



1. Project Data

Project ID
P102177

Project Name
TVEM

Country
Kazakhstan

Practice Area(Lead)
Education

L/C/TF Number(s)
IBRD-79310

Closing Date (Original)
31-Dec-2013

Total Project Cost (USD)
36,360,316.00

Bank Approval Date
08-Jul-2010

Closing Date (Actual)
31-Dec-2015

	IBRD/IDA (USD)	Grants (USD)
Original Commitment	29,230,000.00	0.00
Revised Commitment	29,083,913.01	0.00
Actual	29,083,913.01	0.00

Prepared by
Ann Elizabeth Flanagan

Reviewed by
Susan Ann Caceres

ICR Review Coordinator
Joy Behrens

Group
IEGHC (Unit 2)

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

The project development objective as stated in the Loan Agreement (World Bank, 2010, p. 4) was "to raise the relevance, quality, and efficiency of technical and vocational education (TVE) through an improved policy framework and institutional capacity." The statement of objectives in the Project Appraisal Document (PAD) was identical.

b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?



No

c. Will a split evaluation be undertaken?

No

d. Components

Component 1: Develop Standards and Quality Assurance for Technical and Vocational Education (Appraisal, US\$2.2 million; Actual, US\$2.2 million) financed the foundation of the national TVE system. It had three subcomponents:

- Develop a National Qualifications System (NQS) and a National Qualifications Framework (NQF) to be applied through administrative regulations;
- Develop National Occupational Standards (NOS) laying out the performance criteria required of employees including knowledge and understanding of these criteria, the scope and elements of the criteria; and values and behaviors expected of potential workers. Employer councils and associations were expected to assist in formulating educational standards, curriculum materials, evaluation and certification of employees, and personnel management in line with the new standards.
- Finance technical assistance to improve qualifications assessment mechanisms.
- Support the development and introduction (including adjusting laws and regulations) of an independent, institutional accreditation process.

Component 2: Strengthen Governance, Management, and Financing for Technical and Vocational Education (Appraisal, US\$1.4 million; Actual, US\$1.8 million) supported active involvement of employers in TVE development. It had four subcomponents:

- Provide technical assistance to national, regional, institutional, and sector councils comprised of employer and stakeholder representatives to establish the structure and functions of councils within the TVE system;
- Design and pilot-test formula-based approaches to TVE financing;
- Develop a monitoring and evaluation system for the TVE system to guide policy and decision-making;
- Establish a project management unit (PMU) with the MOES for overall project implementation.

Component 3: Strengthen Skills Delivery Capacity of Technical and Vocational Education (Appraisal, US\$25.6 million; Actual US\$ 25 million) supported the consolidation and integration of existing TVE programs into the newly established competency-based curriculum. It had three subcomponents:

- Revise and develop national level educational standards and core competency-based curricula;
- Develop in-service teacher training programs and pedagogical strategies for teaching the new curricula and develop key competencies in technical areas (financed through awarded grants);
- Implement institutional development plans (IDPs) based on an integrated package of competency-based modular curricula, professional development, upgraded facilities and technology, and overall



alignment with NQS and NQF (financed through competitively awarded grants).

Component 3 was revised in September 2014. A third round of competitive grants was conducted. Grants were awarded to project schools; the selected schools were provided with financial support to act as resource centers for non-project schools (e.g., advisory assistance or access to equipment). The resource centers were expected to increase the return on investment. The revision also supported a pilot of a number of the competency-based curricula developed by the project.

e. Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates

Project Costs

Total project costs were expected to be US\$33.23 million; actual costs were US\$32.98 million. Final disbursement was 99% of original disbursement. In April 2014, the tenge (Kazakhstani currency) depreciated by 20%, resulting in an additional US\$3 million dollars allocated to Component 3 which was funded in the local currency (see further explanation below). Developing the NQS, NQF, and NOS (Component 1) accounted for 7.6% of the actual loan amount. Strengthening governance, management, and financing of TVE (Component 2) accounted for 6.2% of the actual loan amount. Strengthening skills delivery and TVE institutions (Component 3) -- which included the competitive grants -- accounted for 86.2% of the actual loan amount.

The expected borrower contribution was US\$4 million; actual borrower contribution was nearly that amount (US\$3.9 million).

The operation was financed by an International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD) loan (US\$29.23 million).

Dates:

- The project was approved on July 8, 2010, and was expected to close on December 31, 2013, but closed two years later, on December 31, 2015. The first extension was granted on July 26, 2013, due to the delay in project effectiveness by the Government. It extended closing from December 31, 2013 to December 31, 2014. The project was extended again in September 2014 to accommodate a favorable exchange rate variation in the tenge (Kazakhstani currency) that permitted financing of additional activities. The closing date was extended by another 12 months to December 31, 2015.

3. Relevance of Objectives & Design

a. Relevance of Objectives

The project was very relevant to moving from a Soviet-style Technical and Vocational Education (TVE) system to one driven more by market needs. A 2008 labor force survey conducted by the World Bank found a mismatch between the skills supplied and demanded in the labor market; lack of appropriate skills in the



labor force and low productivity were significant barriers to private sector development in Kazakhstan. Improving the human capital base in the country was a key strategy of the government to aid in diversifying its economy.

At approval, the project was well aligned with the government's National Strategy for Industrial Innovation Development for 2003–2015, which sought to increase Kazakhstan's competitiveness through improvements to the investment climate, institutions, human capital, and basic infrastructure (PAD, p.4). The project's objectives were consistent with the government's current sector strategy – the State Program for Technical and Vocational Education and Training Development (2008–2012). At closing, the project remained consistent with the Government's continued emphasis on diversification and continued emphasis on technical and vocational education (TVE). For example, the State Program of Accelerated Industrial Development and Innovation for 2010–2014 and the State Education Development Program 2011-2020 specifically called for modernization and reforms to the TVE system to better align workforce skills with labor market demands.

At approval and closing, the project was fully consistent with the World Bank's 2004 and 2012 country programs which explicitly engaged in the areas identified in the government's strategy to improve competitiveness by investing in human capital (CAS, p. 5; CPS, p. 20-21).

Rating

Substantial

b. Relevance of Design

The project was designed to address all four areas of the TVE sector strategy (i.e., content, structure and governance, facilities, and quality and standards). It was also designed to address the major challenges the TVE system faced at project approval, such as the supply-driven approach to educating students, limited linkages to the demands of the labor market, outdated curriculum and pedagogy, and inefficient allocation of resources to TVE institutions. Revisions to national educational standards, curriculum, and teacher training laid the groundwork for improvements in the quality of technical and vocational education. As envisioned in the design, national-level reforms would catalyze improvements in educational content and pedagogy in self-selected public and private technical colleges and lyceums. All project activities required active involvement of the private sector (potential employers) and an established structure through which the private sector could support modernization of the TVE system (national, regional, sector councils), ensuring the relevance of skills learned (including proficiency levels). Piloting formula-based financing was unlikely to improve the efficiency of the TVE system, although the planned rigorous evaluation could have provided evidence of its effectiveness and supported an evidence-based plan for nationwide roll-out. The objectives were overly ambitious for the three-year implementation period to which the Bank agreed.

Rating



Modest

4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy)

Objective 1

Objective

Raise the quality of the technical and vocational education system

Rationale

Outputs

- The National Qualifications Framework and key elements of the National Qualifications System were formally adopted by the Government of Kazakhstan in June 2013, meeting the target. Changes were made to the Labor Law reflecting the National Qualifications System and the National Qualifications Framework was approved by the Government of Kazakhstan in February 2012 and November 2015, respectively, meeting the target.
- A National Action Plan introducing the National Qualification System was approved in June 2013, meeting the target.
- A report by the European Union noted improvements in the governance of Kazakhstan's TVE sector over the project period -- in particular, moving from a supply-driven to a demand-driven model of education provision by ensuring private sector representation on national, regional, and sector councils.
- Technical assistance provided by the project conducted a study and provided recommendations to improve the governance and management of TVE institutions. Three of these recommendations were included in the State Program on Education Development 2016-2019: (i) develop school boards to facilitate greater collaboration between TVE institutions and employers, (ii) introduce work-based training to complement school-based training in a dual system approach to TVE education, and (iii) strengthen councils at all levels (ICR, p. 46).
- Accreditation standards and procedures for institutional accreditation (voluntary) were developed and approved as of March 2012, meeting the target.
- 6 in-service teacher training programs were developed to provide in-service training in competency-based teaching methods, meeting the target.
- 68 lyceums/colleges received competitive grant funding (12% of total institutions), surpassing the target of 10%.
- 9 private TVE institutions received grants (13% of the total number of institutions receiving grants), falling short of the target of 35%. The ICR reports (p. viii) that required administrative procedures such as reporting and auditing were time-consuming, which led to low uptake among the private TVE institutions.
- 36% of teachers in project schools (925 teachers) were trained in developing and delivering new competency-based curricula, surpassing the target of 25%.



- 91% of project schools (62 of 68 public and private lyceums and colleges) planned and introduced programs that use competency-based curricula, falling short of the targeted 100%. All project schools developed competency-based programs. The remaining 9% of schools are expected to implement their programs between 2016-2017.
- 6 schools passed institutional accreditation, falling short of the target of 10 (one in each priority sector).
- Core curriculum revised and aligned with occupational standards in 147 educational programs in project supported schools, meeting the target.

Outcomes

- A survey was conducted at the end of the project as part of an impact assessment to measure the improvement in the quality of TVE education. The survey collected data on the perceptions of satisfaction of the project's main beneficiaries -- teachers and students in project supported schools (those with implementation development plans). High levels of satisfaction were reported for all groups: 91% of teachers were satisfied with teaching training programs; 88% of graduates rated their education as good or excellent; and 93% of students were satisfied with the revised programs. No comparison was given for students and teachers from non-project schools. The rates of student satisfaction with the education they received and employers' satisfaction with graduates both showed substantial improvement between 2012 and 2015. The survey also found a statistically significant difference in employers' satisfaction between beneficiary and non-beneficiary schools (ICR, p. 44). The ICR provided limited detail on the survey methodology, and caution is warranted in drawing strong conclusions. For example, the ICR provided no information on how the 2012 data were collected making it difficult to attribute the change to the project.
- Supplemental data from the Ministry of Education and Science were provided by the project team. These data show a large increase in the employment rates of graduates from project-supported colleges -- from 48 percent in 2010 to 73 percent in 2016 (post-project implementation). Over the same period, non-project colleges had an 8 percentage points increase in employment of graduates. Although not a controlled comparison, it may suggest mitigation of external factors such as overall increases in employment rates. In fact, employment rates in non-project colleges were initially higher than in project supported colleges. After project completion, employment rates were higher among project-supported colleges than in those colleges that did not benefit from the project.

Rating

Substantial

Objective 2

Objective

Raise the relevance of the technical and vocational education system

Rationale



Outputs

- 100% of national and sector councils have one-third industry representation among their members, increased from 35% and meeting the target.
- 10 councils established in the 10 priority sectors (oil and gas, metallurgy, machinery, agro-processing, construction, communications and information technology, geology, mining, power engineering and transportation sectors), increased from 4 to 10 and meeting the target.
- 100% of newly developed occupational standards included qualification assessment tools, meeting the target.
- Core curriculum revised and aligned with occupational standards in 147 educational programs supported by the project, meeting the target.
- 100% of targeted schools established boards, meeting the target
- 100% of occupations in the 10 priority sectors covered by the new occupational standards (out of the total number of occupations in the priority sectors), meeting the target
- The project started the process of modernization of the TVE system; project activities laid the foundation for follow-on work. The Government continues to increase the role and involvement of the private sector in governing TVE institutions. Specifically, the private sector has been given authority to develop all occupational standards; align qualifications with the NQF; and continue to push the NQS agenda. Changes to the Labor Law were effective as of January 2016, reflecting the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs of Republic of Kazakhstan's authority for all aspects of professional standard setting became effective in January 2016.
- The international accreditation pilot highlighted the importance of the issue and the improvements needed to become globally competitive. The State Program for Education Development 2016-2019 incorporates activities to align Kazakhstan's system to international standards.
- The transparency and autonomy of budget planning was increased. Independent school boards were required to include private sector participation which would allow individual TVE institutions greater flexibility to deliver and assess competencies based on modular programs customized to local employers or individual learners.

Outcomes

- As a proxy for satisfaction with graduates' skills, the project reported employers satisfaction with the industry-led competency-based occupational standards developed during project implementation. Employers' associations fully endorsed (100%) the competency-based occupational standards and their use in developing curricula and programs in TVE institutions, surpassing the 60% target.
- A survey undertaken to determine how satisfied employers were with the relevance of TVE content found 70% of employers were satisfied with recent TVE graduates from project schools. The survey also found a statistically significant and substantial difference in the "level of employer satisfaction with graduate skills coming from beneficiary versus non-beneficiary colleges offering similar programs in the region" (ICR, p.44). The ICR provided little detail on the evaluation methodology, however. Based on the



information provided in the text, caution is warranted in drawing strong conclusions.

Rating
Substantial

Objective 3

Objective

Raise the efficiency of the technical and vocational education system

Rationale

Outputs

- A study of formula-based financing policy options was conducted. Proposals were developed and a plan for nationwide implementation of a formula-based (per-capita) financing model was adopted.
- The team reported that the per capita financing model has been developed and tested and is ready for implementation.

Outcomes

- Data on improved efficiency of the TVE system were not reported in the ICR.

Rating
Modest

5. Efficiency

An economic analysis was conducted at approval. The benefit-cost ratio was calculated as 2.2. At a 5% discount rate the NPV of costs (2010-2030) were estimated to be US\$47.6 million (constant 2010 prices), which included the borrowing cost of the loan (over 20 years) to the Government of Kazakhstan (GOK) and continued maintenance and support for the GOK's investment (over ten years). The economic benefits to the GOK included increased personal income tax revenues, which would capture higher wages to more qualified TVE graduates. This was used as a proxy for the benefits accrued to individuals educated in the revamped TVE system. The NPV of total benefits over the period 2015-2030 (at a 5% discount rate) was estimated to be US\$103.5 million, starting to accrue in 2015. The NPV of net benefits was estimated to be



US\$55.9 million.

At the time of the ICR, the benefit-cost ratio was recalculated as 2.96. The higher ratio reflects more recent data reflecting both macroeconomic conditions and actual financing amounts (ICR, p. 17). Benefits included in the analysis are those accrued by the GOK as well as benefits to individuals through higher expected earnings. The benefit stream is calculated over a 15-year period, similar to the analysis performed at appraisal. The analysis accounts for both direct and indirect costs of borrowing as before. The NPV of the project was calculated as US\$60.7 million. The project team provided additional supporting evidence with adjusted internal rate of return calculations. Underlying assumptions on costs and benefits were not specified. A devaluation in the tenge provided an additional US\$3 million which funded the development of resource centers so that project schools could provide assistance to non-project schools, increasing the efficiency of project funding. Resource centers were established in each of the 15 oblasts. The project team provided data on the positive externalities from these resource centers: an additional 20,000-plus non-project students benefiting from the project by way of these resource centers.

The team also reported efficiency gains from peer-to-peer teacher professional development and learning. Project supported college staff lead and support the network of local colleges in teacher professional development and peer learning in rolling out the modernization program due to their enhanced technical and intellectual capacity.

The project experienced a lengthy and costly project preparation and two extensions. Delays at project implementation were due to GOK procedures and procurement delays, resulting in a one year extension.

Efficiency Rating

Substantial

a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR) and/or Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation:

	Rate Available?	Point value (%)	*Coverage/Scope (%)
Appraisal		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable
ICR Estimate		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable

* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.

6. Outcome

Relevance of objectives is rated substantial. Relevance of project design is rated modest. The objectives of improved quality and improved relevance of TVE were substantially achieved. The remaining objective of improved efficiency of TVE was modestly achieved. Efficiency of the project is rated substantial. Taken together, these indicate moderate shortcomings in the operation's relevance, achievement of objectives, and efficiency, and therefore a rating of Moderately Satisfactory.



a. Outcome Rating
Moderately Satisfactory

7. Rationale for Risk to Development Outcome Rating

Fiscal constraints make it unlikely that the funding formula will be rolled out as an efficiency enhancing measure. Legislative changes in January 2016 may affect the ability of the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs to develop and update occupational standards. These risks are mitigated by the follow-on Skills and Jobs Project, which is expected to continue to implement activities undertaken by the TVE modernization project, specifically the modernization of training standards and competency-based modular curricula.

a. Risk to Development Outcome Rating
Modest

8. Assessment of Bank Performance

a. Quality-at-Entry

Project preparation was preceded by relevant technical assistance. Preparation was participatory and built consensus among key stakeholders (e.g., the Ministry of Health and Social Development, National Chamber of Commerce, other donors, Ministry of Labor and Social Protection, private sector, students, directors of schools, local government authorities). While the up-front work allowed the MOES to tailor international experience to its own needs and design an appropriate policy for Kazakhstan, preparation was lengthy and costly. High turnover in task team leaders (due to internal Bank processes, e.g., routine staff rotations) also impacted project preparation.

The initial three-year project period reflected the intention of GOK to pilot reforms prior to rolling them out to the TVE system-wide. The Bank team redesigned the project (from a project designed for five years, ICR, p. 7), however, the objectives and scope of the project were remained ambitious for the three-year timeframe. The results framework did not distinguish between outputs and outcomes. The impact assessment, if conducted as planned, using before-and-after analysis (augmented with routine administrative data) and quasi-experimental design, might have provided evidence of a causal link between project activities and achievement of objectives as measured by outcome indicators.

Quality-at-Entry Rating
Moderately Satisfactory



b. Quality of supervision

Continuity of Bank TTLs during project implementation allowed for tight oversight of project progress. Difficulties and delays were noted in implementation status reports and aide memoires, such as difficulties in hiring appropriate technical staff in the PMU. Supervision provided technical assistance on demand and remained responsive to the GOK. The PDO was not revised at restructuring to address weaknesses in design; in particular, the PDO was not revised to drop the efficiency objective, despite the fact that "the results framework did not include an outcome indicator to specifically measure the 'efficiency' part of the PDO" (ICR, p. 8).

Further supervision weaknesses included the lack of planning for evidence collection envisioned at project appraisal, and that the impact evaluation originally envisioned was not conducted as planned.

Quality of Supervision Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

Overall Bank Performance Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

9. Assessment of Borrower Performance

a. Government Performance

At project closing, all but one of the planned activities had been completed (ICR, p. 8). The formula-based funding pilot was postponed due to events beyond the scope of the project. The main reason for postponing was national budget constraints due to the economic crisis, which did not allow budgeting additional resources and introducing the new mechanism. Project effectiveness took almost a year. The delay was caused by internal government procedures aggravated by early presidential elections, which resulted in rotation among high-level officials in the key ministries in the cabinet, including the project implementing agency, the Ministry of Education and Science (MOES), delaying project approval by the GOK. Initial delays were exacerbated by unfamiliarity with Bank procedures. The requested three-year project duration was unrealistic given project activities. Following the project's midterm review in June 2013, it became clear that an extension of the project's closing date was needed to make up for the initial delays and enable all planned activities to be completed, the GOK requested an extension of the loan closing date to December 30, 2014. The government complied with all the Bank's financial covenants with satisfactory financial management procedures throughout project implementation.

Government Performance Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

b. Implementing Agency Performance

MOES experienced initial implementation delays in hiring key staff in the Project Management Unit (PMU). Early implementation delays were also due to elaborate internal approval processes within the GOK once the loan became effective. Despite these initial delays, MOES worked with the Bank team to ensure all activities were implemented within the (extended) project period. The MOES did not adequately



ensure monitoring the design and implementation of the monitoring and evaluation framework, in particular, the impact assessment envisioned at appraisal.

Implementing Agency Performance Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

Overall Borrower Performance Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

10. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization

a. M&E Design

The project objectives were clearly stated. The indicators reflected the project's focus on the demand for TVE education. Output indicators were provided in the hope of measuring progress toward the objectives. However, the output indicators were not sufficient to provide information on how improvements in standards translated to improvements in teaching content; how training or competency-based curricula improved pedagogy; or how either of these increased the relevance and quality of skills of students trained in project schools. None of the measures used qualified as outcome measures that would speak to achievement of the objectives. Outputs were measurable; data were to be collected through routine monitoring through the project supported TVE M&E system, a midterm review, and an impact evaluation at project conclusion. The impact evaluation -- which could have provided evidence of attainment of outcomes -- was not conducted as planned.

b. M&E Implementation

Routine monitoring was enhanced through a midterm review and an independent impact assessment at project closure. An interim evaluation was undertaken to assess progress toward objectives. The impact assessment envisioned at project appraisal was not carried out as planned, instead a closing evaluation was undertaken which surveyed various beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries. The results of the impact assessment, while positive, warrant caution in interpreting results. For example, measurements of improved quality were made without comparison to non-project schools. The ICR reports improvements between 2012 and 2015 in satisfaction (both for students and employers); however, the ICR does not specify how the baseline 2012 data were collected, making it difficult to assess the robustness of the observed change, and the ICR also did not provide sufficient information to be able to attribute the change to project activities. The same survey found a statistically significant and substantial difference in the "level of employer satisfaction with graduate skills coming from beneficiary and non-beneficiary colleges offering similar programs in the region," but the ICR again provides little information on the with-and-without methodology.

c. M&E Utilization

The ICR reported that survey results measuring the implementation progress of IDPs were used as a feedback loop during project implementation. The use of these data resulted in closer supervision of IDP



implementation by the PMU and adjustment to the grant funding mechanism.

M&E Quality Rating

Modest

11. Other Issues

a. Safeguards

The project was classified as Environmental Category B at approval. Construction activities planned under the competitive grants to institutions triggered the classification. An Environmental Management Framework (EMF) was developed. In the end, the project did not finance any construction activities (instead they were financed by institutions). No social safeguard policies were triggered.

b. Fiduciary Compliance

Financial Management: Fiduciary risk was rated high at project approval. To mitigate risks, the Bank required a financial management manual be prepared and a financial management consultant be hired along with establishing a PMU within the MOES responsible for all fiduciary aspects of the project. Interim financial reports and audited financial statements were submitted in a timely and acceptable manner. The project complied fully with the Bank's financial covenants.

Procurement: The project experienced both delays and irregularities in procurement. Delays were due to lengthy procedures required by the government; irregularities due to a lack of competition. At the time of the midterm review the implementation rating was marginally unsatisfactory. In the end, all planned procurement activities were completed by project closure.

c. Unintended impacts (Positive or Negative)

None noted.

d. Other

12. Ratings

Ratings	ICR	IEG	Reason for Disagreements/Comment
---------	-----	-----	----------------------------------



Outcome	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Relevance of objectives was rated substantial. Relevance of design was rated modest. Achievement of the relevance and quality objectives were rated substantial. Achievement of the efficiency objective was rated modest. Efficiency was rated substantial. Taken together, these indicate moderate shortcomings in project performance.
Risk to Development Outcome	Modest	Modest	---
Bank Performance	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Bank performance is rated moderately satisfactory due to moderate shortcomings in appraisal and during supervision.
Borrower Performance	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Government performance is rated moderately satisfactory due to the procedural delays and delays caused by high-level staff turnover.
Quality of ICR		Substantial	---

Note

When insufficient information is provided by the Bank for IEG to arrive at a clear rating, IEG will downgrade the relevant ratings as warranted beginning July 1, 2006.

The "Reason for Disagreement/Comments" column could cross-reference other sections of the ICR Review, as appropriate.

13. Lessons

The following lessons are adapted from the ICR (pp. 23-24).

- The Government's overall commitment to reforming the TVE system helped pass changes to the required legal and regulatory frameworks.
- Participation of the private sector in TVE reforms, especially in setting occupational standards, helps achieve relevance of educational programs. Representation of the private sector on national and sector councils and school boards ensured that the project remained focused on providing a demand-driven TVE education that adequately met the needs of the labor market.
- The individual development programs developed a culture of innovation and participation at the school level. School-level assessments of needs and IDP preparation introduced competency-based programs and



improvements in teaching resources and labs. The participation of the private sector in preparing the IDPs provided a direct link to employers' competency demands, standards and skills assessment.

14. Assessment Recommended?

Yes

Please explain

The project placed heavy emphasis on private sector engagement in reforming the TVE system to reduce the mismatch between skills supplied and demanded in the labor market. It also implemented ambitious curricular reforms in pilot schools which are being rolled out nationwide. Combining an evaluation of this project and its follow-on could provide significant information on the enablers and constraints to improving TVE systems, an under-evaluated subsector with growing emphasis in the World Bank.

15. Comments on Quality of ICR

The ICR was well written and concise. Although heavy emphasis was placed on implementation experience and output measures, it also included evidence from the survey conducted at completion. The ICR could have adhered more strictly to guidelines, and it could have been strengthened with lessons that were more explicitly based on evidence presented in the ICR.

a. Quality of ICR Rating

Substantial