Connection 12/08/17



Annex Table 10: Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid, 2013-2015

Development Partners	2013	2014	2015
Australia	4.47	0.33	0.27
Austria	0.49	0.06	0.03
Belgium	25.01	17.38	17.13
Canada	20.70	7.34	10.53
Czech Republic	0.08
Denmark	12.91	10.03	12.41
Finland	1.33	..	0.03
France	67.02	52.84	51.18
Germany	22.52	26.89	24.42
Greece
Hungary	0.00
Iceland
Ireland	3.26	3.02	2.16
Italy	1.86	3.44	2.66
Japan	34.47	32.05	27.69
Korea	0.09	0.50	0.53
Luxembourg	15.50	19.76	23.64
Netherlands
New Zealand
Norway	9.94	10.40	11.20
Poland
Portugal	0.00
Slovak Republic
Slovenia
Spain	5.88	17.44	7.45
Sweden	8.00	7.54	5.52
Switzerland	24.13	26.81	29.73
United Kingdom	..	0.18	..
United States	78.33	79.29	111.90
DAC Countries, Total	335.91	315.30	338.56
EU Institutions	183.63	261.14	227.20
International Monetary Fund, Total	17.15	51.43	54.57
IMF (Concessional Trust Funds)	17.15	51.43	54.57
Regional Development Banks, Total	41.47	31.68	50.98
African Development Bank, Total	29.85	27.26	46.81
African Development Bank [AfDB]	..	0.01	0.01
African Development Fund [AfDF]	29.85	27.25	46.79
Asian Development Bank, Total
Asian Development Bank [AsDB]



Development Partners	2013	2014	2015
AsDB Special Funds
Inter-American Development Bank, Total
Inter-American Development Bank [IDB]
IDB Special Fund
Caribbean Development Bank [CarDB]
Council of Europe Development Bank [CEB]
European Bank for Reconstruction and Development [EBRD]
Islamic Development Bank [IsDB]	11.63	4.42	4.17
United Nations, Total	53.00	61.74	60.78
Food and Agriculture Organisation [FAO]	0.32
International Atomic Energy Agency [IAEA]	0.15
IFAD	9.34
International Labour Organisation [ILO]	0.32	0.58	0.50
UNAIDS	0.49	0.37	0.37
UNDP	8.81	9.26	8.16
UNECE
UNEP
UNFPA	3.78	3.27	3.64
UNHCR	0.31
UNICEF	20.82	19.88	19.71
UN Peacebuilding Fund [UNPBF]	0.74	1.79	0.55
UNRWA
WFP	15.65	24.88	15.90
World Health Organisation [WHO]	1.75	1.71	2.45
World Bank Group, Total	116.66	145.60	96.76
World Bank, Total	116.66	145.60	96.76
International Bank for Reconstruction and Development [IBRD]
International Development Association [IDA]	116.66	145.60	96.76
International Finance Corporation [IFC]
Other Multilateral, Total	52.21	70.60	55.01
Adaptation Fund
Arab Bank for Economic Development in Africa [BADEA]	3.21	3.39	1.41
Arab Fund (AFESD)
Climate Investment Funds [CIF]	1.33	5.33	2.62
Global Alliance for Vaccines and Immunization [GAVI]	20.78	19.14	30.52
Global Environment Facility [GEF]	3.93	4.86	3.81
Global Fund	14.18	35.41	15.32
Global Green Growth Institute [GGGI]
Montreal Protocol
Nordic Development Fund [NDF]
OPEC Fund for International Development [OFID]	8.78	2.47	1.33



Development Partners	2013	2014	2015
OSCE
Multilateral Agencies, Total	464.11	622.20	545.29
Azerbaijan
Bulgaria
Croatia
Cyprus
Estonia
Israel
Kazakhstan
Kuwait (KFAED)	-2.03	-1.86	0.65
Latvia
Liechtenstein
Lithuania
Malta
Romania
Russia
Saudi Arabia
Chinese Taipei
Thailand
Timor-Leste
Turkey	9.62	4.13	8.90
United Arab Emirates	0.24	0.53	0.65
Other donor countries
Non-DAC Countries, Total	7.83	2.80	10.20
Development Partners, Total	807.85	940.30	894.05

Source: OECD Stat as of 12/08/17



Annex Table 11: Economic and Social Indicators for Niger, 2013 – 2016

Series Name	2013	2014	2015	2016	Niger	SSA	World
					Average 2013-2016		
Growth and Inflation							
GDP growth (annual %)	5.3	7.0	3.6	5.0	5.2	3.4	2.7
GDP per capita growth (annual %)	1.3	3.0	-0.3	1.1	1.3	0.7	1.4
GNI per capita, PPP (current international \$)	880.0	930.0	950.0	970.0	932.5	3498.5	15403.0
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$)	400.0	420.0	390.0	370.0	395.0	1642.4	10653.6
Inflation, consumer prices (annual %)	2.3	-0.9	1.0	0.2	0.6	4.6	2.1
Composition of GDP (%)							
Agriculture, value added (% of GDP)	18	4
Industry, value added (% of GDP)	25	28
Services, etc., value added (% of GDP)	57	68
Gross fixed capital formation (% of GDP)	36.0	37.7	38.8	..	37.5	20.6	23.5
External Accounts							
Exports of goods and services (% of GDP)	22.6	21.0	17.2	..	20.3	27.3	30.0
Imports of goods and services (% of GDP)	39.1	39.2	39.4	..	39.2	31.3	29.4
Current account balance (% of GDP)	-15.0	-15.0
External debt stocks (% of GNI)	35.6	33.0	41.2	43.5	38.3
Total debt service (% of GNI)	0.7	0.8	1.3	1.3	1.0	2.1	..
Total reserves in months of imports	4.9	13.4
Fiscal Accounts*							
General government revenue (% of GDP)	24.6	23.0	23.5	20.6	22.9	18.9	..
General government total expenditure (% of GDP)	27.2	31.1	32.5	26.8	29.4	22.9	..
General government net lending/borrowing (% of GDP)	-2.6	-8.0	-9.1	-6.2	-6.5	-4.0	..
General government gross debt (% of GDP)	26.3	32.0	41.0	46.3	36.4	35.9	..
Health							
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	58.7	59.2	59.7	..	59.2	59.4	71.7
Immunization, DPT (% of children ages 12-23 months)	67.0	68.0	65.0	67.0	66.8	73.3	85.3
Improved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)	10.5	10.8	10.9	..	10.7	29.4	67.0
Improved water source (% of population with access)	57.3	58.1	58.2	..	57.9	66.6	90.5
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	55.6	53.8	52.3	50.9	53.2	55.9	32.0
Education							
School enrollment, preprimary (% gross)	7.0	7.1	7.4	..	7.2	21.1	47.4
School enrollment, primary (% gross)	70.2	70.6	72.5	..	71.1	98.1	104.7
School enrollment, secondary (% gross)	16.8	18.8	20.7	..	18.8	42.5	76.1
Population							
Population, total (millions)	18.4	19.1	19.9	20.7	19.5	992.4	7,312.3
Population growth (annual %)	3.8	3.8	3.8	3.8	3.8	2.8	1.2
Urban population (% of total)	18.2	18.5	18.7	19.0	18.6	37.5	53.6

Source: DDP as of 11/16/17

*International Monetary Fund, World Economic Outlook Database, October 2017



Annex Table 12: List of IFC Advisory Services in Niger Advisory Services Approved in FY13-16

Advisory Services Approved in FY13-17

Project ID	Project Name	Impl Start FY	Impl End FY	Project Status	Primary Business Line	Total Funds, US\$
600247	Niger Irrigation Program	2014	2019	ACTIVE	MAS	2,104,972
	Sub-Total					2,104,972

Advisory Services Approved pre-FY13 but active during FY13-17

Project ID	Project Name	Impl Start FY	Impl End FY	Project Status	Primary Business Line	Total Funds, US\$
28148	Niger Port	2010	2015	ACTIVE	CAS	1,528,229
	Sub-Total					1,528,229
	TOTAL					3,633,201

Advisory Services Approved pre-FY13 but active during FY13-17

Annex Table 13: IFC net commitment activity in Niger, FY13 - FY16 (US\$, 000)

		2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	Total
Trade Finance (TF)		4,000,000	1,801,468	1,000,000			6,801,468
Tourism, Retail, Construction & Real Estates (TRP)	Retail	19,480	(522,700)	-			(503,220)
Total		4,019,480	1,278,768	1,000,000	-	-	6,298,248

Source: IFC MIS as of 10/20/17

Annex Table 14: List of MIGA Activities 2013-2016 (US\$, millions)

ID	Contract Enterprise	FY	Project Status	Sector	Investor	Max Gross Issuance
8429	Cotecna Inspection S.A., Niamey Liaison Office	2013	Not Active	Services	Switzerland	6
Total						6

Source: MIGA 10/24/17